
Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte
Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris
(Institut historique allemand)
Band 17/1 (1990)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.1990.1.54078

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

articles plus récents d'André Perret ouvrent souvent des perspectives intéressantes. La difficulté, très réelle, du sujet n'empêche nullement M. Zufferey de trancher de tout avec une belle assurance. Il sait sur quoi se portait l'attention des comtes de Savoie durant la période où les documents mauriciens font défaut (p. 129), connaît les dessous de la politique pontificale en Bas Valais et veut »unbedingt« corriger l'idée que se font certains de l'avouerie savoyarde (p. 131). En fait le livre fourmille d'affirmations controuvées, de truismes ou d'expressions qui ne veulent rien dire (»kirchenfreundliche Politiker«). Faut-il parler de bévues ou d'une maîtrise insuffisante du sujet? Il me semble en tout cas que la publication de ce travail dans son état actuel, était prématurée.

Jean-Yves MARIOTTE, Strasbourg

Christoph EGGENBERGER, *Psalterium aureum sancti Galli. Mittelalterliche Psalterillustration im Kloster St. Gallen, Sigmaringen (Thorbecke) 1987, 211 p., 204 ill.*

The Habilitationsschrift of Professor E. betrays the familiar features of this genre: exhaustive discussions of the fourteen illustrations in the St. Gall Psalterium Aureum, superb and well funded illustrations (there are colour plates of all the illustrations in the Psalterium Aureum) which include comparative material from east and west ranging over a variety of centuries and of artistic media, and summary accounts of St Gall around 900 (3 pages), the Psalter in church and cloister (2½ pages), and the style of the illustrations in the Psalter (8 pages).

A manuscript well known for its depiction of David the Psalmist and for scenes of Joab's soldiers in battle; St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek MS 22 was discussed in detail by Merton, Bruckner and Duft. E.'s monograph aims to determine the sources for the illustrations, the number of artists involved, and the date and purpose of this lavishly decorated manuscript.

After a close analysis of the layout and the contents of the manuscript Eggenberger gives detailed descriptions of each of the illustrations, a discussion of possible sources and parallels for their iconography, and a summary account of the exegetical treatment of the Psalms with illustrations in the commentaries of Augustine and Cassiodorus. He also discusses the spaces left for illustrations which were not executed, and psalms in the David cycle which could have received illustrations, most notably Psalm 50. The volume ends with a discussion of the style of the Golden Psalter illustrations, and a brief conclusion contrasting the Psalter with the contemporary Byzantine aristocratic Psalters which have supplied frequent iconographic parallels.

»Unbeirrt und ohne einem konkreten Vorbild folgen zu müssen, steigerte sich die karolingische schöpferische Kraft ein letztes Mal zu einer imposanten Leistung«. So E. starts his concluding paragraph, nor is this quotation uncharacteristic. By the end of the paragraph the reader has learned that this psalter fits in with the achievements of St. Gall around 900, independent, but only possible at this date, in a setting with these contacts. Few will be shocked by these observations. In the words of Edgar Wind, »It seems to be a lesson of history that the commonplace may be understood as a reduction of the exceptional, but that the exceptional cannot be understood by amplifying the commonplace.«

According to E. the Golden Psalter is the work of five artists and nine scribes. He notes that there are drypoint summaries of some of the rubrics, which he regards as instructions to the rubricator. In his account of the St. Gall scriptorium Bruckner identified only one scribe in this manuscript. The reader of an authoritative and comprehensive study of a single manuscript is entitled to some account of the reasoning behind E.'s assertions; and to a discussion of whether the scribes also worked as artists. He will be disappointed. Nor is it clear whether E. attributes the excellent ornamental initials to scribes or artists; and whether he thinks that all of the artists and scribes were working at the same time. If that were the case, then the

iconographic programme, and its execution, entailed a coherent and comprehensive plan. Not only does E. keep silent about this, he says nothing about how comparable Carolingian manuscripts were produced. His suggestion that the Golden Psalter is unfinished ought to ensure some account of the speed and organization of book production.

E. claims that the illustrations depict the scenes described in the *tituli* copied before each Psalm. An elaborate table sets out what form of *titulus* each Psalm has, and in what script and ink it has been copied. Only some of these *tituli* are transcribed, and it is not clear what principles governed his selection. Given the short nature of these texts, and the importance attributed to them, they should all have been printed here.

The main focus of this study is the originality of the cycle of twelve illustrations from the life of David, which are historical and not typological in their treatment of events mentioned by the Psalmist. E. makes a convincing case for the novelty of this treatment of psalter illustrations, but while he goes into considerable detail about the typology of the arcades which enclose two scenes, he ignores archaeological evidence for the realism of depictions of thrones, weapons and armour. Instead of discussing the parallels to the dragon standard carried by the mounted warrior on page 140 we learn that it is no accident that such a standard is carried by a mounted warrior on Trajan's column (p. 138) and that Charles III brought his standard to St. Gall in 883 (p. 175). In the case of the »Lilienkrone« worn by some of the rulers depicted, a fuller discussion would have established that the artist(s) were depicting a contemporary type of crown, suggesting that innovation and realism in the illustrations deserve fuller treatment. The textiles depicted on pages 75, 132 and 160 reveal a comparable realism, and in view of the clear evidence of Notker Balbulus' interest in textiles, and E.'s discussion of Byzantine links, they might have been considered for other reasons than the artist's rendering of folds. »Detailrealismus« deserves analysis.

One of the most interesting, if one of the least accomplished illustrations shows Samuel anointing David. It is surprising to be referred to an article on »The Significance of Unction in Byzantine Iconography« here. Nor is there any mention of the Anglo-Saxon drawings of David's anointing and of David slaying Goliath on the flyleaf of Leningrad Lat. Q v XIV I, a Northumbrian manuscript of poems of Paulinus of Nola which was in the library of Corbie by the early ninth century. This is the more surprising as E. cites Alexander's volume on insular illumination in his bibliography, and that volume illustrates this manuscript. (Ill. 179). Consequently the account of the iconography of this scene requires revision. The clear evidence that there was a tradition of illustration for this scene known in the west in the early eighth century, if combined with the evidence of a David cycle in the few surviving initials in the Vespasian Psalter, suggests that E.'s claims for the presence of Byzantine picture cycles at St. Gall offer only one possible hypothesis for the source of the illustrations in the Psalterium Aureum. To describe the illustrations in the Golden Psalter as a David cycle is to diminish the importance of the portrayal of Jeremiah and Ezechiel on page 150 which E. discusses in detail.

E.'s arguments for dating the Psalter risk circularity. The Psalter lacks an illustration of Bathsheba because it was made for a Carolingian ruler, who would have found such an illustration offensive. But the clear evidence that ivories with scenes of David's penance were used as covers for a Psalter of Charles the Bald, weakens this suggestion. E. regards the use of the »Lilienkrone« as a way of making the David frontispiece a substitute for a missing ruler portrait and affirms that the references to David are a warning to the (unidentified) Carolingian ruler.

The Golden Psalter was created at St. Gall, but was apparently not completed. If it was conceived as a presentation volume, this may suggest that the recipient for whom it was intended had died. Charles the Fat, whose visit to St. Gall was an occasion for much ceremonial and several presentations, is an attractive candidate. The volume remained at St. Gall, and received an ownership inscription affirming that it was not stolen, but faithfully preserved at St. Gall, and threatening the wrath of God on anyone who removed it. To

understand how it was used at St. Gall we need a fuller description of the liturgy and worship of the abbey. The Psalter includes both the titles of the Psalms and prayers which set each Psalm in a pattern of Christian worship. Professor Tax's introduction to the eleventh century Old High German translation of the Psalter made by Notker the German, frequently cited in E.'s footnotes, is no substitute for this. To refer to the exegesis of Augustine and Cassiodorus is to ignore the presence in the St. Gall library of volumes containing excerpts from Augustine's sermons on the Psalter, Walahfrid Strabo's commentary on the Psalms, and Prosper on the Psalms. Are any of these manuscripts annotated? Is there a particular reason for the production of a cycle of images relating to the life of David, without parallel in previous Carolingian Psalter illustration, and including scenes of David in flight, and scenes of the building of the temple?

E. notes that Notker Balbulus, the St. Gall schoolmaster at the time that the Golden Psalter was made, and one of the greatest of medieval religious poets, has a reference to armour for man and horse as illustrated in the scenes of Joel's troops. He could have explored Notker's identification of himself with Idithun, and his interest in Charlemagne as a new David, radiant and terrifying, clad in iron, besieging cities, erecting churches, hunting in a short cloak, anointed as a ruler. By ignoring the context in which the Golden Psalter of St. Gall was produced, this study diminishes its importance. A spurious local patriotism, tending to overvalue objects because of their origins, shirks too many real issues. Precision and imagination about the difficulties which this didactic manuscript presents are the painful and complex tools which alone can heighten our perception of it.

David GANZ, Chapel Hill

Susan J. RIDYARD, *The Royal Saints of Anglo-Saxon England. A Study of West Saxon and East Anglian cults*, Cambridge (Cambridge University Press) 1988, XI–340 p. (Cambridge studies in medieval life and thought, 4th series, 9).

Après l'ouvrage d'ensemble de W. A. Cheney (1970) et la monographie plus particulière de D. A. Rollason (1982; recension dans la présente revue X, 1982, 760–761), voici que la sainteté royale chez les Anglo-Saxons suscite une nouvelle étude substantielle. Le sous-titre délimite le cadre régional de l'entreprise de S. R.; mais le caractère exemplaire de l'analyse et la portée des conclusions dépassent ces limites. Portée par un enthousiasme légitime envers son sujet, l'A. surestime peut-être un peu l'originalité de sa démarche: étudier les processus de sanctification des rois anglo-saxons comme des opérations dynastiques ou politiques faisait déjà partie du projet d'E. Hoffmann (1975; compte rendu ici même V, 1977, 894–898), curieusement absent de la bibliographie. Accorder aux saintes princesses la place qui leur revient aux côtés des souverains constitue un segment très vivant de l'historiographie actuelle, illustré encore dernièrement par l'étude de P. Corbet¹.

L'intérêt et la valeur propres de l'étude de S. R. tiennent à la fois à la définition de sa problématique et à un maniement avisé des sources. La discussion s'organise autour de trois questions principales: de quoi est faite la sainteté royale chez les Anglo-Saxons? Comment y naissent et se développent les cultes à des personnalités d'origine royale? Quel fut l'impact de la conquête normande sur de telles dévotions? Pour résoudre ces interrogations, les documents dits d'édification – rédigés en latin et en vieil anglais – ne sont pas scrutés en vase clos, mais articulés à toutes les autres catégories de traces disponibles: archéologiques (monuments, monnaies), juridiques (textes normatifs et de la pratique), narratives (Annales, chroniques),

1 Patrick CORBET, *Les saints ottoniens. Sainteté dynastique, sainteté royale et sainteté féminine autour de l'an Mil*, Sigmaringen (Thorbecke) 1986, 288 p. (Beihefte der Francia, 15).