

THE JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF BUDDHIST STUDIES

ERNST STEINKELLNER
WIEN

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

A.K. Narain
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

EDITORS

L.M. Joshi
Punjabi University
Patiala, India

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Jikidō Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Bardwell Smith
Carleton College
Northfield, Minnesota, USA

Robert Thurman
Amherst College
Amherst, Massachusetts, USA

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Roger Jackson
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA

Volume 8

1985

Number 1

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. Nāgārjuna's Arguments Against Motion, *by Kamaleswar Bhattacharya* 7
2. *Dhāraṇī* and *Pratibhāna*: Memory and Eloquence of the Bodhisattvas, *by Jens Braarvig* 17
3. The Concept of a "Creator God" in Tantric Buddhism, *by Eva K. Dargyay* 31
4. Direct Perception (*Pratyakṣa*) in dGe-lugs-pa Interpretations of Sautrāntika, *by Anne C. Klein* 49
5. A Text-Historical Note on *Hevajratantra* II:v: 1–2, *by Leonard W.J. van der Kuijp* 83
6. Simultaneous Relation (*Sahabhū-hetu*): A Study in Buddhist Theory of Causation, *by Kenneth K. Tanaka* 91

II. BOOK REVIEWS AND NOTICES

Reviews:

1. *The Books of Kiu-Te or the Tibetan Buddhist Tantras: A Preliminary Analysis*, *by David Reigle*
Dzog Chen and Zen, *by Namkhai Norbu*
(Roger Jackson) 113
2. *Nagarjuniana. Studies in the Writings and Philosophy of Nāgārjuna*, *by Chr. Lindtner*
(Fernando Tola and Carmen Dragonetti) 115
3. *Selfless Persons: Imagery and Thought in Theravāda Buddhism*, *by Steven Collins*
(Vijitha Rajapakse) 117

4. *Self and Non-Self in Early Buddhism*, by Joaquín Pérez-Remón
(Vijitha Rajapakse) 122
5. *The World of Buddhism*, edited by Heinz Bechert and Richard Gombrich
(Roger Jackson) 126

Notices:

1. *Tibetan Blockprints in the Department of Rare Books and Special Collections*, compiled by Leonard Zwilling
(Rena Haggarty) 134

OBITUARY 135

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS 138

tion, purification, and transformation, and itself entails an effortless practice of one's own primordial perfection that bypasses the gradual and conventional practices of the other *yānas*. Basing his remarks in part on the *bSam glan mig gron* (a *rdzogs chen* text from Tun Huang), Prof. Norbu points out that, from the rDzogs chen pa perspective, although Zen (or Ch'an) is, like *rdzogs chen*, "a way to find yourself in the absolute condition," it nevertheless arises in a bodhisattvayāna context, and lacks the tantric background or specific concept of "the manifestation of the energy of the primordial state of the individual himself," which is at the heart of *rdzogs chen*. Thus, although there are common elements shared by *rdzogs chen* and Zen, we must speak of the former "as the way of self-liberation and the other as the path of renunciation. From the beginning. . . these two methods are very different" (p. 26).

Other topics touched upon by Prof. Norbu include the relation of *rdzogs chen* to Bon, the introduction of the tradition to Tibet by Vairocana, and the importance of *gter-mas*. Appended to the book is a brief biography of Prof. Norbu, a reincarnate lama who now teaches at the University of Naples, in Italy; included, too, is a guide to pronunciation of the Tibetan transliteration system devised by Prof. Norbu based on the pinyin system of transliterating Chinese.

Overall, Prof. Norbu's approach is a somewhat traditional one, but Dr. Lipman's preface and notes flesh out the historical issues raised by the main essay, and make this little book a good introduction to certain aspects of the *rdzogs chen* tradition, and a welcome addition to the growing literature that discusses the relationship among the various Chinese and Indian traditions that contended or cooperated during the early years of Buddhism in Tibet.

Roger Jackson

Nagarjuniana. Studies in the Writings and Philosophy of Nāgārjuna by Chr. Lindtner. Akademisk Forlag: Copenhagen, 1982, pp. 327 (Indiske Studier IV).

Professor Lindtner's *Nagarjuniana* is a most valuable book. Professor Lindtner has given scholars interested in Nāgārjuna a most useful instrument of research.

In his *Introduction*, Lindtner deals with the difficult problem of authenticating the works attributed to Nāgārjuna. He establishes some criteria for solving this problem and, according to these criteria, he divides the works attributed to Nāgārjuna into three groups: a) genuine, b) spurious and c) dubious. In his *Introduction* Professor Lindtner has also a preliminary summary of the religious and philosophical doctrines of Nāgārjuna, in order to guide the reader of the texts that he edits in the following pages.

In the second part of the book, under the title *Authentic Works*, Professor Lindtner gives critical reviews of the following works: I. *Mūlamadhyamakākārikā prajña nāma*; IV. *Vaidalyaprakaraṇa*; VIII. *Ratnāvalī*; IX. *Pratītyasamutpādaḥṛdayakārikā*; X. *Sūtrasamuccaya*; XII. *Suḥṛllekha*. Lindtner offers also a critical edition and a translation of the following works: II. *Śūnyatāsaptati*; III. *Vigrahavyāvartanī*; V. *Vyavahārasiddhi*; VI. *Yuktiśaṣṭikā*; VII. *Catuḥstava* (is the *editio princeps* of the *Lokātīlastava* and the *Acintyastava*, according to four manuscripts); XI. *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*. Finally, Professor Lindtner presents a translation of XIII. *Bodhisambhāra(ka)* from its Chinese text. All these reviews, editions and translations are accompanied by numerous notes which indicate parallel texts, or clarify obscure passages, and which reveal the great knowledge of Sanskrit and Tibetan Buddhist literature that the author has.

The last part, *The Unity of Nāgārjuna's Thought*, first studies the background of Nāgārjuna's thought, then makes a concise exposition of Nāgārjuna's system, and finally refers briefly to Nāgārjuna's influence.

The book ends with a bibliography, a resumé in Danish, and a reproduction of the Nepalese manuscripts used by the author for his edition of the *Catuḥstava*.

Professor Lindtner is to be congratulated for the excellent work he has done, and it is to be hoped that other books like this one will follow.

Professor P. Williams has published a large *Review Article* on Professor Lindtner's book in *Journal of Indian Philosophy* Vol. 12, No. 1, 1984, pp. 73-104, and Bhikku Pāsādika has reviewed it in *The Tibet Journal*, VIII, 2 (1983), pp. 58-61.

In JIABS, Vol. VI, 2, 1983, pp. 94-123, we published the Tibetan text of the *Yuktiśaṣṭikākārikā* of Nāgārjuna with an English translation. In the introduction we gave the references of four

quotations of *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā*'s stanzas (19, 33, 34 and 39), that are found in other authors' works. We think it is useful that we indicate now the other quotations that Professor Lindtner points out. They are: *stanza 1* in *Sekoddeśaṭikā*, p. 48 (ed. M.E. Carelli, Baroda, 1941); *stanza 5* in Āryadeva, *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇā*, 24 (ed. Patel); *stanza 6* in *Ratnakīrtinibandhāvalī*, p. 139 (ed. A. Thakur, Patna, 1975); *stanza 30* in *Subhāṣitasamgraha*, p. 385 (ed. C. Bendall, *Le Muséon*, N.S. IV, 1903, p. 385), and *Nyāyaviniścayavivarana* II, pp. 17–18 (ed. M.K. Jain) both with variants; *stanzas 46–48* in Haribhadra's *Āloka*, p. 161 (ed. Wogihara, Tokyo 1932–35 = pp. 343–344 ed. P.L. Vaidya, Darbhanga, 1960); and *stanza 55* *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa*, already quoted.

We also avail ourselves of this opportunity to correct some small misprints that appear in our article, in the Sanskrit texts of pages 96 and 97 and in the Tibetan text edited by us: *stanza 33a* read *proktaṃ* instead of *proktaṃ*; *stanza 2d* read *śṛṇusva* instead of *śṛṇusva*; *stanza 1b* read *śiṃ* instead of *iś*; *stanza 6c* read *yoṃs* instead of *yoṃś*; *stanza 7d* read *sgyu* instead of *sgu*; *stanza 14d* read *daṃ* instead of *das*; *stanza 19c* read *dños por*¹⁴ instead of *dños por*; *stanza 36a* read *gyo* instead of *g-yo*; *stanza 49c* read *stsogs* instead of *sogs* (as in *Sde-dge* edition; cf. *stanza 44*, and Lokesh Chandra, *Tibetan-Sanskrit Dictionary* II, p. 1916, who refers to *Mahāvīryutpatti* 9228); *stanza 56b* read *bzlog* instead of *bzlog*; *stanza 59b* read *gyo* instead of *g-yo* (twice).

Fernando Tola and Carmen Dragonetti

Selfless Persons: Imagery and Thought in Theravada Buddhism, by Steven Collins. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1982. Pp. ix + 323.

Buddhist teachings on the nature of the self (the celebrated *anattā* doctrine) clearly stood against the established views on the subject that were upheld in India's various other religious and philosophical systems. A radical anti-metaphysical outlook as well as a striking analytical procedure are evident in these teachings; hence, there is much room to link the latter with the standpoints of Western empiricists, both old and new. Yet this, significantly, is not the perception that guides the discussions in the *Selfless Persons*. On the contrary, the exposition of Theravāda thinking