

THE JOURNAL
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

A. K. Narain
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

EDITORS

L. M. Joshi
Punjabi University
Patiala, India

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Jikidō Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Bardwell Smith
Carleton College
Northfield, Minnesota, USA

Robert Thurman
Amherst College
Amherst, Massachusetts, USA

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Roger Jackson

Volume 5

1982

Number 2

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. "Early Buddhism and the Urban Revolution," by Bal-krishna Govind Gokhale 7
2. "Pilgrimage and the Structure of Sinhalese Buddhism," by John C. Holt 23
3. "A New Approach to the Intra-Mādhyamika Confrontation over the Svātantrika and Prāsaṅgika Methods of Refutation," by Shohei Ichimura 41
4. "'Later Mādhyamika' in China: Some Current Perspectives on the History of Chinese *Prajñāpāramitā* Thought," by Aaron K. Koseki 53
5. "The Doctrine of the Buddha-Nature in the Mahāyāna *Mahāparinirvāṇa Sūtra*," by Ming-Wood Liu 63
6. "The Development of Language in Bhutan," by Lopon Nado 95
7. "Prolegomena to an English Translation of the *Sūtrasamuccaya*," by Bhikku Pāsādikā 101
8. "The Issue of the Buddha as *Vedagū*, with Reference to the Formation of the *Dhamma* and the Dialectic with the Brahmins," by Katherine K. Young 110

II. BOOK REVIEWS AND NOTICES

1. *Focus on Buddhism. A Guide to Audio-Visual Resources for Teaching Religion*, edited by Robert A. McDermott; and *Spiritual Discipline in Hinduism, Buddhism, and the West*, by Harry M. Buck 121

2. <i>Fundamentals of Tibetan Medicine</i> , ed. and tr. by T.J. Tsarong, et al.	124
3. <i>Pratīyasamutpādistutisubhāṣitahṛdayam of Acārya Tsong kha pa</i> , tr. by Gyaltzen Namdol and Ngawang Samten	127
4. <i>Répertoire du Canon Bouddhique Sino-Japonais, Edition de Tai-shō. Fascicule Annex du Hōbōgin</i> , compiled by Paul Demiéville, Hubert Durt, and Anna Seidel	128
5. <i>Three Worlds According to King Ruang: Thai Buddhist Cosmology</i> , tr. by Frank E. Reynolds and Mani B. Reynolds	132
6. <i>The Way to Shambhala</i> , by Edwin Bernbaum	133

III. NOTES AND NEWS

1. Computing and Buddhist Studies	136
2. Terms of Sanskrit and Pali Origin Acceptable as English Words	137
3. A Report on an Educational Television/Film Series on Tibetan Buddhism	138
4. Proposal for an Index of Publications in Buddhist Studies	141
5. 6th Conference of the International Association of Buddhist Studies	143

IV. OBITUARY

Isaline Blew Horner (1896–1981)	145
Contributors	150
Contributors	150

the field of Buddhist studies. Being for the most part of the same views as Prof. Guenther on the subject of Sanskrit reconstruction (see his address to the second IABS conference, in *JIAS* vol. 4 no. 2) I was very glad to see included in the present edition good translations into one modern Asian and one modern Western language.

The work forms part of *The Dalai Lama Tibeto-Indological Series*, and contains short forewords in Tibetan and Hindi by the general editor, the Ven. Samdong Rinpoche. There is a short Hindi introduction and an extensive Tibetan one (on the importance of the doctrine of *pratītyasamutpāda* in the Buddhist scriptures) by the Ven. Gyaltzen Namdol. In addition, there is a short English introduction by the Ven. Ngawang Samten.

The actual four-language edition of the text occupies the bulk of the work. It is supplemented by verse indexes in Tibetan and Sanskrit, a list of the more famous commentaries on the text in Tibetan, a complete dual language (Tibetan and Sanskrit) index to the works of Tsong kha pa, and a Sanskrit-Tibetan glossary. All of these features make the present work the most valuable to date on Tsong kha pa's *brTen 'brel bstod pa*.

Jose Ignacio Cabezon

Répertoire du Canon Bouddhique Sino-Japanais. Edition de Taishō. Fascicule Annexe du Hōbōgirin, Edition Révisée et Augmentée. Compiled by Paul Demiéville, Hubert Durt and Anna Seidel. L'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, Institut de France: Tōkyō and Paris, 1978. 372 pages.

In 1931 the important bibliographic work *Répertoire du Canon Bouddhique Sino-Japanais* appeared as a supplement to the series *Hōbōgirin*. The usefulness of this catalogue of the Taishō edition of the Chinese Buddhist canon has made it a prominent volume in the research libraries of Asian scholars for the past fifty years.

A new edition of *Répertoire* is welcome news because it provides a great deal of information not included in the original version. The additional material in this edition includes the following:

(A) A listing of the titles found in the last forty-five volumes of the *Taishō Daizōkyō* (vols. 56–100), which appeared after 1931

and were not available for the original volume. More than a thousand titles (T.2185–3283) of importance to a variety of scholarly disciplines are covered for the first time in the revised catalogue. In these later volumes of the Taishō version of the canon are Japanese commentaries and sectarian treatises, as well as a variety of topical texts, such as those dealing with the study of iconography (T. 2921–3283). There also are descriptions of the seventy-eight catalogues of the canon (vols. 98–100).

(B) Composite texts have been analyzed into their various divisions and each of the sub-categories is listed in the Index. Three major examples of this type of treatment are:

- (1) T. 397 *Mahāvaiṣṭyamaśāstrosūtra* (17 divisions)
- (2) T. 310 *Mahāratnakūṭasūtra* (49 divisions)
- (3) T. 220 *Mahāprajñāpāramitāsūtra* (16 divisions)

The catalogue does not deal with the divisions of non-Mahāyāna texts such as T. 1 *Dirghāgama*, T. 26 *Madhyamāgama*, T. 125 *Ekottāgama*, T. 99 *Samyuktāgama*, etc. These non-Mahāyāna texts have, in some cases, hundreds of sections and the compilers have chosen to limit indexed analysis to Mahāyāna texts made up of items that appear as individual sūtras as well as parts of other sūtras.

(C) A number of new Sanskrit title reconstructions have been added. While reconstructions from either Chinese translations or transliterations and Tibetan renderings of the words are never without suspicion regarding their match with an Indic original, it is true that Sanskrit titles provide a standard mode of reference, making the catalogue more useful to Buddhist scholars who do not read Chinese.

(D) The appended tables and charts have been improved and expanded; authors and translators for the texts in Vols. 56–100 are included in the Index. Former listings are corrected and new information has been added in many instances, as in the case of the biographical entry for “Chōsen” where the article about him written by Chou Yi-liang in HJAS is cited. These biographic aids are invaluable and provide a quick reference to available Western language sources.

(1) An entirely new entry, Table V (p. 355), provides the user with an alphabetical listing of the Romanized Chinese names of authors and translators, followed by the characters and the Japanese equivalents.

(2) “Tables Complémentaires” contain references to dates, dynasties and locations referred to in the entries of the catalogue.

(3) Of special note in the latter part of the Taishō edition is the inclusion of texts which have been found in collections such as those of Stein and Pelliot. The cataloguers have noted these sources in the tables and under each appropriate entry.

(E) One major new item in the revised text is the inclusion of the Korean numbers that match those used in the reviewer's catalogue, *The Korean Buddhist Canon: A Descriptive Catalogue*.

Corrections have been made in the revised version, indicating the care with which the compilers undertook their task. In the original publication there was a misnumbering of pages in the "Sanskrit-Pāli Index," which resulted in a wrong arrangement of the alphabetical listings. This flaw has now been removed. Also, under the index portion, titles and names that appeared under radical 109 in the "Table par Caractères Initiaux" in the previous volume have been shifted to their proper place, under radical 143 (p. 332). An example of the careful process of checking data can be noted under the listing for "Ajikuta" in "Table des Auteurs et Traducteurs," where the date of his arrival in Ch'ang-an has been corrected to read 651 rather than 625 (p. 235). There are errors and typographical mistakes in the new *Répertoire*, but when one considers the enormous array of facts represented in the book, these are comparatively few in number. Recently, Hubert Durt and Anna Seidel put together a comprehensive list of errors and they offer a copy to all who wish to have it. In view of this effort by the authors to note the problems it does not seem necessary to burden this review with a listing. A few examples will indicate the types of items which occur inadvertently: T. 71 "Cf. 20 (151)" should read "26 (151); T. 843 "Nj. 936" in error for "963"; T. 1076 "K 3118" is supposed to be "K 1338."

There are some questions that arise with regard to cross reference under the sign of "Cf." If one consults an entry such as T. 1555, there is a note comparing it with T. 1556, 1557, and 1541. When the user turns to T. 1541 there is no reference back to T. 1555. It would be appropriate to have some indication of these relationships between the texts.

Reference works of the type represented by this volume are an important part of the development of scholarship. We need to have more researchers who are willing to add to the corpus of reference works and aids to the use of the Buddhist materials. Without such works to provide guides to the material, the task of the scholar is an unnecessarily arduous one. In terms of such needs the *Répertoire* is without doubt a masterful work and de-

serves full praise. At the same time that we acknowledge the value of such a work, the question of its limitations can be considered. These limits are not to be interpreted as flaws; they are only indications of the present state of the art. The *Répertoire* is, in common with other published catalogues of this century, dependent on the catalogues of the past from China. It is in effect a catalogue of catalogues, combining information taken from the *mu-lu* literature. The catalogues of the Chinese, no less than those of our present century, relied on the previous compilers for most of their information. Only Tao-an has the honor of being a true pioneer cataloguer of the Buddhist canon, for it is he who made the first one, in 374. Succeeding catalogues, starting from the *Ch'u san tsang-chi chi* (515–518), reproduced information from the preceding catalogues and added such new material as was available. Apart from this literature there are few records with which we can construct a history of the canon in China. There is now a growing secondary literature which has begun to question some of the information in these documents. Japanese and Western scholars make a strong case for saying that some of the attributions and dates assigned to texts are incorrect. The study of apocryphal texts, those thought to have been written in China and not translated from an Indic original, points out many problems in the traditional listings. The revised *Répertoire* has in some instances indicated that a text is considered to be apocryphal (i.e. T. 273, 945, 1667 etc.), but the list of candidates for this designation is far longer than is indicated under the entries. No one cataloguer can hope to solve the many issues being raised by such research; it will take decades for the detailed arguments and assessments to find their way into the literature and eventually be encompassed in some future catalogue.

While the catalogues of the Chinese canon contain information that may be discredited as scholarly research advances, these documents nevertheless remain unique storehouses of information. The *mu-lu* should not be ignored or discounted; rather, the texts deserve much more study, because we have only just begun to explore the possibilities for research that are available in them. The compilers of this present volume are to be congratulated for having made the data of the ancient catalogues available and for carefully including in the entries essential non-Chinese materials in a clear presentation and with admirable accuracy.

Lewis R. Lancaster