

Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte

Herausgegeben vom Deutschen Historischen Institut Paris

(Institut historique allemand)

Band 30/1 (2003)

DOI: 10.11588/fr.2003.1.63180

Rechtshinweis

Bitte beachten Sie, dass das Digitalisat urheberrechtlich geschützt ist. Erlaubt ist aber das Lesen, das Ausdrucken des Textes, das Herunterladen, das Speichern der Daten auf einem eigenen Datenträger soweit die vorgenannten Handlungen ausschließlich zu privaten und nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken erfolgen. Eine darüber hinausgehende unerlaubte Verwendung, Reproduktion oder Weitergabe einzelner Inhalte oder Bilder können sowohl zivil- als auch strafrechtlich verfolgt werden.

fois »ennemi« et »allié« se fait »pièce maîtresse de l'humanisme médiéval« en devenant pour l'homme moyen de connaissance de soi.

Christiane VEYRARD-COSME, Paris

Walter POHL, *Die Völkerwanderung. Eroberung und Integration*, Stuttgart (Kohlhammer) 2002, 266 p. – Karl ROSEN, *Die Völkerwanderung*, München (Beck) 2002, 128 p.

It is a rare pleasure to have the simultaneous publication of two books by eminent scholars on the same subject. Pohl tells the story of the origins and of the arrival in the Roman Empire of various groups of people (Visigoths, Vandals, Anglo-Saxons, Huns, Ostrogoths, Burgundians, Alamanni, Franks, Lombards, Avars and Slavs) from the fourth to the seventh century. He tells it briskly and entertainingly, demonstrating an enviable mastery of research on the early medieval period. Rosen's volume is much shorter than P.'s; there are no footnotes, and no lengthy bibliography. R. tells much the same story, only more discursively. After his opening material, for example, he discusses at relative length (p. 19–37) the historiography and charged etymology (ancient and modern) of folk-movement. He takes up his story much earlier than P., from the time of Augustus. He focuses on the Visigoths to take his account to 476, and on the Ostrogoths and Franks to continue it after this date. Other peoples are dealt with mostly in passing, though particular attention is accorded the Lombard as the last *Völkerwanderung*. He ends with discussion of the root-cause of the ›fall‹ of the Roman west, proposing poor imperial leadership, and of the origins of contemporary Germanophone sensitivity in dealing with the *Völkerwanderung*. As the sort of reader at whom, I guess, both books are aimed – someone with an interest in the subject but lacking a view of it in its entirety – I learned an immense amount from each. However, P.'s clearer structure and greater detail make his my preferred work of reference.

Yet neither book was what I had expected. I had, I guess, mentally inserted a question mark after their main titles: not *Die Völkerwanderung* but *Die Völkerwanderung?* I hoped that each might offer syntheses of the post-1945 reconsideration of previous (basically, nationalist/national socialist) ideas of ›folk movement‹. (As noted, R. concludes with very interesting general observations on this. On the particular significance of *Volk* and *völkisch*, see now U. Puschner's brilliantly disturbing ›Die völkische Bewegung im wilhelminischen Kaiserreich‹, 2001.) Especially important in this respect is R. Wenskus' (›Stammesbildung und Verfassung‹, 1961) concept of ›ethnogenesis‹, which P. has developed in his own right. On this interpretation, less attention is paid to barbarian *gentes* as discrete ethnic/genetic entities and more as products of a constant cycle of dissolution, reformation and redefinition of group-identity caused by contact with other populations. P. seems to promise this in his Foreword, continues in the same vein in a strong opening chapter, and returns to the topic in a final *Ausblick*, but for the bulk of his book he ignores it. There are, indeed, numerous suggestive references to such thinking, but these are left unrelated – to Wenskian concepts (e.g. ›cores of tradition‹) and to each other – and could well be missed by a reader unaware of their wider significance. P.'s story has in places, therefore, a decidedly old fashioned feel. I was struck, for example, by his treatment of Dark Age Britain, in which he only hints at (e.g. p. 87) lively current debate as to the historicity of the Anglo-Saxon ›invasion‹. Elsewhere, P. never directly raises, and so never attempts to answer, the question that W. Liebeschuetz and others have demonstrated has enormous implications for ethnicity, ethnogenesis and migration, namely how we should classify the Goths of Alaric (and indeed, those of Theoderic) – ›nation or army?‹ Though reference is made in passing (p. 76–77, 132, 182), there is no overall discussion of the actual numbers of newcomers involved, and the extent to which these may have been swelled by other barbarians and even imperial citizens (cf. p. 50, 132). Barbarians still press on the frontiers (p. 16, 71, 74); and

Stilicho remains stigmatised as one of them (p. 33, 55–56, 72). Oddly, wider considerations which have long formed part of the traditional ›story‹, and may have received recent attention as ›strategies of distinction‹, such as religious differences and political hostility between eastern and western Empires, though again regularly touched upon (e.g. Arianism: p. 83, 141, 178–179, 215) lack direct consideration.

P. has a general theme, expressed in his sub-title, introduced in Chapter I and mentioned often in his text – ›integration‹. However, since ›integration‹ generally turns out to be the absorption of the weaker society by the stronger, I find it difficult to discern his main point here. All this (as in the case of Anglo-Saxon England) raises questions as to the force of ›weak‹ and ›strong‹, which again demands consideration of the numbers involved.

R.'s story, likewise, is essentially one of high politics and warfare. As in the case of P., there are frequent strong hints of awareness of recent research on ethnogenesis but, apart from notices in his bibliography (p. 124) hardly any direct reference to it. R. offers little discussion of questions concerning the ethnicity and (self-/external) identity of leaders and led.

The problem may be one of language. *Die Völkerwanderung* ›has‹ to happen because it remains the only way a German speaker can express the whole process of the establishment of the western barbarian kingdoms. However, like the ›barbarian invasions‹ of English and French, it is no longer appropriate. As P. remarks (p. 137), citing Liebeschuetz, different peoples did very different things; not all ›invasions‹ were as clear cut or as ill-fated as those of the Huns or Lombards: there is no general pattern. A more worrying alternative, based on the same premise, is that it may turn out to be impossible to analyse the *Völkerwanderung* as a whole in Wenskusian or post-Wenskusian terms.

John F. DRINKWATER, Nottingham

Law, Society and Authority in Late Antiquity, ed. by Ralph W. MATHISEN, Oxford (Oxford University Press) 2001, XVI–324 p.

Ralph Mathisen a rassemblé dans ce recueil le texte de seize communications présentées en 1997 à l'université de Caroline du Sud dans un colloque sur le thème des interactions entre le développement de la loi et celui de la société. L'ouvrage est divisé en deux parties: l'une envisage la loi comme la manifestation d'une autorité renouvelée; l'autre l'impact de la loi sur la société. Le cadre chronologique est celui de ›l'Antiquité tardive‹ qui, pour les participants, s'étend de 260 à 640.

La première partie commence par étudier la continuité de la loi romaine après les invasions: John MATTHEWS montre comment les juristes du royaume wisigothique adaptèrent le Code Théodosien dans la compilation connue sous le nom de Bréviaire d'Alaric; Antti ARJAVA illustre par quelques exemples relatifs au statut des femmes la fusion d'éléments romains et germaniques dans les lois barbares; Michael JONES note, au contraire, que les souvenirs de la loi romaine sont rares dans le droit anglo-saxon, même s'ils ne sont pas absents. Sous le Bas-Empire, Jill HARRIES étudie la nouveauté que représente le pouvoir arbitral de l'évêque; Noel LENSKI reprend l'étude de l'*audiencia episcopalis* qui ne se limite pas aux affaires religieuses et Leslie DOSSEY montre les relations entre justice civile et justice religieuse dans la répression des crimes. Hors de l'Empire, Victoria ERHART décrit l'évolution du droit ecclésiastique dans le royaume sassanide, obligé de s'adapter à un milieu hostile, surtout du IV^e au VI^e siècle mais capable de créer les institutions qui survécurent sous les califes musulmans.

Dans la deuxième partie, Gillian CLARK décrit les efforts des exégètes pour interpréter la Bible dans un sens conforme aux exigences du droit romain. Geoffrey GREATREX explique comment les hommes de loi, dont le rôle croît avec la complexité de la justice et l'administration, devinrent les principaux historiens, à la place des sénateurs qui monopolisaient ce