

---

**Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte**  
Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris  
(Institut historique allemand)  
Band 29/3 (2002)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.2002.3.63063

---

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

hin zur nationalegoistischen Interessenpolitik zu analysieren. Weigands Arbeit stellt einen aufschlußreichen Beitrag zu diesen Bemühungen dar. Neben Buols Konzeption werden auch andere Bestimmungsfaktoren der österreichischen Außenpolitik einbezogen, etwa der Neoabsolutismus und die ausgeprägte Revolutionsfurcht Franz Josephs, der machtpolitische Schwebezustand, der nicht zuletzt aus dem ständig drohenden Staatsbankrott und der militärischen Schwäche Wiens resultierte, sowie die prekäre innere Situation des Vielvölkerstaates.

Mit Weigands Studie liegt die bisher wohl dichteste und gründlichste Untersuchung zur internationalen Politik zwischen Pariser Kongreß und Italienischem Krieg vor. Ausgewogen und detailliert zeichnet die Verfasserin die politischen Entwicklungen nach, ohne dabei den Blick für das Wesentliche und die großen Linien zu verlieren. Anzumerken ist auch, daß sie die ältere Forschung mehrfach korrigiert und sich auch nicht scheut, dort, wo es angebracht ist, mit klaren Worten zu werten.

Stefan WUNSCH, Köln/Bonn

Gerd KRUMEICH, Hartmut LEHMANN (Hg.), »Gott mit uns«. Nation, Religion und Gewalt im 19. und frühen 20. Jahrhundert, Göttingen (Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht) 2000, VI–322 p. (Veröffentlichungen des Max-Planck-Instituts für Geschichte, 162).

As two authors in this volume remind us, German soldiers marched to the front in World War One with »Gott mit uns« inscribed on their helmets. Despite a century of growing secularization and nationalism, religious symbolism still appealed to Germany's leaders as a means of legitimizing violence. The sixteen essays of this volume, which deal predominantly with Germany, explore the continued popularity of religious motifs in various political contexts from the wars of liberation to World War One. In their introduction, the editors rightly point out that modernization theory and the secularization thesis, by now easy targets for historians, cannot account for this phenomenon. A much sharper analysis of the historiography comes in Friedrich Wilhelm GRAF's concluding essay, however. Graf asserts that the wave of studies of religiosity that began in the 1980s, normally hailed as an effective riposte to the reductionism of Hans-Ulrich Wehler, also fail to do justice to religion as a set of theological beliefs independent of social or political usefulness. While certainly not true for all such studies, Graf's quip should be noted: »No practicing Jew believes that Yahweh led his chosen people out of Egypt on the basis that belief in the chosen people results in the psychic health gain of a stable I-identity or contributes to the formation of a strong collective identity« (p. 295).

The contributions, the product of a conference at the Max-Planck-Institut in Göttingen in 1998, are grouped into three categories, which deal in turn with internal and external enemies, religion and nationalism before, and then after, 1914. The first section includes essays by Peter BECKER on the discursive construction of the criminal; Ute SCHNEIDER on the semantic evolution of *der Welsche*; Berit PLEITNER on attitudes to Poles; and Peter SCHUMANN on anti-Semitism in high-brow literature. Beyond showing a tendency to Manichean categories in discourse about the »Other«, the authors add little to our understanding of the role of religious beliefs in particular in demonizing others.

The second section, which is far stronger, focuses on the role of religious imagery in the development of German nationalism from the wars of liberation to the First World War. Hartmut LEHMANN has a contribution on Treitschke's glorification of Luther; Bernhard KROENER on military hymns; Erich PELZER on the demonization of the French in 1813; Daniel MOLLENHAUER on French Catholic reactions to defeat in 1871; Lucian HÖLSCHER on Bismarck's reputation for religiosity; Stig FÖRSTER on that of the general staff between 1870 and 1914; and Jakob VOGEL on monuments to William I. While Hölscher and Förster

both address a rather old-fashioned topic, the piety of great men, they are methodologically sophisticated in their approach to individual piety and its political implications. Hölscher is sceptical of the value of Bismarck's statements and behavior as indicators of piety because, like any individual, he was limited in what he could express by the available discourses and the political conditions of his day. The author also points out that historians tend to measure their subject's religiosity against their own, so that comparisons are difficult. Like the authors in the first section, Förster observes a strongly Manichean and increasingly apocalyptic view among the general staff, but is careful to acknowledge alternative sources, in this case Social Darwinism.

In addition to Graf's reflections on directions in religious history, the final section features essays by Gangolf HÜBINGER on middle-class Protestant nationalists; Wolfgang MOMMSEN on the pivotal role of the First World War in the churches decline; Roland HAIDL on Catholic chaplains in the war; and Gerd KRUMEICH on the war as a religious war. In one of the few comparative forays in the volume, Krumeich draws an interesting contrast in attitudes to the war in France and Germany. Whereas the Germans changed their view of the war from a crusade to a trial in 1917, the French saw it as a crusade throughout because the more immediate experience of war by French intellectuals encouraged a less ambiguous view of the enemy.

GRAF is the only author to tackle the relationship between religion and nationalism at a theoretical level. Identifying himself with ethno-cultural historians of nationalism who insist that nations cannot be constructed out of nothing but build on long shared traditions, he insists that the religious symbols used by nationalists worked because they drew on a reservoir of religious belief. He identifies the particular appeal of religious imagery in its capacity to create an emotionally powerful sense of belonging. In reminding the reader of the universal claims of Christianity, he shows that it had a less easy relationship to nationalism than historians of a Protestant tradition normally assume. He follows with an appeal for studies of nationalism in their confessional context.

By the standards established by Graf, both in the quality of his own contribution and in the demands that he makes of others, the volume fares unevenly. The relationships of Catholicism and Judaism to nationalism receive next to no attention. In fact, the one essay that deals with German Catholics appears to dismiss the theological component of Catholicism as meaningless in the era before World War One: »Confessional, in this case Catholic, identity became a mere functional identity within society« (p. 264). The volume does little to advance our understanding of key religious concepts such as »God«, »salvation«, or »sacrifice«. Violence is understood as state power, thereby excluding popular religious violence, such as pogroms. On a practical level, while the speed with which the conference papers appeared in print is impressive, it is regrettable that time was not found to include notes on contributors and to provide a lengthier and footnoted introduction. It is also unclear why the volume ends in 1918. MOMMSEN's observation that artists resorted to religious imagery to express the tragedy of war at a time when the churches had lost their credibility suggests a promising point of departure for analyses of religious symbolism and the churches in Weimar and Nazi Germany.

On the positive side, the volume incorporates much recent literature on ritual, iconography, and myth and shows how far historians have gone in identifying sources relevant to the study of religion. KROENER, in particular, uses an enormous range, from the memoirs of military strategists to artworks and monuments. Several beautifully reproduced illustrations accompany his essay and that of PELZER. There is much of interest to historians of French-German antagonism and nationalism generally. And as a reflection on the relationship between religion and violence, the volume is certainly timely.

Róisín HEALY, Harvard