

Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte

Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris

(Institut historique allemand)

Band 27/1 (2000)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.2000.1.46553

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

setze sei es gewesen, »die Juden zu bewegen, auf ihre Identität und religiöse Exklusivität zu verzichten und das Christentum anzunehmen« (S. 227). Im Mittelpunkt der Polemik zwischen Judentum und Kirche hätten deshalb auch theologische Streitfragen gestanden. Zusammenfassend stellt Bredero die These auf, »daß die Kirche trotz der antijüdischen Traditionen, die ihr anhafteten, als sie sich an die mittelalterliche Gesellschaft wandte, nicht für alle Äußerungen von Judenfeindlichkeit und auch nicht für alle Gewalttätigkeiten, denen Juden zum Opfer fielen, verantwortlich gemacht werden kann. In einer Reihe von Fällen hat die Gesellschaft selbst, an der auch die Juden partizipierten, einen entscheidenden Anteil gehabt« (S. 247).

Beigegeben sind dem sorgfältig edierten Band eine umfängliche Bibliographie (S. 259–280) sowie Personen-, Orts- und Sachregister (S. 281–293). Es ist begrüßenswert, daß die an verstreuten Orten erschienenen, in niederländischer Sprache verfaßten Aufsätze Brederos in diesem Sammelband in deutscher Übersetzung vorliegen und es so der Forschung erleichtern, sich mit dessen nicht immer konventionellen Zugängen zur mittelalterlichen Welt auseinanderzusetzen. Der Schwerpunkt des Bandes liegt eindeutig in der Zeit des Hochmittelalters, was auch im Titel hätte zum Ausdruck kommen müssen, um keine falschen Erwartungen zu wecken. Denn vor allem das Frühmittelalter findet insgesamt gesehen trotz gelegentlicher Hinweise zu wenig Beachtung, um den Titel ›Christenheit und Christentum im Mittelalter‹ zu rechtfertigen. Das ist mißlich, weil in dieser Epoche durch Mission und Christianisierung das Fundament für das folgende Verhältnis von Religion, Kirche und Gesellschaft gelegt worden ist, über das Adriaan H. Bredero kenntnisreich berichtet.

Lutz E. VON PADBERG, Paderborn

Aryeh GRABOÏS, *Le pèlerin occidental en Terre sainte au Moyen Âge*, Paris/Brussels (De Boeck) 1998, 266 p. (Bibliothèque du Moyen Âge, 13).

This nicely produced volume is, as its author declares, the product of more than twenty years of research, and it aims at filling a gap in the historiography of medieval pilgrimage. Dedicated to the examination of Christian Holy-Land pilgrimage from western Europe, the book is divided into eight chapters, each of which discusses one aspect of the phenomenon of Holy-Land pilgrimage. In the first chapter, entitled ›Le pèlerin de Jérusalem au moyen âge. Traits caractéristiques‹, the author provides a basic chronological division. According to him, as far as Holy-Land pilgrimage is concerned, the Middle Ages are divided into four periods: the Roman and Byzantine period (saec. IV–VII); the first Muslim period in Palestine (saec. VII–XI); the Crusades (saec. XII–XIII); and the later Middle Ages (saec. XIV–XV). In the second chapter (›Motivations religieuses des pèlerins‹) Graboïs discusses the religious motives that might have led the pilgrims' decision to take the long and arduous route to Jerusalem: the search for the holy and the transcendent discourse with God; the development of the cults of relics; and the emergence of the idea of penitential pilgrimage.

The next four chapters concentrate on the pilgrims themselves. In the third chapter (›Expressions de la mentalité religieuse des pèlerins‹) the author discusses the pilgrims' perception of the heavenly and earthly Jerusalem, their feelings of *contemptus mundi* (to which I shall return later), and the transformation, as he sees it, from individual piety in the earlier period, to collective piety in the later Middle Ages. The pilgrim's perception of time and space, their concept of ›sacred geography‹, and their understanding of the biblical past are all discussed in the fourth chapter under the title ›L'image de Terre saint dans les récits des pèlerines‹; while the physical conditions, that is, the landscape, the accommodation, as well as the various logistic problems with which the pilgrims were faced, are the subject of the

fifth chapter (›Le pèlerin et son environnement‹). Lastly, the sixth chapter explores the pilgrims' knowledge of and attitudes towards the local population (i.e. Eastern Christians, Jews, Samaritans, and Muslims).

The last two chapters are dedicated to the written sources. In chapter seven (›Les récits des pèlerins en tant que témoignage historique‹) the author discusses the nature of our sources and their documentary value; and in the last chapter he surveys the influence of these sources on the writing of history and literature in western Europe. The book ends with two appendices (a chronological list of reports and pilgrims' guides, and a list of Indulgences given to Holy-Land pilgrims in the fourteenth and fifteenth century) and a detailed bibliography of primary and secondary sources.

In ›Le pèlerin occidental en Terre sainte au Moyen Age‹ Aryeh Graboïs offers an introductory, and thoroughly derivative, survey of western pilgrimage to the Holy-Land from its late antique and early Christian roots to the end of the fifteenth century. In a review of this kind it is impossible to comment in detail on all the topics discussed by the author. Therefore, I have chosen to concentrate only on a few points which seem to me the most problematic.

In an attempt to characterise western pilgrimage to the Holy-Land in the early Middle Ages, the author declares that ›L'élément romain, déjà moins bien représenté à la fin de l'époque byzantine, disparut finalement au cours du VII^e siècle, cédant la place à des pèlerins d'origine germanique. Ceux-ci, même s'ils avaient adopté les concepts spirituels de leurs prédécesseurs, avaient une mentalité différente de celle qui avait caractérisé les *peregrini* de l'Antiquité tardive: à culture différente, rites différents« (p. 27 and *passim*). Furthermore, argues Graboïs, western pilgrims before the Crusades felt a *contemptus mundi*, that is, a wish to be apart from the rest of the world around them. Subsequently these pilgrims ignored the Muslims and the Eastern Christians, and therefore did not participate in or comment on daily experience. This characterisation of western pilgrimage before the Crusades is a drastic simplification, not to say a travesty. It ignores the obvious, and emphasises points which gain no support in the sources. To say that all western pilgrims from the seventh century onwards were of ›Germanic‹ origin, is misleading. Indeed, we know that Willibald was an Anglo-Saxon, but we know nothing concerning the ethnic identity of Arculf or Bernard the Monk. Using names as the yardstick for the ethnic identity of a person is always a hazardous task, and more so with regards to seventh- and eighth-century Gaul, where the assimilation of Franks and Gallo-Romans had reached a high level. Thus, using ethnic etiquettes to characterise pilgrims from the later Merovingian or the Carolingian period is anachronistic, and historians worth their salt are expected to avoid them.

Furthermore, to say that these pilgrims did not inherit the classical cultural legacy and had no affinities with Palestinian Christianity is, if meant literally, untenable. Such a claim ignores completely the pervasive continuity which characterised the passage from Late Antiquity to the Middle Ages, a continuity on which most, if not all, scholars nowadays agree. Moreover, to argue that political and ethnic factors brought about a total alienation between pilgrims and the local society of the Holy-Land is at odds with the evidence. For example, the so-called *Commematorium de casis Dei vel monasteriis*, composed at the time of Charlemagne, shows no sign of alienation between Eastern and Western Christians in Jerusalem. The picture which emerges from this short document is that of a lively Christian community, which co-operated and collaborated for the benefit of its status and fate.

The secondary literature which Graboïs reprises, although vast, is often outdated, leading him to repeat or compound factual errors more recently given the decent burials they deserve. The omission of significant and relevant studies from the references (which does not, of course, indicate that the author has failed to read them) is alarming. Items such as Robert Markus' paper ›How on earth could places become holy‹, Dan Bahats article on the

physical infrastructure of Jerusalem, Amnon Linder on the Christian communities of Jerusalem, J. Taylor's book ›Christians and the Holy Places‹, Bianca Kühnel's ›From the Earthly to the Heavenly Jerusalem‹, and Ora Limor's recent book ›Holy Land Travels: Christian Pilgrims in Late Antiquity‹, to give just a few examples, are all conspicuous in their absence.

To sum up, those who already know the existing literature on Holy-Land pilgrimage, will find very little that is new in this book; those who were not convinced by Grabois' arguments in his earlier works, will hardly find this book convincing; and beginners interested in the history of Holy-Land pilgrimage in the Middle Ages are advised to consult older reliable authorities, such as J. Wilkinson, E. D. Hunt, R. L. Wilken, and P. Maraval for the earlier period, and B. Kötting, J. Sumption, J. Chélini and H. Branthome, P.-A. Sigal, and A. Dupront for the later period.

Yitzhak HEN, Haifa

Michael MENZEL, *Predigt und Geschichte. Historische Exempel in der geistlichen Rhetorik des Mittelalters*, Köln (Böhlau) 1998, 435 p. (Beihefte zum Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 45).

Predigt und Geschichte is concerned with the presentation and function of historical material in medieval sermons and sermon-related sources. It examines the growing reliance on secular historical exempla which becomes evident in preaching from the second half of the twelfth century and is associated by the author with a new theological perspective on history. The development reached its peak in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, though its effects continued far beyond this time. The study consists of three principal parts, which deal respectively with historical exempla in *artes praedicandi*, sermons and historiographical works.

Both Greek and Roman rhetoric made references to historical events, primarily to provide positive and negative examples or standards, which could be applied to contemporary life. Early Christian writers used exempla somewhat differently, comparing the ethical values of pagan antiquity and those of Christianity in order to prove the equal moral worth of the latter. During the early Middle Ages, the secular historical exemplum was largely supplanted by exempla drawn from hagiography and Christian history. With the rise of preaching in the twelfth century also came a more pronounced interest in history as a whole.

Only a few *artes praedicandi* actually demonstrate the use of exempla; nonetheless, they offer general reflections with respect to purpose and application. As theology came to be treated as a rational science, new branches of knowledge, including nature and history, were integrated into theological thought. Every aspect of human knowledge gained spiritual significance. The writings of Hugh of St Victor among others promoted a perception of history as a mirror of human nature and the divine plan.

Exempla served to illustrate spiritual principles and, as in classical rhetoric, to substantiate the preacher's reasoning process. Universally acknowledged spiritual precepts did not require proof, but could still be confirmed by argument. Initially kept brief and incidental, exempla were elaborated considerably in the course of the thirteenth century. Although they continued to function as moral incentives or deterrents, they came to be regarded further as necessary components of deductive and inductive reasoning, as explanatory illustrations and even as keys to a transcendent reality. To the laity, exempla offered clarification and mnemonic aids.

The mendicants became the principal champions of the historical exemplum. Historical materials were examined in terms of their utility for preaching and transmitted as separate, interpreted incidents. An analysis of sermon-cycles indicates two basic functions for historical narrative. Exempla may be used to prove the validity of a Christian precept, by refer-