

## **Art in the Double Periphery**

### **Commissions ordered by the Bishops Johannes Hinderbach and Ulrich von Liechtenstein in Early Modern Trento**

by

HANNES OBERMAIR, Bozen-Bolzano, and MICHAELA SCHEDL, Kronberg

During the early modern period, Trentino was a borderland situated between northern Europe and Italy, with all of its socio-political and cultural contingencies. Nowhere was this more relevant than in Trento, the regional capital and bishopric, where the co-existence of German and Italian communities created fertile ground for artistic exchange with particular political exigency. Our article aims to shed light on this region as a contact zone with a variety of different features that contributes to its peripheral status in academic studies of Renaissance centres. It begins with an overview of the historical and demographic composition of Trento and this provides the groundwork for an examination of two panel paintings commissioned by fifteenth/sixteenth-century bishops that will help us to determine the circumstances of regional art production, and what that collision or mixing of artistic practices might mean for our understanding of exchange dynamics in the unexpected quarter of a small Renaissance centre, there by the virtue of historical circumstance.

In his widely acclaimed and seminal book titled “The Italian Renaissance”, Peter Burke discusses three new directions of research that in the recent decades have reshaped our notion of the Renaissance.<sup>1</sup> He calls them the

---

\* We would like to thank Joanne W. Anderson, lecturer at the Warburg Institute in London, who has given us the opportunity to talk about these issues at the 61<sup>st</sup> Annual Meeting of the Renaissance Society of America (RSA), held in Berlin on 27 March 2015. We also very much appreciate the comments of Dr Luca Gabrielli, Trento, on our paper which contributed to the final text presented here. We are also grateful to Dr Domizio Cattoi, curator at the Museo Diocesano di Trento, for his cooperation and assistance as well as to Sarah Althaus, Frankfurt am Main, for her linguistic advice.

feminine, the domestic or private, and the global turns. But we could also add the ‘regional turn’ as our observations on Trento will show. Many books and essays have been published on Trento as a bishop’s seat.<sup>2</sup> Yet, comparatively little is known about the important role of bishops and urban elites in developing a vivid centre of civic, ecclesiastical and courtly life amidst the Alps around 1500. Many documents survive in the archives however they are only partially available through the work of local historians who – historically-speaking – have preferred to focus on the high to late medieval period.

Pre-modern Trento was a relatively small town with the prince-bishop residing in the impressive Castle of Buonconsiglio, thus providing the city with its peculiar urban status; it corresponds to Max Weber’s typology of a “Fürstenstadt” (‘prince’s city’) or “Residenzstadt” (‘residential city’), which successfully merged residential, economic and social features, as explained by Werner Paravicini.<sup>3</sup> It seems that during the whole medieval and premodern period the town’s economy depended heavily on the opportunities created by the presence of a resident bishop who operated as a strong, but sometimes also weak, political leader of the Trentino region; a figure who could guarantee prosperity and opportunity for the civic society. Trento’s fortune was thus intimately related to the bishopric with all its ups and downs.

The particular architectural setting of the town, characterized by a grid system of streets and squares, betrays its Roman foundation and heritage.<sup>4</sup> The *civitas* (‘city’), after a long period of decline, was resuscitated as a cathedral city by the bishops from the late twelfth century onwards who aimed at creating a regional district of power and trade on account of their vicinity to the Salian and Staufer emperors.<sup>5</sup> The river Adige was the lifeline of the civic economy, representing a sort of premodern motorway connecting the area with the very wealthy upper Italian regions of the Po valley and also with the northern regions beyond the Alps. Documents attest to merchants using the

---

<sup>1</sup> PETER BURKE, *The Italian Renaissance. Culture and Society in Italy*, 2014, pp. 9–14.

<sup>2</sup> Amongst others, see particularly MARCO BELLABARBA, *La giustizia ai confini. Il principato vescovile di Trento agli inizi dell’età moderna* (Annali dell’Istituto italo-germanico, Monografie 28), 1996.

<sup>3</sup> MAX WEBER, *Gesamtausgabe 1: Schriften und Reden 22: Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft 5: Die Stadt*, ed. by WILFRIED NIPPEL, 1999, pp. 61–64; *Das Gehäuse der Macht. Der Raum der Herrschaft im interkulturellen Vergleich: Antike, Mittelalter, Frühe Neuzeit*, ed. by WERNER PARAVICINI (Mitteilungen der Residenzen-Kommission. Sonderheft 7), 2005.

<sup>4</sup> On Roman Trento see, GIANNI CIURLETTI, *Trento romana. Archeologia e urbanistica*, in: *Storia del Trentino*, ed. by EZIO BUCHI and others, 6 vols., 2000–2005), here 2, ed. by EZIO BUCHI, 2000, pp. 287–346, here pp. 292–297.

<sup>5</sup> EMANUELE CURZEL, *Trento (Il Medioevo nelle città italiane 5)*, 2013.

river as a major transportation artery since at least the thirteenth century in a well-organized and rather systematic way.<sup>6</sup> Historically, the Tyrol-Trentino region with its three urban centres Bozen (Bolzano), Innsbruck and Trento conjoined the Austrian and the Italian territory alongside the Brenner route leading from Italy to Germany.<sup>7</sup> Thus geographically it constitutes a double border or frontier zone.

Trento's status as a small town with a similar-sized population is easily demonstrated by taking a look at its demographical development. At around 1300 Trento is reckoned to have had around 3000 inhabitants.<sup>8</sup> These figures only increased slightly in the following centuries. Although we have only very rough data, it can be assumed that the townspeople's number reached between 4000 and 5000 immediately before the plagues of 1348 and 1374, and, after shrinking during the fourteenth and early fifteenth century, recovered only at the beginning of the sixteenth century, amounting to c. 5000 to 6000 at around 1550.<sup>9</sup> These are rather small numbers when compared to those of the greater centres on the northern and southern edge of the Alps, that is Munich and Verona, the latter for instance comprising of about 40,000 citizens at the end of the fifteenth century. So, how could, Trento, a small town paradoxically become such a significant centre for Humanism and Renaissance in the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries?

One example suffices. The rise of European music in the late Middle Ages and the early Renaissance period strongly depends on the so-called Trento Codices, seven well-studied manuscripts of polyphonic liturgical compositions dating from 1440 to the early 1450s.<sup>10</sup> This enormous music collection with its approximately 1700 pieces illustrates rather impressively the cultural boom of Trento during that period. It equally remarks upon the capacity of the whole region as a site of exchange, as the musical patterns registered in the codices

<sup>6</sup> See TOMMASO FANFANI, *L'Adige come arteria principale del traffic tra nord Europa ed emporio realtino*, in: *Una città e il suo fiume. Verona e l'Adige 2*, ed. by GIORGIO BORELLI, 1977) pp. 569-629.

<sup>7</sup> For a general overview cf. *Alpenübergänge vor 1850. Landkarten, Straßen, Verkehr. Symposium am 14. und 15. Februar 1986 in München*, ed. by UTA LINDGREN (*Vierteljahrsschrift für Sozial- und Wirtschaftsgeschichte. Beiheft 83*), 1987.

<sup>8</sup> HANNES OBERMAIR, *Bastard Urbanism? Past forms of cities in the alpine area of Tyrol-Trentino*, in: *Concilium medii aevi 10* (2007), pp. 53–76 (<https://cma.gbv.de/dr,cma,010,2007,a,03.pdf> [1.10.2018]), p. 67.

<sup>9</sup> GIAN MARIA VARANINI, *L'economia. Aspetti e problemi (XIII–XV secolo)*, in: *Storia del Trentino 3*, ed. by ANDREA CASTAGNETTI and GIAN MARIA VARANINI, 2000, pp. 461–515, here pp. 470f.

<sup>10</sup> REINHARD STROHM, *The Rise of European Music, 1380–1500*, 2005, pp. 507–511.

belong mainly to Austria and southern Germany. There could be mainly two reasons for this cultural heyday. Firstly, we might look to the interaction between civic and courtly population in which the residential town of a prince-bishop played an essential role. In this respect Trento does not differ greatly from other episcopal cities as Basle, Constance, Strasbourg or Augsburg and more research on civic lobbies and their interaction with the art market and other cultural activities is required for all these minor urban centres. It begs an important question: what do we know about ecclesiastical as well as civic patrons, the court's personnel, the workshops of artists and also the network of mighty guilds of trade and craftsmanship? The demographic profile of Trento shows the presence of a roughly 5–10 per cent German-speaking population, especially craftsmen, miners and merchants. For the most part they settled around the church of Saint Peter and Paul in the eastern reaches of the town near the bishops' castle of Buonconsiglio and established the so-called *Hauerbruderschaft* ('hewers' guild) as an ethnic congregation.<sup>11</sup> They certainly contributed to important cross-cultural experiences, enlivening the social and cultural environment of this small alpine town.

The second factor for the cultural heyday is the central authority of the Habsburg rulers and a rapid increase in the number of German speaking canons in the chapter of the cathedral starting from the late fifteenth century.<sup>12</sup> The chapter naturally elected the bishop. Thus bishops generally came from the Tyrolean, Austrian or southern German regions making Trento dependent on the Habsburg dynasty. To reinforce this dependency, in 1474 King Frederic III obtained a papal license to establish a majority of two-thirds of German speaking canons with the regulation confirmed in 1532. Thus, the bishops of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, namely Johannes Hinderbach, Ulrich von Friendsberg, Ulrich von Liechtenstein and Georg Neideck, were all candidates of the Habsburg. Their number also includes Bernhard von Cles (1514–1539) who contributed much to the organisation of the Council of Trent and brought many Italian Renaissance artists to Trento, such as Dosso Dossi and Romanino. Finally, in 1508 during the period of Bishop Neideck and without the assistance of the pope, King Maximilian I became elected Roman emperor of the Holy Roman Empire in Trento, reminding us once

---

<sup>11</sup> SERENA LUZZI, *Stranieri in città. Presenza tedesca e società urbana a Trento (secoli XV–XVIII)* (Annali dell'Istituto storico italo-germanico. Monografia 38), 2003.

<sup>12</sup> EMANUELE CURZEL, *I vescovi di Trento nel basso medioevo: profili personali, scelte di governo temporale e spirituale*, in: *Storia del Trentino* 3 (like note 9), pp. 579–610, here pp. 598–606.

again of the town's status in the early modern period as a place for politically-charged encounters between northern and southern people and their attendant cultures.

Art historians in Tyrol and the Trentino are familiar with the role of Bozen as southern outpost of the German speaking culture and Trento as northern outpost of the Italian speaking population. An exchange of northern and southern art is therefore a natural consequence of this important contact zone. Ezio Chini describes early modern painting in Trento to be the result of "the condition of 'double periphery' of a border zone" and presents its artistic production as "extremely varied and surprising in many aspects".<sup>13</sup> In the following we will expand upon this idea of the double periphery by examining two works of art commissioned by bishops of the diocese of Trento: the German Johannes Hinderbach and the Tyrolean Ulrich von Liechtenstein. These panel paintings are well studied by Italian researchers but are surprisingly neglected by experts of northern alpine art for whom Trento might be a rather unexpected location for artistic exchange, by virtue of its 'southern' location.

### **Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein and his Epitaph with Calvary**

The tombs of the bishops of Trento were located in the city's cathedral dedicated to Saint Vigilius.<sup>14</sup> Bishop Ulrich's tomb can still be found in its original location in the southern transept. The ancestral seat of the family von Liechtenstein was Castle Liechtenstein in Leifers near Bozen, South Tyrol, about 45 kilometres north east of Trento. Ulrich von Liechtenstein was bishop from 1493 until his death in 1505. The tomb's slab stone, slightly inclined towards the beholder, contains architectural elements from the late Gothic period (fig. 1). The bishop's head is placed on a pillow carved in red stone

---

<sup>13</sup> In Italian, "la condizione di 'doppia periferia' di una regione di frontiera" and "produzione artistica singolarmente varia e per molti aspetti sorprendente," see EZIO CHINI, *La pittura dal Rinascimento al Settecento*, in: *Storia del Trentino 4*, ed. by MARCO BELLABARBA and GIUSEPPE OLM, 2002, pp. 727–842, here p. 727. Issues of centre-periphery are discussed below, but here it is worth noting that the process of being twice marginal to the centre, that of double peripheralization originates with the world system theory of IMMANUEL WALLERSTEIN, *Semi-Peripheral Countries and the Contemporary World Crisis*, in: *Theory and Society* 3/4 (1976), pp. 461–483. The semi-periphery can be an agent for change.

<sup>14</sup> For further information on the cathedral cf. *Il Duomo di Trento*, ed. by ENRICO CASTELNUOVO and others, 2 vols., 1992–1993.



Fig. 1: Sarcophagus and epitaph of Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein (before 1960). Trento, Cathedral San Vigilio. Photo in: *Il Duomo di Trento 2* (like note 14), p. 107.

above which an ogee-arched baldachin is placed. He wears the episcopal vestments and holds a book in his right hand, the bishop's crozier in his left. He is framed by two thin columns with two small sculpted saints, the cathedral's patron Saint Vigilius and the bishop's namesake Saint Ulrich. At the bottom of the left column the coat of arms of the bishops of Trento is seen, on the other side the one of Bishop Ulrich. By contrast the sarcophagus, placed on two supports of sculpted lions, is decorated with geometrical elements typical for the Renaissance period. The inscription on the sarcophagus' right side, turned towards the main nave, states that Ulrich commissioned the tomb in his lifetime. Written in antique Capitalis it says:

VDALRICVS · DE · LIECHTENSTEIN | INCLITVS · TRIDENTI · PRINCEPS |  
AC · PASTOR · OPTIMVS · HANC | SIBI · VIVENS PARAVIT · SEDEM · | IN ·  
QVA · SPIRITVS · DVM · | SVPERNA · PETIT · MOLLITER | OSSA ·  
QVIESCANT<sup>15</sup>

Until the 1960s, a wooden epitaph was fixed above the tomb and is now held in the nearby Museo Diocesano of Trento (fig. 2).<sup>16</sup> The epitaph is divided into three scenes, the lower one showing two angels holding a scroll, informing us that both the epitaph and the tomb were commissioned by the bishop in 1504, a year before his death.<sup>17</sup> It states:

<sup>15</sup> Ulrich von Liechtenstein, glorious Prince[-Bishop] of Trento and perfect pastor, has prepared this resting place during his lifetime, so that his mortal remains may gently rest [here] as long as his soul is striving upwards [= towards heaven]. For further information on the tomb cf. M. Lupo, no. 11, in: *Il Duomo di Trento 2* (like note 14), pp. 107–109. – Note to 'paravit': The second 'A' is thinner than the other characters and was added later in order to correct a mistake.

<sup>16</sup> Cf. EZIO CHINI, no. 5, in: *Il Duomo di Trento 2* (like note 14), pp. 160–162, here p. 160.

<sup>17</sup> Inv. 4005. Predella: 85 x 252 cm, central panel: 186 x 252 cm, top: 252 x 81 cm. Cf. EZIO CHINI, 3.3 Maestro dell'Epitaffio di Udalrico IV di Lichtenstein, in: *Arte e Persuasione. La strategia delle immagini dopo il concilio di Trento*, ed. by DOMIZIO CATTOI and DOMENICA PRIMERANO, 2014, pp. 166–168, here p. 166. Cf. also GIUSEPPE SAVA, 148. Maestro dell'Epitaffio di Udalrico di Liechtenstein, in: *Rinascimento e passione per l'antico. Andrea Riccio e il suo tempo*, catalogo della mostra, ed. by ANDREA BACCHI and LUCIANA GIACOMELLI, 2008, p. 576 with bibliography.



Fig. 2: Master of the Epitaph of Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein, *Epitaph of Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein*, 1504. Trento, Museo Diocesano Tridentino. Photo: Archivio fotografico del Museo Diocesano Tridentino.

HANC · FIERI · IVSSIT · PRESVL · PINGIQ(VE) · TABELLAM | VLDRICVS · STATVE(N)S · MVNERA · CHRISTE · TIBI | ET · PONI · TVMVLVM · VIVE(N)S · VBI · MEMBRA · Q(VI)ESCA(N)T | SPIRITVS · AD · SVPEROS · TENDERE · DVM · CELERAT | · VI · K(A)LL(ENDIS) · APRILIS · 1504<sup>18</sup>

The upper part depicts God the Father with his right hand raised in blessing. He is flanked by two angels carrying the Instruments of the Passion. Calvary is shown on the large rectangular panel. Christ on the cross is placed in the centre with Mary Magdalene below and the two other condemned men on either side of Him. Two groups of people are gathered on either side of the cross. Bishop Ulrich is kneeling in the left hand corner in front of his coat of arms and is being protected by a female saint with a crown on her head but no other attribute. She might be Saint Catherine who is amongst others patron of theologians. Standing opposite the female saint on the right hand side we can see Saint Ulrich, the bishop's patron, with his attribute, a fish.

The epitaph was first mentioned by Michel'Angelo Mariani in 1673 in his description of the tombs of the cathedral as "a painting of the Passion of Christ".<sup>19</sup> An initial attribution was made as early as in 1780 by Francesco Bartoli in a manuscript on paintings, sculpture and architecture in Trento. Bartoli maintained the panel was painted in the style of Albrecht Dürer.<sup>20</sup> We have to keep in mind that at that time and until the early decades of the twentieth century the attribution to Dürer was in a certain sense a collective name for works of art created in southern Germany. Detailed research on single artists and the artistic production in various towns started only later, giving us some insight into how the Alps were situated in the broader art history and its turn to regionalism. This attribution which was kept up – with little variation, i.e. *di scuola tedesca di Alberto Durer* ('German school of Albrecht Dürer'), *artista educato all'arte tedesca* ('artist trained in German art') – in the follow-

<sup>18</sup> Bishop Ulrich ordered to make and to paint this panel – presenting herewith you, oh Christ, the [sacrificial?] offerings – and to erect the [his] tumulus so that the parts of his body may rest as long as his soul is striving upwards [towards heaven]. 6. Kal. April 1504 [= 27 march 1504].

<sup>19</sup> See MICHEL'ANGELO MARIANI, Trento con il Sacro Concilio, et altri notabili. Aggiunte varie Cose Miscellanee Universali. Descrittione' Historica, libri tre. Con un ristretto del Trentin Vescovato. L'indice delle Cose notabili, et le Figure in Rame Trento, 1673, ed. by ELENA S. TESSADRI, 1970, p. 38.

<sup>20</sup> FRANCESCO BARTOLI, Le pitture, sculture ed architetture della Città di Trento, e di pochi altri luoghi del suo Principato 1780, Trento, Biblioteca Comunale, ms. 1207, in: GIULIO BENEDETTO EMERT, Fonti manoscritte inedite per la storia dell'arte nel Trentino (Raccolta di fonti per la storia dell'arte 3), 1939, pp. 53–117, here p. 71.

ing decades.<sup>21</sup> This connection can well be understood if, for example, the horse on the epitaph is compared with Dürer's print *The Small Horse*, dated 1505.<sup>22</sup> Also the epitaph's high quality was recognised from the beginning which was astonishingly contested in 1924 by Gino Fogolari, inspector of the *Gallerie di Venezia* since 1905. He described the painter as *meschino* ('primitive') and put forward that it had been wrongly attributed to Dürer – which had never been claimed.<sup>23</sup> Earlier researchers had only suggested that the epitaph reminded of Dürer's style.

In 1952, Nicolò Rasmò, conservationist for monuments in Trento as well as Director of the Civic Museum in Bozen, made a first detailed analysis of the painting and offered a new attribution.<sup>24</sup> He highlighted elements found in Italian art and put forward that the painter of the epitaph might be Giacomo da Vicenza to whom no panel can be attributed with certainty.<sup>25</sup> We only know that Bishop Ulrich received this painter in Trento in 1502 and that he entrusted him with a garden belonging to the chapter of the cathedral in 1502 and 1504. He died about 1519.<sup>26</sup> Rasmò made various comparisons with works of art created in Vicenza, about 70 kilometres southeast of Trento, and in particular with panels by the famous painter, Bartolomeo Montagna. If we compare the Trento epitaph with a painting with the *Madonna with Child and Saint Onuphrius and Saint John the Baptist*, to be dated c. 1483/84, we can see that the face of Saint Catherine in Trento is of a similar style to the face of the Virgin by Bartolomeo Montagna. However, if we compare the landscape and the other two saints in the Vicenza panel with those in Trento, we can see that the latter is far more influenced by the late Gothic art of the North as will

<sup>21</sup> BENEDETTO GIOVANELLI, *Dipinti ragguardevoli in Trento veduti nell'anno 1833*, in: EMERT, *Fonti manoscritte* (like note 20), pp. 133–141, here p. 140; GIUSEPPE GEROLA, *Iconografia dei Vescovi di Trento fino a Bernardo Cles*, in: *Atti della Società Italiana per il Progresso delle Scienze* 19 (1931), pp. 851–872, here p. 872 no. 44 bis.

<sup>22</sup> For this print cf. The British Museum, Collection online, [http://www.britishmuseum.org/research/collection\\_online/search.aspx](http://www.britishmuseum.org/research/collection_online/search.aspx), reg. number: E,4.123 (access: 03/09/2016).

<sup>23</sup> GINO FOGOLARI, *Trento* (Collezione di monografie illustrate 1: Italia artistica 80), ca. <sup>2</sup>1930, p. 153; on Fogolari cf. GIAN MARIA VARANINI, Gino Fogolari, in: *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, ed. by ALBERTO M. GHISALBERTI and others, 84 vols., 1960–2015, here 48 (1997), pp. 500–503, here p. 501.

<sup>24</sup> NICOLÒ RASMO, *Note in margine all'esposizione commemorativa del Concilio di Trento*, in: *Cultura Atesina* 6 (1952), pp. 145–153, here pp. 148–150.

<sup>25</sup> First published by Monsignor SIMONE WEBER, *Artisti Trentini e artisti che operarono nel Trentino*, ed. by NICOLÒ RASMO, <sup>2</sup>1977, p. 170.

<sup>26</sup> NICOLÒ RASMO, *Storia dell'arte nel Trentino*, 1982, p. 210.

be suggested later on.<sup>27</sup> As stated in following publications, for Rasmus it became beyond all doubt that Giacomo da Vicenza painted the bishop's epitaph.<sup>28</sup>

With new research on the cathedral published in two volumes in 1993, the epitaph of Bishop Ulrich was also re-evaluated. Ezio Chini rightly put forward that there were no solid reasons to identify the epitaph's painter with Giacomo da Vicenza. Since the painter's name was unknown, Chini created a provisional name calling him the Master of the Epitaph of Bishop Liechtenstein.<sup>29</sup> He also highlighted the northern alpine character of the epitaph and compared it with a print of the Master I. A. M. of Zwolle, who was active in the southern Netherlands.<sup>30</sup> Although, the painter of the epitaph is not known to have been familiar with this print, we can see that the panel has various elements in common, for example the presentation of the three crosses and the fact that Mary has fainted. In addition, the results of the epitaph's restoration in 2013 indicate that it was most probably executed by an artist of the German-speaking regions north of Trento. The technique of how the ten horizontal planks of spruce of the main panel were prepared for painting, in addition to the use of hatching for the preparatory drawing are typical for these regions.<sup>31</sup> Luca Gabrielli claims that it might be a local painter oriented towards the 'open channels versus Italy and the North' or someone coming from the North.<sup>32</sup>

Up to now no other works of art can be attributed to this painter. As pointed out by Bernd Konrad, the painter might have been active in the circle of Hans Burgkmair the Elder (1473–1531), active in Augsburg.<sup>33</sup> Konrad refers to the eyes of some persons which seem to be swollen from crying. This can be seen

<sup>27</sup> Vicenza, Pinacoteca di palazzo Chiericati. Cf. LIONELLO PUPPI, Bartolomeo Montagna, 1962), p. 137, No. 2 with illustration, online: [https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Bartolomeo\\_Montagna\\_-\\_Madonna\\_and\\_Child\\_under\\_a\\_Pergola\\_with\\_St\\_John\\_the\\_Baptist\\_and\\_St\\_Onofrius\\_-\\_WGA16152.jpg](https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Bartolomeo_Montagna_-_Madonna_and_Child_under_a_Pergola_with_St_John_the_Baptist_and_St_Onofrius_-_WGA16152.jpg) (access: 03/17/2016).

<sup>28</sup> Cf. NICOLÒ RASMO, Gli aspetti artistici, in: Trentino. Alto Adige, ed. by SANDRO GATTEI and others, 1979, pp. 347–468, here p. 367. Rasmus repeated this attribution in publications that followed.

<sup>29</sup> EZIO CHINI, I dipinti del Cinquecento per il Duomo di Trento, in: Il Duomo di Trento 2 (like note 14), pp. 153–159, here p. 154 and pp. 160–162, no. 5.

<sup>30</sup> Cf. the illustration in Il Duomo di Trento 2 (like note 14), p. 160.

<sup>31</sup> Cf. EZIO CHINI, 3.3 Maestro dell'Epitaffio di Udalrico IV di Lichtenstein (like note 17), pp. 166–168.

<sup>32</sup> E-mail of Dr Luca Gabrielli dated 11/04/2015. Original Italian, "canali aperti verso l'Italia e il Nord".

<sup>33</sup> Stated by Dr Bernd Konrad in an e-mail dated 03/13/2015.

for example in the face of the bowman in the left corner of the left painting *Basilika Santa Croce in Gerusalemme*, executed by Hans Burgkmair the Elder in 1504 and that of Saint John Evangelist in the Trento epitaph (fig. 3).<sup>34</sup>

The painter of the Trento epitaph is an artist who seems to be caught between two spheres, the German and the Italian, influenced by the ‘Renaissance climate of the Veneto area’.<sup>35</sup> As to the division in various parts the epitaph can be compared to an epitaph for the family Ronsperg in the Vorarlberg-museum in Bregenz, Austria, created around 1564.<sup>36</sup> Here the donors are depicted on a separate panel so that the epitaph consists of four parts, also with God the Father shown on the top and an inscription on the lower part.

The epitaph is an example of a work of art with not only hybrid idioms but also some unusual iconographic details. The man in the foreground next to Saint Ulrich appears to be Stephaton carrying a reed with a small sponge soaked in vinegar. It is, however, unusual that he is portrayed with damaged legs.<sup>37</sup> It is more typical for the beggar with Saint Martin to be depicted in this way. Furthermore, a minute grey dog can be seen between Stephaton and Saint Ulrich. It is striking that the painter portrays it on such a small scale. Another peculiarity is the child sitting behind the Centurion on the horse, which itself has a particularly distinctive head. Children are often depicted in the scene of Calvary but this detail is rather unusual.

<sup>34</sup> On this painting cf. MARTIN SCHAWÉ, *Rom in Augsburg. Die Basilikabilder aus dem Katharinenkloster*, 1999, pp. 84–97, with illustrations. – Christ’s body in the Trento painting resembles formally to the one painted in the ‘Lamentation of Christ’ executed by a painter active in Augsburg, dated c. 1525. Cf. *Altdeutsche Gemälde. Katalog*, ed. by Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen (Staatsgalerie Augsburg. Städtische Kunstsammlungen 1), <sup>3</sup>1988, pp. 17–19, fig. 47. – With regards to the composition, the little dog, Mary who has fainted and the landscape it might be also referred to the wall painting of Ulrich Apt the Elder, active in Augsburg, with the ‘Crucifixion of Christ’, dated c. 1485. Cf. MARTIN SCHAWÉ, *Staatsgalerie Augsburg. Altdeutsche Malerei in der Katharinenkirche*, 2001, p. 36, fig. 36.

<sup>35</sup> GIULIO DE CARLI, *La città del Concilio 1: Le pietre medievali*, 1962, p. 136. Original Italian, “clima veneto rinascimentale”.

<sup>36</sup> As to the epitaph cf. LEO ANDERGASSEN, *Renaissancealtäre und Epitaphien in Tirol* (Schlern-Schriften 325), 2007, plate 215.

<sup>37</sup> Some explanations on this iconography are given in *L’immagine dell’altro tra stereotipi e pregiudizi. Spunti di riflessione. Guida alla mostra*, ed. by DOMIZIO CATTOI, LORENZA LIANDRU, DOMENICA PRIMERANO, 2012, p. 52, no. 11.

**Bishop Johannes Hinderbach, panel painting  
with the Virgin and Child and Saints**

Our second example will present a work of art which most probably was executed by a painter coming from the German speaking community. He might have worked in Trento or he had delivered the panel to the bishop in Trento from his workshop situated north of the Alps.

The panel is depicting the Virgin with Child and Saints. We know little about Ulrich von Liechtenstein, but various studies on Bishop Johannes Hinderbach



Fig. 3: Hans Burgkmair the Elder, Basilika Santa Croce in Gerusalemme, 1504. Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen – Augsburg, Staatsgalerie. Photo in: SCHAWÉ, Rom in Augsburg (like note 34), p. 88f.

have been made.<sup>38</sup> Many details on his career as German university man, jurist, imperial counsellor, and bishop are known. Hinderbach was born in 1418 in Rauschenberg in Hesse, situated about 90 kilometres north of Frankfurt am Main. His first studies at the University of Vienna starting in 1434 were followed by studies of law which he continued in Padua starting from 1441. In 1448 he was ambassador for Frederick III in Milan and in the following year he obtained the parish of Mödling near Vienna and also posts as a capitular in Passau, Regensburg and Trento where he became bishop in 1465. He died at Trento in 1486.<sup>39</sup> Hinderbach set the benchmark for an episcopal library by ordering various manuscripts and incunabula.<sup>40</sup> He also initiated the rebuilding of the bishop's residence at Castello del Buonconsiglio.<sup>41</sup> Hinderbach's name is strongly connected with that of Simon of Trent, a little boy born there, who had disappeared in 1475. When his dead body was found, members of the city's Jewish community were blamed to be responsible for the child's alleged ritual murder and were executed. Soon pilgrims came to Trento because first miracles in connection with Simon's corpse were stated. The Bishop worked hard to have the child canonized.<sup>42</sup>

The bishop's tomb is first mentioned by Giano Pirro Pincio in 1546 who relates that it was situated in the southern nave of the Cathedral San Vigilio near the altar dedicated to Saint Dorothy.<sup>43</sup> The only remnant of the bishop's tomb is the slab, now exhibited in the Museo Diocesano (fig. 4).<sup>44</sup> The slab's iconography is similar to that of Ulrich von Liechtenstein. Johannes Hinderbach is framed by two thin columns with a thick branch forming an arch over

<sup>38</sup> As to Bishop Ulrich cf. EZIO CHINI, 3.3 Maestro dell'Epitaffio di Udalrico IV di Lichtenstein (like note 17), p. 168. With regards to Bishop Johannes cf. Il principe vescovo Johannes Hinderbach (1465–1486) fra tardo Medioevo e Umanesimo, ed. by IGINIO ROGGER and MARCO BELLABARBA, 1992.

<sup>39</sup> DANIELA RANDO, Dai margini la memoria: Johannes Hinderbach (1418–1486) (Annali dell'Istituto storico italo-germanico Monografie 37), 2003 = DANIELA RANDO, Johannes Hinderbach (1418–1486). Eine „Selbst“-Biographie (Schriften des Italienisch-Deutschen Historischen Instituts in Trient 21), 2008.

<sup>40</sup> Cf. Pro bibliotheca erigenda. Manoscritti e incunaboli del vescovo di Trento Iohannes Hinderbach (1465–1486), ed. by FABRIZIO LEONARDELLI, 1989.

<sup>41</sup> Cf. GIOVANNI DELL'ANTONIO, In viridario novo Castri Boni Consilii. Architettura e umanesimo al tempo di Johannes Hinderbach, in: Il Castello del Buonconsiglio, ed. by ENRICO CASTELNUOVO, 2 vols., 1995–1996, here 2, pp. 71–87.

<sup>42</sup> Cf. AARON TÄNZER, Simon (Simeidl, Simoncino) of Trent, in: The Jewish Encyclopedia, ed. by ISIDOR SINGER, 12 vols., 1901–1905, here 11 (1905), pp. 374–375; DANIELA RANDO, Hinderbach, Johannes, in: Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani (like note 23), here 16, pp. 709–712.

<sup>43</sup> Cf. Il Duomo di Trento 2 (like note 14), p. 102.

<sup>44</sup> Cf. ELEONORA CALLOVI, 128. Scultore di ambito nordico (?). Lastra tombale del vescovo Giovanni Hinderbach (1465–86), in: Rinascimento e Passione per l'Antico (like note 17), p. 534.

the top, a decoration typical of the late Gothic period in the northern alpine region. Different saints are sculpted in the orphreys of his chasuble and his mitre, his crozier and the branches above him. To both sides of his feet two coat of arms are placed: the left one with the eagle stands for the diocese of Trento and the right one is that of his family with a raising unicorn with four flames. An inscription on the edges of the slab states that Bishop Hinderbach died in 1486. A second and more detailed inscription is related in sources of 1765 and was possibly seen on the sarcophagus.

A panel also exhibited in the Museo Diocesano shows the Virgin sitting on a throne that has Gothic architectural elements (fig. 5).<sup>45</sup> The Child on her lap is flicking through the pages of a book. The bishop portrayed on a smaller scale kneeling next to her feet was identified by Don Giovanni B. Zanella in 1879 as Bishop Johannes Hinderbach on the basis of the coat of arms placed before him.<sup>46</sup> Two saints are positioned on either side of the throne. To the left stands Saint John the Baptist with his right leg over the back of a lithe-looking lion, which is seeking help from Saint Jerome. The saint's cardinal hat is placed in the left corner. By pointing to Jesus Saint John is referring to the beginning of a sentence said twice by him in the presence of Jesus written on a roll: · ECCE · ANGNVS · DEI ·<sup>47</sup> On the right-hand side, Saint Peter and Paul with their attributes have approached the throne. The fact that the Virgin and the Child wear garments typical of the depiction of the *Madonna del Popolo* might refer to a copy of this icon which the Bishop had ordered in Rome in 1466 on the occasion of his consecration as bishop of Trento. This panel had been placed in the choir of Trento's Cathedral.<sup>48</sup>

As for the painter, it has never been doubted that he originally came from a northern region.<sup>49</sup> That he might also have been influenced by Italian art, was first pointed out by Giuseppe Gerola in 1911.<sup>50</sup> The idea of portraying the figures in such a majestic way might have been borrowed from Italian paintings as a comparison with the fresco in the Cathedral before which the

<sup>45</sup> Inv. 4024. 167 x 190.5 cm.

<sup>46</sup> Cf. Don GIOVANNI B. ZANELLA, *S. Maria di Trento, Cenni Storici*, 1879, p. 21.

<sup>47</sup> John 1.29 and John 1.36 – 'agnvs' is mistakingly written for 'agnvs'.

<sup>48</sup> The observation on the garments was made by Dr Bernd Konrad, Radolfzell (e-mail dated 03/13/2015). On the copy of the *Madonna del Popolo* cf. ELVIO MICH, *I dipinti*, in: *Il Museo Diocesano Tridentino*, ed. by DOMENICA PRIMERANO, 1996, pp. 59–62, here p. 60.

<sup>49</sup> For the various positions cf. SERENELLA CASTRI, no. 3, in: *Il Duomo di Trento 2* (like note 14), pp. 142–147.

<sup>50</sup> GIUSEPPE GEROLA, *Appunti per la storia dell'arte nel Trentino*, I. La morte del pittore Gerolamo da Trento, in: *Trientum* 12 (1911), pp. 460–466, here p. 461, footnote 5.

epitaph of Bishop Ulrich was placed may show. The fresco with its similar subject matter is dated about 1340 and is attributed to a painter from Verona.<sup>51</sup> Yet stylistically the Hinderbach-painting differs from other Italian works. Nicolò Rasmò put forward that it might have been painted by Michael Tanner, who is mentioned in various documents in Trento.<sup>52</sup> He probably came from Tittmoning, situated about 35 kilometres north-west of Salzburg, to whose diocese it once belonged. We cannot say for certain if this painting can be attributed to Michael Tanner but we can recognise the links to Austrian painting.<sup>53</sup> We suggest a comparison with a painting by the Master of Schloss Lichtenstein, who was active in Vienna around 1440/50. The painter was named after two panels in Castle Lichtenstein in southern Germany, about 40 kilometres south of Stuttgart.<sup>54</sup> If we compare the Trento painting with the *Death of Mary* we can state that both artists use rounded forms for the faces, the noses are rather long (fig. 6). The haloes are surrounded by a black line and, as in the Hinderbach-panel, some figures of the *Death of Mary* are leaning inwards with their heads bowed to the side.

The first information on where the panel was located dates from 1879 when it is witnessed in a small chapel on the outskirts of Trento that belonged to the bishops as well as the Conte Piero dei Consolati.<sup>55</sup> Bishop Benedetto de Riccabona agreed that the panel should be transferred to the church Santa Maria Maggiore in Trento where it was fixed on the southern wall of the nave. Don Giovanni B. Zanella assumed that in the beginning the panel had been most likely made for the chapel in the bishop's residence.<sup>56</sup> Subsequently it has been assumed that the Hinderbach-panel served as an epitaph for the bishop's

---

<sup>51</sup> Cf. *Il Duomo di Trento* 2 (like note 14), p. 29, upper illustration.

<sup>52</sup> RASMO, Note in margine all'esposizione commemorativa del Concilio di Trento (like note 24), p. 148, footnote 13.

<sup>53</sup> CASTRI, no. 3, in: *Il Duomo di Trento* 2 (like note 14), p. 145. She puts forward various works of art from the Salzburg area that are similar to the Hinderbach-painting.

<sup>54</sup> Wien 1450. *Der Meister von Schloss Lichtenstein und seine Zeit*, ed. by AGNES HUSSLEIN-ARCO and VERONIKA PIRKER-AURENHAMMER, 2013. On the painting cf. p. 114, Kat. 1/1.

<sup>55</sup> Cf. ZANELLA, S. Maria di Trento (like note 46), p. 21; LUDOVICO OBERZINER, Un quadro di Gerolamo da Bamberga nella Chiesa di S. Maria Magg. in Trento, in: *Strenna del 'Giovane Trentino'* (1911), pp. 131–136, here pp. 131, 133.

<sup>56</sup> Cf. ZANELLA, S. Maria di Trento (like note 46), p. 21.



Fig. 4: Memorial Slab of Bishop Johannes Hinderbach. Trento, Museo Diocesano Tridentino.  
Photo: Archivio fotografico del Museo Diocesano Tridentino.



Fig. 5: Painter of Austrian (?) origin, *Madonna with Child and Saints and Bishop Johannes Hinderbach and his chaplain*, c. 1470. Trento, Museo Diocesano Tridentino. Photo: Archivio fotografico del Museo Diocesano Tridentino.

tomb and was thus located in the Cathedral, just like the epitaph of his follower Ulrich von Liechtenstein.<sup>57</sup> After various moves in the church of Santa Maria Maggiore it was finally transferred in 1963 to the Museo Diocesano.<sup>58</sup> In 1993 Castri pointed out that, given the prolific records for the Cathedral of Trento, it is somewhat unusual that the panel had never been mentioned.

<sup>57</sup> Cf. RASMO, Note in margine all'esposizione commemorativa del Concilio di Trento (like note 24), p. 145.

<sup>58</sup> DOMIZIO CATTOI, 127. Michael Tanner (?). Tavola epitaffio del principe vescovo Giovanni IV Hinderbach, in: *Rinascimento e Passione per l'Antico* (like note 17), pp. 532–533, here p. 532 with bibliography.

Some observations may show that the panel probably did not serve as an epitaph for Bishop Hinderbach ordered explicitly for the Cathedral. We can first ask how the presence of a chaplain can be explained on an epitaph of his bishop. The person kneeling behind the bishop was probably Johannes Ortwein who became a chaplain of the bishop at least in 1476. In 1501 he became part of the chapter of the Cathedral and died in 1518.<sup>59</sup> Second, the painter's style dates to about 1470.<sup>60</sup> It is rather unlikely that Hinderbach, who became a bishop in 1465 and died in 1486, thought about his epitaph at such an early point. The saints depicted next to the throne might give an indication for which church it had been ordered. On the left side we see Saint Jerome, patron of the theologians, and before him Saint John the Baptist, patron of Bishop Johannes – or John – Hinderbach. To the right side Saint Peter and Paul are placed. We know that the bishop organised the reconstruction of the church of Saint Peter and Paul.<sup>61</sup> Thus, the panel could well have been made for one of the altars in this church.

### Art in a Double Periphery?

The influential centre-periphery debate for art history was first set out by Carlo Ginzburg and Enrico Castelnuovo in 1979.<sup>62</sup> The concept has been in the intervening years widely discussed and refined. Especially, the debate has been regarding the definition of core and periphery in art history and its relation with the concepts of space and time problems, reflecting on the creation of borders in various meanings, from the “real” one (geographical, political) to the “invented” one by historians.<sup>63</sup> Further, in order to overcome the obvious downfalls of the centre-periphery juxtaposition, i.e. the implicit

---

<sup>59</sup> IGINIO ROgger, *Interessi agiografici del vescovo Hinderbach, con particolare riguardo al Santorale trentino*, in: *Il principe vescovo Johannes Hinderbach* (like note 38), pp. 319–380, here p. 319.

<sup>60</sup> As to the time frame in which the panel had been executed cf. also LAURA DAL PRÀ, *Ancora su Hinderbach e la „sua“ creazione iconografica, con la riscoperta del cicle simoniniano di S. Maria della Misericordia di Trento*, in: VALENTINA PERINI, *Il Simonino. Geografia di un culto*, 2012, pp. 17–50, here pp. 30–32.

<sup>61</sup> On this church cf. GIUSEPPE SAVA, *La chiesa di San Pietro in Trento*, 2004.

<sup>62</sup> ENRICO CASTELNUOVO, CARLO GINZBURG, *Centro e periferia*, in: *Storia dell'Arte Italiana 1: Materiali e problem. Questioni e metodi*, ed. by GIOVANNI PREVITALI, 1979.

<sup>63</sup> See for instance FOTEINI VLACHOU, *Why Spatial? Time and the Periphery*, in: *Visual Resources. An international journal on images and their uses* 32 (2016), pp. 9–24.



Fig. 6: Master of Schloss Lichtenstein, active in Vienna, *Death of the Virgin*, c. 1445. Lichtenstein, Schloss Lichtenstein (Germany), property of the Duke of Urach. Photo in: Wien 1450. HUSSLEIN-ARCO, PIRKER-AURENHAMMER, *Der Meister von Schloss Lichtenstein* (like note 54), p. 115.

asymmetries and naive hierarchy assumption it entails, the concept of a double periphery has been set up mainly in socio-economic terms. For example, modern political studies use it to capture a setting where there are different centres acting as a force, leading to a semiperipheral pathway.<sup>64</sup> Seen in this way, does Trento which is a contact zone on all sides qualify? We very much think so, also in the light of a revised Humanist model as proposed by Claire Farago, who was emphasizing the cultural consequences of interaction and mixing phenomena within the Renaissance movement.<sup>65</sup> From this perspective, the key points of the historical setting of Trento, as set out in the introduction, denote the town as a small Renaissance centre also situated on the periphery of other centres.

To summarize it can be stated that artists from northern Italy as well as from the northern alpine region were active in Trento and its region around 1500. Often, the works of art can be easily attributed to either of these regions. The epitaph painted for Ulrich von Liechtenstein, however, suggests that sometimes characteristics of both regions can be found. It can be described best as “something new that emerges from the combination of older elements” and is therefore a shining example of cultural hybridization, as pointed out by Peter Burke.<sup>66</sup> Both panels are well discussed by Italian researchers but have only received a brief mention until now by researchers of the northern alpine region.<sup>67</sup> Rasmø thought that the Liechtenstein-panel would only be interesting for the local community.<sup>68</sup> However, we assume that he was misguided and that a collaboration between Italian researchers and those dealing with northern alpine painting, when attentively dealing with Burke’s new paradigm, could possibly bring forward new information, also reframing the panels and their very peculiar cultural embeddedness.

<sup>64</sup> See only SŁAWOMIR MAGALA, Double Peripheralization, in: *Review* 9/1 (1985), pp. 139–151.

<sup>65</sup> CLAIRE FARAGO, *Reframing the Renaissance: visual culture in Europe and Latin America, 1450–1650*, 1995.

<sup>66</sup> PETER BURKE, *Hybrid Renaissance. Culture, Language, Architecture* (The Natalie Zemon Davis Annual Lectures), 2016, pp. 1–5.

<sup>67</sup> As far as we see only the Hinderbach-panel was mentioned by KARL ATZ, *Kunstgeschichte von Tirol und Vorarlberg*, 1909; ALFRED STANGE, *Deutsche Malerei der Gotik*, 11 vols., 1934–1961), here 10, p. 196, and ERICH EGG, *Gotik in Tirol. Die Flügelaltäre*, 1985, pp. 398, 401. Leo Andergassen briefly mentioned both works of art in 2007 (cf. ANDERGASSEN, *Renaissancealtäre und Epitaphien* [like note 36], p. 328) with reference to Enrico Castelnuovo (cf. CASTELNUOVO, *Il Duomo di Trento* [like note 14]).

<sup>68</sup> RASMO, Note in margine all’esposizione commemorativa del Concilio di Trento (like note 24), p. 148.

### Illustration List

Fig. 1: Sarcophagus and epitaph of Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein (before 1960). Trento, Cathedral San Vigilio. Photo in: *Il Duomo di Trento* 2 (like note 14).

Fig. 2: Master of the Epitaph of Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein, *Epitaph of Bishop Ulrich von Liechtenstein*, 1504, oil on spruce, 338 x 235 cm. Trento, Museo Diocesano Tridentino. Photo: Archivio fotografico del Museo Diocesano Tridentino.

Fig. 3: Hans Burgkmair the Elder, *Basilika Santa Croce in Gerusalemme*, 1504, pine, 238.3 x 341.5 cm. Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen – Augsburg, Staatsgalerie. Photo in: SCHAWÉ, *Rom in Augsburg* (like note 34), p. 88f.

Fig. 4: Memorial Slab of Bishop Johannes Hinderbach. Trento, Museo Diocesano Tridentino. Photo: Archivio fotografico del Museo Diocesano Tridentino.

Fig. 5: Painter of Austrian (?) origin, *Madonna with Child and Saints and Bishop Johannes Hinderbach and his chaplain*, c. 1470, tempera and oil on wood, 167 x 190.5 cm. Trento, Museo Diocesano Tridentino. Photo: Archivio fotografico del Museo Diocesano Tridentino.

Fig. 6: Master of Schloss Lichtenstein, active in Vienna, *Death of the Virgin*, c. 1445, fir, 205 x 119.1/117.3 x 0.5/0.8 cm. Lichtenstein, Schloss Lichtenstein (Germany), property of the Duke of Urach. Photo in: HUSSLEIN-ARCO, PIRKER-AURENHAMMER, *Der Meister von Schloss Lichtenstein* (like note 54), p. 115.

Dr. Hannes Obermair  
South Tyrol's Museums Directorate  
Pascolistr. 2  
39100 Bozen-Bolzano, Italy  
[hannes.obermair@provinz.bz.it](mailto:hannes.obermair@provinz.bz.it)

Dr. Michaela Schedl  
Ludwig-Sauer-Str. 3  
61476 Kronberg, Germany  
[michaelaschedl@gmail.com](mailto:michaelaschedl@gmail.com)