

Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte

Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris

(Institut historique allemand)

Band 27/1 (2000)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.2000.1.46906

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

de compléter un tableau nuancé; Erich MASCHKE, par exemple, pour expliquer la politique urbaine des Staufens, allie volontiers la recherche de leurs intérêts avec un but à signification publique (comme Knut SCHULTZ). Tant de villes sans planification autour d'un même concept, lui paraît impossible. Bernhard TÖPFER distingue, quant à lui, deux types de »fondations«: les anciennes (villes épiscopales, marchés) et les nouvelles, type dominant dans le sud ouest de l'Allemagne mais laissé à l'état d'ébauche en raison de la politique italienne des Staufens. Les perspectives de recherche, enfin, apparaissent nettement: traiter ce thème de la »fondation« à une échelle européenne car la recherche allemande favorise plus les monographies que les études d'ensemble; reprendre les travaux sur l'arrière-pays (Umland) dans la perspective de la domination citadine; développer les enquêtes philologiques et heuristiques, archéologiques et géographiques.

Cette belle livraison des *Oberrheinische Studien* mérite d'être lue, travaillée et continuée dans la perspective d'interdisciplinarité et de comparatisme dont les différents auteurs ont prouvé l'excellence.

Odile KAMMERER, Mulhouse

Armin WOLF, *Die Entstehung des Kurfürstenkollegs 1198–1298. Zur 700jährigen Wiederkehr der ersten Vereinigung der sieben Kurfürsten. Mit 11 genealogischen Tafeln und 8 weiteren Abbildungen*, Idstein (Schulz-Kirchner Verlag) 1998, 224 p. (*Historisches Seminar*, N.F., 11).

In spite of reams that have been devoted to this theme, most recently the origin of the imperial electoral college had been considered an insoluble enigma and as such a waste of time and trouble, until some twenty years ago Armin Wolf began to describe a new method of interpretation. The essential details of his approach are complex and difficult to master, because even in the presence of a firm juristic foundation, the development of the college would abruptly alter direction in ever changing circumstances. The volume under review presents the materials and ideas necessary to a basic understanding of the mysterious rise of the electoral college according to a single underlying principle: those entitled to inherit the imperial throne were entitled to vote in royal elections. The historian's problem is not unlike that of the would-be electoral participants: how does one decide who in the particular case is qualified to represent rights of royal inheritance. The historian's problem is also much deeper, because there is only sparse evidence, not only of the early lines of inherited right, but also of the participants in the elections. The princes eventually decided to limit the body of electors to seven, namely the three Rhenish archbishops plus the count palatine of the Rhine, margrave of Brandenburg, duke of Saxony and king of Bohemia. Yet nowhere has the slightest trace of their reasons been explicitly preserved for posterity.

The vital period in the formation of a college limited to seven is the thirteenth century, to which this book is largely devoted. The situation with respect to sources on electoral participation improves considerably. There were many elections, and the basis of candidacies and electoral participation can be examined in numerous instances. During this period the pool of possible electors slowly diminished as princely lines became extinct. The author provides an extensive examination of the circumstances of these elections in terms of the lines of descent capable of participating. The book seeks to provide, and succeeds admirably in providing, a framework for understanding a dynamic development.

Yet readers who approach it intending to solidify their knowledge of this significant topic are in danger of leaving disappointed. Areas that are as yet underdeveloped are so many that only specialists in the subject matter may find a helpful resolution of the major issues. Even in the fundamental account of the sources for electoral participation there are problematical

gaps. The letter of Pope Innocent IV praising those who elected William of Holland (1247) refers to the counts of Geldern and Looz, neither of whom appears in Wolf's tables of the daughter lines. Similarly, there is no genealogical explanation for the successful candidacies in 1292 of Konrad of Teck and Adolf of Nassau, although in every other case the hereditary credentials of candidates are examined. For a discussion of the candidacies of 1292 one must consult Wolf's previous book – *König für einen Tag: Konrad von Teck, gewählt, ermordet (?) und vergessen* (Kirchheim unter Teck 1993) – where some details concerning Geldern and Looz emerge in the discussion, although their relevance is not thoroughly appraised there. In the present book, these materials are absent. In a case that rests primarily on minute and intricate details, large issues remain unaddressed.

Nor is the non-electoral political function of the electors taken into consideration. The obscure Swabian prince Rudolf of Habsburg, elected and crowned in 1273, persuaded the electors nine years later to approve the installment of his sons in the vacant duchies of Austria and Styria. Clearly there is a profound theme here, one that would lead beyond the confines of this book and is thus rightly omitted. Nevertheless, falling as it does well within the period of development, this event must ultimately impact heavily on interpretations of the college's formation, perhaps even on the manner in which the electors arrogated a right, previously claimed by the pope, to administer the empire during an interregnum. One can fairly say that the book is addressed towards the mechanics of the formation, whereas a coherent description of the development is left to subsequent efforts.

In keeping with this outlook, Wolf directs careful attention to the problems of the sources, many of which had previously been subjected to loose interpretation or inappropriate attention. Indeed, the principal sources, together with old or new translations, are collected and presented at length in the second part of the book, which will be of great benefit to future investigations. There is also a table (p. 100–101) showing the observable interconnections between narrative sources from Germany and the papal decretals and their commentaries over the course of the thirteenth century. The presentation of sources is offered largely without comment, but with reference both to extant secondary literature and to the relevant sections of the first part where significant problems are briefly yet incisively addressed.

Not all issues of sources could be dealt with effectively, even when they might appear significant. The testimony of the *Sachsenspiegel* (1220/35) is highly problematic, since it includes reference to six imperial electors, with the king of Bohemia expressly omitted, yet dates well before the number of electors was reduced this far. The author submits that the passage in question is a late interpolation (p. 34, 50–51), and the reader does not doubt this, although the question of the *Sachsenspiegel*'s composition is much larger than such brief treatment allows. In fact it suggests the importance of the study of historicity to a thorough reconstruction of the college's development.

In the author's work on Konrad of Teck previously mentioned, some effort is made to explain candidacies and electoral functions in terms of descent not only ultimately from Henry the Fowler (reigned 919–936) but also from Charlemagne. Thankfully no similar effort is made here. Such inquiries appear antiquarian and in all likelihood miss their mark. If the electoral college developed as Wolf suggests, then descent from Charlemagne is virtually understood for the kings and emperors from Henry forward, and it would likewise have been implicit in all electoral dealings where the right to participate was based on a right to inherit. The focus must fall on King Henry, as the source of rights to the German kingdom, and perhaps also more narrowly on his son, Otto the Great, as the source of empire. Wolf's important studies of lines descending from Otto's previously unknown granddaughter Richlint are left almost unmentioned in this book, yet they can be drawn on to explain many difficult issues of the early history of imperial succession, such as the limiting of candidacy to the Salian princes in 1024, and the Welf-Staufen conflict spawned in the election of Lothar of Supplinburg in 1125.

The book is intended not merely to present a new understanding of the electoral college's formation, but also to stimulate discussion of the historical material. Its purpose is thus served more by direct presentation of material than by synthesis. The question in the back of readers' minds is whether order, in the form of a legal-historical interpretation, can be imposed on an extended sequence of events that otherwise seems chaotic. Anticipating this doubt, Wolf devotes special attention to the several stages of Albert of Habsburg's election in 1298. A *Reformacio sacri status imperii* at this time fixed both the notion of a 'college' and the composition of this college. Yet the genealogical relationship of each lay elector to the Habsburg dynasty remains by far the most striking feature. The college formed, according to the author, with the establishment of the new dynasty. It was perceived as a limited and continuing community of heirs. Its composition was formalized in a written instrument, the Golden Bull of 1356, by the Luxembourg emperor Charles IV, Rudolf of Habsburg's great-grandson. A particular virtue of the author's standpoint is that it allows the Golden Bull to assume a natural place in juristic developments, in reference both to the past, where it more or less served to close the lengthy period of the struggles for imperial election, and to the future, where it defined once and for all the community of heirs entitled to electoral participation. The theory developed in this book thus goes well beyond exposing the juristic significance of the Golden Bull and explaining its background. For the attentive reader it delineates stages of constitutional development with a precision only juristic analysis can afford.

Donald C. JACKMAN, State College, Pennsylvania

Comunicazione e mobilità. Incontri fra il Sud e il Centro dell'Europa (secoli XI–XIV), a cura di Siegfried DE RACHEWILTZ e Josef RIEDMANN, Bologne (Il Mulino) 1997, 539 p. (Annali dell'Istituto storico italo-germanico. Quaderno, 48).

Entre le 18 et le 20 mai 1994, une vingtaine de spécialistes de langue allemande et italien se sont réunis à Castel Tirolo, à l'occasion d'une exposition autour de la figure du comte tyrolien Mainardo II, né en 1295, et de la naissance de la principauté tyrolienne. Le thème retenu sur les échanges et les communications entre le sud et le centre de l'Europe, en fait l'Europe méditerranéenne et l'Europe germanique, a fait ainsi l'objet d'illustrations aussi larges que possible sur la mobilité d'hommes de conditions sociales diverses: souverains, marchands, artisans, étudiants, pèlerins, ecclésiastiques, mercenaires, qui en nombre important gagnèrent depuis l'Europe centrale l'Italie, ou qui inversement se rendirent d'Italie en Europe centrale. De tels échanges, qui animèrent les vallées et les cols alpins ne manquèrent pas de retentir sur les connaissances artistiques et juridiques, comme sur le cheminement de thèmes littéraires du monde méridional en direction du monde germanique. Les relations entre les empereurs allemands et le monde italien sont assurément connues quant aux Ottoniens et aux Staufens, mais les contacts entre la dynastie Luxembourg-Bohême et l'Italie méritaient d'être soulignés.

Le cadre géographique dans lequel s'insèrent les diverses études repose prioritairement sur la zone tyrolienne quant aux contacts entre les deux mondes mis en perspective. Cependant, les deux régions sises aux extrémités de l'axe alpin: la Savoie à l'ouest, le Frioul à l'est ont fait l'objet d'une étude, où les deux auteurs: G. Castelnuovo pour la première, R. Hartel pour la seconde présentent une situation fort peu différente de celle du Tyrol: un territoire de passage, un pont-levis, par où se sont engouffrées les invasions lombardes et hongroises et les influences nordiques vers la péninsule italienne pour le Frioul, tandis que la Savoie est qualifiée de »région-charnière« entre nord et sud, qui canalise les modèles culturels et institutionnels à travers lesquels s'effectue la recherche d'équilibres sans cesse nouveaux entre Savoie et Piémont. Le Tyrol avec la route du Brenner est ainsi largement privilégié quant à l'étude des échanges d'hommes et de marchandises par la majorité des auteurs qui se sont