

THE JOURNAL  
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF  
BUDDHIST STUDIES

ERNST STEINKELLNER  
WIEN

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

*A. K. Narain*  
*University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA*

EDITORS

*L. M. Joshi*  
*Punjabi University*  
*Patiala, India*

*Ernst Steinkellner*  
*University of Vienna*  
*Wien, Austria*

*Alexander W. Macdonald*  
*Université de Paris X*  
*Nanterre, France*

*Jikidō Takasaki*  
*University of Tokyo*  
*Tokyo, Japan*

*Bardwell Smith*  
*Carleton College*  
*Northfield, Minnesota, USA*

*Robert Thurman*  
*Amherst College*  
*Amherst, Massachusetts, USA*

ASSISTANT EDITOR

*Roger Jackson*

*Volume 7*

*1984*

*Number 1*

# CONTENTS

## I. ARTICLES

1. The Literature of the Pudgalavādins, by *Thich Thien Chau* 7
2. Modern Japanese Buddhology: Its History and Problematics, by *Minoru Kiyota* 17
3. Marginalia to Sa-skyā Pandita's Oeuvre, by *L.W.J. van der Kuijp* 37
4. The Problem of the *Ichchantika* in the Mahāyāna *Mahā-parinirvāna Sūtra*, by *Ming-Wood Liu* 57
5. The Sanmon-Jimon Schism in the Tendai School of Buddhism: A Preliminary Analysis, by *Neil McMullin* 83
6. The Indravarman (Avaca) Casket Inscription Reconsidered: Further Evidence for Canonical Passages in Buddhist Inscriptions, by *Richard Salomon and Gregory Schopen* 107
7. The Tibetan "Wheel of Life": Iconography and doxography, by *Geshe Sopa* 125
8. Notes on the Buddha's Threats in the *Dīgha Nikāya*, by *A. Syrkin* 147

## II. BOOK REVIEWS

1. *A Buddhist Spectrum*, by Marco Pallis (D. Seyfort Rugg) 159
2. *The Heart of Buddhism*, by Takeuchi Yoshinori (Paul Griffiths) 162

3. *Paritta: A Historical and Religious Study of the Buddhist Ceremony for Peace and Prosperity in Sri Lanka*, by Lily de Silva (Ter Ellingson) 164
4. *The Threefold Refuge in the Theravāda Buddhist Tradition*, ed. John Ross Carter  
*Buddhist Images of Human Perfection*, by Nathan Katz (Winston King) 169
5. *The Word of the Buddha: the Tripitaka and Its Interpretation in Therāvada Buddhism*, by George D. Bond (Nathan Katz) 173

### III. PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

1. *Ascent and Descent: Two-Directional Activity in Buddhist Thought*, by *Gadjin M. Nagao* 176

### IV. NOTES AND NEWS

1. *A Report on the Sixth Conference of the IABS, Held in Conjunction with the 31st CISHAAN, Tokyo and Kyoto, Japan, August 31-September 7, 1983* 184

## II. REVIEWS

*A Buddhist Spectrum*, by Marco Pallis, London: George Allen and Unwin; New York: Seabury Press. 1980. ix , 163 pp.

The name of the author of these essays will be well known to many readers from his earlier book, first published in 1939, entitled *Peaks and Lamas* in which, beside an account of travel and mountaineering in the Indo-Tibetan borderland, we find perspicacious observations on the state of the traditional civilization and arts of that fascinating region as expressions of the Dharma. Then, in 1947, Marco Pallis was able to spend a whole season at Shigatse, in the Tsang province of Tibet proper, as the outcome of which sojourn the third edition of *Peaks and Lamas* (London, Woburn Press, 1974) included further consideration of the traditional civilization of Tibet. In the present volume are contained more general reflections on different aspects of the Buddhism of India, Tibet and Japan, usually from a comparative point of view which is informed by the author's awareness of the values of traditional religions: Christianity, Islam and Hinduism as well as Buddhism. Several of these essays originally appeared in the journal *Studies in Comparative Religion*, and a couple have already been reprinted in the *Sword of Gnosis* edited by Professor Jacob Needleman (Baltimore, 1974).

The opening essay concerns Karma, the pivotal notion of Buddhism interpreted here as "concordant action and reaction" within the divisions of the world of Saṃsāra. Even in this condition—given the "thread of Buddha-nature passing through the heart of every being"—man is, nevertheless, placed "on the axis of Buddhahood" and can thus be described as "buddhamorphic" (pp. 5, 54). Hence, the dynamic rather than the passive, and fatalistic, view of Karma is set out here (p. 14). The pitfalls of certain moralizing arguments with their anthropomorphism are at the same time pointed out (p. 10), as is the inappropriateness of the common quantitative concept of good Karma as "merit" (p. 11).

Essay Three then proceeds to demonstrate that in Buddhism, which is of course non-theistic, there is not only no problem of theodicy but no problem of evil either: the bad (or unwholesome, *akuśala*) is along with the good (or wholesome, *kuśala*) just a component of the Saṃsāric condition, without the

opposition evil *vs.* good having in fact any ground in reality. Evil is then to be regarded as nothing but "a particular case of the relative, viewed from its privative angle" (p. 46). The true problem—or question—is rather how to "rejoin our centre," how to "find the way home" where this dichotomy (and either dichotomies) simply do not apply.

Essay Four, entitled "Is there room for 'grace' in Buddhism?" considers the contrast, which has become classical in Japanese Buddhism, between "self power" (*jiriki*) and "other power" (*tariki*), and in particular it examines the significance of the latter in Jōdō-shin. "The key to the problem," the author writes, "lies in a property of transcendence itself . . . Enlightenment . . . cannot possibly be situated at the passive pole in relation to man's endeavour, it cannot *per se* become object to man as subject" (p. 55). "Other power," then, is nothing but the "activity of enlightenment"—which is precisely the function of grace (p. 57). Moreover, the outward, "human Guru is not the whole story," Intellect being so to speak the interior Guru (p. 63). Even in Zen, however, characterized though it is by its cultivation of "self power," the Rōshi or Master is also of primary importance (p. 68). In Essay Four there is also a discussion on the similarity of function between Remembrance of Amida (Amitābha) in Sino-Japanese Buddhism and the Six-syllable *Mañi-Mantra* of Avalokiteśvara in Tibetan Buddhism (p. 70–71). In the final analysis, "self power" and "other power" turn out to be in no way incompatible: rather, they belong together and are equally indispensable (p. 68). And "the Buddha's mercy is providential, but does not, for this very reason, suspend the Law of Karma" (p. 98). Essay Six is, then, devoted to a special study of *nembutsu* or Remembrance.

In Essay Nine, dealing with non-self, it is however suggested that "other power" is in a sense more in harmony with this fundamental Buddhist theme of *anātman* (Pali *anattā*; Tibetan *bdag med*) than is "self power" (p. 137). The notion of selflessness is moreover typical of the apophatic method of Buddhism (p. 131); and rather than as a mere analytical exercise it may better be understood as a kind of catalysis (p. 141).

Essay Seven is concerned with Dharma and dharmas as a basis or principle for inter-religious communication. Here it is above all the Hindu notion of Dharma—and of *svadharmā* (corresponding to one's "uniqueness as a person" as well as to a group-interest, p. 105), a term and concept that are not Buddhist—that has attracted the author's attention. This essay also examines René Guénon's adaptation of "Eastern" spirituality to

a "West" in need of help to rekindle its own fires (p. 115) and bring about a *metanoia* (p. 116), as well as Guénon's delimitation of the "esoteric" against the "exoteric." In the last analysis "what is no longer clear, however, is where the frontier between exoteric and esoteric is to be drawn, if indeed a set frontier makes any sense in this order of reality. . ." (p. 119).

In Essays Two and Five, and also in Essay Four, we find percipient remarks on Tantrism, the spiritual "alchemy" it furthers, and its place in our life of today.

Essay Ten is concerned with archetypes, and differences with regard to them between Buddhist thought and many theories of modern psychology—which are often reductionist or scientific (p. 73)—are brought out. In this essay reference is also made (p. 150) to problems raised by the tensions existing between many modern ideas about freedom and equality on the one hand and the fact of bondage and inequality as essential differentiation among individuals in the Saṃsāric condition on the other hand. More could have been said here on this subject, however, for the fundamental distinctions between egalitarianism run riot, equality before the law and of opportunity, and Equality (*samatā*, Tib. *mnyam pa nyid*)—though certainly well-known to the author—have perhaps not been spelled out in sufficient detail to avoid all misunderstanding. And in an essay on archetypes and "archetypal illumination" (p. 152) one misses an explicit reference to the *tathāgatagarbha*, that universal germ of Buddhahood which occupies such an important and central place in the Mahāyāna Buddhism of India and Tibet as well as in that of East Asia, and which is grounded precisely in the equality as to *tathatā* of all sentient beings without exception (see e.g. *Ratnagotravibhāga* i.23–28 and *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* ix.37). (The Buddha nature has, of course, been mentioned in a couple of earlier essays in this volume, where the nature of man has also been very felicitously described as Buddhomorphic.)

In addition to being a profound and penetrating student of religion and traditional forms of life, Marco Pallis is a composer and musician of note. And as a performing artist, as well as a disciple of Arnold Dolmetsch, who was one of the precursors of contemporary interest in early music, he has been especially active in the movement that has over the last several decades revived the music of the fifteenth, sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. This volume thus includes an essay on the "metaphysics of polyphony." Polyphony, a musical form unique to certain periods in the Western Christian tradition, is described here as a sonorous theology and an image of the universe embodied in a

contrapuntal discipline which in its interplay of tensions and releases—crescendi and diminuendi—reflects spiritual disciplines in the “counterpoint we call life.”

D. Seyfort Ruegg

*The Heart of Buddhism* by Takeuchi Yoshinori, edited and translated by James W. Heisig. New York: Crossroad, 1983, xxii + 165 pages, glossary and index. \$17.50 hardcover.

This book is the fourth in the series *Nanzan Studies in Religion and Culture*, a series which has thus far been largely dedicated to making available the thought of the Japanese Kyoto school of Philosophy to the English-speaking world. It contains seven essays by Takeuchi Yoshinori, a follower of Nishida Kitarō and Nishitani Keiji—the major figures in the Kyoto school—and, in his own words, a “Pure Land believer of an extremely conservative stamp” (page 132). The first three of these essays—“The Silence of the Buddha,” “The Stages of Contemplation” and “Centering and the World Beyond”—have to do with Takeuchi’s understanding of the relevance of dhyāna in early Buddhism, and have previously been published in both German and Japanese. The concluding essays are concerned with Takeuchi’s understanding of the Bultmannian and Heideggerian hermeneutic and its possible application to Buddhism; they were all originally published in Japanese.

The *Nanzan Studies* in general—and this work in particular—give those Western Buddhologists and philosophers of religion who cannot read Japanese access to a fascinating cultural and intellectual phenomenon. They make available the thought of a Japanese philosophical movement which is profoundly rooted in Buddhism, and which has also soaked itself in the German philosophical tradition; it is therefore syncretistic in the most positive sense of that term. Takeuchi’s main concern—and that of the Kyoto school generally—is to make sense of and to communicate what it takes to be the central religious meaning of Buddhism. To do this, Takeuchi uses the hermeneutical tools of German philosophy and theology. Thus, he interprets the Buddha’s famous silence on certain metaphysical issues as a “sign of contemplation,” a manifestation of the effects of the meditative techniques practised by the Buddha and an attempt by him to