

THE JOURNAL
OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
BUDDHIST STUDIES

CO-EDITORS-IN-CHIEF

Gregory Schopen
Indiana University
Bloomington, Indiana, USA

Roger Jackson
Fairfield University
Fairfield, Connecticut, USA

EDITORS

Peter N. Gregory
University of Illinois
Urbana-Champaign, Illinois, USA

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Jikidō Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Robert Thurman
Amherst College
Amherst, Massachusetts, USA

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Bruce Cameron Hall
College of William and Mary
Williamsburg, Virginia, USA

Volume 10

1987

Number 1

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. The Female Renunciants of Sri Lanka:
the *Dasasilamattawa*, by Lowell W. Bloss 7
2. Les Réponses des Pudgalavādin aux Critiques
des Écoles Bouddhiques, by Thich Thien Chau 33
3. Tsong kha pa's Understanding of Prāsaṅgika Thought,
by Lobsang Dargyay 55
4. Who Gets to Ride in the Great Vehicle? Self-Image
and Identity Among the Followers of
the Early Mahāyāna, by Paul Harrison 67
5. Shingon Mikkyō's Twofold *Maṇḍala*: Paradoxes
and Integration, by Minoru Kiyota 91
6. Yung-ming's Syncretism of Pure Land and Ch'an,
by Heng-ching Shih 117
7. Pre-Buddhist Elements in Himalayan Buddhism: The
Institution of Oracles, by Ramesh Chandra Tewari 135

II. BOOK REVIEWS

1. *Essays in Gupta Culture*, ed. Bardwell Smith
(Holly Baker Reynolds) 157
2. *Nāgārjunas Filosofiske Vaerker and Miscellanea Buddhica*,
by Chr. Lindtner
(Fernando Tola and Carmen Dragonetti) 161
3. *Tantric Concept of Bodhicitta: A Buddhist Experiential
Philosophy*, by Minoru Kiyota
(Dale Todaro) 164
4. *Zen and Western Thought*, by Masao Abe
(Paul J. Griffiths) 168

Written by leading scholars in South Asian Studies, this is a strong collection of essays which increases in many different ways understanding of the Gupta age and its influence. One would be hard pressed to find anywhere else a better advanced introduction not only to Gupta culture, but also to the interdisciplinary study of Indian civilization.

Holly Baker Reynolds

Nāgārjunas Filosofiske Vaerker, oversat og indledet af Chr. Lindtner, Indiske Studier II, København: Akademisk Forlag, 1982. 263 pages; *Miscellanea Buddhica*, edited by Chr. Lindtner, Indiske Studier V, Copenhagen: Akademisk Forlag, 1985. 221 pages.

These two books belong to the same series (*Indiske Studier*) in which Professor Chr. Lindtner published his valuable *Nagarjuniana, Studies in the Writings and Philosophy of Nāgārjuna*, as the fourth volume. This last book has been reviewed by us in this same Journal (Vol. 8, No. 1, 1985, pp. 115-117).

Nagarjunas Filosofiske Vaerker contains an Introduction in Danish in which Lindtner gives a succinct exposition of Buddhism and Nāgārjuna's system, and also special information about the *Bodhicittavivarāṇa*, *Catuhstava*, (*Lokatīstava* and *Acintyastava*), *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, *Sūnyatāsaptati* and *Vigrahavyāvartanī*. The principal part of the book is the Danish translation of the mentioned treatises. The Tibetan text, with Sanskrit fragments of *Bodhicittavivarāṇa* and *Sūnyatāsaptati*, the Sanskrit text of *Catuhstava* (both hymns) and the Sanskrit text and Tibetan text of *Vigrahavyāvartanī* has been edited by Lindtner in *Nagarjuniana*. The Sanskrit text of *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* constitutes the first Appendix of this book. The second Appendix is the Tibetan text of the *Sūnyatāsaptativṛtti* and the third Appendix is the Danish translation of the Chinese version of the *Pú tí zǐ liáng lūn Bodhisahhāra(ka)?*.

Miscellanea Buddhica is a collection of four articles edited by Lindtner, who is also the author of one of them. These articles are:

- a. J.W. de Jong: Le Gaṇḍavy ūha et La loi de la naissance et de la mort.

- b. M. David Eckel: Bhāvaviveka's Critique of Yogācāra Philosophy in Chapter XXV of the *Prajñāpradīpa*.
- c. V.V. Gokhale and S.S. Bahulkar: *Madhyamakahrdaya-kārikā* Tarkajvāla, Chapter I.
- d. Chr. Lindtner: A Treatise on Buddhist Idealism: Kam-bala's *Ālokamālā*.

a. De Jong's article (pp. 7-24) is a valuable review of Y. Imaeda's book, *Histoire du cycle de la naissance et de la mort. Étude d'un texte tibétain de Touen-Houang* (Genève-Paris, Librairie Droz, 1981). De Jong considers that Imaeda should have given a critical edition of the Tibetan text, since a mere translation of a text of Touen-houang without such an edition is of a limited value for the reader. De Jong observes also that in several places Imaeda does not translate the text as it is presented in the manuscripts and that it is necessary to guess the corrections he has introduced. De Jong thinks also that Imaeda should have given the passages of the *Gaṇḍavyūhasūtra* that correspond to the text he edits, since, as Imaeda himself observes, the translation of that text is difficult, and even impossible, without referring to the *Gaṇḍavyūhasūtra*. Then de Jong examines several passages of Imaeda's translation, giving its Tibetan text and the corresponding Sanskrit text of the *Gaṇḍavyūhasūtra*, and corrects Imaeda's translation.

Per Kvaerne, *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens*, 1985, pp. 229-231, also has written a review of Imaeda's book.

Along with Professor de Jong's severe but as always well founded and accurate judgment, let us mention, in order to rescue the positive elements of Imaeda's book the opinion of Kvaerne: "Imaeda has provided students of Tibet's religious history with access to an important document from a crucial period of religious confrontation and change. His work will also be of interest to a wider audience, including Buddhologists interested in the adaptation of Buddhism to indigenous religious traditions and historians of religion in general."

b. Eckel offers (pp. 25-75) an English translation of Bhāvaviveka's *Prajñāpradīpa*, Chapter XXV, utilizing the Tibetan text edited by Lindtner in *Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica*, Vol. XXIX/2, pp. 77-97. Bhāvaviveka's text is very clearly analyzed and presented in Eckel's translation. It is also richly annotated. This text deals with the Imagined, Dependent and Absolute Natures, contrasting the Yogācāra's and the Madhyamaka's points of view regarding them. It is preceded by an Introduction in which Eckel studies the contents and importance of Bhāvaviveka's text.

c. Gokhale's article (pp. 76–108) contains (a) an English translation of the Tibetan text of Bhavya's *Tarkajvālā*, first chapter, (b) the Sanskrit text of the *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā* (MHK) (of which the *Tarkajvālā* (TJ) is a commentary) and (c) an English translation of these *kārikās*. The Sanskrit text of the *kārikās* was taken by Gokhale from a manuscript of which photographs were provided to him by the late Professor G. Tucci and the IsMEO: this manuscript cannot be later than the tenth century. Its Sanskrit text corresponds almost exactly to its Tibetan translations (in MHK and TJ). The theme of this first chapter is "how a *bodhisattva* continues to strive even after his attainment of *bodhicitta* for the good of humanity (*lokasamgraha*)."

d. Finally Lindtner's article, "A Treatise on Buddhist Idealism" (pp. 109–220) is a critical edition of the Sanskrit treatise of Kambala, *Ālokamālā* (AM), together with its Tibetan translation (*Snang ba'i phreng ba zhes bya ba'i rab tu byed pa*). The edition of the text is accompanied by an English translation, a critical *apparatus* and many notes which indicate parallel passages in other texts. This edition is preceded by a careful introduction.

In this introduction Lindtner tells us that for the study of this treatise he had at his disposal (a) a unique manuscript preserved in the Tokyo University Library, (b) its Tibetan translation contained in the Narthang, Peking, Derge and Cone editions of the *Bstan 'gyur*, and (c) a Tibetan translation of an old Sanskrit commentary ascribed to Asvabhāva and contained also in the four mentioned editions of the Tibetan Canon. Lindtner considers that Asvabhāva's commentary is the main authority for the establishment of the text of AM. AM is a didactic poem and constitutes a simple introduction to the Yogācāra system mixed with Mādhyamika elements. The AM is so a syncretic work. Reminiscences of several authors of both schools and allusions to various *sūtras* are found in it. According to the Colophon of AM its author was Kambala, probably (Lindtner thinks) the same author of *Navaśloka*, edited by Tucci in his *Minor Buddhist Texts* I. Lindtner assigns Kambala's *floruit* to a period placed between 450 and 525 A.D.

Both volumes, especially the second one, provide useful and excellent material for the study of Buddhist philosophy, and are another valuable contribution by Christian Lindtner.

Fernando Tola and Carmen Dragonetti