

THE JOURNAL
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Roger Jackson
Dept. of Religion
Carleton College
Northfield, MN 55057
USA

EDITORS

Peter N. Gregory
University of Illinois
Urbana-Champaign, Illinois, USA

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Jikido Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Steven Collins
University of Chicago
Chicago, Illinois, USA

Robert Thurman
Columbia University
New York, New York, USA

Volume 15

1992

Number 2

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. The *Heart Sūtra*: A Chinese Apocryphal Text?
by Jan Nattier 153
2. Indian Altruism: A Study of the Terms *bodhicitta* and *bodhicittotpāda*,
by Gareth Sparham 224

II. TRANSLATION

1. A Twelfth-century Tibetan Classic of Māhāmudrā: *The Path of Ultimate Profundity: The Great Seal Instructions of Zhang*,
by Dan Martin 243

III. BOOK REVIEWS

1. *Mind Only: A Philosophical and Doctrinal Analysis of the Vijñānavāda*, by Thomas E. Wood (Paul J. Griffiths) 320
2. *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā-vṛtti: Commentaire à la soixante sur le raisonnement ou Du vrai enseignement de la causalité par le Maître indien Candrakīrti*,
by Cristina Anna Scherer-Schaub (José Ignacio Cabezón) 325

- IV. I.A.B.S. MEMBERSHIP LIST 328

Yuktiṣaṣṭikā-vṛtti: Commentaire à la soixante sur le raisonnement ou Du vrai enseignement de la causalité par le Maître indien Candrakīrti, by Cristina Anna Scherrer-Schaub. Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises, 1991. Mélanges Chinois et Bouddhiques, vol.XXV. Paper: 2000 FB

Not since the work of Étienne Lamotte and Louis de La Vallée Poussin has *Mélanges Chinois et Bouddhiques* published a work of such pivotal importance to the field of Indo-Tibetan Buddhist philosophy. Scherrer-Schaub's critical edition and annotated translation of Candrakīrti's commentary (*Vṛtti*) to Nāgārjuna's *Yuktiṣaṣṭikākārikā* (Sixty Verses on Reasoning) is a fabulous work, both philologically and philosophically, reminding us nostalgically of earlier days in French-language buddhological scholarship. The preface to the work touches on some of the important issues raised by Candrakīrti, but the bulk of the introductory philosophical material is actually found in a section of the introduction called "Profile of the Text" (pp.xxiii-xlvi), which is preceded by shorter sections on the root text and commentary and on Candrakīrti, the author of the *Vṛtti*. It is clear, however, that the Introduction is not meant to be anything more than an impressionistic discussion of some key issues in Indian Madhyamaka thought. The more extensive discussions on Buddhist doctrine are instead found in the notes to the translation. Some of these, such as the six-page note 492 that discusses the Yogācāra-Madhyamaka synthesis, are short essays in their own right, not only surveying the literature on a given topic, but also discussing historical and philosophical questions as well. Other important discussions are to be found in note 99, on *dnegos por lta ba* (seeing things as real), and in note 462, where we find an excursus on the notions of *upādāya* and *pratītya*, to name just two examples. The annotations also serve the useful purpose of contextualizing the *Vṛtti* within the corpus of Candrakīrti's other writings, especially the *Prasannapadā*.

The translation itself is accurate, readable and straightforward, evincing Scherrer-Schaub's clear conceptual mastery of the material. For the most part, following the Mādhyamikas' own dictum, she mercifully abides by the translation equivalents that have come to be accepted in the discipline, making it unnecessary for the reader to retranslate from some new and unknown buddhologicese. There is only one case in which a translation choice seems to me less than elegant, and this has to do with the rendering of *kun rdzob bden pa* (*saṃvṛtisatya*) as "enveloping/covering truth" (vérité d'enveloppement) rather than by the more common "conventional truth." It is clear that this choice must have been motivated in part by the fact that "conventional" was reserved as a translation for another term (e.g., in *loka vyavahāra*, which she renders "appellation conventionnelle mondaine"). Despite this, and despite the fact that etymologically the word *saṃvṛti* does convey the sense of "covering" or "obscuring," I believe that precedence should still prevail as a criterion, and therefore favor rendering *saṃvṛti* as "conventional." This, however, is largely a matter of personal taste, and Scherrer-

Schaub can certainly not be faulted for this. It is clear throughout her work that she has given a great deal of thought to her choice of translation terms, and that in every case they are at the very least defensible.

The critical edition of the Tibetan texts are based not only on all of the available recensions of the texts found in the various editions of bsTan 'gyur, but on two Dunhuang documents (P.T. 795 and 796) previously studied by Scherrer-Schaub herself (Proceedings of the Csoma de Körös Symposium, Višegrad, 1984). Finally, there is an extremely valuable and detailed Tibetan-Sanskrit-French glossary/index, and a separate subject index (mostly of Sanskrit terms and proper names).

For those of us who work in the field of Indo-Tibetan Madhyamaka philosophy Scherrer-Schaub's book is bound to become the standard reference work on the *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā* and its *Vṛtti*. It is, without a doubt, one of the most important contributions to the field that we have seen in recent years.

José Ignacio Cabezón