

THE JOURNAL
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

A. K. Narain
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

EDITORS

L. M. Joshi
Punjabi University
Patiala, India

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Bardwell Smith
Carleton College
Northfield, Minnesota, USA

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Jikidō Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Robert Thurman
Amherst College
Amherst, Massachusetts, USA

Volume 4

1981

Number 2

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. New Buddhist Sanskrit Texts from Central Asia: An Unknown fragment of the Mahāyāna *Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra* by *G. M. Bongard Levin* 7
2. Buddhist Hybrid English: Some Notes on Philology and Hermeneutics for Buddhologists by *Paul J. Griffiths* 17
3. Nonorigination and *Nirvāṇa* in the Early *Tathāgatagarbha* Literature by *William Grosnick* 33
4. Multiple Dimensions of Impermanence in Dōgen's "Gen-jōkōan" by *Steven Heine* 44
5. The Autobiography of a 20th-Century Rnying-ma-pa lama by *Alexander W. Macdonald* 63
6. Metapsychology of the *Abhidharma* by *Shanta Ratnayaka* 76

II. SHORT PAPER

1. The Buddhist "Prodigal Son": A Story of Misperceptions by *Whalen Lai* 91

III. BOOK REVIEWS

1. Lustful Maidens and Ascetic Kings (Buddhist and Hindu Stories of Life) by *C. Amore and Larry D. Shinn* 99

2.	The Syncretic Religion of Lin Chao-en by <i>Judith A. Berling</i>	101
3.	The Memoirs of a Modern Gnostic (Parts I and II) by <i>Edward Conze</i>	102
4.	Buddhist Studies by <i>J. W. de Jong</i>	106
5.	Sources for a History of the bSam yas Debate by <i>G. W. Houston</i>	107
6.	Buddhist Architecture of Western India (c. 250 BC–AD 300) by <i>S. Nagaraju</i>	109
7.	The Thousand Buddhas: Ancient Buddhist Paintings from the Cave-Temples of Tun-huang on the Western Front- ier of China by <i>Aurel Stein</i>	112

IV. PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

1. Tasks Ahead: Presidential Address Given on the Occasion
of the Third Conference of The International Associa-
tion of Buddhist Studies, Winnipeg, Canada, August
1980 by *Herbert V. Guenther*

Contributors

124

an elementary familiarity with the terminology of *Phar phyin* where the phrase is clearly recognized as an abbreviated way of referring to the four stages of the application path (*prayoga-mārga—sbyor lam*). This shows the difficulty of Tibetan historiographical studies, wherein some familiarity with the philosophical culture of the Lama authors is as essential as the usual skills of the historian.

In spite of these flaws, the work is a welcome addition to *Bsam yas* debate studies, especially as providing balance to Demiéville's account, primarily from Chinese sources, by showing the Tibetan perspective. A final point: the Tibetan assumption that the Hwashang Mahayana faithfully represents the Ch'an position should not be uncritically accepted. The great Ch'an masters such as Ma Tzu, Pai Chang, Huang Po, etc., would doubtless have dealt the Hwashang quite a few blows themselves, for his simplistic presentation of "sudden enlightenment" as mere "thoughtlessness." We must remember that the explosion of Ch'an practice during T'ang times produced numerous pretenders to enlightenment as well as highly enlightened masters.

The Hwashang Mahayana should not therefore be simplistically accepted as a representative of all Ch'an lineages of practice, as Tibetan Buddhists tend to do.

Robert A. F. Thurman

Buddhist Architecture of Western India (c. 250 BC–AD 300), by S. Nagaraju. Delhi: Agam Kala Prakashan, 1981. xxix + 368 pp. Map, Charts, Figures, Plates, Appendix, Bibliography, Index. Rs.500 (\$100).

If the dating of the Mahāyāna caves at Ajanta has for some time been the number-one problem of chronology for historians of early Indian art, the second most vexing issue would certainly have to be the dating of the rock-cut *caitya*-halls and *leñas* of the "Hīnayāna phase," found in great numbers throughout the western Deccan and northern Konkan. This earlier group of monuments forms the subject matter of this impressive volume by S. Nagaraju, and understandably, the author's prime concern is to establish a viable chronology for the series. Attempts in this same direction have been made before—the two most valuable being the works of Walter Spink (*Rock-cut Monuments of the Andhra Period: Their Style and Chronology*, unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard, 1954) and Vidya Dehejia (*Early Buddhist Rock Temples: a Chronological Study*, London, 1972)—but the problems of dating these

monuments are so complicated that the whole issue still remains largely unresolved. For all those who are devoted to such chronological perplexities and their solution, this book will be a welcome addition to the literature.

Whether or not one actually accepts the chronology proposed is a matter of little concern, for the real merit of the book lies elsewhere. Nagaraju has given us not just another chronological reconstruction, but something much more: a valuable reference tool of the sort which is all too often lacking in the field of Indian art. What the book practically amounts to is a corpus for the rock-cut architecture of the "Hīnayāna phase," and although not every single monument of the field is included, the coverage is far more complete and detailed than in any other work previously available. In total, the number of known rock-cut monuments from this period comes to about 1000 independent excavations distributed over some 50 separate sites; of these, 29 major sites together accounting for nearly 800 of the excavations were studied by Nagaraju during a six year period of field work. The number of monuments actually described in the catalogue portion of the book was further reduced to 570 excavations representing the 19 most important sites. Speaking strictly in terms of numbers, this amounts to a detailed coverage of about 60 percent of the known monuments; but from the standpoint of representative importance, very little has been missed.

The sixth chapter of the book, "Descriptive Inventory and Analysis of Monuments and Architectural Development in Different Centres," provides in over 200 pages a site-by-site, excavation-by-excavation description of the 570 monuments covered. After all the excavations of a given site have been described, a general discussion follows, in which the architectural data are considered in conjunction with associated epigraphical and paleographical evidence in an attempt to reconstruct the history of each site. Plans are included for most of the monuments, and the 220 plates serve fairly well as photographic documentation. The appendix is a "list" of all the known associated inscriptions for each site, complete with summaries, information as to location, and bibliographies; but in fact, in the majority of cases even the original text of the inscription is provided. (It is unfortunate that some of the more important, longer inscriptions, such as Nanaghat N° 1 and Nasik N° 4—as well as some shorter but previously unpublished inscriptions—are only summarized. For the amazingly high price of this book, one would expect to find not only the text of every inscription, but translations as well.)

Other chapters deal with the architecture of the caves from within the context of their natural and social environments. The in-

fluence of geographical and geological considerations upon the distribution and form of the monuments, the socio-economic factors relating to patronage, and the nature and demands of the *saṅgha* and the laity as factors influencing architectural form and distribution, are some of the topics dealt with. These chapters are full of suggestive statistics and sharp observations, and even though more questions are raised than answered, there is plenty of food for thought here.

As for the chronology proposed, I can only say that it can be argued as well as any other. It is obvious that we are still a long way from any kind of certainty when talking about the chronology of these monuments. The excavations are so numerous, and the problems in our understanding of the history of the period are so serious, that one might well despair of ever arriving at a reasonably sound chronological footing. Stated simply, the problem is how to relate the overall relative sequence—established on the basis of stylistic development, and of which only a few of the minor details are ever disputed—to a framework of absolute dates. A handful of inscriptions clearly places the excavation of several monuments within the reigns of specific Sātavāhana rulers, but then the whole problem hinges upon what dates one accepts for the Sātavāhanas. This in turn largely depends upon the way in which one interprets the highly controversial evidence of the Purāṇas. One extreme places the rise of the Sātavāhanas at c. 271 B.C., the other extreme argues for a date of c. 30 B.C., and numerous dates intermediate between these two have been suggested. Nagaraju offers an interpretation which puts Simuka, the founder of the dynasty, at c. 228 B.C., and thus places the beginnings of rock-cut architecture in the western Deccan at a very early period, about the middle of the third century B.C.

I am certain that there will be those who are convinced by Nagaraju's arguments for an early chronology, just as there will be those who prefer the later dates proposed by Dehejia and others. But whatever one's chronological leanings, this book will be greatly appreciated for the wealth of detailed and up-to-date information it provides.

Phil Wagoner