

THE JOURNAL  
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF  
BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

*A.K. Narain*  
*University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA*

EDITORS

*†L.M. Joshi*  
*Punjabi University*  
*Patiala, India*

*Alexander W. Macdonald*  
*Université de Paris X*  
*Nanterre, France*

*Bardwell Smith*  
*Carleton College*  
*Northfield, Minnesota, USA*

*Ernst Steinkellner*  
*University of Vienna*  
*Wien, Austria*

*Jikidō Takasaki*  
*University of Tokyo*  
*Tokyo, Japan*

*Robert Thurman*  
*Amherst College*  
*Amherst, Massachusetts, USA*

ASSISTANT EDITOR

*Roger Jackson*  
*Fairfield University*  
*Fairfield, Connecticut, USA*

*Volume 9*

*1986*

*Number 1*

# CONTENTS

## I. ARTICLES

1. The Meaning of *Vijñapti* in Vasubandhu's Concept of Mind, by Bruce Cameron Hall 7
2. "Signless" Meditations in Pāli Buddhism, by Peter Harvey 25
3. Dōgen Casts Off "What": An Analysis of *Shinjin Datsuraku*, by Steven Heine 53
4. Buddhism and the Caste System, by Y. Krishan 71
5. The Early Chinese Buddhist Understanding of the Psyche: Chen Hui's Commentary on the *Yin Chih Ju Ching*, by Whalen Lai 85
6. The Special Theory of *Pratītyasamutpāda*: The Cycle of Dependent Origination, by Geshe Lhundub Sopa 105

## II. BOOK REVIEWS

1. *Chinese Religions in Western Languages: A Comprehensive and Classified Bibliography of Publications in English, French and German through 1980*, by Laurence G. Thompson (Yves Hervouet) 121
2. *The Cycle of Day and Night*, by Namkhai Norbu (A.W. Hanson-Barber) 122
3. *Dharma and Gospel: Two Ways of Seeing*, edited by Rev. G.W. Houston (Christopher Chapple) 123
4. *Meditation on Emptiness*, by Jeffrey Hopkins (J.W. de Jong) 124

5.	<i>Philosophy of Mind in Sixth Century China, Paramārtha's 'Evolution of Consciousness,'</i> by Diana Y. Paul (J.W. de Jong)	129
	Diana Paul Replies	133
	J.W. de Jong Replies	135
6.	<i>Seven Works of Vasubandhu: The Buddhist Psychological Doctor,</i> by Stefan Anacker (A.W. Hanson-Barber)	136
7.	<i>Tsong Khapa's Speech of Gold in the Essence of True Eloquence: Reason and Enlightenment in the Central Philosophy of Tibet,</i> translated by Robert A.F. Thurman (Janet Gyatso)	138

### III. NOTES AND NEWS

1.	Election Results, IABS	143
2.	Conference Announcements	144
	8th Conference, IABS	144
	32nd ICANAS	145
	7th World Sanskrit Conference	145
3.	AAR Buddhism Group	146
	OBITUARIES	147
	LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	156

that same text (i.e. the *Kośa*) after Hui-k'ai's death." I am sorry to insist on the fact that this is stated nowhere in Paramārtha's biography. In my review I wrote that Hui-k'ai lectured on the *Kośa* until his death and that after his death Paramārtha continued to lecture on the same text, and I referred to both the HSKC and to Ui. I may add that the same information is given by Demiéville in an article mentioned in Diana Paul's bibliography (see *Choix d'études bouddhiques*, p. 21).

In her reply, Diana Paul writes that "Ui claims that the biography means to say that Paramārtha revised and polished an already completed text, even though the HSKC does not say that." Ui's source is not, of course, Paramārtha's biography, but Hui-k'ai's preface to Paramārtha's translation of the *Kośa* (Taishō 1559.29.161b20–22).

Diana Paul's third example is her translation of verse VII. It is rather amazing to see that she still does not recognize that her translation is wrong, as has already been pointed out by another reviewer (see Collett Cox's review in the *Journal of Asian Studies*, 45,1,p. 126). It is absurd to say that I prefer Hsüan-tsang's translation which reads: "It (i.e. the defiled mind) does not exist for the Arhat, nor in the meditation of cessation, nor on the supramundane path" (see Ui, p. 411).

The eight (not five) points raised in my review represent only a small selection of the critical notes I made while reading Diana Paul's work. I believe that they are sufficient to show the way in which Diana Paul handled her Chinese sources and her "single most important secondary source in [her] analysis of the HSKC." Diana Paul's reply only confirms what I have already said in my review.

*Seven Works of Vasubandhu: The Buddhist Psychological Doctor*, by Stefan Anacker, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984. 492 pages.

*Seven Works of Vasubandhu* is divided into fourteen sections. The major chapters are: Vasubandhu, His Life and Times; A Method for Argumentation (*Vādavidhi*); A Discussion of the Five Aggregates (*Pañcaskandhaka-prakarāṇa*); A Discussion for the Demonstration of Action (*Karma-siddhi-prakarāṇa*); The Twenty Verses and their Commentary (*Viṃśatikā-kārikā [vṛtti]*); The Thirty Verses (*Triṃśikā-kārikā*); Commentary on the Separation of the Middle from Extremes (*Madhyānta-vibhāga-bhāṣya*); and The Teaching of the Three Own-Beings (*Tri-svabhāva-nirdeśa*).

The work further includes: a glossary and index of key terms in English, Sanskrit and Tibetan; the Sanskrit text for: the *Vimśatikā-vṛttih*, *Triṃśikā-vijñapti-kārikāh*, *Madhyānta-vibhāga-bhāṣyam*, and the *Trisvabhāva-nirdeśah*; a bibliography, index of proper names and a general index.

This is an authoritative work that will prove to be required reading for those interested in either Yogācāra or in Vasubandhu. Dr. Anacker's wide range of knowledge of Buddhist studies and of Buddhist languages has been utilized to its fullest extent in presenting a comprehensive volume. The translations are most reliable and his annotation is enlightening.

Three of the works were first translated in Dr. Anacker's Ph.D. dissertation (Wisconsin, 1970): the *Vādavidhi*, *Karma-siddhi-prakarana* and *Madhyānta-viḡhāga-bhāṣya*. The translations found in the present volume are all re-worked and offer the reader a considerably improved rendering into English. They also include less use of technical Sanskrit vocabulary. The latter is not lacking, but it is contained in the extensive and useful glossary.

The first chapter presents a historical discussion of previous attempts to deal with the problems surrounding the figure of Vasubandhu. The work draws information from Sanskrit, Tibetan and Chinese sources. It concludes that there was only one Vasubandhu, who wrote both the *Abhidharmakośa* and the Yogācāra works normally ascribed to him.

Each of the translations is preceded by an introduction useful for understanding the text under consideration. In general, these discussions help place the particular text in the philosophical milieu wherein it belongs. For example, in the "Discussion for the Demonstration of Action," there is a discussion of Vasubandhu's early theory of memory, found in the *Abhidharmakośa*, as well as of the Vaibhāṣika explanation and the view of Saṅghabhadra. Finally, the author summarizes the text and points out some of its salient features.

Some readers may object to Dr. Anacker's notion of Vasubandhu as a "Psychological Doctor." I believe that Dr. Anacker's understanding of this term is considerably different from what the words first imply, and sharply contrasts with any Western psychological model. Indeed, Dr. Anacker criticizes quite severely the whole basis of Western psychology, which he sees as formulating concrete categories such as "psychotic," forcing a particular individual into this pigeon-hole and finally applying the prescribed remedies. Vasubandhu, by contrast, views the situation in an Abhidharmic manner, i.e., seeing individual moment-

events and then applying antidotes to increase benefit and decrease suffering. These categories of moment-events are then discarded for the more advanced theories of the Yogācāra, which are seen as being based experientially in meditation. This allows for a non-fixed base of viewing and a dynamic approach to the human situation. Thus, the use of the word "psychological" must be understood in light of Buddhist notions, and not tied to Western theories.

I have two minor reservations about this work. The first is that the general index is so short as to be nearly useless. Some of the problem is corrected by an extensive index of proper names. However, more should have been added to the general index.

The second is Dr. Anacker's tendency to employ hyphenated and multi-hyphenated words to express technical terms. Although this cannot at all times be avoided, there are definite examples of abuse. A case in point: "A Discussion of the Five Aggregates," one will find the term "*kuśala mūla*" translated as "root-of-the-beneficial" (e.g., p. 66). Certainly there must be alternatives to translating a term with three hyphens separating the elements.

Overall, this is an outstanding contribution to the field of Buddhist Studies in general and to Yogācāra studies in particular: scholars interested in Mahāyāna developments and later Indian philosophy/psychology will find considerable information here that should prove most useful.

A.W. Hanson-Barber

*Tsong Khapa's Speech of Gold in the Essence of True Eloquence: Reason and Enlightenment in the Central Philosophy of Tibet*, translated with an introduction by Robert A.F. Thurman. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, Princeton Library of Asian Translations, 1984. xviii + 442 pp.

As Prof. Thurman points out in his introduction to this book, "Even in recent times, great critical scholars such as Stcherbatski (sic) and Murti were misled . . . into thinking that the Centrists were 'metaphysical absolutists' who repudiated all forms of logic whatsoever, along with the meaningfulness of all language." (p. 57) An outstanding testament to the contrary is this fine