
Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte
Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris
(Institut historique allemand)
Band 21/2 (1994)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.1994.2.58889

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

significatifs, ainsi en Angleterre en 1687–1688, dans le cadre de l'offensive catholique de Jacques II. Au total, avec sa bibliographie, son annotation, son introduction, P. F. nous donne une édition exemplaire, qui permet de mieux prendre la mesure d'un texte quelque peu sous-estimé jusqu'ici.

Jean-Louis QUANTIN, Paris

Olivier CHRISTIN, *Une Révolution symbolique. L'Iconoclasme huguenot et la reconstruction catholique*, Paris (Editions de Minuit) 1991, 350 p.

It is in some ways surprising that the massive outbreak of imagebreaking which characterised the emergence of the protestant reformation throughout sixteenth-century Europe has not received more sustained attention from historians of all persuasions. Of course, there have been some interesting essays in recent years, notably that of Alain Lottin and Solange Deyon on the *casseurs* of 1566 in the Netherlands, and in a more history-of-ideas vein, Carlos Eire's study of the disputes over images from Erasmus to Calvin. French experiences of iconoclasm, especially in the early 1560s but in some places delayed until (or repeated) the later 1570s and 1580s (Lesdiguières pillaged Embrun cathedral in 1585), have inspired relatively little sustained interest among historians, even of mentalities. The subject has long seemed to languish where the abbé Carrière left it in his heart-tugging and evocative studies on *les épreuves de l'église de France au XVI^e siècle*.

Olivier Christin's study is therefore welcome as an attempt to reopen the files and bring some sense of methodological order to the subject, without which the multitudinous accounts of image-breaking cannot yield worthwhile conclusions. His central contention is that image-breaking is *un geste intentionnel, significatif et construit*, whose rationality needs to be understood rather than, as has too often been the case, denied or denounced. But what, to begin with, do we mean by iconoclasm? It cannot be the pillaging and sacking of churches and religious treasures by soliders, since Catholic troops were as prone to such excess during the Reformation as their Protestant counterparts. Iconoclasm must be a more precisely focussed activity, which also suggests that regarding it as the *blind fury* of a mob, which is how it is so often projected, will not do either. In order to answer these questions, Christin devotes the first section of his study to the debates about the place of images in religion begun by the humanists and, quite logically, taken up by the Reformers. His purpose as he puts it is to observe the *travail de formation d'une théorie et d'une pratique légitimes de l'iconoclasme* (p. 35–36, author's italics). He notes that as we move from Luther to Calvin via Zwingli, the tone and the message become more hostile and unyielding towards any form of representative art in the religious sphere – not just against images of the saints, but of the life of Christ and of the divinity itself. The increasing incidence of iconoclasm from the 1540s onwards reflects this intellectual process, but Christin realises that a simple cause-and-effect relationship between actual behaviour and high-brow debate cannot be sustained. Instead, he looks towards an intermediary category of discourse in the form of pamphlets, sermons and more accessible material which provided a bridge between élite discussion and popular attitudes. He also notes the restrictions placed on the phenomenon by religious leaders and thinkers, fearful of popular violence generally since the 1525 Peasants' War – the assault on images should not be a private matter, and should not be against property.

The author attempts to apply the theory of sixteenth-century iconoclasm in an analysis of the actual practice of iconoclasm. His method here is to focus on particular cities – Le Mans, Rouen and Lyon especially – in an effort to dissipate the stereotypes about contemporary behaviour, and to understand what was actually involved. Though the archival basis of his argument is rather limited, he nevertheless argues with considerable force (and with statistical evidence in his appendices) that outbreaks of iconoclasm, especially during the peak period

around 1562, were not spontaneous popular orgies of violence; they were well-conducted and properly-supervised confiscations, complete with proper records and accounts, in which local élites and officials played the leading part, though that did not preclude individuals trying to steal valuable objects for themselves. And, as in the French Revolution, the timetable and geography of image-breaking suggests that such élite action was subsequently extended beyond towns to local villages and parishes. Images were first broken to humiliate and defile the symbols of what was detested as no better than paganism, but also as a practical and necessary prelude to the commencement of a purified and more austere religious régime. But the Protestant reformers did not have the last word. The old church reacted, though Christin rightly shows the difficulties of re-asserting a full-blown veneration of images, which had been discredited by the humanists and which moderate Catholics like Claude d'Espence, hoping to wean Huguenots back into the Church, were keen to avoid having to accept. But here, too, intellectual arguments, whether in colloquies or at Trent, which issued an inconclusive decree in 1563, were not the only force shaping the Catholic response. There was also, on the ground, the need to fight back against desecration and defilement: churches needed to be re-consecrated, and images restored or replaced by new ones. And in time, evidence of miracles worked by images which were the targets of protestant attack (Christin proposes a typology of them, p. 245) had a profound influence on clerical and popular imaginations, since they clearly vindicated the power of the saints. This Catholic response – this *recharge sacrée*, as Christin calls it – and its underlying dynamics conditioned the kind of veneration of images that would obtain in subsequent generations far more than the learned discussions of artists (though much less of architects).

Christin's book is a suggestive argument rather than an exhaustive survey, and he moves rather too quickly over a number of difficult problems. One of its many attractive features is its attempt to bring religious and intellectual history alongside the concerns of art history and iconography. It can only be hoped that other scholars will follow his example.

Joseph BERGIN, Manchester

Philippe ANNAERT, *Les collèges au féminin. Les Ursulines: enseignement et vie consacrée au XVII^e et XVIII^e siècle*, Namur (Vie consacrée) 1992, 195 p.

Die vorliegende Studie gibt einen detaillierten Einblick in die Geschichte und Entwicklung des Ursulinen-Ordens in Frankreich vom Beginn des 17. bis zum ausgehenden 18. Jahrhundert. Der Verf. wendet sich damit einem Thema zu, das zwar nicht zur terra incognita, gleichwohl aber zu einem bislang wenig beackerten Feld gehört. (Zu den in diesem thematischen Zusammenhang erschienenen Arbeiten gehören u. a.: Gueudré M. de Chantal, *Histoire de l'ordre de Sainte-Ursule en France*, 3 vol., Paris 1957–1963; R. Devos, *Vie religieuse féminine et société*, Annecy 1973; Cl. Langlois, *Le catholicisme au féminin*, Paris 1984; D. Dinet, *Vocation et fidélité*, Paris 1988.)

Der Orden, 1535 von Angela Merici in Brescia gegründet, begann um 1600 auch in Frankreich (wie in anderen westeuropäischen Ländern) Fuß zu fassen (Avignon 1585, Aix-en-Provence 1600, Toulouse 1604, Dijon 1605, Paris 1607, Rennes 1611 etc.). Der nach der hl. Ursula (10. Jh.) benannte Klosterorden – dem der Jesuiten und Kapuziner vergleichbar – vereinigte auf der Grundlage der Augustinerregel Jungfrauen, die (zunächst) ohne Gelübde in der Welt religiös-erzieherisch wirkten. Ab 1612 etablierte sich dann das Klosterwesen. (Bis heute wurde aber die Lebensform außerhalb des Klosters beibehalten, so vor allem in Italien.)

Dem Verf. geht es in erster Linie darum, die aktive Rolle der Frau in der Religions- und Kirchengeschichte herauszuarbeiten. Dies gelingt ihm auch, indem er unter regionalgeschichtlicher Perspektive eine Fülle weitgehend unveröffentlichten Quellenmaterials heranzieht (Chroniken, Dekrete, Klosterregeln und -verfassungen, Biographien, Memoiren, Briefe etc.).