

THE JOURNAL  
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF  
BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

*A. K. Narain*  
*University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA*

EDITORS

*Heinz Bechert*  
*Universität Göttingen, FRG*

*Lewis Lancaster*  
*University of California, Berkeley, USA*

*B. J. Stavisky*  
*WCNILKR, Moscow, USSR*

*Leon Hurvitz*  
*University of British Columbia*  
*Vancouver, Canada*

*A. W. MacDonala*  
*Université de Paris X, Nanterre, France*

*Alex Wayman*  
*Columbia University, New York, USA*

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

*Stephen Beyer*  
*University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA*

*Volume 1*

*Number 2*

1979

c/o Department of South Asian Studies, University of Wisconsin, Madison,  
Wisconsin 53706

# CONTENTS

## I. ARTICLES

1. Is the Buddhist Notion of "Cause Necessitates Effect"  
(*Paṭiccasamuppāda*) Scientific? by *A.D.P. Kalansuriya* 7
2. Chou Yung vs. Chang Jung (on *Śūnyatā*): the *Pen-mo*  
*Yu-wu* Controversy in Fifth-Century China, by  
*Whalen Lai* 23

## II. SHORT PAPERS

1. Guṇaprabha's *Vinaya-sūtra* and his Own Commentary on  
the Same, by *P. V. Bapat* 47
2. *Keci*, "Some," in a Pali Commentary, by *I. B. Horner* 52
3. Comments on Zen, by *M. Kiyota* 57
4. The Freudian Unconscious and *Bhavaṅga*, by *O. H. de A.*  
*Wijesekera* 63

## III. BOOK REVIEWS

1. Tibetan Buddhism in Western Perspective: Collected Ar-  
ticles, by *H. V. Guenther* 67
2. Practice and Theory of Tibetan Buddhism, by *Geshe*  
*Lhundup Sopa* and *J. Hopkins* 69
3. Shingon Buddhism: Theory and Practice, by *M. Kiyota* 72
4. Choix de Documents tibétains conservés à la Bibliothèque  
Nationale, complété par quelques manuscrits de l'India  
Office et du British Museum; présentés par *Ariane*  
*Macdonald* et *Yoshiro Imaeda* 76

#### IV. NOTES AND NEWS

- |  |    |
|--|----|
| 1. Presidential Address by Professor Gadjin M. Nagao   | 79 |
| 2. Report on the Proceedings of the First Conference of the<br>I.A.B.S., Columbia University, New York, September<br>15-17, 1978 | 85 |
| 3. List of Members of I.A.B.S.   | 92 |

#### V. OBITUARY

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| Yamaguchi Susumu, by <i>Sakurabe Hajime</i> | 104 |
|---|-----|

details that had been omitted from the earlier translation. The text is an important and interesting one, giving detailed instructions on the procedure to be followed in a meditative sitting. The session described involves visualization, prayer, mantra and a meditation that touches on most of the major points of the *lam-rim* (a particular arrangement of the "stages of the path" that is, in one form or another, central to the practices of all Tibetan schools): the rarity and importance of human birth, impermanence and the imminence of death, the sufferings of *samsāra*, the cultivation of *bodhicitta*, and the meditation on emptiness. Geshe Sopa's and Prof. Hopkins' translation is a clear and readable one, prefaced by a detailed background discussion of *lam-rim*, and one wishes that such detail could equally have been provided for the *Precious Garland* translation. The difficulties with that translation notwithstanding, though, the *Practice and Theory of Tibetan Buddhism* provides a tantalizing taste of the vast range of thought and practice encompassed by Tibetan Buddhism, and should—if used in concert with other texts—prove useful to specialist and interested layman alike.

V. Olivetti

*Shingon Buddhism: Theory and Practice*, by Minoru Kiyota. Los Angeles and Tokyo: Buddhist Books International, 1978. viii, 178 pp. Annotated bibliography and glossary of technical terms. \$7.95 (cloth); \$5.95 (paper).

*Shingon Buddhism* is a tightly structured and specialized treatment of Shingon thought in relation to Mahāyāna philosophy. Shingon, or specifically, "Shingon mikkyō," is the Japanese version of Tantric Buddhism. Although Shingon had its roots in Indian Tantrism and was colored by the Chinese Buddhist tradition, this brand of Buddhist thought was systematized as a distinct school of the Mahāyāna and as an integral part of the Japanese Buddhist tradition by Kūkai (A.D. 774-835) in the ninth century. In terms of its canonical sources, Shingon owes its basic insights to two Indian texts, the *Mahāvairocana-sūtra*, which transmits the Mādhyamika system of thought, and the *Tattvasamgraha-sūtra*, which transmits the Yogācāra-vijñānavāda system of thought. In essence, Shingon consists of a systematization of these two doctrinal foundations of Mahāyāna. However, it differs from other Mahāyāna traditions to the extent that it describes its doctrine through symbolic representation, identifies *Dharmakāya* Mahāvairocana, the cosmic Buddha, as the embodiment of truth, and develops a new dimension of world order, the *dharmadhātu*, which in turn is also identified as Dharmakāya Mahāvairocana.

Minoru Kiyota's monograph is a product, over the course of many years, of serious Buddhological research into primary Shingon sources and is a substantial contribution to the development of Buddhist Studies in the West. In its organization, the work consists of five sections: a historical introduction to Tantric Buddhism in the first chapter, followed by separate chapters on Shingon doctrine and practice (chapters II-V), and a concluding essay on the relation between Shingon thought and Yogācāra-vijñānavāda Buddhism ("Epilogue"). In addition, Kiyota has included at the end of the volume a selected bibliography of books and articles in Japanese and English and a glossary of technical terms. The bibliography is annotated and is a carefully chosen list of secondary sources. Consisting largely of Japanese studies of the first magnitude, it is extremely useful for those capable of employing contemporary Japanese Buddhological works on Shingon for further investigation. Readers unacquainted with Shingon jargon will also appreciate the glossary attached at the end of the volume where Kiyota has coined expressions for some 185 Shingon-related terms.

In reviewing a work of this sort, at least three strong points can be discerned:

1. Kiyota has relied heavily on primary sources; portions of the work contain canonical documents in excerpts translated by the author. While it is regrettable that the author did not offer more lengthy translations, the present work is, of course, preceded by Yoshito Hakeda's scholarly introduction to the life and thought of Kūkai with a translation of his major works (Cf. *Kūkai: Major Works*, Columbia, 1972). However, while this earlier study does give the English reader the first coherent account of this school, the translations should be viewed as background—not as an end in itself—for with Kiyota's doctrinal exposition of the same primary sources, the translations become increasingly useful and valuable. Given the current situation of a grossly inadequate amount of intelligibly translated documents, this is not to imply that translations of Buddhist texts are unimportant. Indeed, both works complement each other and should be read together to gain a fuller appreciation of Shingon thought. In light of this earlier study, Kiyota has wisely chosen to focus in on the major aspects of Shingon theory and practice.

2. The author has critically used secondary sources to present the historical and religious background to Tantric Buddhism. Though he does not go out of his way to find fault with the Japanese studies, his treatment of their research is objective and his judgments are fair. As evidenced by the manner in which he handles the materials, he also shows an obvious sensitivity to historical data. The first chapter, which examines the Indian doctrinal foundations of Tantric Buddhism, provides us with a concise treatment of the emergence of Tantric Buddhist

ideas during the mid-seventh century in India and a real attempt to evaluate the overall influence of Tantra on Buddhist thought. There is also a valuable discussion of the organization of the two primary Shingon sūtras and an analysis of the geographical origins and transmission of these sūtras.

Chapter II ("The Shingon System of Doctrinal Classification and Evaluation") involves a lengthy discussion of the *p'an-chiao* exercise within the context of Kūkai's thought. My only criticism of this section is the author's discussion of the Chinese Tantric tradition, for there is only a passing attempt to evaluate the influence of the Chinese materials on Kūkai's thought. Kiyota, however, is careful to remind us that, while Tantric Buddhism established deep roots in Japan, it essentially failed to sustain the interests of the Chinese. If there is any evidence of Chinese influence, it is to be found in Kiyota's analysis of the *p'an-chiao* exercise which Kūkai adopted from the Chinese textual tradition. In other words, we must remind ourselves that Tantric Buddhism was unorganized when Kūkai began his investigation of the sūtras and that, while the *Mahāvairocana-sūtra* was known during the Nara period, Kūkai's reason for going to China was to look for a commentary on that sūtra and to seek out a master of Tantric thought unavailable to him in Japan. Thus, as Kiyota explains, "granting the fact that Shingon is largely based upon texts of Indian composition and that its tradition was transmitted to Japan from China, the formation of Shingon doctrine, the systematization of Shingon as a distinct religious order, and the identification of Shingon as a distinct entity of Mahayana are attributed to the creative efforts of Kūkai." Nonetheless, one still is led to the hope that he will give us a study of the Chinese religious background at a future date.

3. The most original and valuable part of the work is Kiyota's analysis of Shingon doctrine and practice concentrated in chapters III-V ("Shingon Doctrinal Concepts," "The Two Maṇḍalas," and "The Path to Buddhahood," respectively). In reviewing these key chapters, it is perhaps best to summarize their major theme as I see it. The interpretative principle of Kiyota is that Shingon is an existential philosophy and that the crux of this system lies in an understanding of what faith means within the Shingon context in particular and within the Mahāyāna in general. Working from the perspective of the Mahāyāna, his exposition of Shingon doctrine largely deals with soteriological issues. The strength of Kiyota's research is seen in its theoretical formulations and in the author's attempt to describe the Shingon view of Mahāvairocana both doctrinally and iconographically. As a school of Mahāyāna, Kiyota claims that Shingon begins with the *a priori* view of universal enlightenment (e.g., the concept of non-duality, *shinzoku furi*, and its corollary doctrine of *sokushin jōbutsu*) and that it emphasizes

wisdom as the sole vehicle to realize enlightenment. Focusing in on the practice of compassion as the means to cultivate wisdom, Kiyota attempts to describe compassion as the act of implementing wisdom, or in more practical terms, the application of religious insight on the phenomenal level. Thus, he claims that, in Shingon, enlightenment is not the goal. Practice is. Practice, as he conceives of it, is enlightenment, or in more religious terms, a practice designed to realize one's inherent Buddha-nature. In other words, Kiyota sees Shingon enlightenment as the individual's intense awareness of his contingency to others and conceives of the ultimate form of human liberation to consist of the practice of liberation. It is in this context that he identifies Shingon as an existential philosophy. However, he goes on to say that, because Shingon takes an *a priori* view of enlightenment, faith constitutes the basic ingredient of theory and practice. Thus, he sees faith as the "unconditional acceptance of the proposition that the seeds of enlightenment are inherent in all sentient beings," and claims that it is this kind of faith that contributes to the Buddhist view of the awakening of man.

In these sections it is clear that the book is not written for the novice, but for the advanced student and specialist of Sino-Japanese Buddhism. The Western reader who has not already studied Japanese Buddhism through either primary sources or secondary scholarly works in Japanese is often likely to find Kiyota's discussion somewhat technical. Nevertheless, it does offer the student of Buddhism a detailed picture of how Shingon thought can be analyzed within the broader context of Mahāyāna Buddhism. In particular, the "Epilogue," which summarizes the major doctrinal themes of the work, provides penetrating insights into Shingon from the perspective of the Yogācāra "three *svabhāva* theory".

In summary, by facilitating a better understanding of the religious background and the dynamics of Shingon thought, Kiyota's work presents depth to the appreciation of Mahāyāna Buddhism. Although the author touches only lightly on the religious and historical background of Chinese Buddhism, he does show sensitivity to the many facets of Sino-Japanese Buddhism which had created a new vision of things and an ideal Buddhist image of man. The value of this work for the scholarly study of Buddhism is seen in the fact that, behind the intricate expressions of Shingon doctrine, Kiyota shows that there is a humane ideal that belongs to the empirical world. My only reservation about the book is that, because the subtlety of thought involved is so focused and expressed in an extremely terse manner, the work might be difficult for the novice unacquainted with Buddhist terminology to follow the finer points of his doctrinal exposition. A general introduction to the fundamentals of Mahāyāna thought coupled with an index might be in order. This does not detract from the value of the work as a whole, fo:

I feel that, to date, this small volume is the most comprehensive treatment of Shingon theory and practice available in any Western language. It is a welcome addition to the literature on Buddhism and is likely to be the standard work on Shingon doctrine for some time. Its many-sided information is certain to help formulate some tentative judgments about the Sino-Japanese Buddhist tradition.

Aaron K. Koseki

*Mission Paul Pelliot: Choix de Documents tibétains conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale, complétés par quelques manuscrits de l'India Office et du British Museum; Présentés par Ariane Macdonald et Yoshiro Imaeda; Tome Ier; Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale; 1978.*

A stiff, protective box contains photographic reproductions of the documents chosen and a brief introductory and explanatory fascicule. The documents are reproduced on the recto only of separate sheets, numbered successively from 1-304. The choice of documents was operated by Madame D.A. Macdonald, Madame A.-M. Blondeau and Professor R.A. Stein. In the first instance the choice was guided by the desire to make available for study those texts concerned with unknown or little known aspects of Tibetan civilisation. However the importance of the Chinese Ch'an dossier was also taken into account; and Buddhologists will be grateful for the entries under Buddhism in the brief summary of the contents of the manuscripts on p. 17-18 of the fascicule.

In a short preface, Professor Stein situates the general importance of these manuscripts and stresses the light they cast on the dim beginnings of Tibetan history and society. He sketches out the story of their dispersion and their conservation; he renders homage to the previous labours of Louis de La Vallée Poussin, J. Bacot, F.W. Thomas and Marcelle Lalou; he also tells us of his hope that the vocabulary of rare words constituted by Marcelle Lalou will one day be published, completed by more recent research.

A list of the inventory numbers of the manuscripts reproduced in this first volume is to be found on p. 16. Mademoiselle Marie-Rose Séguy, Conservateur en chef à la Bibliothèque Nationale, Département des manuscrits, Section orientale, gives a general description of the Tibetan collection from Tun-huang in Paris which includes over 2500 manuscripts of which 254 are bilingual or trilingual. She provides a table of the Tibetan manuscripts containing texts, fragments or notes in Chinese characters as catalogued in the *Inventaire* of Marcelle Lalou: some of these were previously inventoried under two numbers, one Pelliot Tibetan, one Pelliot Chinese, so this table will be of service to