

**Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte**

Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris

(Institut historique allemand)

Band 28/1 (2001)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.2001.1.47161

---

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

Volpini dans les *Contributi dell'Istituto di storia medioevale* [dell']Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore [di Milano], III, 1975, p. 300–302, meilleure que celle indiquée dans le regeste; et au n° 1284 (testament de l'évêque Elbuncus de Parme, déjà cité) l'article accompagné d'une nouvelle édition corrigée que lui a consacrée Ettore Falconi dans l'*Archivio storico per le province parmensi*, 4<sup>e</sup> s., 9, 1957, p. 49–67.

L'ouvrage est doté de tables de concordances avec les éditions des actes royaux et pontificaux et d'une liste des diplômes perdus classés, selon l'usage, par ordre alphabétique des destinataires (Zielinski ajoute une quinzaine d'items à ceux déjà répertoriés par Luigi Schiaparelli). L'entreprise, dont on attend le troisième volume augmenté des *Nachträge und Berichtigungen* aux tomes précédents, est une réussite.

François BOUGARD, Rome

Cartulaire de l'abbaye de Saint-Sauveur de Redon, IX<sup>e</sup>–XI<sup>e</sup> siècles, Rennes (Amis des Archives historiques du diocèse de Rennes, Dol et Saint-Malo) 1998, 4<sup>o</sup>, 368 p.

The Association des Amis des Archives historiques du diocèse de Rennes, Dol et Saint-Malo have taken an important initiative by commissioning this high-quality facsimile reproduction of the cartulary of the abbey of Redon (Ille-et-Vilaine). The cartulary contains 391 documents dating from 802/13, a generation before the abbey's foundation in 832, down to 1156/59. There is a hiatus in the collection from 924 to 990/92: the exceptionally rich collection of ninth- and tenth-century private charters predating the break in the archive form both the bulk of the cartulary and its most well-known section. Although Aurélien de Courson edited it in 1863 for the series *Collection des documents inédits sur l'histoire de France* (and appended many of the charters from the missing folios known through early modern transcripts), it is not as well known outside Brittany as its importance warrants. Still in the library of the Archbishop of Rennes, the manuscript itself is not very accessible to the scholarly world: this publication makes it available to a much wider public too.

This edition presents the manuscript's two prefatory leaves and 185 numbered folios at approximately 95% of their actual size in a reproduction whose clarity makes the late eleventh- and twelfth-century hands a joy to read. Three experts provide useful introductory essays. Hubert GUILLOTTEL provides an admirably thorough codicological and palaeographical analysis of the manuscript. He indicates the close stylistic affinities with the manuscripts produced at Mont-Saint-Michel, presents arguments for attributing the compilation of the first and largest part (fols 1–138) to the abbacy of Almod (1062–1084), suggests why forged or interpolated documents are frequent in the subsequent section and synthesizes the information which the charters provide for the history, internal organisation and personnel of the abbey itself. André CHÉDEVILLE then offers an overview of local society and economy as revealed by the charters, first in the Carolingian period and then in the »feudal« period. He suggests that ninth-century local society in eastern Brittany remained largely »Celtic« and still had more in common with Late Antiquity than with the Middle Ages. Both these verdicts are surely oversimplifications. By the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries, however, not only were the distinctions between eastern and western Brittany reduced but French influence was also more widely evident in the eastern region. Chédeville declines to commit himself to whether the difference is one of »mutation« or merely »évolution« (p. 38). Finally, Bernard TANGUY comments on the rich stock of personal and place names in these charters. After brief remarks on the cartulary's orthography, he deals with patterns of both Breton and Frankish personal name formation in the Carolingian charters and then with changing habits of naming in the eleventh-twelfth centuries. He finally moves on to the various strata of place names, Gallo-Roman, Breton and French in the area covered by the charters and teases out from the toponyms enough evi-



dence to reveal the landscape in considerable detail. The introduction ends with a tabulation of the dates which Guillotel proposes for each and every charter, listed alongside the dating suggested by earlier critics. Usually, he simply narrows down the range of possibilities, but occasionally (as with nos. 293, 383) he shifts them from the reign of one abbot to another, many years apart.

This edition is aimed as much at the wider Breton public with a general interest in the history of their *pays* as at academic scholars. Both groups will appreciate it; both, however will also find shortcomings. A more general reader is likely to be struck by the imbalance between some of the highly technical detail provided by both Guillotel and Tanguy in contrast to Chédeville's more accessible tone and style. Such a reader will certainly be left wondering whether this is a typical eleventh-twelfth-century cartulary, how the economy and society it reveals compare or contrast with that elsewhere, what the difference between *mutation* and *évolution* might be, and how to account for changing patterns of both familial onomastics and toponymics. *Amateurs* and academics alike will regret the lack of co-ordination across the three essays, which do not even cite the charters in a consistent fashion.

This attractive facsimile does not, however, obviate the need for a new critical edition of the Redon cartulary. At the very least, that would enable Tanguy more effectively to tie his topographical analysis to specific pieces of land, or Guillotel to defend the rationale behind his dating of the charters. Guillotel warns (p. 71) that his decisions may surprise: some of them certainly do. Nevertheless there are considerable gains, especially when this facsimile is used alongside de Courson's edition. Although Tanguy (p. 49) notes a few of de Courson's errors in transcribing names, his edition is in fact riddled with inaccuracies, case endings silently »corrected«, and words omitted or even added. In the absence of a new edition, henceforth it will be advisable to use the printed old edition in conjunction with the new facsimile.

Another gain is the chance to study the Redon cartulary not simply as a collection of archival transcriptions, but as a coherently assembled manuscript book whose contents, taken as a whole, have much to tell about Redon's perception of itself, its relationship to donors, local communities, more distant rulers and other churches in Brittany and western France. No cartulary is ever simply a transparent window giving a view of the society at the time of the documents' original production: it is, first and foremost, a product of the time of its compilation, and deserves to be treated as such. To be sure, Guillotel goes some way towards acknowledging this when he situates the initial compilation of the Redon cartulary under Abbot Almod during the mid eleventh-century ecclesiastical revival in eastern Brittany (p. 16–17). In so doing, he suggests that the exclusion of material from 924 to 1050 was a deliberate strategy to emphasize that Redon's legitimacy and property claims rested upon its ninth-century foundation and the support of Carolingian kings/emperors and Breton *principes*, not upon its restoration in c. 990 nor on the contentious politics of the nicholaist and simoniac abbots of the generations until 1050. Further, as Tanguy remarks (p. 49), the eleventh-century copyist faithfully transcribed the ninth-century orthography, making no attempt to remove its obvious archaisms.

Much more, however needs to be said here. The Redon cartulary fits neatly into the sudden French upsurge in cartulary production in the middle decades of the eleventh century. As with other cartularies, it is a document not just for practical administrative and legal purposes but also has historical and commemorative import. There is, however, an instructive contrast to be drawn with the earliest Breton cartulary, that of Landévennec (compiled 1047–1055). This has yet to attract the detailed study which its careful selection of hagiographical, liturgical, historical and legal records surely deserves. The difference in contents suggests different attitudes to the past, to the political environment at the moment of compilation as well as to the purpose and function of a cartulary as a mode of literate expression.



After 1089, charters were entered into Redon's cartulary by various copyists. This final section lacks coherent ordering but includes a series of interpolated or forged documents, several of which relate to the opening years of the eleventh century. Both Guillotel and Chédeville adopt an approach which regrets »les déficiences qu'entraîne la présence des faux« on the grounds that they impugn the authority of this last part of the cartulary (p. 20, cf. p. 38). But this is to miss the point, for as a political exercise in manipulating the written record these documents have much to tell about the malleability of the past as well as about dispute processes in the eleventh/twelfth centuries. The interaction of tradition, literacy and disputing is worth investigation in its own right. Similarly, the ways in which relationships between the monks and their patrons were established, negotiated and maintained deserves analysis. To confine assessment of the cartulary to the facts of social, economic and linguistic history of eastern Brittany is to miss its significance for cultural, religious and legal history: authentic *mentalité* does not presuppose factual accuracy. Since cartularies have recently become such a fertile subject of enquiry, above all in France, it is a shame that the introduction to this one remains limited in its approach. In view of its potential, the Redon cartulary certainly deserves the greater attention which this fine facsimile invites.

Julia M. H. SMITH, St Andrews

Pays de Loire et Aquitaine de Robert le Fort aux premiers Capétiens. Actes du colloque scientifique international tenu à Angers en septembre 1987, réunis et préparés par Olivier GUILLOT et Robert FAVREAU, publiés par la Société des Antiquaires de l'Ouest avec le concours du Centre de recherche »Les pouvoirs, XIII<sup>e</sup>-XV<sup>e</sup> siècles, pratiques et mécanismes, conception et représentation« de l'Université de Paris-Sorbonne, Poitiers (Société des Antiquaires de l'Ouest) 1997, 267 p. (Mémoires de la Société des Antiquaires de l'Ouest et des Musées de Poitiers, 5<sup>o</sup> série, IV).

Bücher haben bekanntlich ihre Schicksale, aber besonders traurig ist das des vorliegenden Werkes: Die Beiträge eines Colloquiums aus dem Herbst 1987 konnten wegen der ernsthaften Erkrankung eines wichtigen Referenten erst mit mehrjähriger Verspätung für den Druck vorbereitet werden, und als schließlich alles soweit war, erklärte sich der Verleger für zahlungsunfähig, was zugleich den Verlust aller bis dahin eingeworbenen Druckkostenzuschüsse bedeutete. Insgesamt vergingen auf diese Weise zehn Jahre, bis das Buch dank finanzieller Hilfe durch Forschungsmittel der Universität Paris IV erscheinen konnte. Nun aber betrat der Schrecken aller Autoren und Herausgeber die Bühne: der säumige Rezensent, und hinter seinen Arbeitsbelastungen und Prioritäten trat ein Buch in den Hintergrund, das wahrlich anderes und Besseres verdient hat.

Im Jahre 866 fiel Robert der Tapfere, erster mächtiger Vertreter des Hauses der später sogenannten »Robertiner« und damit bedeutender Vorfahr der Kapetinger, gegen die Normannen kämpfend in der Kirche von Brissarthe (Anjou); aus Anlaß dieses 1100 Jahre zurückliegenden Ereignisses wurde eine wissenschaftliche Tagung ausgerichtet, die sich mit den Anfängen der ersten nachkarolingischen Dynastie beschäftigte und regionalgeschichtliche mit übergreifenden Fragestellungen und Analysen in methodisch vorbildlicher und in vieler Hinsicht richtungweisender Art verband. Insofern kann der Band zu den Standardwerken gezählt werden, denn er trägt sehr viel zur Quellenerschließung bei und eignet sich zur ersten Information über die Wege und Resultate der einschlägigen Forschung ebenso gut wie als Hilfsmittel für die künftige wissenschaftliche Arbeit am Gegenstand.

Der umfangreichste und zugleich in der Vielfalt seiner Aspekte grundsätzlichste Beitrag stammt von Karl Ferdinand WERNER (Les premiers Robertiens et les premiers Anjou [IX<sup>e</sup> siècle-début X<sup>e</sup> siècle], S. 9-67), der von eigenen jahrzehntelangen Studien und Vorarbeiten ausgehen konnte und auf breitem prosopographischem Fundament darlegt, daß