

Klaus FREITAG – Matthias HAAKE (Hgg.), Griechische Heiligtümer als Handlungsorte. Zur Multifunktionalität supralokaler Heiligtümer von der frühen Archaik bis in die römische Kaiserzeit. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag 2019, 330 S., 3 s/w-Abb., EUR 59,00. ISBN: 978-3-515-12389-1

If Greek religion was ‘embedded’ in the ancient mind, then sanctuaries were ‘embedded’ in their multi-scalar communities. Long restricted to the domain of archaeology, studies of Greek sanctuaries have over the past few decennia been examined by historians from angles of landscape, economy, ritual, and social and political interaction, finally merging with studies of Greek religion and festival cultures. Sanctuaries were flashpoints of communication with the gods, but they were also places of mediation between human actors, channeling and shaping religious experience in the broadest terms. A special case concerns transregional shrines and the communities that frequented them. This has been a solid line of inquiry at Münster, through a series of publications that draw attention to their roles regarding politics (Freitag / Funke / Haake 2006), social memory (Haake / Jung 2011), and federated communities (Funke / Haake 2013). The current volume addresses multi-functionality and is aptly dedicated to Peter Funke, on the occasion of his 65th birthday in 2015. The volume is attractively designed, with a cover illustration by Thanasi Papapostolou, and comprises 16 chapters, 9 of which are in German, 5 in English, and 2 in French. On the whole, the book is carefully edited, although there are occasional typos and a few missing references; an index would have been helpful. The contributions provide a good range of topics, but cross-references would have strengthened their coherence. However, they are largely clustered around common themes: ritual practices (Patera, Graf), knowledge transmission and communication (Freitag, Drauschke, Chaniotis, Trampedach, Prêtre), communal scope at Olympia (Pirenne-Delforge, Hölscher, Scharff), and slavery and economy (Bresson, Lepke). Knäpper is left dangling at the end, but in my view fits well with Chaniotis and Trampedach.

Matthias Haake opens the volume with a bird’s eye view of the general multi-functionality of sanctuaries, particularly ‘panhellenic’ sanctuaries (p.1-30). Sanctuaries were the place to see and be seen and his exposition of this facet indeed ‘sets the scene’ for the rest of the volume, although he leaves it to the reader to discover how this will unfold. Following an insightful review of some 30 years of scholarly research (see also the extensive bibliography), Haake substantiates the qualifier ‘supra-local’ as affording more overlap of function and scope with sanctuaries than topographical labels (urban, extra-

urban, panhellenic). Sanctuaries with agonistic events could especially draw a large crowd with a variety of 'actors' – intellectuals, merchants and monarchs, besides performers and local communities (also Slater 2007) – greatly fluctuating in scope and function according to season and time.

Time is factored into Christoph Ulf's multi-faceted analysis of sanctuaries and their scopes (p.31-56). He links their formal development (from *Rundbau* to *peripteros*) to settlement type and interprets levels of communal rivalry through the lens of social theory (Simmel 1903; Brewer 2003). The resulting matrix (Abb. 1, p.40) presents a functionality of supra-local shrines, according to degrees of competition (even for brides), identity, and communication. Ulf thus distinguishes the social objectives between compound settlement, ethnos, polis, and transregional sanctuaries in a nuanced discussion that progresses to the role of special 'super-locality', border spaces and spheres of influence. Whether transregional sanctuaries actually contradicted other levels of identity is debatable, but on the whole he presents a compelling framework for understanding sanctuaries in their spatial and temporal contexts.

The next two articles focus on ritual practice and regional appeal. Ioanna Patera uses several examples to highlight ways that sacrificial practices reflect shifts in communal scope at sanctuaries (p.57-74), whether in degree (e.g. Aktion) or in kind (e.g. Amphiareion). Such shifts may also be seen through other rituals, particularly processions with their increasing splendor (e.g. Eretria, Ptoia, Plataia). Fritz Graf presents a different kind of ritual in 'Lead invocations in Greek sanctuaries' (p.75-86). Dismissing the traditional distinction between 'curse' and 'judicial' spells as too neat, Graf chooses for the more neutral term and examines the contexts of such tablets, per sanctuary type. Rather than a secret practice, Graf argues the importance of their publicity and hence their occurrence in busy sanctuaries, but especially those with localized, personal gods (e.g. Demeter) that would surely act on behalf of the supplicant – hence their rare appearance in panhellenic shrines (Nemea).

The following five contributions explore different types of communication and their transmission. Klaus Freitag examines sanctuaries as spaces of philosophical and cultural interaction (p.87-120), discussing notable appearances of philosophers and intellectuals at sanctuaries, as well as their archival role, along with dedications of literary works in sanctuaries, cults of intellectuals, and libraries. The plethora of examples makes this a lively read (e.g. the self-immolation of Peregrinus and the Olympic festival in 165 AD), yet with so many also to be found in Asia Minor one is left longing for even more. The same may be said of Marie-Kathrin Drauschke's examination of the

placement of interstate treaties, as *koinē stēle* (p.121-136). She tests the views of Heuß 1934 and Lalonde 1971 on the placement and cooperative aspects of such interstate treaties. Her several examples, drawn largely (but not exclusively) from mainland Greece and Crete, distinctly show that sanctuaries relevant, but not necessarily neutral, to all parties were selected as a third place of publication. Angelos Chaniotis further studies sanctuaries as places of mediation through emotion, especially between Greece and Rome (p.137-154). Flamininus' historical pronouncement of 'freedom' at Isthmia in 196 BCE thus belongs to a series of impassioned oratories at sanctuaries, using the element of surprise to invoke an emotional response in the hearts of a wide audience, in this case to effectuate the opposite, i.e. unmitigated loyalty to Rome. Oppositions are also at the heart of the oracular responses at Delphi, as Kai Trampedach observes (p.155-174). Rather than a political ruse by the priests, as scholars tend to believe, Trampedach observes an unquestioned belief in the oracle in ancient sources, supported by the continued protection of the shrine by the god in times of crisis. Herodotos' narrative (8.32-36) of the epiphany of Apollo during the Persian invasions is echoed in subsequent manifestations – a pivotal feature in the Delphic-centric history constructed by the Delphians. The larger objectives behind stories of divine intervention are also the topic of Clarisse Prêtre's examination of the iamata at Epidauros (p.175-186). Prêtre closely analyzes the three different voices that can be heard in these accounts of miraculous healings: the editor, the god, and the patient, each voice with its own aims. This polyphonic communication underscores the strength of the sanctuary, a sacred propaganda that helps attract patients (and craftsmen) from across the Greek world, thereby reinforcing the extra-regional function of the healing shrine.

Three articles address the supra-local role of Olympia from different perspectives. Vinciane Pirenne-Delforge gives a rich survey of myths and early ritual activity at Olympia (p.187-206), before focusing on the political cohesion facilitated by the 16 Elean women after the synoikism. She thus argues for an early cult of Hera, now often interpreted as a later addition (e.g. Moustaka 2002) – the famous foot-race for girls in the Heraia should be seen against this background as a coming-of-age event for local girls, exceptions notwithstanding. Olympia is then a panhellenic construction by the Eleans, who use the cult place as an 'extra-urban' shrine to consolidate their own identity while consciously embedding it within larger narratives and ritual frameworks. The role of women at Olympia in later times is examined in Tonio Hölscher's close reading of Pausanias 5.17.1-4 concerning the images inside the Heraion (p.207-226). His reconstruction (p.208, Abb. 1) and comprehensive discussion show the statues, partly drawn from older groups

in the thesauroi, to have been carefully selected and arranged, probably in the later part of the 1st century AD. The ultimate objective was to heighten religious experience from the female perspective, from goddesses to queens to priestesses. Hölscher views this in the context of pre-nuptial rituals, observing Olympia as a multi-functional space that attracted several seemingly opposite spheres, with the panhellenic male agonistic festival as only one of many dimensions. Yet the continuity of agonistic events at Olympia should not be taken for granted. The later Hellenistic period is often seen as one of decline due to the fewer victors lists and the domination of Eleans, yet rather than arguing *ex silentio*, Scharff pieces together evidence for wide participation from across the Mediterranean in this period (p.227-250), with Elean victories restricted to hippic events. Moreover, he traces the victors to a wealthy landed elite who could compete against teams sponsored by the Ptolemies or Attalids, and would be interested to promote their success across generations. We are left with little reason to doubt the continued wide catchment area of Olympia, even in these turbulent times.

With agonistics drawing crowds, supra-local shrines may be expected to have functioned as fairs. But a special category pertains to the sale and release of slaves, examined in the following two chapters from a regional perspective, particularly northwest Greece. In his study of Illyria, Epiros and Akarnania (p.251-278), Alan Bresson notes that federal sanctuaries were excellent centers for manumissions in order to secure legality beyond the micro-community. Moreover, slave trade was integral to festival fairs, shown in the document regulating the division of proceeds from the Aktia between Anaktorion and the Akarnanian League (*NIvO* 13 published notably at Olympia). Especially fascinating are the uncertainties on both sides of the transaction – slaves and releasing owners – revealed in the Dodona oracles, and Bresson's poignant observation that the later capture of western Greece by Rome transformed former slave-owners into slaves themselves. The integration of sanctuaries in regional slave economies is further pursued by Andrew Lepke, showing the link between manumission inscriptions and the action radius of a sanctuary (p.279-302). Some 1300 manumissions inscribed at Delphi in the 2nd century largely concern western Locris and Aetolia, demonstrating a regional function of the shrine in this capacity. Of special interest are the early manumissions, from 197 to 184 BC, nearly all from Amphissa, and with propographic overlap in guarantors and witnesses. Lepke connects this to an elite circle in Amphissa, who probably used the oath ritual and the sanctuary to build their social network, while consolidating their presence at Delphi, especially significant in the events following the Second Macedonian War.

Just preceding this period, the final contribution to the volume focuses on local events and their geopolitical implications in western Asia Minor. Katharina Knäpper (p.303-322) analyzes the claims of territorial inviolability, or *asylia*, famously made by Magnesia on the Maeander but also Milete through their respective main sanctuaries (of Artemis Leukophryene and Apollo at Didyma), and subsequent diplomatic missions. Thonemann (2007) had identified the rivalry with Milete as a driving factor behind the much-debated *I.Magnesia* 16, but Knäpper goes further in comparing its language with that of Milesian argumentation as known from the Koan response (Rigsby 2010). Her conclusion, that each city specifically targeted long-term ‘friends’ for support, rather than a broadcasting a blanket appeal to the oikoumene, is original and makes sense against this tense period that predicated warfare between the two cities.

A jewel of a postlude by Robert Parker (p.323-330) wraps up the volume, while tying together the different contributions. Parker notes the difficulty of identifying ‘supra-local’ sanctuaries, as all places of cult could potentially reach beyond their local borders. But most that did so had some special feature or function that drew a crowd, making journeys worthwhile, but they need to be examined on a case-by-case base. He thus returns to the pivotal role of Peter Funke in opening up several avenues of research that are further addressed here.

As Parker observes, this volume does not project any rules or rationales behind supra-local sanctuaries, but instead presents a kaleidoscope of options, showing how sanctuaries met the needs of different communities at different scales, and at different times; time being in itself is a critical factor, as noted by Haake at the beginning. This volume will be of interest to anyone concerned with social, political and economic aspects of Greek religion, but especially with the operationalization of sanctuaries, the diversity of their actors, and the wide range of activities which they empowered. The editors are to be congratulated for assembling such a wide range of high-quality contributions that shed light on many facets of this phenomenon. Taken together, they show just how tightly sanctuaries were bound to their societies, but not just as places of action for ceremonies or geopolitics, but as active places in themselves, co-producing the fundamental structure of human relationships. The interdependency of action and place, whether within the temenos or in its wider topography, is touched on by a few (e.g. Ulf, Hölscher) but would be worth exploring in greater detail – perhaps in a future volume?

Bibliography

- Haake / Jung 2011 = Haake, M. and M. Jung (2011) *Griechische Heiligtümer als Erinnerungsorte. Von der Archaik bis in den Hellenismus. Erträge einer internationalen Tagung in Münster, 20.-21. Januar 2006*, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Heuß 1934 = Heuß, A. (1995 [1934]) 'Abschluß und Beurkundung des griechischen und römischen Staatsvertrags', in: J. Bleicken ed. *Alfred Heuß. Gesammelte Schriften in 3 Bänden. Bd. I: 1. Griechische Geschichte – 2. Griechische und römische Geschichte – 3. Weltgeschichte – 4. Laudationes und Nekrologe*, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 340-419.
- Freitag / Funke / Haake 2006 = Freitag, K., P. Funke and M. Haake, eds (2006) *Kult-Politik-Ethnos. Überregionale Heiligtümer im Spannungsfeld von Kult und Politik. Kolloquium, Münster, 23-24. November 2001*, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Funke / Haake 2013 = Funke, P. and M. Haake, eds (2013) *Greek federal states and their sanctuaries. Identity and integration. Proceedings of an International Conference of the Cluster of Excellence "Religion and Politics" Held in Münster, 17.06.-19.06.2010*, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Lalonde 1971 = Lalonde, G.V. (1971) *The publication and transmission of Greek diplomatic documents*, PhD diss. University of Washington, Ann Arbor, MI.
- Moustaka 2002 = Moustaka, A. (2002) 'On the cult of Hera at Olympia', in: R. Hägg ed. *Peloponnesian sanctuaries and cults. Proceedings of the Ninth International Symposium at the Swedish Institute at Athens, 11 - 13 June 1994*, *Skrifter utgivna av Svenska Institutet i Athen., Series in 4° 48*, Stockholm: Svenska Institutet i Athen, 199-205.
- Rigsby 2010 = Rigsby, K.J. (2010) 'Cos and the Milesian Didymeia', *ZPE*, 155-157.
- Simmel 1903 = Simmel, G. (1903) 'Soziologie der Konkurrenz', *Neue Deutsche Rundschau (Freie Bühne)* 14, 1009-1023.
- Slater 2007 = Slater, W.J. (2007) 'Deconstructing festivals', in: P.J. Wilson ed. *The Greek theatre and festivals. Documentary studies*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 21-47.
- Thonemann 2007 = Thonemann, P.J. (2007) 'Magnesia and the Greeks of Asia (*I.Magnesia* 16.16)', *GRBS* 47, 151-160.

Christina G. Williamson
 University of Groningen, Ancient History
 Oude Kijk in 't Jatstraat 26
 9712EK Groningen
 Netherlands
 E-Mail: c.g.williamson@rug.nl