

DIETRICH BOSCHUNG, HENNER VON HESBERG und ANDREAS LINFERT (†). **Die antiken Skulpturen in Chatsworth sowie in Dunham Massey und Withington Hall.** Monumenta Artis Romanae, Band 26 = Corpus Signorum Imperii Romani, Great Britain Band 3,8. Verlag Philipp von Zabern, Mainz 1997. 149 Seiten, 15 Abbildungen, 2 Farbtafeln, 123 Tafeln.

The antiquities at Chatsworth differ from those of most stately homes in the United Kingdom because William Spencer Cavendish (1790–1858), 6th Duke of Devonshire (from 1811) travelled widely and collected unusual stone fragments as well as complete or restored sculptures. His greatest purchase abroad (1838) was the bronze head from a cultstatue of Apollo, found two years earlier at Tamassos (modern Politiko, South of Nicosia) on Cyprus, and taken to Smyrna for sale (p. 13, figs. 3,4). The statue's body and limbs came apart when peasants dragged the statue through the dry, rocky riverbed. In 1957, after the then (10th) Duke died (in 1950) chopping wood (with a weak heart) shortly before a trust settlement would have become effective, this early classical masterpiece was conveyed to the British Treasury (for the British Museum) in lieu of death duties. Seven other masterpieces also went the Treasury route. The 11th Duke and his Duchess (the Hon. Deborah Freeman-Mitford, subject of a glorious portrait, oil on canvas, by Pietro Annigoni at Chatsworth) are credited with heroic measures to save, reinhabit, and restore Chatsworth in the face of financial and other obstacles.

Careful copies in bronze of the Apollo had been made and presented to the Cyprus Museum in Nicosia (Fasti Arch. IV [1951] 21, no. 151), to the Ashmolean Museum and the Fitzwilliam Museum. The Chatsworth Trustees kept one for the great house in Derbyshire. There was a story, now over fifty years old, that the original and the copies were mixed up, and, for years, no one knew where the real Tamassos Apollo hung his symbolic curls (see Ann M. Nicgorski, at the San Diego AIA, Dec. 1995: *Minerva* 7,2, 1996, 50–51, fig. 4). Such stories are legendary tributes to the skill of replicators, the Readys, Axtell at the British Museum, and Joseph Harrington at the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. Mr. Harrington made a dozen replicas of the Rhodian owl alabastron (80.599), all indistinguishable from the original. Tamassos, by the way, has been the recent source of lifesized and over Archaic Cypriote limestone statues of sphinxes and lions, in styles influenced by Egypt and the ancient Near East (see E. HERSCHER, *Archaeology in Cyprus*. *Am. Journal Arch.* 102, 1998, 330–332, figs. 20, 21).

The great Victorian-era compiler of the contents of English collections (the British Museum excepted) never visited Chatsworth, did not know the 6th Duke's own 1844/45 Handbook (based on 1838 notes by Richard Westmacott and other, older sources), and relied on Waagen's 1838 travel book on the arts. Thus, Adolf Michaelis knew of the Parthenon metope fragment (head of a Lapith; see below), and became cautiously overstimulated (following Waagen) by the bronze group of two greyhounds, which the learned Duke had noted in his writing was copied from the marble in the Vatican (see "Playing Hounds" in the *Sala degli Animali*: M. BIEBER, *The Sculpture of the Hellenistic Age* [1955] 155, fig. 661).

Adolf Michaelis also knew what many have forgotten in charting taste and the migration of ancient marbles within the British Isles, that the Cavendish family had inherited, through marriage to Lord Burlington's daughter, both Burlington House on Piccadilly in London and Chiswick Villa up the Thames beyond Hammersmith. The three togate statues in the Garden Exedra at Chiswick, including a Menander head on one and an early Septimius Severus on another, were thought to be Lord Burlington's, but they may have been Devonshire acquisitions, in any case not deemed worthy of transport to Derbyshire. The base of the Obelisk across the lake includes a much-restored East Greek grave stele of a *palliat* and a woman in *pudicitia* pose, not worth moving. They all smack of preCavendish taste (see *Archaeology* 8, 1955, 10–17). Unlike Chatsworth (pp. 58–61), Chiswick is not programmed in H. OEHLER, *Foto und Skulptur. Römische Antike in englischen Schlössern* (1980), but it could be part of an "around London and beyond" red volume with, say, Syon House, Osterley Park, what was once in Holland House, and several other candidates farther afield, such as Stratfield Saye. There are also ancient marbles in several London museums (other than the British Museum), at University College and,

of course, Sir John Soane's Museum. Soane, an older contemporary of the 6th Duke, bought at some of the same London auctions and had a similar taste for fragments from Rome. The long overdue catalogues of Soane's antiquities, including the Duke of Buckingham's gems, are being readied for publication. Chatsworth also boasted an exceptional collection of cameo and intaglio gems.

Aside from the fascinating marble and terracotta fragments walled into the West Lodge ("Museum") at Chatsworth and Carlos A. Picon's marble "Big Foot" in the Chapel Corridor (The Treasure Houses of Britain. National Gallery of Art, Washington [1985] 309, no. 234), an awesome female colossus with a mate, the matching right foot, in the Pergamon Museum, Berlin, from Egypt (no. 42), the most unusual statues (for Derbyshire, if not for any country house, anywhere) are the two seated Sekhmets from the Temple of Mut at Karnak (nos. 162, 163). On my first visit to Chatsworth, nearly half a century ago, these two lioness-headed, divine Egyptian ladies were on a slope above the tennis courts. Sensing the humor of the location, my mother (whose First World War experiences in France gave her access to Ducal circles) and I asked the Duke's Librarian, Mr. Francis Thompson, if we could play a set. As we swatted the ball back and forth over the net, the Sekhmets looked down on us, like line judges at Wimbledon. Sekhmets have been in high fashion ever since Yoko Ono sold John Lennon's pet at Sotheby's, New York (and Sekhmet came from Ireland too, to suburban Detroit: Sotheby's, New York, Nov. 24, 1987, cover and lot 43, Clandeboye, County Down, The First Marquess of Dufferin and Ava; then to the Cranbrook Academy of Art; the other[s]: Sotheby's, New York, March 1, 1984, lot 145 and May 30, 1986, no. 63). Jerome M. Eisenberg tells me that the Sekhmet I saw in his New York Gallery many years ago is now in a smaller American Museum.

Without the Sekhmets in view, Chatsworth flashes across the television screen as Mr. Darcy's Derbyshire pad, "Pemberley", in one of the makings of *Pride and Prejudice*. Elizabeth Bennet travelled about Derbyshire in the company of her aunt and uncle, Mr. and Mrs. Gardiner, and an impromptu tour of Pemberley with a housekeeper led eventually to Elizabeth's discovery by the returning Mr. Darcy at the avenue from the lake just below the gardens.

The huge, enriched architectural elements taken from the theatre at Melos (nos. 117 a–d) and the column-drums from the colonnade of the Temple of Poseidon at Sounion (no. 121) (the top drum supporting a bust of the collector Duke, out near the Sekhmets) are evidences of how the Royal Navy cruised the Aegean and Mediterranean coasts of the fading Ottoman empire in search of antiquities, large and small, Melos and Sounion having been visited by the Duke's half-brother Admiral Sir Augustus Clifford and his fleet, notably his flagship HMS *Euryalos* (so named in the Homeric tradition). Mr. Thomas Wragg, the Curator, helped me complete notes on and photographs of these and many other architectural and sculptural fragments in July 1954. The fragments are superbly catalogued and illustrated in the volume under review here. Many came ultimately from the sculptor Antonio Canova, who adorned the exterior of his Studio in Rome with similar marbles, but not with the Neo-Babylonian fragments which found their ways to Chatsworth (nos. 168–170). Another Roman locale serving as a somewhat-decayed paradise for walled-up fragments, sarcophagi, altars, bases, portraits, ideal figures, and architecture, is "Der östliche Gartenbereich" of the Villa Torlonia-Albani (Forschungen zur Villa Albani. Katalog der antiken Bildwerke 5 [1998] nos. 767–815, pls. 134–144, and much more, cf. p. 590 ff.).

The richly-carved architectural elements from the Theatre at Melos are dated between 150 and 175, and they are related by Henner von Hesberg to enrichment at Ephesos, Miletos, Limyra, and, naturally, Aspendos. The 6th Duke was very careful to note that the Sounion column-drums were not "robbed" from "the shrine", but they had been rolled down onto the beach where they were soon to be covered by sea and sand. Clearly this was a rescue operation, like Lord Elgin's agents at the lime-kilns on the Athenian acropolis. The Roman Theatre at Melos, on the valley slopes below the walls, near where the Venus was found, was excavated in 1917 or later and has been "somewhat restored" (Blue Guide, Greece [1981] 625; G. BERMOND MONTANARI in: The Princeton Encyclopedia of Classical Sites (1976) 570–571: "now in a poor state of preservation"; we can see why!).

In 1823 to 1827, when Admiral Augustus cruised, it would have been hard to remove anything from the Temple of Poseidon at Sounion itself. The classic Doric building had been measured by Revett in 1765 and by the Dilettanti Society in 1812, not to mention further immortalized by the poetic doggeral and graffito activities of the sainted George Gordon (Lord Byron), who criticised Lord Elgin in verse for his activities around the Parthenon of Athens. Admiral Augustus also did a bit of acquiring in Athens (a portrait [no. 53, a young Claudian lady, mercifully untouched by restorers], grave and votive stelai [e. g. no. 67]) and, perhaps, oddest of all, a statue-base of Julia Domna, dated 195 to 198, at Eleusis, where Charles R. Cockerell had recorded it a decade earlier (no. 133). To his great credit, three years before his death, the 6th Duke gave the British Museum the Lapith head (fitting on the body) from South Metope XVI of the Parthenon (p. 14, fig. 5).

Turning from these and other naval triumphs in the Mediterranean and Aegean, there are the more traditional "ancient marbles" in the Sculpture Gallery and the halls of the house itself. One of these, a

Plautilla-like Severan woman brought from Devonshire House on Piccadilly in London (no. 154), is a lesson to us all that very excellent copies of ancient portraits were made before and after 1800, not just the atrocious Nero Uffizis, the Vitellius Grimanis (no. 159), or a Canovesque Caracalla (no. 160). There are two ancient portraits of Faustina the Elder, one extensively restored (no. 56) and the second type, a head with a new tip of the nose on a modern bust (no. 57). Another replica of this, second Faustina the Elder has recently appeared on the provenance-conscious North American scene, at the Mount Holyoke College Art Museum (Museums Boston 2,1 [1998] 41, 2 illus.). This portrait, like Chatsworth's Severan bust of a woman, should not cause the museum Maoists in Boston, New York, and London concern, since those large eyes never gazed out on Antiquity. What hype at Holyoke, as Bryn Mawr's Katherine Hepburn might have said! "As one of antiquity's most beloved and stylish 'first ladies', Faustina was the Jackie Kennedy of her day." The first three years of Antoninus Pius (Faustina died in 141) were no Camelot. The plump, dowdy matron was more like Bess Truman, Barbara Bush, or, backwards to the young Republic, even Martha Washington. Can you imagine Faustina the Elder in a memoir like HUGH AUCHINCLOSS III '46, "Growing up with Jackie" (Groton School Quart. 60,2, 1998, 8-20)?

Surely the lowest point in creativity from Neo-Classical Italy is the early Hadrianic bust of a woman, onto which has been set a "modern" head copied after the elder son of the old Trojan priest Laocoon (no. 61). Dietrich Boschung had the delightful assignment of applying his iconographic studies of the Emperor Augustus to a modern Primaporta-like head and upper half of the neck set on a military bust, *paludamentum* over cuirass, dated 170, in the reign of Marcus Aurelius (no. 60).

One of the great pleasures of post-antique Chatsworth is the collection of marble statues by Francesco Bienaime which populate the green spaces and the well-manicured pathways. As copies of all the best chestnuts from the Belvedere (Apollo) through Florence (the Boar, that prototype of the loveable "Porcellino") to the Louvre ("Germanicus") and Versailles (Artemis) and on to the British Museum (Dadophorus, restored as Paris), they are very good in every detail. Indeed, knock off a head or two, roll a torso in the weeds, apply some rootmarks (baked Wagon-Lits towels, linen with high fiber content), and pieces of these sculptures could turn up at the auction houses as genuine creations of Antiquity. It happens all the time.

The ancient Chatsworth marbles can be divided conditionwise into two groups, the restored and the unrestored. A third-rate Scottish sculptor, Thomas Campbell, who executed the bust of the 6th Duke atop the column-drums from Sounion, did his worst for some of the Duke's best acquisitions in the realm of ancient sculptures. Thus the splendid Tiberian head of a man with a heavy wreath, acquired in Smyrna along with the bronze head of Apollo, received a ghastly new nose and a bust (no. 48). The head of Domitian in his last years (90 to 96) lost its manifest, pristine quality to heavy restoration about the head, a new neck, and a cuirassed bust of Severan type (no. 49). Contrast this butchery with the shimmering, mint bust of Domitian in the Toledo (Ohio) Museum of Art (1990.30), where a rare form of late Flavian high polish is very evident (see Minerva 2,4, 1991, 35, illus.; The Toledo Museum of Art 1989-90 Annual Report (1990) cover, colour illus.; Toledo treasures (1995) colour illus.; references I owe to Dr. Sandra Knudsen, Curator). The rich head of Antinous (no. 50) was so badly massacred, in marble and plaster, that modern critics have fought over its total authenticity.

Thank heaven (and the 6th Duke's wisdom) Thomas Campbell kept his paws off the Chatsworth Hadrianic Relief, in the centre of the West Corridor (no. 76), a Roman historical masterpiece bought, believe it or not, at auction of an obscure collection in London and brought to the world's attention because S. Arthur Strong (husband of Eugenie Sellers Strong) was the Ducal Librarian at the end of the Victorian Era. She included the relief in all her general books on Roman art and sculpture in particular. Its message about burning tax records is very strong today, Nerva, Trajan, and Hadrian having been leaders in debt reduction and the removal of punitive taxation. The scene in very abbreviated form on a sestertius of Hadrian, struck 119 to 121, showing a Licitor lighting the tax debts, is proof positive that the Chatsworth Relief must have had a companion panel, featuring the actual burning. 900 million sestertii of public debt was relinquished in the elaborate ceremony held in the Forum of Trajan, partly because of public outcry over the execution of four high-ranking Senators for alleged conspiracy while Hadrian was off in Moesia subduing Sarmatians and Roxolani (see "Historical Hadrian Sestectius", Classical Numismatic Group, Inc., Auction 43, Lancaster, Pennsylvania, and London, England, September 24, 1997, p.207, no.1970). Those who use the two surviving heads to suggest a date for this monument well into the reign of Hadrian confirm that there could be a lapse of time between events and carvings, as was the case with the Ara Pacis Augustae or the Column of Marcus Aurelius.

On the other hand, the torso, neck and start of the head of an early imperial Minerva (no. 13) in strong Pergamene motion (descended from the Athena in the West Pediment of the Parthenon) deserves to be the first statue illustrated in the present volume, a full page of unrestored splendor. In 1997-1998 visual descriptions of the type of marble are no longer enough in such precise catalogues as the red-covered German-British-American series on British collections. Many questions could be settled with

scientific samplings, and now, thanks to the traffic in international marble congresses (see below), there are a number of scientists able and willing to perform such tasks.

This masterful book concludes with two small statues of barbarians in various marbles, Dokimian and North African (Tunisia) (nos. 171, 172) and a head of Hadrian (no. 173) at Dunham Massey, Altrincham, Cheshire. Finally, there is a strigilar sarcophagus with a man and a woman at the corners and the Three Graces in the center (no. 174) at Withington Hall, Macclesfield, Cheshire. This last entry was written by Andreas Linfert, who died suddenly while the book was being printed and is regretted by all students of classical sculpture. We worked together on the Hera (of Polykleitos) at Argos.

The two "Dacians" are classed as totally modern (before 1769), but I feel that the bodies, bereft of the white marble additions, could well be ancient. They must be set alongside the certainly-ancient draped bodies of "barbarians" in unusual blocks of Dokimian stones, as the example on extended loan from the Estate of Sir Northwald Nuffler, Bt., to the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston (see *Minerva* 6,2, 1995, 18–19, fig. 4). This last "barbarian" was much admired by the participants in the Fifth International Conference, ASMOSIA, Museum of Fine Arts Boston, June 11–15, 1998. (See ASMOSIA 1998, Abstracts, especially HEIKE GREGAREK, *Ideal Sculpture of Colored Marble*.) Another such "Dacian" is on or above one of the grand staircases in the Reggio Calabria Museum, guarding the Riace Bronzes. They all miniaturise, in various forms, the colossal "Dacian" in giallo antico with extremities in bigio morato, from the Villa Mattei (see SILVIA ALLEGRA DAYAN in: *Museo Nazionale Romano. Le sculture I 1* [1979] 129 no. 93).

Cambridge, Massachusetts

Cornelius C. Vermeule III