



---

David Ganz: Carolingian Manuscripts. The Verdict of the Master, in: *Francia* 42 (2015), S. 253-274.  
DOI: 10.11588/fr.2015.0.44658

---

#### Copyright



Das Digitalisat wird Ihnen von perspectivia.net, der Online-Publikationsplattform der Max Weber Stiftung – Deutsche Geisteswissenschaftliche Institute im Ausland, zur Verfügung gestellt. Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

DAVID GANZ

## CAROLINGIAN MANUSCRIPTS\*

### The Verdict of the Master

After completing his dissertation on the school of St Emmeram in Regensburg in 1933 Bernhard Bischoff started to examine manuscripts in Germany, Switzerland and Italy on behalf of E. A. Lowe, who was assembling the descriptions of all extant Latin manuscripts copied before 800 which we know as »Codices Latini Antiquiores« (CLA)<sup>1</sup>. On his journeys for Lowe Bischoff systematically examined all manuscripts dated to the ninth and tenth centuries. In 1955 he first submitted a request to the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft for funding for a catalogue of all ninth century continental Latin manuscripts. He explained that the basis of the work would be an archive of photographs of the different hands writing in each manuscript, with 4–5 photographs pro manuscript.

The remarkable process by which a single style of writing, Caroline minuscule, was adopted from the Pyrenees to the Danube was the most enduring legacy of Carolingian rule. The diversity of letter forms was not the result of modifications of a model, but the consequence of a large number of local developments. Bischoff always stressed the importance of the taste for calligraphy: what Malcolm Parkes has called »*decorum*« »the ground of common consent between contemporary scribes and readers as to the qualities of handwriting required for different kinds of texts, and to the appropriate balance between style and function within the limits of prevailing fashion«<sup>2</sup>. The concept is conveyed in the »Admonitio generalis« where Charlemagne decreed that Gospelbooks, Psalters and missals were to be copied by mature scribes. This volume lists some 127 Gospel Books and 57 sacramentaries.

Bischoff's investigation of scripts depended on exact observation of details: ligatures and abbreviations, the shape of the letters, the ductus, the proportions of letters, and the particular sense of form which made it possible to identify symptoms of individual scriptoria, and local and regional features shared by different centres. His record of these features was expressed in a terse and elliptic prose which was seldom easy to interpret, and which only conveys something of what he considered signifi-

\* This article is a review of Bernhard BISCHOFF, *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen)*, vol. 3: Padua – Zwickau, aus dem Nachlaß hg. von Birgit EBERSPERGER, Wiesbaden (Harassowitz), 2014, XXIV–628 p. (Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften. Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe der mittelalterlichen Bibliothekskataloge Deutschlands und der Schweiz), ISBN 978-3-447-10056, EUR 168,00.

1 Elias Avery LOWE, *Codices Latini Antiquiores*, vol. 1–11 and Supplement, Oxford 1934–1971.

2 Malcolm B. PARKES, *Their Hands Before Our Eyes. A Closer Look at Scribes*, Aldershot 2008, p. 151.

cant when read beside images of the manuscripts, or ideally beside the manuscripts themselves. In the words of Hartmut Hoffmann: »Der Katalog der Handschriften des 9. Jahrhunderts ist kein bequemes Nachschlagewerk<sup>3</sup>.« Three volumes of the Katalog have now been published: this article is an account of the final volume, and an attempt to suggest some ways in which it can be used<sup>4</sup>.

## I

Bernhard Bischoff died on 17<sup>th</sup> September 1991, leaving his work unfinished. He had corrected the proofs of Volume I, but the remaining material cannot be considered to represent what he would have published. The final volume of Bischoff's »Katalog« is both an inventory of those manuscripts in libraries from Padua to Zwickau which Bischoff dated to the ninth century (his notes on manuscripts in private collections have been omitted) and an edition of his detailed entries for manuscripts in Paris (p. 5–254). There are entries for 3771 manuscripts and fragments, including some manuscripts copied before 800 with Carolingian additions, and for manuscripts which had been dated to the ninth century, but which Bischoff considered to be later. The »Katalog« contains full descriptions of 1221 items in the Bibliothèque nationale de France and other manuscripts in Padua, Turin and Trier, and a list of ninth century manuscripts known to Bischoff in other public collections. Dr. Birgit Ebersperger is to be congratulated on having made something accessible of this material, and on her editing of detailed but sometimes enigmatic records<sup>5</sup>. But the form of most of the entries in this volume is primarily an invitation to explore further. A planned index volume will aid in locating and identifying palaeographical features: this volume has an 15 page index of manuscripts by their scriptoria or regional attributions.

Unlike the two previous volumes of this »Katalog«, the greater part of this volume consists of a brief listing of the main text in the manuscript and a date, sometimes accompanied by a more or less precise localization. But for the libraries of Paris the entries are usually detailed (though there are only summary entries for Paris BN lat. 12410–13352). For Würzburg the reader is referred to Bischoff's descriptions in his »Libri Sancti Kyliani« though strangely the dates in that volume are not reported here<sup>6</sup>. Those seeking information about manuscripts from Lorsch or from the South East German writing centres are directed to pages in Bischoff's earlier publications<sup>7</sup>, and for classical texts and liturgical books not in Paris to the catalogues by Munk

3 Review in: *Deutsches Archiv* 55 (1999), p. 590. Hoffmann's are the most important reviews of the Katalog.

4 For reasons of space I have abridged the location of manuscripts throughout this review. Manuscripts in the Bibliothèque nationale de France in Paris are listed as BN lat., those in other libraries are identified by the name of the town in which the library is located. – I reviewed the previous volumes in *Francia* 27/1 (2000), p. 273–278 and 32/1 (2005), p. 231–232.

5 For St Omer 153 his notes record »Aber wo«.

6 Bernhard BISCHOFF, Josef HOFMANN, *Libri Sancti Kyliani. Die Würzburger Schreibschule und die Dombibliothek im VIII. und IX. Jahrhundert*, Würzburg 1952 (*Quellen und Forschungen zur Geschichte des Bistums und des Hochstifts Würzburg*, 6).

7 Bernhard BISCHOFF, *Die Abtei Lorsch im Spiegel ihrer Handschriften*, Lorsch 1989; ID., *Die südostdeutschen Schreibschulen und Bibliotheken in der Karolingerzeit*, vol. 1–2, Leipzig, Wiesbaden 1940–1980.

Olsen<sup>8</sup> and Gamber<sup>9</sup>, who each consulted him. Round brackets around the verdict on the date and origin of a manuscript indicate that Bischoff had published it; square brackets record a verdict from his lists of the manuscripts to be included. The treatment of script records distinctive letterforms especially variant forms of »a« and »d«, ligatures and abbreviations, though not every reader will know that when the catalogue prints a »z« between two dots that was how the letter was written at Tours. In contrast to descriptions of Paris manuscripts in »Codices Latini Antiquiores« Bischoff noted the heavy ductus in Paris BN lat. 653 and for BN lat. 1564 from Chelles »manche Hände schreiben geradezu drucklos«. The letter »g« used by one scribe in the Gospels in BN lat. 268 is »mit gewelltem Schopf« (»with a wavy tuft«). The description of the letterforms in BN lat. 10600 is particularly instructive. No scholar has seen more early manuscripts than Bischoff, no one was more tenacious in teasing out every detail to be found in a manuscript. A classical quotation, a vernacular or a Latin gloss, poor spellings, endleaf entries, short supplementary texts, marginal notes copied from the exemplar (discussed below) were all recorded. He noted accents above the text in the final sermon in the Tours »Martinellus«, Paris BN lat. 5325<sup>10</sup> and also in BN lat. 12242 and 12243, volumes of the »Moralia« from St Germain des Prés. He deciphered the heavily rubbed verses at the end of a Priscian manuscript Paris BN lat. 7496 and saw that they were Lupus of Ferrières's verses for a scriptorium<sup>11</sup>. Bischoff was the first to spot several important notated liturgical fragments, unknown to musicologists<sup>12</sup>. His sensitivity to the range of evidence about the literary culture of the ninth century, and his ability to interpret it, mean there is much here which only he had spotted.

In addition to the preliminary lists Bischoff's extensive notes are now deposited in the Bischoff Nachlass in the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munich<sup>13</sup>. These files include the forms which were prepared in order to describe manuscripts for »CLA«, some dating from Bischoff's first visits to St Gall in 1932 and to Verona in 1936. In addition to his notes they often contain letters asking him about individual Carolingian manuscripts, generally with the draft of his replies, which sometimes give the explanation for his verdicts. (The notes for manuscripts in the Bibliothèque nationale de France fill 16 folders.) Criticism of Bischoff has sometimes assumed that he did not explain, and has all too often ignored his collection of over 20,000 photographs of Carolingian manuscripts. His share in creating »CLA« involved arranging for the photography of the manuscripts, and choosing the folios to be photographed, and he was a master at finding the telling detail. He had hoped that the »Katalog« might include similar plates, but the mass of material made this impossible. His photographs are in Munich: at present they must be ordered separately from the notes.

8 Birger MUNK OLSEN, *L'étude des auteurs classiques latins aux XI<sup>e</sup> et XII<sup>e</sup> siècles*, Paris 1982–1989.

9 Klaus GAMBER, *Codices Liturgici Latini antiquiores*, vol. 1–2 and Supplementum, Fribourg 1968–1988.

10 The manuscript is wrongly described as »neumiert«.

11 Bernhard BISCHOFF, *Mittelalterliche Studien*, vol. 3, Stuttgart 1981, p. 65.

12 Neumed fragments in BN lat. 126, Vat. lat. 5749, and Vat. lat. 5775 and the antiphonary fragments St Geneviève 223 and Stuttgart bibl folio 65, and St Gall 1397 p. 13–16.

13 Ana 553. There is a 115 page typescript list of all of the material, made by Dr Monika Köstlin.

Bischoff was constantly revising his judgments and in the Paris entries he recorded changes with the words »hier zurückgenommen«<sup>14</sup>. In 1981 BN nouv. acq. lat. 1448 was described as from the court of Louis the Pious<sup>15</sup> but here is assigned to Tours. The purple Gospels from St Denis, BN lat. 9387, dated to the first quarter of the ninth century at the Aachen Charlemagne exhibition in 1965, and linked to the work of Godesscalc in the Paris Trésors carolingiens exhibition in 2007 are here dated to the mid ninth century and located in central France. Valenciennes 394 f 91–124 was dated ninth century for Munk Olsen but is now dated X/XI. The importance of these examples is that Bischoff recognized that a palaeographical dating is the clumsiest way to date a manuscript, and that his conclusions were provisional ones. That became clear in 1989, when others wanted to publish his work on Auxerre before he had revised it.

The major scriptoria identified in this volume are Mainz (55 mss), Fulda (64 mss), Lorsch (93 mss), Reichenau (48 mss), Würzburg, Salzburg, St Gall (225 mss), Corbie (172 mss), Paris, St Denis (57 mss), St Germain, Reims (146 mss), St Amand (87 mss), Fleury, Tours (137 mss), Auxerre, Wissembourg (59 mss), Lyon, Nonantola, and Verona (58 mss)<sup>16</sup>. But there are also much smaller groups of manuscripts, which made up the hundred separate Carolingian writing centres he had distinguished. (Unfortunately these smaller groups cannot be located in the excellent index.) Further work will need to establish to what extent the manuscripts which Bischoff attributed to the regions of Paris, or Tours, or Reims or to Lake Constance, many be grouped together.

Bischoff taught us quite how many manuscripts were copied during the reign of Charlemagne. This volume lists c. 350, which I have included in an appendix (see below p. 272–273). Bischoff saw his catalogues as primarily palaeographic so that neither in these volumes nor in his 1965 surveys of manuscripts copied in the reign of Charlemagne did he dwell on what texts were being copied<sup>17</sup>. The manuscripts listed in the appendix include 13 Gospelbooks, 3 Gospel lectionaries and 2 Comes, and 21 copies of the complete Bible, the Prophets or the Psalter. There are 29 canon law books, some only containing the acts of a single church council. There are 10 sacramentaries or sacramentary fragments. There are 5 copies of the Theodosian code or the Breviary of Alaric, 4 of other barbarian law codes, and 3 manuscripts containing capitularies of Charlemagne. There are 15 grammar books, most containing several different works, and 5 glossaries. There are 22 mss of works of Augustine (of which 7 are portions of his »Ennarationes in Psalmos«), and 20 of commentaries by Jerome. (7 of his commentary on Matthew). In addition there are 3 copies of Pseudo-Jerome on the Psalms and 3 of Pseudo-Jerome on Matthew. There are 7 copies of other patristic commentaries on the Pauline Epistles, and 7 copies of Cassiodorus on the Psalms. I

14 For Paris Bibl. Mazarine 512, Paris BN lat. 1647A, 5725, 9452, 10588, 11308, 18520.

15 BISCHOFF, *Mittelalterliche Studien* (as note 9), p. 23.

16 These figures include items where the attribution includes a question mark. Of the scriptoria whose chief holdings were listed in the two previous volumes there are two more manuscripts copied at Cologne, Pommersfelden 125 (Beda »de Templo«) dated 819–841 and Vienna lat. 449 »Codex Carolinus«, ten from Freising, eleven from Murbach and thirteen from Regensburg.

17 Bernhard BISCHOFF, *Panorama der Handschriftenüberlieferung aus der Zeit Karls des Großen*, in: *id.*, *Mittelalterliche Studien* (as note 9), p. 5–38.

count 6 copies of parts of Gregory's »Moralia«, and 6 copies of Isidore's »Etymologiae« (with many more early fragments in the first two volumes of the »Katalog«). There are 19 copies of works by Alcuin. There are at least 15 collections of sermons. Of historical works there are 3 copies of Eusebius-Rufinus, and 3 of works described by Bischoff as »Gesta Francorum«, together with 2 manuscripts of Carolingian annals. Lastly there are 17 books containing the lives of one or more saints. Bischoff's Panorama article mentions 6 other manuscripts of canon law, 7 more grammatical books, 3 sacramentaries and 2 more copies of the Breviary of Alaric.

We see that in addition to improving Latinity, Charlemagne and his advisors sought a church familiar with its history and with canon law, and able to expound the Bible, especially the Gospels and the Psalter. Civil law, whether Roman or national, was also important. The courts of Charlemagne and his sons Pippin of Italy and Louis of Aquitaine had scriptoria and book collections: Charlemagne owned works on grammar, (including the grammar of the Anglo-Saxon Tatuin), on dialectic, canon law and exegesis, and had an augmented text of Cassiodorus on the Liberal Arts, as well as the Dionysio-Hadriana, the Gregorian Sacramentary and the Rule of St Benedict. Louis owned copies of Augustine, »de Doctrina Christiana« (BN lat. 13359), and Theodulf, »de spiritu sancto« (London BL Harley 3024). Pippin owned a Comes in purple and gold (BN lat. 9451), a copy of Pelagius on the Pauline Epistles (BN lat. 653), a copy of Pseudo-Jerome on the Psalms (St Gall 108), Jerome and Pseudo-Jerome on the Gospels (St Gall 227, Karlsruhe Aug 261) and collections of sermons (St Gall 227, Vienna 1616). Some of Pippin's books may have been written for distribution elsewhere. St Gall 257 Beda »in Marcum« has a full page word square with the text »Pippinus rex Deo in aeternum vivat amen« on page 3 which is not mentioned here: it is the clumsy work of an unskilled scribe and it is not clear to which ruler named Pippin it refers.

This volume adds the following items to the list of manuscripts which Bischoff had linked to the court of Charlemagne:

- BN lat. 1913 Augustinus »Confessiones«, described as close to the court;
- BN lat. 4627 Lex Salica »Kanzlei bzw Hofschule«;
- BN lat. 7193 f 17–34 and Reims 1094, Priscian are both »nahe zum Hof IX. Jh. Anfang«;
- BN lat. 12273 a copy of the »de titulis psalmorum« is labelled »vielleicht etwa Hofschule«;
- Valenciennes 150 Gregory of Nazianz »wohl etwa Hof«.

Had Bischoff revised his entry for Vercelli CXXVIII it would surely have included the colophon at the end of Augustinus, »de Musica«, which reveals that it is a copy of a book written for Charlemagne by one Bodus.

## II

Close ties to the court may explain the importance of the scriptoria of Chelles, Corbie, and the AB scriptorium, Cologne and Salzburg, and the range of texts to which they had access. In the next reign Vat. Pal. lat. 1448 part II Bede's computistical

works is attributed to »Hofschule Ludwigs«. The quality of the scripts, and the »li« and »ra« ligatures seem to me to sustain that verdict. The script is akin to the final hand in Paris BN lat. 1597A the letters of the Byzantine emperors Michael and Theophilus and the Paris synod of 825 with the names of emperors in gold uncial, at the start of the text, which Bischoff thought was written at the court for a Carolingian ruler (but which one?). Bischoff characterized the minuscule script as »strenge (nicht Reims)« though the manuscript came to Reims at the end of the century. These descriptions show the problems of using the »Katalog«: subtle differences are always present, and Bischoff knew that his descriptions could only draw attention to some of the features anyone working with these manuscripts should weigh. But there is no substitute for hours of looking at manuscripts themselves, and I regret that the editors have chosen not to include the dates when Bischoff himself saw a manuscript, which he always recorded.

One group of manuscripts which Carolingian historians have explored, because it seems to show lawbooks copied at an administrative centre for distribution, are the books of the so-called »Leges scriptorium«. That term is used in the »Katalog« entries for Vat. Reg. lat. 991 and Vat. Reg. lat. 1431 but not for Paris nouv. acq. lat. 204, Reg. lat. 846, Reg. lat. 852, or Reg. lat. 857, which were members of that group in Mordek's »Bibliotheca capitularium regum Francorum manuscripta«, for which Bischoff supplied places and dates of the entries. Vat. Reg. lat. 846 »Codex Theodosianus« has important marginal notes, as well as texts in Tironian notes and there are *formulae* in Tironian notes in Reg. lat. 852. If these came from the scriptorium, we have a major centre for the teaching and development of Roman law. The »Confessio« on f 51v of Vat. Reg. lat. 991 is worth editing, it also contains a prayer which every Christian is urged to use. In an article on the »Leges scriptorium« Rosamond McKitterick also cited two other Paris lawbooks, BN lat. 4408 and 4416 but their script is unconnected and Bischoff thought 4416 a tenth-century book<sup>18</sup>.

### III

South of the Loire is largely unexplored territory, and we must hope that others will examine the more than 150 manuscripts Bischoff only put in central France, Burgundy and especially Southern and South Eastern France. Of these Paris BN lat. 2123 and 3848B »Concilia«, Troyes 657 Cassiodorus, »in Psalmos«, Vat. lat. 3828 Claudius of Turin, »in Ev. Matthaei« and perhaps Vat. lat. 7277 »Codex Theodosianus« came from Flavigny. Paris BN lat. 2660 Chrysostom from St Savin, lat. 2294 are four leaves of a sacramentary with the names of the bishops of Le Puy. *Formulae* added to law books locate them at Bourges<sup>19</sup> and Clermont<sup>20</sup>. Perhaps the scripts of those books can be linked to others. But Bischoff always emphasized that most Carolingian manuscripts could not be localized, except to a region, and that of the

18 Rosamond MCKITTERICK, Zur Herstellung von Kapitularien: Die Arbeit des Leges-Skriptoriums, in: Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung 101 (1993), p. 1–14.

19 Paris BN lat. 4629.

20 Ibid., lat. 4697.

hundred Carolingian scriptoria he had identified, over half could not themselves be located.

By 1959 Bischoff had identified the distinctive script used at Corbie in the mid ninth century which enabled him to localize the classical and patristic florilegia made by Hadoard<sup>21</sup>. Other scribe librarians are Reginbert of the Reichenau and Pacificus of Verona<sup>22</sup>. Stuttgart HB VII 12 Hieronymus, »Epistolae« is a manuscript copied by Reginbert and listed in his catalogue. BN lat. 4860 is a later Reichenau copy of his important historical collection, which has not survived. Bischoff also noted Reginbert's entries in Paris BN lat. 17394 Augustinus, »in Ep Pauli«, 9544 Augustinus, »de perfectione iustitiae hominis«, Vienna 397 »Concilium Chalcedonense« and Zurich Car. C 116 »Altercatio Athanasii contra Arrium«. He identified the autographs of the Carolingian scholars Prudentius of Troyes in Paris BN lat. 2243 and Agobard of Lyons in the canonical collection BN lat. 11709 and the computus Rome, Vallicelliana E 26. In his own notes Bischoff recorded the entry on f 95r of Vat. lat. 474 Augustinus, »Sermones – hucusque ab abbate et praeceptore Lupo« – but this is not included here. Nor is his comment on the marginal entry on f 14r of Reims 393 »dies kann der Eintrag H (Hincmar of Reims) sein«.

Some of the manuscripts listed here have entries which suggest that they belonged to laymen. Paris BN lat. 113 »Libri Salamonis« from Tours was inscribed by Eluinus comes. Paris BN lat. 4418 »Breviarium Alarici« and »Lex Salica« is described as »an einem Verwaltungszentrum im Frankenreich entstanden«. The pen trials in chancery script on f 38r, f 151v and 126r in the Virgil manuscript Paris BN lat. 7926 may suggest that it also belonged to such a centre though it was copied at Fleury. Less clear is the status of Landulph and Anno, named in the copy of Walahfrid Strabo, »Expositio psalmorum« in Paris BN lat. 1979 *Orate pro Annone Hoc Supplicio* and *Landulfus Ovans Hunc Libellum Fieri Iussit*. Their text is written on the arcade surrounding a full page standing figure of David. It is not clear if they were laymen, and another such case is *Solius me fecit sed tavolis abest* beside a figure in an initial in the Burgundian ms Paris BN lat. 4412. St Gall 163 a section of one of the volumes of Augustine on the Psalms, has an inscription of page 152 stating that it was copied by one Wibertus cantor. This seems a unique testimony to the role of the cantor in the care and provision of non-liturgical books.

Recent research has sought to explore the »networks« in which texts and ideas circulated. Bischoff drew attention to manuscripts copied by several scribes writing in different house styles, which he saw as the product of a »Schulzentrum«. These include:

BN lat. 4410 »Breviarium Alarici«: »Schulzentrum«;

BN lat. 5568 hagiographical texts: »Die Mischung der Schreibstile Anzeichen eines Studienzentrums?«;

21 His familiarity with that hand enabled him to identify possible Hadoard autographs in Paris BN lat. 2166 Faustus, 2204 Gregory of Tours »in Gloria martyrum«, 4950 Justinus, 8670 Martianus Capella, and the corrections in 12208 and 13354.

22 Marginalia by Pacificus are in Padua 94 Scaff. V Ambrosiaster, Padua 182 Scaff X Augustine, »Quaest et loc in Hept«, Paris BN lat. 1924 Augustine, »de Haeresibus«, and Vat. lat. 1322 a dedication to a Carolingian added in a sixth century book.



The notes describe BN lat. 13833 Abbo of St Germain as »von einer ganzen Schulklasse« but that has not been printed here;

St Omer 91 Beda »Collectio in epistulas Pauli«: »Gemeinschaft von Schülern«;

Does Paris BN lat. 7558 copied by many different hands and containing grammatical texts together with works of Florus of Lyons and Claudius Marius Victor also qualify?

Some of these centres can only be identified by palaeographers: they cannot be traced via Carolingian letters. Is it possible that, as at the Council of Konstanz, Carolingian assemblies were places where texts might be circulated?

The major Carolingian libraries owned books copied in other scriptoria, and some houses, notably Chelles, St Denis and the AB scriptorium, were supplying copies for other libraries. There seems to have been a lively exchange of books between Reims and St Amand. More complicated are the cases where Bischoff saw a manuscript which had been started in one place and completed somewhere very different: such as the St Denis-Reichenau manuscripts Paris BN lat. 17394 and St Gall Stiftsbibliothek 40, 73, 107 and 248. Bischoff had shown that St Denis copied manuscripts for the Reichenau, but his description of these items suggests scribes were collaborating. Other instances of collaboration are scribes from St Denis and Corbie in Paris BN lat. 14087 part 1, and scribes from St Amand and Mainz in Cassiodorus, »Institutiones saecularium litterarum« BN lat. 8679. BN lat. 18064 Ambrosius, »de Officiis« is located between Paris und Corbie, but the justification seems to be the entry on f 102v *ratbertus diaconus scripsit et subscripsit*. In my view that entry is not the work of a Corbie hand. The necessity of separating origin and provenance, which had been the basis of all of Bischoff's work, is well shown by his assessment of BN lat 1153. It was clearly written for St Denis, which is twice mentioned in the litany, but Bischoff's verdict as to where it was written is »weiterer Umkreis von Paris (?)«. I assume that that does not exclude scribes writing at St Denis, but that the script lacks any of the distinctive St Denis features, so they were not trained in the house style. BN lat. 268 is a Gospel Book with a stationary liturgy for the churches of Metz, but Bischoff noted that none of the scribes or artists resemble those working at Metz for bishops Angilram or Drogo, and his final verdict is »vielleicht Lothringen«.

The »Katalog« reminds us of the importance of the format of a book. Unfortunately we only have dimensions for the manuscripts in Padua and Paris but I note the giant law book BN lat. 4418 »Lex Salica« measuring 427 x 300 mm and the devotional handbooks BN lat. 2996 Paulinus, »Liber exhortationis« in handbook format with contemporary marginalia copied at St Amand measuring 127 x 105 mm, BN lat 2984, Ambrosius Autpertus, »de Conflictu vitiorum et virtutum«, and the sermons in nouv. acq. lat. 447 described as in »Taschenformat«, the small law books BN lat. 4697, 4759A, 4787, and 8801 or the classical florilegium BN lat. 6256.

#### IV

Three early manuscripts of the »Annales Regni Francorum« are localized. Vat. Reg lat. 617 was copied near Orléans in the first half of the ninth century, Reg. lat. 213 in the third quarter and Paris BN lat. 10911 in a Westfrankish centre in the second quar-

ter<sup>23</sup>. Vienna lat. 430 is described here as »Gesta Regum Francorum«, but contains the annals edited as the »Chronicon Laurissense breve« copied at Fulda, as Richard Corradini has shown<sup>24</sup>. Old French scholars will want to know that BN lat. 9768 (our only copy of Nithard) dated »s. IX ex. « in the Paris Trésors carolingiens exhibition is explicitly rejected here. BN lat. 1455 is perhaps the oldest witness to the Donation of Constantine. Bischoff dated the St Denis collection BN lat. 2777 which also contains that text, to the end of the ninth century, though it most probably copies a collection assembled by Fardulf of St Denis.

The palaeographer must always look for traces of the exemplar of every non-autograph manuscript. In this volume Bischoff recorded many important cases, which shed light on the transmission of patristic texts and hint at how they were studied. In this list I have added marginalia which are in his notes, or mine, but not in the »Katalog«:

Paris BN lat. 1546 »Concilium Carthaginense« 411 Rustica »der sehr alten Vorlage nachgebildet«;

1804 Hieronymus, »Quaestiones Hebraice in Gen«, Augustinus, »de Gen ad Litt«;

1811A Hieronymus, »in Isaiam« marginalia copied;

1842 Hieronymus, »in Matthaëum« marginal notes;

1870 Hieronymus, »Epistulae« marginalia copied;

2053 Augustinus, »de civitate Dei« marginalia copied *Legendum valde Pulchre et iuste*;

2109 Eugippius copied from a very early exemplar since it uses the *Nota antiqua fortiori*;

2112 Augustinus, »de Genesi ad litteram« marginalia copied;

2164 Claudianus Mamertus marginalia copied;

2312 Hesychius, »Expositio Libri Levitici«;

2779 Faustus, Claudianus Mamertus marginalia copied;

5061 Hegesippus marginalia copied;

7730 Marius Victorinus NE France *mire, optime totum mire*;

11642 Eugippius is a copy of a Naples book;

13385 Salvian f 43v and 55r formulas copied from the exemplar;

nouv. acq. lat. 1443 Augustinus, »Epistulae« has the colophon *Legi Facistus iuxta mendosum exemplar in Severinae* on f 156r;

Reims 70 Praedestinatus marginal glosses *totum bene, mire*;

St Gall 98 Ambrosius, »de spiritu sancto«, *magnifice* p. 176;

St Gall 127 Pseudo-Hieronimus, »in Marcum«;

St Gall 161 Augustinus, »de Genesi ad Litteram«;

St Gall 171 Augustinus, »de baptismo«;

St Gall 172 Augustinus, »Contra Faustum«;

23 What the inscription *ADAM syderum mereatur scandere regnum* on f 47v–48r means remains unclear. He seems to have been the scribe of a section of the lost Reims polyptique, Pierre DESPORTES, François DOLBEAU, Découverte de nouveaux documents relatifs au Polyptyque de Saint-Remi de Reims. À propos d'une édition récente, in: *Revue du Nord* 68 (1986), p. 575–607.

24 Richard CORRADINI, *Die Wiener Handschrift Cvp 430\**. Ein Beitrag zur Historiographie in Fulda im frühen 9. Jahrhundert, Frankfurt am Main 2000 ((Fuldaer Hochschulschriften, 37).

Salzburg St Peter a X 23 Hieronymus, »in Heremiam« has a prayer for Andreas Fortunatianus presumably a late Antique notable;

St Mihiel 16 Ambrosiaster;

Valenciennes 166 Augustinus, »de Trinitate« *satis magnifice*;

Vat. S Petri Basil. C 99 Augustinus, »de Civitate Dei« marginalia copied;

Vat. Pal. lat. 201 Augustinus, »Contra Faustum«;

Vat. Pal. lat. 234 Augustinus, »de Genesi ad litteram« *Mire*<sup>25</sup>;

Vat. Pal. lat. 829 Orosius;

Vat. Reg. Lat 201 Claudianus Mamertus Reims *acute intellege*;

Vat. lat. 426 Augustinus, »de Civitate Dei« important marginal notes which are also found in St Gall 178;

Wolffenbüttel Weiss 16 »de Civitate Dei« I–X contains the same set of marginalia as in Brussels 9641.

## V

One of the major contributions of this volume is what it reveals of Bischoff's verdict on the scriptoria of Reims. Flodoard recorded that Archbishop Tilpin gave books of the Holy Scriptures to his church, which were still in use<sup>26</sup>. A fire in 1774 destroyed much of the library of St Remi. The »Katalog« includes entries for four manuscripts known only from engravings. Of the 63 entries in the »Katalog« now in the Reims Bibliothèque municipale 17 have Hincmar's donation inscriptions for St Marie, and 1 his inscription to St Thierry, outside the city while 16 others belonged to St Thierry<sup>27</sup>, 11 to St Marie and 4 to St Remi. But what were the links between those three houses? Flodoard records that Hincmar gave a copy of the life of the Virgin and the homily of Pseudo-Jerome in a gold and ivory binding and a Gospel Book in gold and silver letters containing a verse now lost to the cathedral of St Marie, perhaps for the rededication in 862<sup>28</sup>. He gave a Gospel written in gold and a sacramentary, both with ivory covers, to St Remi, together with a lectionary of comparable beauty<sup>29</sup>. He wrote to Bishop John of Arezzo asking for a copy of the »canones Martini papae« which Stratmann identified as the »capitula« of Martin of Braga<sup>30</sup> and that he asked John of Cambrai to bring a copy of Bede on Proverbs to the synod of Douzy<sup>31</sup>. He thanked Fulcric of Troyes for copies of letters of Augustine and for Di-

25 Similar comments are in the sixth century copy Rome Vitt Em Sess 13.

26 Flodoard II, 17, MGH Scriptorum, vol. 36, p. 170 These passages were printed by Frederic M. CAREY, *The Scriptorium of Reims during the Archbishopric of Hincmar (845–882 A.D.)*, in: *Classical and Medieval Studies in Honor of Edward Kennard Rand*, ed. Leslie Webber JONES, New York 1938, p. 41–60. London BL Harley 1772 may be one of Tilpin's books.

27 A late tenth century catalogue of the books of St Thierry is on f 12–13 of Reims BM 427 and Carey listed those books which belonged to St Remi in the thirteenth century including manuscripts now in Leiden, Paris and the Vatican.

28 Flodoard (as note 26), III, 5, p. 198. The lost poem is edited MGH Poetae, vol. 3, p. 409.

29 Flodoard III, 9, p. 205.

30 Flodoard III, 21, p. 278.

31 Flodoard III, 23, p. 312. Reims BM 70 is a Reims copy of that text with Hincmar's donation inscription.

dymus, »de Spiritu sancto«<sup>32</sup>. Jean Devisse attempted to use the extensive quotations in Hincmar's writings to reconstruct his library and Martina Stratmann and Rudolf Schieffer have corrected some of his identifications of manuscripts<sup>33</sup>. Hincmar used Berlin Phillips 1762 in 859 and quoted Augustine, »de cura pro mortuis gerenda«, which survives in Reims 391. In 869 he quoted Ambrosius, »de Sacramentis«, which is in Reims 377 and Pseudo-Hieronymus »in Psalmos« which is in Reims 74. Hincmar gave a copy of the Acts of the Council of Frankfurt to St Remi, and owned a copy of the »Libri Carolini«. There seems no way to establish whether these books were already present at Reims, or if Hincmar was the first to obtain them. Could Ebo have taken books away from Reims with him when he was deposed?

Cambridge Pembroke College 308 is the copy of Hrabanus, »in Epistulas Pauli« given by Hincmar to St Maria, and famously containing the names of 8 scribes of the *portiones*<sup>34</sup>. It may be compared with Reims 377 discussed below. Most of the books were copied at Reims, though 3 of Hincmar's gifts were not. Bischoff thought Reims 83 was started at St Denis, Reims 376 with works of Ambrose came from Northern Italy and Hincmar gave BN lat. 5609, copied at St Hubert in a large and imprecise hand, to St Remi. Presumably it came to him as a gift<sup>35</sup>. In addition Vercelli CLIII Hrabanus, »in Deuteronomium« was commissioned by Hincmar as a gift for bishop Luitward of Vercelli probably between 878 and 882.

The earliest surviving Reims books are:

Vat. Pal. lat. 216 f 20–133 s VIII/IX, London BL Harley 1772 s VIII/IX, Paris BN lat. 7520, (f 85–99) S IX in »de proprietate sermonum« Reims 5, (800–825) Reims 75 Hieronymus, »in Isaiam«, Reims 426 (800–825) Isidore, »Etymologiae« I–X, Reims 671, (800–825) Dionysio-Hadriana, Vat. Reg. lat. 2078 (c. 800–830) »Poetae«, BN lat. 9347 »Poetae« which belonged to St Remigii, and Bern 522 (800–830) »Grammatica« by the scribe of the later volume Vat. Reg. lat. 191.

Avranches 109 Isidore, »Proemia«, Reims 77 Jerome, »in Matt«, and Reims 101 a part of Gregory, »Moralia«, are dated to the middle third of the ninth century, so they may be earlier than Hincmar.

In the time of Hincmar two more volumes of Christian poets were copied and notes reveal that they were studied: BN lat. 2773, contains much which is also in BN lat. 9347<sup>36</sup> and BN lat. 8086 is a copy of Prudentius<sup>37</sup>, Paris BN lat. 10293 is a copy of Isi-

32 Flodoard III, 23, p. 307.

33 Jean DEVISSE, Hincmar, Archevêque de Reims 845–882, Genève 1997, p. 917–964, 1475–1514. Martina STRATMANN, Hincmar von Reims, Collectio de Ecclesiis et capellis, Hannover 1990, p. 28–30; Rudolf SCHIEFFER, Hincmar von Reims, De divortio Lotharii regis et Theutbergae reginae, Hannover 1992, p. 39, 48–50, 65–69.

34 Bischoff was convinced that these were the scribes who had supplied and prepared the parchment. PARKES, Their Hands Before Our Eyes (as note 2), p. 88–93 regards them as the scribes of the sections and has found them in other manuscripts and the two articles by Vezin cited there.

35 The other Carolingian copy, in Vienna lat. 550, was not localized by Bischoff.

36 Cf. Joanna STORY, Aldhelm and Old St Peter's Rome, in: Anglo-Saxon England 39 (2010), p. 7–20.

37 Bischoff noted a draft of a poem on f 77r, which is too rubbed to be legible on the poor microfilm on »Gallica«, and good chancery minuscule on f 76v.

dorus, »Etymologiae« from St Thierry and Reims 426 the St Remi copy. Works of patristic theology assembled and studied by Hincmar are BN lat. 12132 Hilary, »de Trinitate«, Hague ms 75 B 24 Liberatus of Carthage, Reims 46 Victor of Capua, Reims 70 Praedestinatus, Reims 373 Optatus (from Corbie), 384 Tyconius, »Liber Regularum«, 390 Augustinus, »de Trinitate«, of which another Reims copy was Paris BN lat. 18104<sup>38</sup>. Montpellier 407 is a twin of Reims 391 Augustinus, »de fide et operibus«, »de cura pro mortuis gerenda«, »de continentia«<sup>39</sup>. BN lat. 1988 (f 110–166) Augustinus, »Ennarationes in Psalmos« has a section by Reims scribes working with others. Klosterneuburg 783 is Augustinus, »de doctrina christiana«. Reims 1351 Eusebius-Rufinus, is a text quoted by Hincmar in his letters<sup>40</sup>. Reims 374 contains the »Apologeticum« of Gregory of Nazianz, quoted in 860. Vat. Reg. lat. 213 Hieronymus, »in Ezechielem« belonged to St Remi.

Reims 377 deserves more attention. It contains Ambrose, »de Mysteriis« f 10v, »de Sacramentis« f 32r, »de Paradyso« f 32r, »de Virginibus« f 63r, Rufinus, »de Fide Symboli« (as a work of Augustine) f 81r, Victor »de Lapsis«. Bischoff would have noted the names entered in the separate sections of this manuscript: f 1r *pars huberti*, f 63r *pars aderhardi*, f 109r *pars berulfi* and the Tironian notes in »De Paradiso« on folia 44v, 47v, 48r, 48v, 49v, 51r, 51v, 52v, 54v, 60v, 61r, 61v and 62r. Hincmar also completed the Reims set of the »Moralia« for Ste Marie now Reims 99, 100, and 101. Vat. Reg. lat. 272 Alcuin, »Epistolae« was copied in the 860's. Reims 129 is a Reims made copy of Hrabanus, »in libros Regum«, Laon 342 »Liber Pontificalis« soon came to Laon.

Classical texts were fewer: Leiden Voss lat. Q 116 contains the lists of Latin words made by Festus and Nonius. Another Reims copy of Nonius is now Bamberg Class 30 and New York Morgan 906 is a copy of Phaedrus; another Reims copy of Phaedrus perished in the 1774 fire. Vat. lat. 1669 is the Reims glossed Vergil<sup>41</sup>, and Florence Laur Strozzi CXVII a glossed Horace.

Reims scribes copied more canon law texts than any other Carolingian scriptorium and were supplying canon law books to other places. St Gall 727 Ansegisus and Benedictus Levita went to St Gall and Vat. Reg. lat. 1045 Council of Chalcedon to St Germain. Berlin 1741 and Paris BN lat. 12445 both copies of the Dionysio-Hadriana stayed at St Remi; Bern 425 and Vat. Reg. lat. 845 are copies of the important systematic early Carolingian »Collectio Dacheriana«, BN lat. 4280A Canons, Vat. Reg. lat. 1046 the acts of the Council of Nicea was given to St Remi by Sichelmus. Merseburg 100 is another Reims copy of the »Collectio Dacheriana« while the copy of this in Vat. Reg. lat. 1000A belonged to St Thierry. Vat. lat. 1337 (here called *canones*) is the »Concordia canonum« of Cresconius. Milan A 46 inf. is a Reims copy of Florus's canonical collection. There were also important books of secular law: Berlin Philipps 1762 and BN lat. 10758 Ansegis, and collections of capitularies in The Hague

38 Hincmar received a copy of the text from Hrabanus in 850 and quoted it in works of 857.

39 Hincmar quoted the »de fide et operibus« in 858.

40 MIGNE PL 126, col. 365.

41 This manuscript is the subject of an exemplary study by Silvia OTTAVIANO, *Il Reg. Lat. 1669: un'edizione di Virgilio d'età carolingia*, in: *Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae* 16 (2009), p. 259–324.

10 D 2 and Paris BN lat. 10758. In addition there here are nine extant copies of works of Hincmar written at Reims.

Bischoff drew attention to the work of Framegaudus, a recluse working for and perhaps at Reims who copied Paris Arsenal 852, Isidore, »Sententiae«: BN lat. 2731 A Ambrosius Autpertus and »Liber precum« and the Gospels BN lat. 17969. Reims was involved in the production of luxury Gospel books with evangelist portraits<sup>42</sup>. Artists found in Reims Gospel books seem to have worked with scribes from outside Reims, as in Paris BN lat. 265. Gospel Books copied during Hincmar's episcopate are Paris BN lat. 17968, New York Morgan 728, London BL Harley 2797, and Harley 2826. Reims 7 is a Gospel book which Hincmar gave to St Thierry, and Reims 11 the purple Gospels for St Marie.

The following books copied at Reims came to other libraries in the course of the ninth century:

BN lat. 2792 Gregorius, »Moralia« to St Denis;  
BN lat. 9555 Cassiodorus »Expositio Psalmorum« to Echternach;  
St Gall 106 is a Reims written copy of a commentary on Job.

Four Reims volumes came to St Amand: Valenciennes 167 Augustinus, »Enchiridion«, 203 Jonas Aurelianensis, »de Institutione regia«, 285 Smaragdus, »Expositio libri comitis«, and 293 Chalcidius. Is the Smaragdus related to the St Bertin copy now St Omer BM 257?

Scribes from Reims and St Amand worked together in Valenciennes 174 Bede and St Amand also owned manuscripts from Fleury, Arras, Reims, the Loire, the Court, St Denis, and Tours. In making such distinctions Bischoff's awareness of how the origins of a book and its ninth century ownership differed is shown to be essential.

Since Bischoff supplied Munk Olsen with lists of manuscripts of classical authors, students of the classics will find few new discoveries, but some changes of date deserve notice. Paris BN lat. 8039 f 1–50 is a copy of Lucan dating to around 900 which has apparently never been collated, and BN lat. 10310 from Autun s IX med may be the oldest extant copy of Horace, it had previously been dated to the end of the century. The Lucan from Tours BN lat. 7502 f 155–206 is dated to the first third of the ninth century, it had previously been dated to the end. Bischoff suggests here that the damaged copy of Cicero, »de Officiis« in BN lat. 6347 f 49–56 was written at Corbie, (though the good half uncial on f 54r is not standard Corbie script). There is still crucial work to be done on the transmission and use of Isidore's »Etymologiae«. I count twelve manuscripts in Paris which were not used by Lindsay or Reydellet<sup>43</sup>.

42 Wilhelm KOEHLER, Florentine MÜTHERICH, *Die karolingischen Miniaturen*, vol. VI/1–2: *Die Schule von Reims*, Berlin 1994–1999.

43 BN lat. 7582–7585, 7587 (books 11–20, Mainz), 7670 (books 1–6 close to Paris), 7671 (books 1–2), 8812 (books 2–3, ?Aniane), 10291–10293 (Reims) and 14085 (Corbie); Wallace M. LINDSAY (ed.), *Isidorus Etymologiae*, Oxford 1911; Marc REYDELLET, *La diffusion des »Origines« d'Isidore de Séville au haut Moyen Âge*, in: *École française de Rome. Mélanges d'archéologie et d'histoire* 78 (1966), p. 384–436.

## VI

The »Katalog« is instructive about the circulation of works of Carolingian exegetes: Reims 130 Walahfrid on the Old Testament was given by Probus to Reims, other copies listed here are St Gall 283 from St Gall, Wolfenbüttel Weiss 29 (as Hrabanus) and Vat. Reg. lat. 530 fragments from Tours.

The following copies of works of Hrabanus Maurus were made west of the Rhine:

Vat. Reg. lat. 91 Hrabanus, »in Genesin«. Eastern France;

Troyes 559 Hrabanus, »in Exodum« copied at Fulda came to St Germain des Prés;

Vercelli 153 Hrabanus, »in Deuteronomium« was copied at Reims and given to Vercelli by Hincmar;

BN lat. 2426 Hrabanus, »in Numerorum« was copied in central France and came to St Denis;

Reims 129 Hrabanus, »in Libros Regum« was copied at Reims;

BN lat. 11683 Hrabanus, »in Matthaum« was copied at St Germain des Prés, and the same work is in Tours 106 copied at Tours. We can only imagine how these texts crossed the Rhine: Hrabanus sent copies of his Old Testament commentaries to Freulf of Lisieux<sup>44</sup>, Frederick of Utrecht<sup>45</sup> and Hilduin of St Denis<sup>46</sup>.

## VII

Dating queries: The treatise on the soul in Paris BN 4883 f 1–7 and the Passionale and sermon collections in Paris BN lat. 17625–17626 seem later than the ninth century, as does St Omer 764, »Vita Wandregisili«<sup>47</sup>. Troyes 804 f 1–79 is dated »IX. Jh., Anfang«, but contains works by Florus of Lyons and Adrevald of Fleury. The Stockholm Gregorian Sacramentary A 136 refers to Charles the Bald as emperor and so can be securely dated to 876–877.

There are minor errors of identification. Paris BN lat. 13909 is titled »Vita S. Arsenii«, but it is the biography of Wala of Corbie known as the »Epitaphium Arsenii« and Vienna 449 »Codex Carolinus« is called »Liber Carolinus«. »Canones« is used to identify the following manuscripts of the Dionysio-Hadriana, BN lat. 1452 (Vienne, last quarter of the ninth century), 3838, 3844 (Loire, s IX 2/4), 3846, 12445 (Reims, s IX 3/4), 12446 (Lyon, s IX 2/4), 12447 (Southern France, s IX 4/4), 12448 (Northern Italy, s IX ex.), Reims 671 (Reims), Rome Vallicelliana A 5 (Rome, s IX 3/4), Vat. Pal. lat. 577 (Main region), Vat. Pal. lat. 578 (Mainz), Vat. Reg. lat. 1043 (Burgundy), Vat. lat. 1337 (Upper Rhine, s IX in.), Wolfenbüttel Weiss 3 (Wissembourg, s IX in.), Washington Library of Congress Ms 90 no 2 and 3, Würzburg m. p. th. F. 3 (Main region, s IX in.), Würzburg m. p. th. f 70 (Italy).

44 MGH Epp., vol. 5, p. 393–400.

45 Ibid., p. 400–401.

46 Ibid., p. 401–403.

47 This important illustrated manuscript was dated tenth century by Cynthia HAHN, *Portrayed on the Heart. Narrative Effect in Pictorial Lives of the Saints from the Tenth through the Thirteenth Century*, Berkeley 2001, p. 214–215.

Readers in search of the curious marginal note in BN lat. 2175 will find it on f 6r not f 3r. I am not clear why the »Katalog« does not include Stuttgart HB VII 43 f 1–146 Amalarius, »Liber Officialis« dated by Autenrieth to the second half of the ninth century<sup>48</sup>. The Schoenberg Collection in Philadelphia now owns a glossed copy of Boethius's translation of the »Periermenias« from Fleury, datable to the ninth century (but with eleventh century restoration of f 1–4 and 45–64)<sup>49</sup>. This was still in private hands when the »Katalog« was compiled.

## VIII

My own work makes it possible to augment some of Bischoff's entries for Valenciennes manuscripts, keeping his localizations and dates<sup>50</sup>:

Ms 47: ff 88, 248 mm x 170 mm, 29 lines, Bede, »in Parabolis« very small script starts with the verses *Beda dei famulus* MGH Poetae, vol. 2, p. 665; f 87v–88r by a later scribe North East France, s IX med;

ms 51: ff 81, 256 x 180, 25 lines, main text is Aponius, »in Cant«, f 1v title in good monumental capitals in alternate black and red lines, f 52 is a letter of Hincmar, Ep. XXXIV to John of Cambrai (866–879), Migne PL 126, col. 253, f 53r excerpts of Augustine, »de Trinitate«, (these may correspond to the excerpts in Boulogne BM 51), Letter of Sigwaldus of Aquileia to Charlemagne (MGH Epp., vol. 4, p. 505), Carolingian binding. Reims, s IX 3/4;

ms 72: ff 119, 141 x 116, 20 lines, front flyleaf liturgical Pseudo-Hieronymus, »in IV Evangelia«, starting *Primus* (sic) *querendum est omnium librorum tempus*, f 108–119r brief lives of the popes, listing the number of bishops they ordained, ending with names of popes to Leo IV, though the text stops with Stephan I; the work of several scribes. Reims region, s IX/X;

ms 73: a twelfth century manuscript which includes f 152v–r a leaf with easter tables and marginal annals 22 lines edited MGH SS, vol. 13, p. 38 with stub before f 144. St Amand, s IX 2/2;

ms 76: Beda, »in Marcum« ff 139, 286 x 195, 28 lines, scriptural text in uncials. Lyons, s IX 3 or 4/4;

ms 81: Alcuin, »In Iohannem« ff 102, 250 x 225, 31 lines, small elegant hand the pastedown shows an offset f 5r Franco-Saxon in Principio with silver f 102v glosses quoting magister Fergus and Greek. Reims, s IX 4/4;

ms 95: f 1–95, 230 x 175; Junilius, f 29r Eucharius titles in red, 24 lines, f 95v »Confessio«. St Amand, s IX ex;

48 JOHANNA AUTENRIETH, *Die Handschriften der ehemaligen Hofbibliothek Stuttgart*, vol. 3: *Codices iuridici et politici*. Patres, Wiesbaden 1963, p. 187–188.

49 Ms LJS 101 olim Phillippus 2179. Sold from the Beck collection at Sothebys in 1997. The manuscript has been fully digitized and may be viewed on the Penn in hand website.

50 BISCHOFF, *Katalog*, p. 393–401. I do not include those manuscripts which Bischoff discussed in his account of St Amand and Salzburg in *Schreibschulen* (as note 7), vol. 2 or the Gospels Valenciennes BM 69, discussed by KÖHLER, MÜTHERICH, *Die karolingischen Miniaturen* (as note 42), vol. 7, Berlin 2009, p. 323–327.



part 2 f 96–230; Honorius and Jordanes, »Romania and Getica«, 21 lines, *Lege Felix* at start by 2 hands, 21 lines, text has been corrected, good red capitalis titles f 1r *Omnis qui peccatum facit servus est peccati*, f 167 change of scribe. Loire, s IX 4/4;

ms 147: ff 144, 250 x 230 mm, 28 lines, Lactantius, »Divinae institutiones« I–VI textually linked to the Corbie copy BN lat. 1662. A second scribe takes over at f 90r. There are extensive marginal notes. The text seems unrelated to Vat. Pal. lat. 161 copied by Lotharius at St Amand. Reims, s IX 3/4;

ms 150: ff 143, 237 x 150, 24 lines, Gregory of Nazianz, »Apologeticum«, »Homiliae«. These works of Gregory are also found on Lyons BM 599 copied for Leidrad of Lyons before 814 and in Boulogne 30. Bischoff attributes the Valenciennes manuscript to the court s IX 1/4: he dated the sequences the Old French Eulalia and Ludwigslied s IX ex (not St Amand);

ms 160: 252 x 190, 23 lines, f 1–110 Augustinus, »Contra Cresconium«, linked to Boulogne 60 and BN lat. 12221. Corbie, Reims;

f 111r–140r, Nicholas I, »Ad Michaelem Imperatorem«, 28 lines. Northern Italy, s IX 1/4;

f 141v–157v, »Vita s. Launomari«, 26 lines. Blois, s IX 3/4?;

ms 161: f 1v–188, 295 x 260, 24 lines, Augustinus, »Rectactatio«, »Questiones in Heptateuchum«, f 6v good red and black headings Carolingian marginal notes. Textually linked to the Fulda written ms Paris 1951 which was at Corbie? Loire, s IX 4/4;

ms 162: ff 88, 182 x 130, 22 lines, Augustinus, »de natura et origine animae«, f 74r–86r »Epistola ad Hieronymum«, f 86v »Hymnum de sancta Adalberga«, f 87r–88r Capitulary fragment distinctive Fleury »st« ligature. Carolingian binding. Fleury Auxerre;

ms 163: ff 138, 275 x 180, 23 lines, f 4r Augustinus, »De Quantitate Animae«, f 80r »Epistula ad Petrum«, f 97r »de Natura et origine Animae«, f 108r change of hand, f 1 and f 138 Mortuary Roll s XII. The »de Quantitate Animae« is linked to the Tours ms London BL Harley 3012. St Denis, s IX 2/4, the »de Natura Animae« text in 162 and 163 are related. The manuscript belonged to Hucbald;

ms 166: ff 176, 260 x 192, 30 lines, Augustinus, »de Trinitate« has marginal comments *optime exposuit*, *magnifice*, *satis magnifice totum* and chapter titles in capitalis red rustic. North of Paris, s IX 3/4 or 4/4. The manuscript belonged to Hucbald;

ms 167: f 1–83, 183 x 159, Augustinus, »Enchiridion« owned by Hucbald, text starts f 4v after prayers, marginal notes f 70, f 78r »Ratio in hoc universaliter«, f 83v quotes Augustinus, »de vera religione«. Reims, s IX 3/4. The flyleaf is from Augustine »in Ev. Johannis«;

ms 172: ff 80, 285 x 190, 29 lines, Cassiodorus, »Institutiones humanae«, f 1r title in black and red alternate lines, good monumental caps; f 11r alternate red and green capitalis for start of »Dialectica« with supplement has important glosses to Cassiodorus; on f 7r the gloss quotes Cicero, »in libris de oratione« and gives biblical examples for the various *species definitionis*. Green highlighting of initials. St Amand s IX 1/4; f 84v *Quattuor a quadro consurgunt* Quires signed with Roman numerals;

ms 173: f 1v–58, 223 x 165, Isidorus, »Soliloquia«, 18 lines red and green capitals for incipit f 2r. St Amand, s IX 3/4;

f 59–108r »Passio s. Sebastiani«, »Passio Sanctorum Martyrum Marii et Marthae«. St Amand, s IX 2/4;

f 108v–110v »Passio S Quintini« (f 111–113 are twelfth century), f 114v–154 (not 152 as reported by Bischoff) Prosper, 25 lines, Southern France. This is the oldest witness to Prosper;

ms 174: ff 170, 245 x 145, 23 lines, Beda, »de Natura Rerum«, f 13 »de Temporibus«, f 23r »Epistula ad Wicthdum«, f 29 *computistica* with glosses including on f 30v *Martianus Autem aliter Dicit*, f 32v–40r Calendar with local obits from the 870's, f 41r Aulus Gellius, »Noctium atticarum Libro IIII Cap VI de ligno Palmae«, f 41v Jordanes on the birth of Christ and an excerpt from Varro, f 42r–168r »de Natura Rerum« with extensive glosses, f 46r Bede, »in Genesin« and Augustinus, »de Vera innocentia« as glosses, f 29r Astronomical notes on place of the planets in 770 and 794 ending *Discite o iuvenes cum Abraham caeli et siderum cursus cognoscere, non cum epicurio voluptatem ventri deservire et luxuriate*. On f 125v a marginal gloss calculates the *annus presens* as 874, on f 168v in margin names of bishops. Reims and St Amand, s IX 4/4;

ms 195: ff 90, 240 x 173, 19 lines, Alcuin, »De Fide S. Trinitatis«, f 76r–90v »de animae ratione«. Bischoff thought that this book was copied in Southern England, it might also be the work of a Mercian scribe working on the continent, as f 9 is the work of a scribe trained in the elaborate cursive scribe of Carolingian charters. Dr Herrad Spilling kindly tells me that she does not think it can be the work of an insular scriptorium on the continent, though the clumsy pen initials are without parallel in extant English manuscripts;

ms 203: ff 148, 220 x 182, 21 lines, Jonas Aurelianensis, »de institutione laicorum«, excellent capitalis, titles f 148r at base *de his qui ecclesiastica ministerial praeter ecclesiam faciunt ex concilio Gangernse Cap VI*. Reims, s IX 3/4;

ms 288: flyleaves A and B Fulgentius, »Mythologiae IX–XIX Expositio sermone« in tiny script 260 x 190, 43 lines;

f 1–87 Glosses on the »Regula Benedicti«, sources include Gregory, Augustine, Ambrose, Jerome, Basil, Bede, Fructuosus, Pachomius, Cassiodorus, Cassian, Isidore, Cyprian, Origen, 27 and 22 lines, text of the Rule in a clumsy uncial, s IX 1/4. The manuscript belonged to Hucbald<sup>51</sup>;

Part 2 f 88r–105r »Regula Isidori«, f 105v–115v »Regula Fructuosi«, Explicit f 115r–119 »Regula Fausti«. On f 97 script gets much smaller, s IX 1/4. Bischoff did not assign a place of origin for either part;

ms 293: f 2–131, 254 x 226, 24 lines, Chalcidius f 1v has accounts of Plato by Ambrose and Jerome marginal index and notes Quires signed with Greek letters, distinctive Irish inspired ligatures f 74r. Reims, s IX 3/4;

ms 293 f 132–154, 229 x 207, Lupus, »de Tribus Quaestionibus«, f 145v dedicatory Epistle to Charles, f 148 Lupus, »Collectaneum de Tribus Quaestionibus«. 24 lines in a very small hand. The quires are fastened by tackets, suggesting that the volume arrived unbound at St Amand;

ms 294: ff 51, 250 x 185, 32 lines, Cassiodorus, »de Anima«, 32 lines a leaf missing: f 20r »Divinae Institutiones«, 28 lines. St Amand, s IX 4/4;

ms 337: ff 79, 252 x 151, 48 lines, f 1v Priscian, »de Figuris Numerorum«, f 4v »de Metris Fabularum«, f 6v »Praexercitamina«, f 10r Alcuin, »de Rhetorica et Virtuti-

51 This text is being edited by Prof M. van der Meer, Syracuse University.

bus«, f 18r Alcuin, »de Dialectica« with glosses including some Greek, f 26r »Map-pae Clavicula«, f 32r »Podismus mensurarum«, f 37r a glossary of Greek words, Popina 54 lines. West Germany, s IX med;

f 38r–41 Hyginus, »Astronomica« misbound 55 lines very small hand with large initials; s IX 2nd half;

ms 384: ff 85, 208 x 200, 27 lines, f 1r–15r. Red Uncial *Incipit Iuxta Sanctum Isidorum ars Musica*, f 5v–53r Augustinus, »de Musica«, D and M headings omitted, f 42r change of hand quires signed roman in centre, from f 67r marginal notes, f 85v »OSD CHD« at end of text. Bischoff commented »Nicht St Amand aber Gegend« though this is not in the »Katalog«. Carolingian binding on the front flyleaf a list of books s XI;

ms 392: ff 71, 230 x 180, 27 lines, Alcuin, »Epitome Prisciani«, good black capitalis headings several scribes, f 39r start of Alcuin, »De virtutibus«, f 47v excerpts from Gregory and Augustine, 56r change of hand, Carolingian binding. Reims, s IX ex;

ms 393: ff 158, 211 x 132, 30 lines, Alcuin, »Epitome Prisciani«, capitula text starts f 4v »Albini in Priscian«, red uncial headings Aldhelm Servius »Nt«, »rg«, »ro«, »rt« ligatures, heightened »e«, open »a«, bow of »g« open, »mus« with reversed »c« over »m«, distinctive capital »ET« f 33r, smaller scribe f 77r »Sententi Hieronimi de utilitate artis Grammaticae«. Item Augustinus, »Ait Terentius« f 77v, Donatus »Ortigraphus« f 112r, »Incipiunt Pauca de Barbarismis Collecta de Multis« f 123r, »Incipiunt Glose de Libris Gramaticorum«, »De Littera et Syllaba et Accentu et Posituris« f 125r, Greek alphabet f 126r, Hebrew alphabet added in margin s XI f 129r »de Digamma« f 139v, f 142v »De Pedum Regulis Aldhelmi« f 152r, »Incipit Conlatio de Generibus Metrorum« f 155r–157v, Servius, »de Centimetro«, f 158r later pen drawing of standing haloed cleric. West France, s IX 1/2;

ms 394: f 1–90, 232 x 155, 27 lines, f 1–6v Phocas, »Ars de nomine«, f 7–16v Priscianus, »Institutio de nomine«, heavily glossed title in capitalis. North France 3/4.

Priscian, »Partitiones«, f 17r–54r, f 54v »is Dicuil« (MGH Poetae, vol. 2, p. 667–668). Normandy or Arras, s IX 2/4;

f 55–90 »Commentarius in Vergilium Eclogas«<sup>52</sup>, f 34 lines f 71v signed »t«, f 72 change of hand to a clumsy one, s IX 4/4;

ms 395: ff 101, 52 x 173, 29 lines, Marius Victorinus, »Ars Grammatica«, Book III ends blank, f 72r *Utere Stephane scriptor et lector*, f 72r–77r Treatise on the Metres of Horace, f 77r »Proba«, 2 column layout red uncial section titles f 84r, Servius, »de Metris« f 87–101r, Aldhelm, »de Metris« f 101v, Carolingian binding. St Amand, s IX in; this manuscript belonged to Hucbald.

ms 399: f 2–207, 325 x 200, 40 lines, Isidore, »Etymologiae«, f 2r chapters in 2 columns, f 5r interlace initial and capitals »Disciplina a discendo« bow of »g« is open »ct« ligature or ligature long head of f 7r, Neums f 8r, Tironian f 20r, »R« with interlace at start of book II, f 31v, 32r–v, geometrical figures f 39r, »M« with interlace at start of book IV, f 43v »M« at start of book 5, f 53r »V« at start of »VI«, quires signed with letters in centre f 62v, change of hand f 64v, f 12r, f 143r in caps *Explicit liber secundus, Incipit liber tertius*, chapter list in uncial f 69v–140v chapter headings in large caps, f 132r title to book XIII, f 143r chapter titles in red uncial, from f 148v *con enim IN monogram qo h*, f 180r distinctive cursive »te« ligature, f 188 chapters begin with

52 This work has been attributed to Remigius: Augustine is quoted f 69v.

red uncials titles written in margin in capitalis by a later hand, f 207v colophon *Qui scribere nescit* ends *Vale in Xpo omnes qui legitis obsecro ut pro bono scriptorem orare non dedigmini*. Greek alphabet with numerical values of letters, flyleaf f 1v *in natalium plurimarum virg* neumed. North or North East France, s IX in. The manuscript belonged to Hucbald;

ms 404: ff 118, 219 x 148, 26 lines, Isidore, »Liber de Rethorica et Dialectica«, red capitalis chapter headings »de Rhetorica« f 13, »Dialectica« f 27–56r, Alcuin »de Rhetorica et Virtutibus«, purple infill in Q, red and purple caps for title, distinctive question mark, insular *enim*, f 56v diagrams, f 57r »Sententiae Septem Sapientium« with Greek, f 60r–61v Origen, »in Canticum canticorum«, Prologus, f 61v–62r »Dicta Sybili«, f 62r–65 Sybilline cento, f 65r »Iuditii Signum«, f 66r Dicuil, »Computus« with Tironian annotations on f 76–77, curved »d«, »&«, in words »re« ligature »orum«, red initials, f 114v–115r change of hand, Carolingian binding, s IX 3/4. The manuscript belonged to Hucbald;

ms 405: ff 68, 236 x 143, 22 lines, »Oratio S. Eugenii Rex deus in mense«, f 1v »Versus in vela«, f 2v »Versi Albinus de cuculo«, f 3r »Rumpitur invidia« = Martial IX 97, f 3v »Epitaphium bonifacii papae«, »Gregorii pape«, »Epitaphium Monice« f 4r heading in red »Karolus Rex de Rhetorica, de Dialectica«, red initials »qi« with »I« above accents, »tn«, »tm«, »con«, »q« with 3 dots for »qui«, »rt«, »orum«, »enim«, »p« with »t« above *vel* insular *autem*, »a« sometimes has a loop f 24r, f 35v *figurae*, f 40r *quia mentionem* has red numbered headings in minuscule or clumsy capitals, f 67v *Qui rogo civiles*, f 68v entries by various hands *vae genti inopi*, *Famelici pulites*, *Ars et ingenium* on the end flyleaf various notes in ninth century hands, *virgo quasi virago Veritas Spongia felle et aceto plena*. West Germany, s IX 2/4;

ms 407: f 2–232, Virgil with extensive glosses which include references to Johannes Scotus and to Fulco, perhaps the archbishop of Reims;

ms 411: ff 140, 167 x 132, 16 lines, M. Plotius Sacerdos f 2–57r, f 57v Servius, »de Centum Metris«, f 69r »de Metris Boethii«, f 75r–88v »Proverbia Senecae, f 88v »Anthologia latina«, f 90r–105r Seneca, »Apocolocyntosis« (on f 102r 2 column layout), f 106r–136v Walahfrid, »Visio Wettini«, f 137v »de diversis vocalibus nimpharum«, f 139r verses names of the Muses. North East France, in part Reims, s IX 4/4. The manuscript belonged to Hucbald;

ms 415: ff 66, 186 x 149, 19 lines, small square format, Milo and Hucbald »Carmina«, f 1v notes on length of lives of men, *cornicis, cervi, corvi*, list of names, Stephanus f 2r–3r »Conflictus veris et hiemis« (title re-inked s XV), f 3v–4v Hucbald, »Aurea lux mundi«, red title and initials of each line, f 5r *Si bene te tua laus taxat sua laute tenebis* written as a cross, f 5v alternative red and green initials with glosses, f 6v Milo, »de Sobrietate«, title page in red and green lines. Nota annotations throughout, marginal notes in an insular hand *honestas verborum pernecessaria est*. On f 65r sketch of a cleric. Carolingian binding. St Amand, s IX 3/4;

ms 510: ff 88, 185 x 118, 20 lines, f 1r blank, f 1v–7r »de Cotideanis diebus«, Prayers, f 7r »super oblata«, f 8r »Passiones sanctorum« first 12 lines rewritten s XII, f 38v large capitals for incipit of »Vita Hucberti«, »r« large initial »B«? St Hubert. This manuscript is dated to the tenth century on »Gallica«;

ms 518: ff 164, 192 x 135, Martinellus, f 162–164 Isidore »Sententiae« 2 44. Large early Tours script Carolingian binding, s IX 4/4;

ms 521: ff 164, 190 x 135, 27 lines, f 1–26r Heraclides, »Paradisus«, f 30v »Passio S Mametis«, 30 lines »Passio Pantaleonis«, f 42r–44v »Vita S. Benigni«, f 69r–71r »Passio S. Luciae«, f 75r–84v »Vita Sancte Eufrosine« in very clumsy script, f 84v–106r »Conversatio Beatae Melaniae« on f 101r a better scribe intervenes. North East France, s IX 3/4;

ms 545: Orosius ff 124, 296 x 220, 2 columns of 30 lines by several scribes with marginal glosses in the geographical section f 4v–8r. North East France, s IX 2/4.

## IX

The work of Bischoff has made it possible to survey the Carolingian renaissance in a more comprehensive way. The kinds of investigations pioneered by Ezio Ornatò and Peter Gumbert, who urged manuscript scholars to embrace statistics, are now possible. In an ideal world, his photographs would be digitized: as it is, the number of manuscripts which can be studied online is increasing daily. New finds continue to be made: perhaps the most important are the Latin manuscripts from Mount Sinai, which included a palimpsested text in insular script and a Psalter with remarkable initials. Scientific analysis of ink, pigment and even manuscript DNA is refining our knowledge of the manuscript as object, and reminding us of its place in medieval economic history. With Bischoff's »Katalog« the investigation of Carolingian scriptoria, which in Germany began with Paul Peiper's remarkable 1899 study of Otfrid, has an indispensable tool. Scholars will want to consult the notes and photographs in Munich: it is unlikely that anyone will ever see as many Carolingian manuscripts, and know what to look for and how to interpret it.

## Appendix

*Manuscripts copied in the reign of Charlemagne listed in this volume*

Manuscripts also described in »Codices Latini Antiquiores«: I assume they are also included here because Bischoff thought that they might have been written before 800 or soon after. They represent about one tenth of all of the manuscripts in »CLA«.

Paris Arsenal 599, BN lat 260, 653, 1451, 1564, 1603, 1718, 1853, 2296, 2326, 2360, 2843A, 3784, 3836, 3848B, 4568, 7906, 8921, 9380, 9451, 10318, 10457, 11529–11530, 11627, 12171, 12217 12226, 12240, 12254, 12260, 12527, 12598, 13159, 13386, 13396 13440, 15304–15305, 17177, 17371, 17959, 18282, nouv. acq. lat. 203, 1587, 1597, 1629, St Geneviève 55, 63, Perugia 2, Poitiers 17, Prag Sacramentary, Princeton Scheide 69, Reims 435, Rome Sess 94, 590, Vitt Emm 1357, Salzburg a VII 3, a X 23, M I 478, M III 18, St Gall 12, 75, 110, 120, 125, 133, 185, 193, 216, 227, 229, 230, 259, 348, 350, 548, 549, 552, 567 (2 entries), 722 (2 entries), 903, 908, 911, 1394 (3 entries), 1396 (2 entries), 1399, St Paul 7/1, St Paul 9/1, Schaffhausen 78, 80, Schweinfurt Frag 3, Solothurn R 1 3 192, R 1 3 193, S 1 539, Stuttgart Klosterarchiv, Stuttgart Cod. Theol. 2 208, 2 303, Stuttgart HB II 35, HB VI 107, HB VI 113, Stuttgart fragm. 47, Tours 10, Trier 22, Troyes 581, 657, 853, Turin D V 3, F V III 16, F VI 2, Utrecht 1003, Valenciennes 414, Vat. Basil H 25, Vat. Barb. lat. 679, Vat. Pal. lat. 67, 177, 187, 188, 202, 207, 212, 216, 218, 238, 245, 487, 493, 554, 560, 577, 814, 822, 966, 1746, 1753, Vat. Reg. lat. 762, 1040, 1997, Vat. lat. 553, 583, 1322, 1512, 3835, 3861, 5007, 5359, 5465, 7016, 7207, 7809, 10644, 13501, Verona LII, LXII, Vienna Schatzkammer Gospels, Vienna 277, 313, 366, 411, 418, 420, 482, 515, 690, 732, 743, 765, 795, 964, 970, 1002, 1114, 1224, 1861, 2141, 2147, 2195, 2233, 15269, Vienna ser. Nov. 2065, 3642, 3748, 3750, Williamstown 7, Wolfenbüttel Helmst 455, 496a, 513, Weiss 14, 24, 34, 64, 67, 74, Würzburg M p th f 4, 5, 19, 42, 46, 64, 67, 79, M p th q 26, 28 (2 items), 31, 32, Zurich C 65, Rh. 30, 92, 140.

The student of manuscripts from the reign of Charlemagne will also want to look at those 125 manuscripts here dated s VIII/IX or » IX. Jh., Anfang« which were not included in »CLA«. Where there is a precise localization I have included it.

Paris BN lat. 528 (St Denis), 1750 f 29–40 (Corbie), 1804 (Burgundy), 1842, 1960, 2123 (Flavigny), 2164 (near to the court), 2175, 2195 (St Denis), 2675, 2796, 3837 (Angers), 3848A (Metz), 4404, 4412 (Burgundy), 4629 (Bourges), 4950, 5584 (Tours), 5596, 5600 part 2, 6796 (Corbie), 7296 (Corbie), 7520 (Reims), 8847 (Tours), 9332 (Fleury), 9377 (Murbach), 9529 (Echternach), 9565 (Echternach), 10457 (Verona), 10601, 11218 (Burgundy), 11682, 11710 (Burgundy), 11711 (Corbie), 11999 (Reims region), 12173 (Corbie), 12176 (Corbie), 12177 (Corbie), 12180 (Corbie), 12218 (Corbie), 13027, 13351 (Corbie), 13359, 13384 (Corbie), 14087 (St Denis), 14088 (Corbie), 14144 (St Germain), nouv. acq. lat. 1740 (Lyon), 2442, Reims 671 (Reims), Rouen 465 (Paris), St Mihiel 29 (Tours), St Omer 15, St Gall 28, 29, 85, 87, 127, 150, 183, 190, 235, 240 (Chelles), 249, 451 (Mainz or Fulda), 876, 916 (all from St Gall save 240 and 541), Stuttgart hist 4 36 (Tours), Stuttgart HB II 54, VII 17, VII 25, Tours 286 (Tours), Trier Priesterseminar 143 (Reims), Trier Stadtbibl Orosius (Murbach), Troyes 1165 (Tours), 1528 (Orléans), Valenciennes 59 (Fleury), 99, 148, 173 flyleaves,

395 (St Amand), 399 flyleaves, and main ms Vat. Ottob lat. 2225, Vat. Pal. lat. 168, 169, 170 (Lorsch), 186 (Lorsch), 189, 195 (Lorsch), 556, 829 (Lorsch), 1447 (Mainz), 1448, 1719 (Lorsch), Reg. lat. 76, 116 (Orléans), 310 (St Denis, 3 items), 586 (Lake Constance), 1625 f 78, Vat. lat. 7277 (? Flavigny), Vercelli CXLVIII, Verona VIII, XVI, LXVII, LXXXVI, XCII, CI (all Verona), Vienna 371 (St Amand), 489 (St Amand), 737 (Salzburg), 934 (Salzburg), 997 (Salzburg), 1080 (St Amand), 2223, 2232, Wolfenbüttel Weiss 17, 43, 72, 80 (all Wissembourg), 91, Würzburg M p th f 146, 175, Zürich Rh 34 (Verona).