

Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte

Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris

(Institut historique allemand)

Band 28/1 (2001)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.2001.1.47128

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

maintenait la fidélité à une tradition qui se proposait »d'intégrer les exigences de la critique moderne« tout en préservant »le contenu et l'originalité de la sainteté telle que la conçoit la théologie catholique«. Dans un climat déjà fort tendu, car les Bollandistes passaient pour des »dénicheurs de saints«, il publia en 1905 *Les Légendes hagiographiques* pour, entre conservatisme et hypercriticisme, définir les principes d'une hagiographie critique. La réaction se déchaîna avec quelque retard (1912), au plus fort de la répression du modernisme; il ne dut qu'à de puissantes protections d'échapper à l'Index mais en resta suspect (le livre ne put paraître qu'en 1927). Ces temps sont révolus, jugera-t-on peut-être, les résistances des mentalités traditionalistes et les censures de l'autorité ecclésiastique ne représentaient que des combats d'arrière-garde. Mais un examen de la production courante en ce domaine, dans l'entre-deux-guerres et même au-delà, montrerait que la »nouvelle hagiographie« ne s'est imposée que lentement et non sans heurts.

Émile GOICHOT, Strasbourg

Monique ZERNER (ed.), *Inventer l'hérésie? Discours polémiques et pouvoirs avant l'inquisition*, Nice (Centre d'études médiévales) 1998, 284 p. (Collection du Centre d'études médiévales de Nice, 2).

This volume, despite a title suggesting an exercise in deconstruction, does not reduce the problem of heresy to a problem of polemical discourse. It actually consists of a sophisticated series of studies, originating in a 1993–1996 Nice seminar, which documents the efforts of medieval elites to conceptualize and deal with mass heretical movements, especially those of the 11th and 12th century. Although the individual papers do not fit together perfectly and vary greatly in the amount of knowledge they presume from their readers, they are united by a common methodology – close textual analysis of anti-heretical treatises written prior to the legalistic world of the inquisition.

The late Lynn White Jr., who did so much to popularize the study of medieval technology, used to tell how he had not been allowed to pursue his original research interest in 11th and 12th century heretical movements (the subject of his Masters thesis), because his professors at Harvard University in the 1920s/1930s claimed that on this subject »everything has already been said«. Much has changed since then! Familiar 18th and 19th century editions have been problematized by a return to the manuscripts. The corpus of material has been increased by new discoveries. Some of the resulting excitement is conveyed in Monique ZERNER's »Introduction« (p. 7–13).

The first essays examine the origins of anti-heretical rhetoric. One type is introduced in Jean-Pierre WEISS's analysis of »The Polemical Method of Augustine in his *Contra Faustum*« (p. 15–38), where Augustine's superficially irenic courtesy fails to mask his desire to score debating points, in part through the creation of a structured discourse making Faustus the verbal aggressor and giving Augustine the last word, in part through his masterful use of irony and authority. Jean-Daniel DUBOIS surveys »Polemics, Power, and Exegesis: The Example of the Early Gnostics in the Greek World« (p. 39–55), discussing the early development of a notion of heresy, the first anti-heretical treatises, and the use of exegetical argument in these debates. Such ancient quarrels had an afterlife. In the later 11th century at Saint-Victor's at Marseilles, just as the Gregorian Reform was entering Provence, some ancient anti-heretical treatises were collected together in Paris BN lat. 5672, a volume discussed in Michel LAUWERS's »An Echo of Ancient Polemics at Saint-Victor de Marseille at the End of the 11th Century?« (p. 57–66).

The heart of the volume concerns the mass heretical movements of the High Middle Ages. Guy LOBRICHON, in »Arras, 1025, or the True Record of a False Accusation«, champions both the often-questioned authenticity of the *Acta* of the 1025 Synod of Arras and the

style of its rhetoric (p. 67–85). Dominique IOGNA-PRAT examines »Defensive Argumentation from Gregorian Polemic to the *Contra Petrobrusianos* of Peter the Venerable« (p. 87–118), finding in Peter's sources, *colores rhetorici*, and logical arguments a discourse combining earlier denunciation and high-flown rhetoric in such a way as to constitute the »first true anti-heretical treatise« of the High Middle Ages. This larger context is also found in Monique ZERNER's »At the Time of the Call to Arms against the Heretics: From the *Contra Henricum* of the Monk William to the *Contra hereticos*« (p. 119–156). She postulates a transition from relatively free 12th-century conversations about religious doubts to inquisitorial demands for absolute assent. Here she situates the various anti-heretical texts which she deconstructs. She views the *Summa contra hereticos* edited by Raoul Manselli as a composite treatise made up of at least three polemics, the earliest of which would have originated in 1140–1150, the latest of which would have been around 1180–1190. Then she treats fragmentary polemical treatises from around 1200, offering diagrams indicating their interrelationships and component parts.

Other studies examine particular problems. Michel LAUWERS, in »Dicunt vivorum beneficia nichil prodesse defunctis«: The History of a Polemical Theme (11th–12th Centuries) (p. 157–192), demonstrates in a highly persuasive analysis that opposition to indulgences, burial fees, and other clerical exactions was sometimes less a matter of high theological disagreement than of social resistance motivated by economic concerns. Michel RUBELLIN, »When Valdès Was Not a Heretic: Hypotheses on the Role of Valdès at Lyons (1170–1183)« (p. 193–218) puts Peter Valdès into a local context, suggesting that he launched his reform movement in the chaotic diocese of Lyons with the support of Bishop Guichard (1165–1181/82). Jean-Louis BIGET, »The »Albigensians«. Remarks on a Name« (p. 219–255), documents the appearance of the name »Albigensians« as a synonym for heretics a generation before the siege during Innocent's crusade that made the city of Albi more notorious. Benoît CURSENTE, »An Affair of Non-Heresy in Gascony in the Year 1208« (p. 257–262) deals with a peasant revolt at Saint-Sever, one that might have been seen as heretical under other circumstances but which was settled leniently at a time when it would have been impolitic to have more trouble in Gascony.

The conclusions are somewhat summary. In a postscript (p. 263–269), R. I. MOORE signals the contributions of each study. He stresses that early treatises on heresies are better understood as witnesses of transformations of society than of antique or Byzantine heretical survivals. He sees the papers presented here as »not an end but a beginning«. Apparently high medieval heresy is no longer a topic about which »everything has already been said«. Indeed, insofar as this volume sees the concept and reality of heresy as created to some extent by its interpreters – in such a way that the Cistercians help to define the Albigensians and the cathedral chapter at Lyons to define the Waldensians – it situates the problem of heresy in the mainstream of the study of European society.

John HOWE, Lubbock

Maurice KEEN (Hg.), *Medieval Warfare. A History*, Oxford (Oxford University Press) 1999, VIII–340 S., 102 Abb., 10 Karten und Pläne.

»Medieval Warfare« – ein Buch mit einem allzu umfassend erscheinenden Titel, in seinem Anspruch dann aber doch wieder eingeschränkt durch den Untertitel »A History« – trägt dem heutzutage wieder gestiegenen Interesse an der mittelalterlichen Kriegführung mit all ihren Aspekten Rechnung. Es handelt sich um eine Sammlung von Beiträgen, die von verschiedenen Spezialisten dem aktuellen Forschungsstand entsprechend gut lesbar verfaßt wurden. Auch die reiche Illustration sowie der schöne Schutzumschlag, der eine Miniatur aus einer Handschrift über die türkische Belagerung von Rhodos im Jahre 1480