

THE JOURNAL  
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF  
BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

*A. K. Narain*  
*University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA*

EDITORS

*Alexander W. Macdonald*  
*Université de Paris X*  
*Nanterre, France*

*Ernst Steinkellner*  
*University of Vienna*  
*Wien, Austria*

*Bardwell Smith*  
*Carleton College*  
*Northfield, Minnesota, USA*

*Jikidō Takasaki*  
*University of Tokyo*  
*Tokyo, Japan*

*Robert Thurman*  
*Amherst College*  
*Amherst, Massachusetts, USA*

ASSISTANT EDITOR

*Roger Jackson*

ERNEST STEINKELLNER  
WIEN

*Volume 7*

*1984*

*Number 2*

# CONTENTS

## I. ARTICLES

1. The Buddhist Path to Liberation: An Analysis of the Listing of Stages, *by Rod Bucknell* 7
2. Temporary Ordination in Sri Lanka, *by Richard Gombrich* 41
3. The Symbolism of the Early Stūpa, *by Peter Harvey* 67
4. Reason as the Prime Principle in Tsong kha pa's Delineation of Deity Yoga as the Demarcation Between Sūtra and Tantra, *by Jeffrey Hopkins* 95
5. Buddhism and Belief in Ātma, *by Y. Krishan* 117
6. Giuseppe Tucci (1894–1984), *by Luciano Petech* 137
7. Kokan Shiren and Musō Soseki: "Chineseness" vs. "Japaneseness" in Thirteenth and Fourteenth Century Japan, *by David Pollack* 143
8. The *Rasāvahinī* and the *Sahassavatthu*: A Comparison, *by Telwatte Rahula* 169
9. A Study of the Theories of *Yāvad-bhāvikatā* and *Yathāvad-bhāvikatā* in the *Abhidharmasamuccaya*, *by Ah-yueh Yeh* 185

## II. BOOK REVIEWS

1. *Alone With Others: An Existential Approach to Buddhism*, *by Stephen Batchelor*; *The Way of Siddhartha: A Life of the Buddha*, *by David J. and Indrani Kalupahana* (reviewed by Roger Jackson) 208
2. *The Buddha*, *by Michael Carrithers* (reviewed by Paul Griffiths) 216

3. *Buddhist and Western Psychology*, edited by Nathan Katz  
(reviewed by Paul Griffiths) 219
4. *A Lamp for the Path and Commentary*, by Atiśa, trans-  
lated and annotated by Richard Sherburne  
(reviewed by José Cabezón) 224
5. *Religious Festivals in South India and Sri Lanka*, edited  
and prefaced by Guy R. Welbon and Glenn E.  
Yocum (reviewed by Peter Claus) 226

### III. NOTES AND NEWS

1. 7th Conference of the International Association of  
Buddhist Studies 230
  2. L.M. Joshi: A Brief Communication 232
  3. I.A.B.S., Inc. Treasurer's Report 233
- OBITUARY
- John Brough (1917–1984) 236
- Contributors 239

of the theory of "Buddha-nature." Nonetheless, both Prāsaṅgikas and Svātantrikas have a very developed and extensive literature expounding their own theory of the tathāgatagarbha. In fact, one of the main Indian works on the subject, Asaṅga's commentary to the *Uttaratantra*, is held by many scholars to be a Prāsaṅgika work.

Dr. Sherburne devotes extensive notes to the subject of Nirvāṇa (p. 156 and p. 198) but his explanations do not correlate with any that I have seen in my own study of the Tibetan commentaries of the *Abhisamyālankāra* and *Sputārtha* (where the topic of Nirvāṇa is discussed at the very outset). For example, Dr. Sherburne seems to indicate that "Nirvāṇa with remainder" belongs to the śrāvaka, that "Nirvāṇa without remainder" belongs to the pratyekabuddha and that "Non-abiding Nirvāṇa" (or, in his terminology, "deferred Nirvāṇa") belongs to the bodhisattva. Instead, texts like Tsong kha pa's *gSer phreng* and Rong ston pa's *Ṭikā* are quite clear: "Nirvāṇa with remainder" and "Nirvāṇa without remainder" can both belong either to śrāvakas or to pratyekabuddhas. In the former, the Arhant still possesses his five skandhas, which remain because of karma accumulated previous to his attainment of Arhantship. In the latter, the Arhant has exhausted this karma, his body has died. "Non-abiding Nirvāṇa," they state, exclusively refers to Buddhahood itself.

Be that as it may, since these doctrinal points do not directly bear on the text, they do not detract from Dr. Sherburne's chief task, the translation of this very important work. All in all, supplemented with two very useful appendices on the system of initiations, and an excellent glossary and bibliography, Dr. Sherburne's translation must be recognized both as a scholarly rigorous work and, as was the original in eleventh century Tibet, a superb introduction to the Mahāyāna for the novice.

José I. Cabezón

*Religious Festivals in South India and Sri Lanka* (Studies on Religion in South India and Sri Lanka, Vol. 1) Edited and prefaced by Guy R. Welbon and Glenn E. Yocum. New Delhi: Manohar 1982, pp. xi-341, including Index.

Some readers will be disappointed in the treatment given Hindu festivals by the 12 authors whose papers are contained in

this volume. Those who have witnessed South Indian festivals will catch only occasional glimpses of the grand ritual performances and the milling crowds they surely associate with their experience. A majority of the papers are written by historians of religion and reflect a perspective on religion which is quite different from the exoteric meaning and experience of the crowd. True to their profession, these researchers turn to texts and learned priestly informants whose apprehension and comprehension of what is going on at a festival can be remarkably different than that of the other participants. Another source of disappointment lies in the fact that the papers were written and presented over a decade ago, at the 1971 meeting of the workshop of the Conference on Religion on South India. Thus, even the anthropological papers miss the sense of "anti-structure" that social anthropologist and theorist Victor Turner, writing in the 1970's, has suggested characterizes such festivities.

The twelve papers in the collection can be roughly divided into two groups: those which deal with the prescriptive, textual aspects of a festival, and those which take a more descriptive stance, viewing the festival as an on-going performance. In the former group are two papers which concentrate on calendrical aspects of festival cycles and three papers on temple conventions (*āgama* texts) specifying rituals appropriate for certain dates and commemorations. In the latter group of more descriptive papers there are papers which discuss the relationships between myth (or text) and theatrical and artistic modes of expression as these combine to create a festival drama. Also in this category are three papers which explore the relationships of festival and society.

The papers themselves tend to be rather technical. The one common theme running through all the papers is the importance of the chronometric cyclicity of festivals. The first paper, Karen L. Merrey's "The Hindu Festival Calendar," provides an excellent introduction, as well as background reference, to this theme. It is a detailed account of both the solar and lunar calendrical systems. Fred Clothey's paper, "Chronometry, Cosmology and the Festival Calendar in the Murukan Cult," tries to demonstrate that the festival calendar integrates cosmic and ecological time as well as the sequence in a god's career, which he calls commemorative time. The three papers emphasizing the āgamic conventions of specific groups of temples—H. Daniel Smith's "Festivals in the Pāncarātra Literature," James Martin's "The Cycle of Festivals at Pārthasārathi Temple," (both on Vaiṣṇava systems) and J. Bruce Long's "Mahāśivarātri: The Śaiva Festival

of Repentance”—describe how particular rituals are allocated to the calendrical cycle. The number of such rituals is impressive; for the Parthasarathi temple there were “festivals” on 345 days in a year, and in other temples, Martin says, the figure is much higher. One question raised by such a high figure is what is meant by “festival” in this context; if all of these are equally “festivals” for the Brahman officiates, why are only some of these occasions considered “festivals” by the rest of society?

The more descriptive papers tend also to be more eclectic. Guy Welbon’s paper “The Caṇḍāla’s Song” concentrates on a ritual enactment of a text in which an untouchable pilgrim is confronted by a demon (*brahmarākshasa*) before and after gaining merit from his pilgrimage. The drama, only a small part of the festival, and not even witnessed by the temple higher-ups, is nonetheless quintessential of what many temple festivals are all about, the public reenactment of a ritual drama. Clifford R. Jones’ “Kaḷam Eḷuttu: Art and Ritual in Kerala” is about similar sorts of drama in which, additionally, elaborate colored powder drawings are made. His analysis concerns the history of the artistic conventions of the drawing, but also suggests a vast realm of further study to be done on the dramatic aspects of these rituals. Glenn E. Yocum’s “An-keḷiya: A Literary-Historical Approach” demonstrates the value of comparative study of the relationship between mythic narrative and ritual enactment. He brings to bear a wealth of tradition from around Sri Lanka and throughout Tamil Nadu on a Sinhalese game played in honor of Pattini, the goddess of both fertility and smallpox.

Suzanne Hanchett’s paper, “The Festive Interlude: Some Anthropological Observations,” Jane M. Christian’s paper, “The End is the Beginning: A Festival Chain in Andhra Pradesh,” and Donald K. Swearer’s paper, “The Kataragama and Kandy Āsaḷa Perahāras: Juxtaposing Religious Elements in Sri Lanka,” all emphasize that many aspects of festivals belong to the community. While Hanchett’s paper stresses that festivals are composed of elements which are continually negotiated by different factions of the community, Christian’s paper emphasizes how the multiplicity of meanings in festival events represent different social contingents. Swearer characterizes Sri Lankan festivals as national religious celebrations wherein both Buddhism and Hinduism are subsumed in a broader sense of community spirit.

One paper, Dennis Hudson’s “Two Citra Festivals in Madurai,” stands above the rest in being able to bring all of these aspects of festival together. Through myth and ritual, esoteric

doctrine and popular lore, textual authority and modern practice, Vaiṣṇava and Śaiva traditions are wedded—literally—in a grand pageant: the marriage of Śiva to Viṣṇu's sister, Mīnākṣī. Hudson suggests that this was accomplished historically when the Telugu king Tirumala Nayaka merged two temple traditions into a common myth to elicit the loyalty of certain segments of society after the fall of Vijayanagar. Thus, despite the calendrical cyclicity and a wealth of temple convention—indeed, by clever use of the illusion of these elements—festivals are at once things in time and out of it, reflective of both past structure, immediate structure and cosmic structure, as well as “anti-structure,” the structure of rebellion against petrified conventions.

Peter Claus



## This publication is available in microform.

**University Microfilms**  
International reproduces this  
publication in microform:  
microfiche and 16mm or  
35mm film. For information  
about this publication or any  
of the more than 13,000 titles

we offer, complete and mail the coupon to: University  
Microfilms International, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor,  
MI 48106. Call us toll-free for an immediate response:  
800-521-3044. Or call collect in Michigan, Alaska and  
Hawaii: 313-761-4700.

Please send information about these titles:

\_\_\_\_\_

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Company/Institution \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_

State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

Phone (     ) \_\_\_\_\_

**University  
Microfilms  
International**