
Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte

Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris

(Institut historique allemand)

Band 22/1 (1995)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.1995.1.59260

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

L'ouvrage se compose de deux parties, symétriquement scandées de belles expressions latines: la vie, les souverains, les papes, les évêques *magistri et confratres*, la *terrena vagatio*, la Saxe, l'église d'Hildesheim rebaptisée Bennopolis, la *nova ecclesia*, la sainteté. Outre une copieuse bibliographie et les cartes générales, le premier volume regroupe trente-neuf contributions au champ plus au moins spécialisé, rédigées dans une volonté didactique jamais démentie, mais également pourvues d'une abondante bibliographie spécialisée. Certaines brossent le cadre d'ensemble, d'autres développent des points plus précis, qui vont du culte de l'image à Rome autour de l'An Mil (G. WOLF) aux pratiques du droit (R. POKORNY) et à une très évocatrice reconstitution de l'itinéraire de Bernward en France (M. PARISSÉ), sans omettre Slaves et Juifs, ni aucun aspect d'un riche épiscopat, de son temps et d'un souvenir millénaire et multiforme dans ses manifestations. Sans vouloir dresser aucun palmarès, on comprendra tout l'intérêt du volume comme livre d'histoire, à la présence de présentations denses, comme celles qui sont consacrées aux Ottoniens (J. FLECKENSTEIN), aux papes (G. TELLENBACH), à la religiosité (O. G. OEXLE), au culte des reliques (A. ANGENENDT). Tout au plus le recenseur sourcilieux, qui doit bien faire ressortir toutes les qualités de l'entreprise, pourra-t-il penser que, même fort bien menés, quelques exposés ont un peu manqué de place, quand il s'agissait de faire pressentir la complexité du jeu des pouvoirs dans l'Italie aux alentours de l'An Mil ou le lourd poids symbolique de la production de la chancellerie ottonienne.

Le catalogue proprement dit de l'exposition, qui occupe le second volume, en fait, de son côté, un puissant outil de travail et de recherche, en 390 notices (si j'ai bien compté), dont la variété et la qualité étaient pressenties dès le premier volume. Toutes les traces et tous les signes ont été collectés et commentés, des sceaux aux élévations architecturales, des épigraphes aux gemmes, des manuscrits aux monnaies. La richesse le dispute à la diversité. A l'intérieur de quelques sections, l'évocation suit inévitablement des chemins parfois un peu détournés. Dans l'évocation de Mayence par exemple, monnaies et bijoux séparent la norme juridique du dogme augustinien. S'il n'est pas trop malséant de regretter une petite lacune, c'est l'absence d'une table typologique des documents/monuments exposés et révélés. Il est vrai qu'elle eût privé le lecteur de goûter un plaisir supplémentaire, celui de flâner au long d'un chemin empli de belles découvertes.

Olivier GUYOTJEANNIN, Paris

L'Eglise de France et la papauté (X^e-XIII^e siècle). Die französische Kirche und das Papsttum (10.-13. Jahrhundert). Actes du XXVI^e colloque historique franco-allemand organisé en coopération avec l'École nationale des chartes par l'Institut Historique Allemand de Paris (Paris, 17-19 octobre 1990), publiés par Rolf GROSSE, Bonn (Bouvier) 1993, X-408 p., 13 pl. (Studien und Dokumente zur Gallia Pontificia. Études et documents pour servir à une Gallia Pontificia, 1).

This is the first volume in a series of studies and documents preparatory to a Gallia Pontificia. It is dedicated to the memory of the indefatigable student of papal documents, Johannes Ramackers, whose criticism of the German bombing of archives, which was written for publication in volume IV of the »Papsturkunden in Frankreich« (1942) but was censored by Paul Kehr, is published here for the first time (29-30). The sixteen articles were originally presented at the twenty-sixth Franco-German historical colloquium held in Paris in October 1990. The reviewer of a volume like this is faced with the problem of whether to look for general themes or to discuss each article separately, showing its distinctive contribution. The emphasis here will be on the common subject-matter, but a summary of the contents will give an idea of the variety of the work.

Following an introduction by Dietrich LOHRMANN on the history of the Papsturkunden series and the genesis and prospects for a Gallia Pontificia, the articles are grouped into

sections devoted to general aspects, bishops and monasteries, and regions. The three general studies are on the relations of Rome and France in the tenth century (Harald ZIMMERMANN), the churches of east Francia and Lotharingia at the time of Sylvester II (Pierre RICHÉ), and papal legates in France from the middle of the eleventh until the end of the twelfth century (Rudolf HIESTAND). The articles on bishops deal with papal influence on episcopal documents in the provinces of Reims, Sens, and Rouen (Olivier GUYOTJEANNIN) and the relations of Alexander III and Henry of France (Ludwig FALKENSTEIN), and those on monasteries with the preparations at Corbie for the Roman synod of 1065 (Laurent MORELLE) and with the papacy and Luxeuil in the eleventh century (Gérard MOYSE), St Denis under abbot Suger (Rolf GROSSE), and the Parisian abbeys of Ste Geneviève and St Victor in the thirteenth century (Bernard BARBICHE). Six regional studies are on the relations of the papacy with Brittany in the eleventh century (Hubert GUILLOTTEL), with the Franche-Comté during the pontificate of Calixtus II (Bernard DE VRÉGILLE), with the Cistercians in the diocese of Besançon (René LOCATELLI) and in the duchy of Burgundy (Benoît CHAUVIN), both in the twelfth century, and with Trier and Upper Lotharingia (Egon BOSHOFF) and Catalonia (Odilo ENGELS), both in the tenth and eleventh centuries.

The articles range in length between fifteen pages (Zimmermann and Boshoff) and seventy-four (Falkenstein) and differ in scope and depth, and they naturally leave many gaps in both regional and chronological coverage. Outside the general articles there is almost nothing on France south of the Loire or west of the Seine, aside from Catalonia and Brittany. Moyse reaches back into the sixth and seventh centuries, and Barbiche is concerned with the thirteenth. The other articles concentrate on the period between the late tenth (and mostly the middle of the eleventh) and the end of the twelfth centuries and on the ancient region of Francia.

Within these limits, the volume raises some general questions concerning the history of the papacy and its relations with the regional churches in the age of reform. The first of these concerns the sources, and above all the documents, which vary in type and in number. The *Papsturkunden* series includes only acts of the popes themselves and omits the acts of legates and judge-delegates and the proceedings of legatine councils and synods, which often throw more light on the policy and activity of the popes than their own documents (21). Even the imitation of papal styles in episcopal documents reflects the influence of the papacy on regional hierarchical relationships and behavior (83-101). The distribution of papal documents is also of interest. Almost half of the ninety-four known acts concerning the Cistercians in the diocese of Besançon between 1139 and 1197 concern the abbey of Bellevaux. Most of the other houses received under ten, though this is still a considerable number (306-307). At least 340 papal bulls were addressed to Ste Geneviève and St Denis in the thirteenth century (241) – almost exactly the same number as all known bulls addressed to Normandy before 1098. It is unclear whether these differences were owing to chance losses and the vagaries of transmission or to real differences either in papal policy or in the importance of the receiving institutions – or perhaps in the skill and enterprise of their superiors.

The property lists in papal privileges and confirmations need special scrutiny because they were often wish-lists drawn up in the hope of making good a claim to properties that had once been held or given to an institution (22). There are also some interesting remarks in these articles on forgeries and alleged forgeries, such as the early bulls for Luxeuil, which have long been suspect but of which the substantial authenticity is now accepted (183). When the monks of Corbie were preparing a dossier to put before the Roman synod of 1065, they apparently got in touch with their »brothers in arms« at St Denis, who sent a formula of exemption which survives only as a notula in *Bibliothèque nationale lat.* 17762. So far as is known, it was never used, but it stood ready, if needed, to be incorporated into a forgery (207-218). Some authentic documents were treated as forgeries, like the acts of the schismatic archbishop Humbert of Besançon, which the legate Roger of Vico Pisano systematically sought to discover and destroy (316).

The most significant general conclusions concern papal legates, who were in many respects the real rulers of the church in France between the pontificates of Leo IX and Innocent III (76, 273). Papal commands to legates and judge-delegates were no less important in implementing papal policy than the direct commands or solemn privileges which have attracted more attention from scholars (18). It was the legates who really imposed papal primacy and ecclesiastical reform in almost every aspect of the workings of the church and who concerned themselves not only with great affairs like schism and the crusades but also with the details of political and economic matters. Their unpopularity reflected their power and was enhanced by the expense of their procurations, which were borne by the local churches (68), and there was a constant balance between the power of the central church, represented by the papacy and the legates, and the regional interests of the king, bishops, and secular magnates. The main work of the legates in France was accomplished by the middle of the twelfth century. After Gerard of Angoulême, who supported the anti-pope Anacletus, the popes were apprehensive of standing legates and preferred short-term ad hoc appointees. The role of the legates mirrored both the personal policy of the popes and the evolution of the church (80), and it tended to decline in the course of the twelfth century as the papal monarchy became established and secular monarchs asserted their authority.

Much of the material here needs to be compared with that from other parts of Europe before a broad picture of the workings of papal centralization can be established. It is interesting to observe, however, the influence of individuals and personality. Sylvester II, for instance, concerned himself primarily with clerics and monks whom he had known before he became pope, and his interventions were therefore concentrated in particular regions (52). It was Gregory VII who first established the authority of legates over local prelates (58). Their numbers, after a slack period in the 1130s and 1140s, increased dramatically under Hadrian IV (62). The longest article in this volume concerns the relations between Alexander III and Louis VII's brother Henry, who was successively bishop of Beauvais and archbishop of Reims and was a man of strong views and personality (which were no doubt enhanced by his birth), though there is no evidence that he had any particular intellectual or legal training (170–171). Suger is another strong personality who figures in these pages. He was in contact with the papacy from an early date and also cultivated good relations with the kings of France (221–225, 232). An ingenious, if not entirely convincing, argument is made here that Suger was caught between the pope and St Peter on one side and the king and St Denis on the other, and that he turned increasingly to the papacy after the king in effect rejected the overlordship of St Denis by having his son consecrated at Reims (234, 237).

Many of the points made in this work are hard to find owing to the absence of an index. There are useful remarks on monastic exemption, which was pioneered in some episcopal privileges (190–191); on the pontificalia (202–203, 372); on the rivalry between the two chapters at Besançon (288); and on the significance attached to apostolic foundations, as at Trier, which was considered parallel with Ravenna (375–380). Enough has been said, however, to show that this collection is more than the sum of its parts and is as a whole a valuable contribution to the study of both the papacy and France in the eleventh and twelfth centuries. It does not say the final word, which will have to await the publication of the »Gallia Pontificia« and the systematic presentation of all the evidence for the relations of the papacy and France, but it is an important step in that direction.

Giles CONSTABLE, Princeton, New Jersey

Dominique BARTHÉLEMY, *La société dans le comté de Vendôme de l'an mil au XIV^e siècle*, Paris (Fayard) 1993, 1118 S.

Wie schon in früheren Werken setzt sich Barthélemy auch hier mit dem Lehwesen auseinander. Er wählte dafür die Gegend um Vendôme, die wegen der erstmaligen Erwähnung