

THE JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

A. K. Narain
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

EDITORS

L. M. Joshi
Punjabi University
Patiala, India

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Jikidō Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Bardwell Smith
Carleton College
Northfield, Minnesota, USA

Robert Thurman
Amherst College
Amherst, Massachusetts, USA

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Roger Jackson

ERNST STEINKELLNER
WIEN

Volume 6

1983

Number 1

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. Enlightenment in Dōgen's Zen, *by Francis H. Cook* 7
2. The Place of the Sudden Teaching within the Hua-Yen Tradition: An Investigation of the Process of Doctrinal Change, *by Peter N. Gregory* 31
3. Morality in the *Visuddhimagga*, *by Damien Keown* 61
4. Contemporary Lay Buddhist Movements in Japan, with Special Reference to the *Lotus Sūtra*, *by Tsugunari Kubo* 76
5. Before the Prajñā Schools: The Earliest Known Chinese Commentary on the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā*, *by Whalen Lai* 91
6. The Generalization of an Old Yogic Attainment in Medieval Mahāyāna Sūtra Literature: Some Notes on *Jātismara*, *by Gregory Schopen* 109

II. BOOK REVIEWS

1. The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhism, edited and introduced *by Leslie S. Kawamura* 148
2. Contributo allo Studio Biografico dei Primi Gterston, *by Ramon Pratz* 151
3. Gedatsukai: Its Theory and Practice (A Study of a Shinto-Buddhist Syncretic School in Contemporary Japan), *by Minoru Kiyota* 154
4. A Study of the Twenty-two Dialogues on Mahāyāna Buddhism, *by W. Pachow* 157

5. Zen and Christian: The Journey between, *by John Dykstra Busden* 159

III. PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

1. Presidential Address Given on the Occasion of the Fifth Conference of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Hertford College, Oxford, England, August 16–21, 1982, *by Walpola Rahula* 162

IV. NOTES AND NEWS

1. A Report on the 5th Conference of the IABS, Hertford College, University of Oxford, Oxford, England, August 16–21, 1982 167

Contributors 180

to social disruption. By clarifying the nature of the Buddhist content in new religions such as Gedatsukai, Buddhologists can help social scientists and historians of religion broaden and deepen their interpretation of Japanese new religions. The questions raised by Kiyota's study will help stimulate the dialogue among scholars of various disciplines about the significance of Japanese new religions, and new Buddhist movements in other countries. We are indebted to Kiyota for opening this dialogue, and would hope that other Buddhologists will follow his lead of working with Japanese new religions.

H. Byron Earhart

A Study of the Twenty-two Dialogues on Mahāyāna Buddhism, by W. Pachow. Taipei, 1979. Pp. 126. \$15.00 (paperback).

This is a significant and valuable publication, for which all students of the history and philosophy of Buddhism will be grateful to Dr. Pachow. It contains a critically edited Chinese text, in Chinese characters, of a short but remarkable work called *Ta-ch'êng-êrh-shih-êrh-wên*, written by T'an-K'uang, a learned Chinese Buddhist monk of the eighth century; an English translation of the text; and an introduction dealing with various aspects of the historical context and doctrinal contents of the work. The format of this publication is not very inviting. It seems to have been put together from two issues of a magazine, *The Chinese Culture: A Quarterly Review*, vol. XX, No. 1 pp. 15-64; and vol. XX, No. 2, pp. 35-131 published in 1979. The format, however, does not minimize its significance and value.

The work is based on three manuscripts, two belonging to Pelliot's collection (P. 2960 and P.2287) and one belonging to Stein's collection (S.2074) kept in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris. Pachow informs us that each of these manuscripts is incomplete and imperfect in many ways. He has fixed the edited version of the text after careful collation and comparison of all three manuscripts. The newly edited and published text contains "roughly 13000 Chinese characters with nearly 400 entries of footnotes and comments" (p. 32).

In his introduction, Pachow discusses several topics relating to possible circumstances leading to composition of *Ta-ch'êng-êrh-shih-êrh-wên*, translated as *The Twenty-two Dialogues on Ma-*

hāyāna Buddhism. This work turns out to be a joint creation of Śramaṇa T'an-K'uang of China and King Khri-srong-lde-tsan of Tibet. This sounds strange, but Pachow has shown that the twenty-two questions answered and explained in this book were formulated and dispatched by the Tibetan monarch to the Chinese master of the Dharma while the latter was living in a monastery in Tun-huang. Although the name of the Tibetan monarch is not mentioned in the text, in his preface to the work T'an-K'uang refers to a certain king as "Your Majesty." Pachow's suggestion that this does not refer to the Chinese emperor Teh-tsung (780-804), who is not known to have been interested in Buddhism, is speculative but acceptable. On the other hand, in 781 the Tibetan army had invaded China and conquered Shachou and its adjoining areas, including Tun-huang. The author of the text was living in Tun-huang during the Tibetan occupation. Moreover, the contents of the treatise reveal a remarkable correspondence to the doctrinal issues that became the central concern of an international Buddhist conference held in Tibet, in which eminent Buddhist masters and philosophers of India, Tibet, and China took an active part. This conference, or doctrinal debate, was held at bSam-Yas in Tibet, in 781 A.D. according to Pachow, between 792 and 794 A.D. according to Demiéville and Tucci (Paul Demiéville, *Le Concile de Lhasa*, 1952; Giuseppe Tucci, *Minor Buddhist Texts*, part II, Rome, 1958). In this debate, the issue of the differences between the followers of the "Sud-den Path" propagated by the Ch'an masters headed by Mahāyāna Ho-shang of China, and those of the "Gradual Path" propagated by the Indian Buddhist Ācāryas of the Bodhisattvayāna, headed first by Śāntarakṣita and then by Kamalaśīla, was discussed and decided under the chairmanship of the Tibetan King Khri-srong-lde-tsan. The Chinese party was defeated and the classical Buddhist doctrine of the Bodhisattvayāna, based on the twin principles of wisdom (*prajñā*) and compassion (*karuṇā*), was officially accepted as established. The devoutly Buddhist Khri-srong-lde-tsan, whom D. L. Snellgrove assigns to 740–792 A.D., may then have sent a list of twenty-two questions to the Chinese Buddhist master T'an-K'uang, seeking their clarification, as it were, from a third and impartial authority on Buddhist doctrines and practices. T'an-K'uang's learned answers resulted in the production of *The Twenty-two Dialogues on Mahāyāna Buddhism*. The tradition of dialogue literature in Buddhism is very ancient indeed. The nearest parallel to the work of T'an-K'uang is the *Milindapañha*.

The dialogues were completed between 781 and 787. They are a valuable source of authentic information on points of controversy among Buddhists belonging to different schools of practice and interpretation. The author, in the course of his detailed answers, quotes several sūtras and śāstras including the following: *Vimalakīrtinirdeśa*, *Akṣayamatīnirdeśa*, *Saddharmapūṇḍarīka*, *Laṅkāvatāra*, *Mahāyānaśraddhotpādaśāstra*, *Vijñaptimātratā-siddhi*, and *Mahāyānasamgraha*.

The questions and answers relate to several important Buddhological ideas such as *bhūtatathatā*, Tathāgatagarbha, dharmakāya, saṃsāra, nirvāṇa, and some soteriological and ethical practices associated with śrāvakas, Pratyekabuddhas, and Bodhisattvas. The last and twenty-second question is of historical significance, and concerns the differences between the "original" Dharma taught by the Buddha and the doctrines and practices associated with different sects that emerged in the course of different councils held in India. T'an-Kuang's answer to this question is the longest (pp. 72–85). In his answer, he tells the Tibetan king that the first Buddhist Council was held in the twelfth year after the *mahāparinirvāṇa*, which is not true. He gives interesting details of the origin of controversies concerning "five heretical theses" propounded by the notorious monk, Mahādeva. The author gives some fanciful etymologies of proper names, such as that of the Vātsīputriya, Kaukkuṭika, and Kāśyapīya. On the whole, this is a very interesting and illuminating document, discovered in the ruins of Buddhist monasteries in Tun-huang. Its contents can be profitably studied in the light of the three *Bhavanākramas* of Kamalaśīla, composed soon after the debate of bSam Yas. They also are relevant to a fresh study of the relation between Śrāvakayāna and Bodhisattvayāna. The book can be recommended to both the specialist and the general reader.

L. M. Joshi

Zen & Christian: The Journey Between, by John Dykstra Eusden. New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1981. 184 p. index. \$10.95.

In a continuing succession of books appearing in the field of Buddhist-Christian dialogue, this is one of the more recent. The