

THE JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

A. K. Narain
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

EDITORS

Heinz Bechert
Universität Göttingen, FRG

Leon Hurvitz
UBC, Vancouver, Canada

Lewis Lancaster
University of California, Berkeley, USA

Alexander W. MacDonald
Université de Paris X, Nanterre, France

B. J. Stavisky
WNIIR, Moscow, USSR

Alex Wayman
Columbia University, New York, USA

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

Stephen Beyer
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

Volume 2

1979

Number 2

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. Dharmaśrī on the Sixteen Degrees of Comprehension
by Leon Hurvitz 7
2. Indrabhūti's 'Confession of Errors in the Fundamental Teachings of the Vajrayāna', A Critical Edition, English Translation and Discussion, *by Nathan Katz* 31
3. Non-duality of the Two Truths in Sinitic Mādhyamika: Origin of the 'Third Truth', *by Whalen Lai* 45
4. Transpersonal Psychological Observations on Theravāda Buddhist Meditative Practices, *by James Santucci* 66
5. *Bodhicaryāvatāra* 9:2 as a Focus for Tibetan Interpretations of the Two Truths in the Prāsangika Mādhyamika
by Michael Sweet 79

II. SHORT PAPER

1. Some Buddhist Poems in Tamil, *by G. Vijayavenugopal* 93

III. BOOK REVIEWS AND NOTICES

Reviews:

1. The Prajñāpāramitā Literature, *by Edward Conze* 99
2. Two Ways to Perfection: Buddhist and Christian
by Shanta Ratnayaka 103
3. An Introduction to the Buddhist Tantric Systems
by F. D. Lessing and A. Wayman 104
4. Religion and the Legitimation of Power in South Asia;
Religion and Legitimation of Power in Sri Lanka;
Religion and Legitimation of Power in Thailand, Laos
and Burma, *by Bardwell Smith* 107
5. Studies in Pali and Buddhism, *Edited by A. K. Narain* 109

Notices:

- | | |
|---|-----|
| 1. Buddhist Wisdom. The mystery of the self, <i>by George Grimm</i> | 111 |
| 2. Buddhism. A select biography, <i>by Satyaprakash</i> | 112 |
| 3. Living Buddhist Masters, <i>by Jack Kornfield</i> | 112 |
| 4. Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis, <i>by Steven T. Katz</i> | 112 |

IV. NOTES AND NEWS

- | | |
|---|-----|
| 1. On Buddhist Research Information (B.R.I.)
of the Institute for Advanced Studies
of World Religions (IASWR), New York | 113 |
| OBITUARY | 116 |
| LIST OF IABS MEMBERS | 117 |

The Editor-in-Chief wishes to express thanks to Roger Jackson and Rena Crispin for their assistance in the production of this issue.

Indrabhūti's "Confession of Errors in the Roots and Branches of the Vajrayāna": A Critical Edition, English Translation and Discussion*

by *Nathan Katz*

Introduction

I. The Text

The *Vajrayāna mūlāṅgāpatti deśanā* (Tibetan: *rDo rje theg pa'i rtsa ba dang yan lag gi ltung ba'i bshags pa*), or *Confession of Errors in the Roots and Branches of the Bajrayāna*, by the tantric master Indrabhūti (also known as Indrabodhi), is found in two editions of the *bsTan 'gyur*, namely the sNar thang and Peking editions. To the best of our information,¹ it is absent in the Co ne and sDe rge editions. We have found neither commentary nor specific reference to it in other tantric writings, although the issues involved in tantric confessions have been discussed by such authors as Kong sprul,² the Sa skya Paṇḍita,³ the Seventh Dalai Lama⁴ and Tsong kha pa,⁵ and we shall employ some of their observations in our discussion of themes in the present text.

Our text is quite short. In the sNar thang edition it covers fascicles 114b-115b of volume Pu, and in the Peking edition it is found from fascicle 116b to 118a of volume Pu. The Otani catalogue numbers it 4626, and it is not found in the Tohoku catalogue.

Our critical edition is made from a comparison of the Peking and sNar thang texts. Almost all divergences seem to involve errors in transcription alone, although there seems to be one significant difference⁶ where the Peking edition makes reference to the *dkyil 'khor* (*mandala*) and the sNar thang edition is of ambiguous reference.

II. The Author of the Text

The present text was written by one Indrabhūti or Indrabodhi, an eighth-century tantric author from Ugyen (currently Swat state of Pakistan). According to his hagiography,⁷ he was king of his region and an extremely accomplished tantric master. At some point during his reign, Indrabhūti became inspired by the commitment to Buddhist practice by his sister, Lakshminkāra, another in the traditional listing of the eighty-four *grub chen* (*mahāsiddhas*). Feeling a life dedicated merely to one's own self-aggrandizement not to be worthwhile, Indrabhūti handed the government over to his son and began practicing Buddhism seriously but secretly. Having attained *phyags chen* (*mahāmūdra*) after twelve years' arduous practice, Indrabhūti appeared in the sky to his subjects, who attained the first *bhūmi* on seeing this miracle. Remaining in the sky for seven days, he preached about the inaccessibility of Dharma to mundane thought. His hagiography (*rnam thar*) concludes with the attainment of religious ecstasy by his audience, expressed through the metaphor of sky-walking (*mkha' spyod*).

In the Tibetan tradition, especially the rNying ma and bKa' brgyud lineages, Indrabhūti's importance exceeds that of many of the other of the eighty-four *grub chen*. He is paid great homage by the tradition, which ascribes to him the role of teacher of Nāgārjuna (kLu sgrub), and that of foster-parent of Padmasambhava.⁸ Probably for these reasons, B. Bhattacharyya⁹ claims he was the very founder of the Vajrayāna itself, a claim we find exaggerated although not totally without support.

Several of Indrabhūti's works have been included in *bsTan 'gyur*, including some *sādhana* and commentorial writings.

III. Analysis of the Text

As the title indicates, our text is concerned with a confession (*deśanā*; *bshags pa*) of errors (*āpatti*; *ltung ba*) in tantric Buddhist practice. This is significant for any understanding of Vajrayāna Buddhism, since a clear notion of what is taken to be an error in practice would suggest a great deal about the tantric *Weltanschauung* in general. In order to get a clear picture of the tantric usages of "error" and "vow" (*sdom pa*), we propose to compare them with similar structures found in the Theravāda and Mahāyāna Buddhist traditions, in particular the

Theravāda *Pāṭimokkha* (or *śāvakayāna-prātimokṣa*, as it would be known in Mahāyāna texts) and the *Bodhisattva Prātimokṣa Sūtra*. By so doing, we should be able to get some notion as to the continuities and divergences among these three styles (*yāna*; *theḡ pa*) of Buddhism.

A traditional Vajrayāna hermeneutical device has been to speak about these three *yānas* in terms of body, speech and mind, and we wish to employ this indigenous tool to assist in clarifying the issues involved in these three types of vows—a topic about which we find a good deal of secondary literature from the Tibetan Buddhist tradition. We offer that the *śāvakayāna prātimokṣa*, as found in the Pali *Pāṭimokkha* texts, contains vows regarding the body, especially when 'body' (*kāya*; *sku*) is taken in the sense of intentionality or embodiment of volitions; that the *bodhisattva prātimokṣa* deals essentially with vows about speech, when 'speech' (*vāca*; *ngag*) is taken in the sense of our communicative abilities in terms of teaching others, the major concern of the *bodhisattvayāna* in general; and that tantric vows, the type found in our present text, deal with the mind (*citta*; *sems*), especially that mind which indulges in conceptualizations (*vikalpa*; *rtogs pa*) as a style of avoiding what is actually given in a situation (*dnegos po*).

The Tibetan commentorial tradition generally sees restraint from misdeeds as the distinguishing feature (*mtshan gzhi*) of the *śrāvakayāna prātimokṣa*, and in reading through the *Bhikkhupātimokkha*¹⁰ one sees that all of the *āpatti* or errors involve certain behaviors understood as misdeeds, and that the vows undertaken by a *bhikkhu* are essentially restraints against these misdeeds. Citing the *Abhidharmakośa-ṭīkā*, Kong sprul¹¹ gives this etymology for *śrāvakayāna prātimokṣa*: "As it restrains body and speech (from misdeeds), thus it is called *prātimokṣa* vows or restraints."

Although the Sa skya Paṇḍita, in his *sDom gsum*,¹² tells us that all three types of vows are harmonized in the tantric path, and that these three vows are likened to the three jewels, nevertheless the restraining character of the *śrāvakayāna prātimokṣa* is understood as being at a lower level than the *bodhisattva* or tantric (*vidyādhāra*) vows, and it is potentially subject to abrogation by these vows understood as higher.

Similarly, Kong sprul¹³ says that the distinguishing feature of the *śrāvakayāna prātimokṣa* is: "... morality which is not merely aspiring for the refuge of protection from fear and the wish for something good, but the thought of gaining peace for oneself (*rang nyid shi ba*) and developing a strong feeling of disgust (*nges par 'byung pa*) for the whole cycle of *samsāra*." Of course, in Tibetan Mahāyāna literature the idea of

rang shi or 'self-pacification' is thought to be of a much lower order than the noble aspiration (*pranidhāna*) of the bodhisattva to save all sentient beings, so the nature of the *śrāvakayāna prātimokṣa* is understood as lower than that of the bodhisattva.

The vows undertaken by the bodhisattva chiefly deal with the cultivation and maintainence of *bodhicitta*, which is thought of attaining complete enlightenment for the welfare of all sentient beings. The *Bodhisattva Prātimokṣa Sūtra*¹⁴ rather self-consciously distinguishes itself from the *śrāvakayāna prātimokṣa*. It says that the distinguishing feature of the bodhisattva *prātimokṣa* is that the bodhisattva works for the good (*artha; don*) of all sentient beings, while the *śāvaka*, who need not do so, is basically concerned with his own goal.

Kong sprul¹⁵ tells us that the bodhisattva vows involve four aspects: "(1) a special objective, namely being motivated by the attitude of acquiring *samyaksambodhi* (*rdzogs pa'i byang chub*) for the benefit of others; (2) trying to practice the factors conducive to *samyaksambodhi* (*mtshun phyogs*); (3) abandoning all vulgar behaviors (*nyes spyod*) which are adverse to *samyaksambodhi*; and (4) morality of renunciation (*nges 'byung*), together with a mind in accord with all of the above." Thus, according to both Kong sprul and the *Bodhisattva Prātimokṣa Sūtra*, what is essentially different about the bodhisattva vows is a concern for others, and it is in this sense that we maintain the relevance of the speech-communicativeness metaphor for the bodhisattva vows. That this concern is higher than the concerns of the *śrāvaka* is indicated by the Sa skya Pandita's maintaining¹⁶ that the *śrāvaka* vows are binding only for a single lifetime, while the bodhisattva vows carry from birth to birth.

The tantric or *vidyādhāra* vows deal with obscurations of mind (*jñeyāvarana; shes sgrib*). Kong sprul¹⁷ tells us that the nature (*ngo bo*) of tantric vows is: "... to be restrained (*sdom*) from the preconceptions of subject/object with its instincts (*'pho ba'i bag chags*), and to resolve to hold the wisdom (*ye shes; jñāna*) of great bliss (*mahāsukha; bde chen*) which restrains, and the mind which trains itself by this method." He also gives this etymology for 'vidyādhāra vows' (*rig 'dzin sdom*):¹⁸ *Vidyā* means "the excellent wisdom of the non-duality of subject/object, called 'the wisdom of the great bliss'; *dhāra* means "though this *vidyā* is unborn, we re-call it" (*slar gsal gtap pa*); and vow means "the method of re-calling it through the aspect of the deity (*lha'i nam par*), or by being blessed (*adhiṣṭhāna; byin rlabs*)."

Our text begins with a dedication to the *vajrācārya*, the tantric guru,

to the *vīra* and *vīra*, embodiments of the heroic deeds of one striving for enlightenment, and to the lord of the practice of yoga. There are then fourteen specific confessions, followed by three verses of entreaty which serve both to summarize the fourteen specific confessions and to pray for the accomplishment of *siddhi*. It is to the fourteen specific confessions that we wish to call attention.

Of these fourteen errors, eleven are clearly problems of conceptualization. Of the remaining three, two deal with vows of secrecy involved in tantric training, and one deals generally with the breaking of vows. To summarize, the eleven errors of conceptualization are: (1) undervaluing the guru; (2) disregarding Buddhist doctrines; (3) not adequately respecting the intimacy of the 'tantric family' or teaching situation; (4) not generating sufficient loving thought ('*byams sems*') for all beings who are potential Buddhas; (5) losing *bodhicitta* by indulging in such conceptions as 'relative' and 'absolute'; (6) insufficiently regarding the integrity of all philosophic systems (*siddhānta*; *grub mtha*'), whether Buddhist or not; (7) regarding the five *skandhas* as problematic, whereas in reality they are the five wisdoms; (8) the prejudice of imposing affirmation or negation and moral judgments onto one's experience; (9) infatuation with those who are opposed to the Vajrayāna; (10) imposing one's own personal affirmation or negation onto the wisdom of *śūnyatā*; and (11) because of the *kleśa*, not sufficiently regarding one's own insight into the Buddhist path.

Clearly, then, the predominant notion of an 'error' in Indrabhūti's texts involves the conceptualizing mind, and perhaps the harmony of these three vows which the Sa skya Paṇḍita maintains is that of the harmony of body, speech and mind, a harmony which is the goal of all Buddhist practice.

English Translation

Hum Vajrācārya, the one who is peerless
in the fundamentals of the *maṇḍala*
to the *vīra* and the *vīrā*,¹
the Yogeśvara² and so forth,
I beg you to think of me compassionately.

I beg forgiveness from the *trikāya* of the gurus³
because, being intoxicated by the great disease of arrogance,
I have, by my recklessness, held the Vajrācārya,
who is the root of all *siddhi*, in contempt.

I sincerely declare and confess
having transgressed and disregarded,
by underestimating its worth,
the speeches from the holy mouths
of the indescribable Dharmakāya, the Sambhogakāya and
Nirmāṇakāya, which exist for the benefit of others.

I sincerely declare and confess
being angry with and rebuking the tantric family,⁴
which by one vow⁵ is conjoined
of one guru, one wisdom consort⁶ and one *maṇḍala*,
especially in other times.

I sincerely declare and confess,
because I have been unskillful and totally influenced by hatred,
the giving up of all beneficial and loving thought⁷
for all sentient beings, who are endowed with *Buddhagarbha*,⁸
the ability to become the holy, exalted offsprings of the Jina.⁹

I sincerely declare and confess,
by having succumbed to the influence of mundane preconceptions,¹⁰
the abandonment of the blissful *bodhicitta*,
which is the nature of all phenomena,
beyond the ideas of relative and ultimate.¹¹

I sincerely declare and confess
abusing the philosophic systems¹²
of outsiders,¹³ *śrāvakas*,¹⁴ *pratyekabuddhas*,¹⁵ mahāyānists¹⁶
and peerless secret mantrayānists,
those either seeking or having already entered the path.¹⁷

I sincerely declare and confess
the promulgation of secret *mantras*, *mūdras*, signs, *mantra*,
profound secrets and so forth, to improper containers,
those degenerated from the rituals, immature and
not suitable receptacles for the profound mantrayāna.

I sincerely declare and confess
killing, hindering, bashing, mortifying, abusing and
regarding as inferior,
the five *skandhas*,¹⁸
which are in reality the five Buddha-families
which are of the nature of the five wisdoms.¹⁹

I sincerely declare and confess
to the stainless Dharmadhātu²⁰
my prejudices which prevented me from realizing
that, although all phenomena are by nature pure,
they are labelled into two as 'yes/no' and 'good/evil'.

I sincerely declare and confess to the guru,
the *triratna*,²¹ my failure to convert,
in fact, my infatuation with, the people who abuse,
cast aspersions upon and disregard
the secret *mantra* and Vajrayāna.

I sincerely declare and confess
the labelling as 'yes' and 'no'
the great wisdom of the vacuity of constructed thought,²²
in which there is not the least predicament
as all names are merely projections.²³

I sincerely declare and confess
to those who are the devoted ones
and who follow the transmission
my being responsible for the loss of faith
of those who possess the initial disposition,
who are childlike,
by disclosing the profound words and tantric practices.

I sincerely declare and confess
with a mind filled with extreme regret,
my not keeping by belittling
all branches of the vows
which should be known, safeguarded, engaged in and kept,
despite my knowing better.

I sincerely declare and confess
to the common and special peerless wisdom consort
abusing and seeing the shortcomings and faults
of the holy insight²⁵ into the external, internal and
secret (levels),²⁶
having been motivated by the defilements.²⁷

Though confession and what is to be confessed
are non-objectifiable,
in order to eliminate the instinctive thought-constructs,

as I sincerely confess to the exalted object of the holy vows,
so may I have happiness.

Please grant forgiveness, O compassionate protector!
(I have) cultivated the wisdom-consort which has no vow,
argued in the offering-circle²⁸ and so forth,
taken the elixir²⁹ and the inferior wisdom-consort,
not preached to the right containers who aspire to the secret Dharma,
and misled the faithful ones with non-Dharmic talks,
passed more than seven days among the *śrāvakas*,³⁰
claimed to be a tantrika only in name,
and wrongly disclosed mantra to improper containers,
contradicted and made mistakes in meditation and recitation
and committed errors of impure views and practice.

Please grant the *siddhi* of Brahmā³¹ quickly.
I declare and confess the degeneration of the vows of body.
I declare and confess the degeneration of the vows of speech.
I declare and confess the degeneration of the vows of mind.
I declare and confess the degeneration of the root vows.
I declare and confess the degeneration of the branch vows.
I declare, declare, declare to the wisdom deity.³²
I confess, confess, confess to the assembly of the *dākinīs*³³ of the vows.
By offering this declaration and confession,
please grant me the *siddhi* of Brahmā.

Critical Edition

rDo rje theg pa'i rtsa ba dang yan lag gi ltung ba'i bshags pa
by Indrabhūti (Indrabodhi)

sNar thang edition: sNgags, vol. Pu, fascs. 114b–115b.
Peking edition: rGyud 'grel, vol. Pu, fascs. 116b–118a.
Otani number: 4626.

hung rdo rje slob dpon rig mar mtshungs¹ pa dang
rtsa ba dkyil 'khor² la bla na med³ pa dang
dpa' bo dpa' mo rnal 'byor dbang phyug sogs
mkha' 'gro'i tshogs rnams brtse bas dgongs su gsol

dngos sgrub rtsa ba rdo rje slob dpon la
nga rgyal mthon po'i nad kyis bdag gzer te
bag med tshul gyis brnyas pa gang bgyis pa
bla ma rnam gsum sku la bzod par gsol

chos sku⁴ spros dang bral bde nyid la
longs spyod rdzogs dang sprul skus gzhan don mdzad
de yi⁵ zhal nas gsungs pa'i bka' rnams las
'das shing khyad du bsad pa 'thol lo bshags

bla ma gcig dang rig ma gcig hyid dang
dkyil 'khor gcig dang bye brag dus gzhan du
dam tshig gcig gis bsdus pa'i spun rnams la
khros shing nyis par brjod par⁶ 'thol lo bshags

sems can thams sangs rgyas snying po can
rgyal ba'i sras mchog dam par gyur pa la
bdag ni mi mkhas zhe sdad dbang du⁷ gyur te
byams sems phan bde spangs pa mthol lo bshags

chos rnams thams cad byang chub sems yin⁸ te
kun rdzob don dam cha lam rten cing
'jig rten rnam rtog dbang du gyur pa yis
bde chen byang sems spangs pa 'thol lo bshags

phyi rol pa dang nyan thos rang rgyal dang
theg pa che dang gsang sngags bla na med
lam tshol⁹ ba dang de bzhin lam chen zhugs
grub pa'i mtha' rnams smad pa 'thol lo bshags

smod min chog nyams dang ma smin dang
zab mo gsang ba'i smod du mi rung¹⁰ la
gsang sngags phyag rgya brda dang sngags la sogs
zab mo gsang ba bsgrags pa 'thol lo bshags

phung po lnga ni rgyal ba rigs lnga'i dngos
ye shes lnga yi rang bzhin yin pa la
gsad bcad bngeg dang dkar thub bsnyung ba sogs
smad cing dam na par brtags pa mthol lo bshags

chos rnams kun gyi rang bzhin dag pa la
yin dang min dang bzad¹¹ gnyis su btags
rang bzhin dag pa'i¹² chos kyi dbyings nyid la
the tshom som nyi zos pa 'thol lo bshags

bla ma dang ni dkon mchog gsum rnams dang
gsang sngags rdo rje theg la mi mos zhing
smod cing bkur pa 'debs pa'i mi rnams la
tshar¹³ ma bcad cing byams bgyis 'thol lo bshags

ming rnams thams cad rnam par rtog¹⁴ pa ste¹⁵
rtog pas stong pa'i ye shes chen po nyid
'de le zug rdu rdul tsam med pa la
yin dang min¹⁶ du btags pa 'thol lo bshags

dang po'i las can gyis pa'i dang tshul can
dang ldan lung gi rjes su 'brang rnams la
zab mo'i tshig brjod brtul zhugs spyod bstan pas
pha rol sems sun phyung ba 'thol lo bshags

mi spings spyad cing bsrung bar bya ba dang
shes par bya ba'i dam tshig yan lag bcas
shes bzhin khyad de gsang nas mi rten pa
rab tu 'gyod pa'i sems kyis 'thol lo bshags

phyin ngag sang ba'i shes rab dam pa dang
thun mongs gyad par rig ma bla med la
skyon dang nyes pa'i sgo nas smad gyur pa
nyon mongs kun nas blad ba 'thol lo bshags

bshags dang bshags par bya ba migs kyang
rnam par rtog pa'i bag chags sbyan dya'i phyir
rje btsun dam pa yul gyi 'chog rnams la
rab tu bshags pas bde ba thob gyur cig
dam tshig mi ldan rig ma brten pa dang
tshogs 'khor la sogs nad du brcod pa dang
rig ma dman la 'dud rtsi blangs pa dang
gsang chos 'dod pa'i smod la ma bshags
dang ldan chos min gtam la sbyar ba dang
nyan thos nad du zhag bdun 'das pa dang
ming tsam la rten sngags pa yin smra dang
smod min pa la sngags bshad nyes pa dang
sgom bzlas la sogs 'gal 'khrul gyur pa dang
lta sbyod la sogs ma dag nyes pa rnams
mgon po thugs rje¹⁷ can la bzod par gsol

tshangs pa'i dngos grub myur du stsal du gsol
 sku'i dam tshig nyams pa 'thol lo bshags
 gsung gi dam tshig nyams pa 'thol lo bshags
 thugs kyi dam tshig nyams pa 'thol¹⁸ lo bshags
 rtsa ba'i dam tshig nyams pa 'thol lo bshags
 yan lag dam tshig nyams pa 'thol lo bshags¹⁹
 'thol lo 'thol lo ye shes lha la 'thol bshags so bshags so²⁰ dam can mkha'
 'gro tshigs
 'thol bshags phul nas tshangs pa'i dngos grub stsol
 zhes bshags so
 rdo rje theg pa'i rtsa ba yan lag gi²¹ ltung ba'i bshags pa
 slob dpon in dra bo dhis mdzang pa rdzogs so

NOTES TO THE INTRODUCTION

Williams College, Williamstown, Massachusetts

* A paper presented to International Seminar on Tibetan Studies, St. John's College, Oxford University, July 1-7, 1979.

1. Personal communication from Professor Lewis Lancaster, University of California at Berkeley, dated October 26, 1978.

2. Kong sprul, *Theg pa'i sgo kun las btus pa gsung rab rin po che'i mdzod bsal pa gsum legs par ston pa'i bstan bcos shes bya kun khyab* (*Shes bya kun khyab*), ed. Lokesh Chandra, intro. E. Gene Smith, *Kongtrul's Encyclopaedia of Indo-Tibetan Culture*, Parts I-III, New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, Sata-Pitaka Series, Vol. 80, 1970.

3. Sa skya Pandita, *Rang bzhin rdzogs pa chen po'i lam gyi cha lag sdom pa gsum mnam par nges pa zhes bya ba'i bstan bcos bzhugs so*, n.p.: The Press of the Indestructible Sacred Word, n.d.

4. dGe slong bLo bzang bskal bzang rgya mtsho (the Seventh Dalai Lama), *gSang chen rdo rje theg pa'i smin byed kyi dbang rjes gnang sogs kyi sngon 'gro'i ches kyi gtam do bya ba gzhan phan ra ster bzhugs*, Tibetan wood-block text, Library of Tibetan Works and Archives accession no. 1081.

5. Tsong Kha pa, *sNgags rim chen mo*, in *The Collected Works of Tsong kha pa*, Peking ed., Otani no. 6210. Partially translated by Jeffrey Hopkins, et. al., *Tantra in Tibet: The Great Exposition on the Secret Mantra*, London: George Allen & Unwin, 1977.

6. See note 2 to the critical edition.

7. bLa ma chen po Mi 'jigs pa sbyin pa dpal, *'Phags yul grub chen brgyad cu rtsa bzhi'i byin rlabs skor lus/ lo rgyus mnam par thar pa mams bzhugs so*, Varanasi: E. Kalsang, 1972, translated by Nathan Katz, "A Translation of the Biography of the Mahāsiddha Indrabhūti with Notes," *Gangtok: Bulletin of Tibetology*, XII, 1, 1975.

8. W.Y. Evans-Wentz (ed.), *The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation*, London and New York: Oxford University Press, 1959.

9. B. Bhattacharyya, *The Indian Buddhist Iconography*, Calcutta: Firma K.L. Mukhopadhyay, 3rd edition, 1968, p. 57f.
10. Nānamoli Thera, ed. & tr., *The Pātimokkha: The Rule for Buddhist Monks*, Bangkok: King Mahā Makuta's Academy, 1969.
11. Kong sprul, *op. cit.*, 'grel, II: 38. lus ngag sdom pa'i phyir so so thar pa'i sdom pa shes bya'o.
12. Sa skya Pandita, *op. cit.*, fasc. 55a.
13. Kong sprul, *op. cit.*, 'grel, II: 37.
14. Nalinaksha Dutt, ed. & tr., "Bodhisattva Prātimoksa Sūtra," *Indian Historical Quarterly*, VII, 1931, pp. 259-286, p. 278.
15. Kong sprul, *op. cit.*, 'grel, II: 101.
16. Sa skya Pandita, *op. cit.*, fasc. 2b.
17. Kong sprul, *op. cit.*, 'grel, II: 136-137.
18. *ibid.*, 'grel, II: 137.

NOTES TO THE TRANSLATION

1. *Vīra* and *vīrā* = *dpa' bo dpa' mo*, literally "hero" and "heroine," or the heroic quality of striving for enlightenment, as indicated by the Tibetan translation of 'bodhisattva' by *byang chub sems dpa'*.
2. The 'lord of yoga' = *yogesvara* = *rnal 'byor dbang phyug*.
3. The 'trikāya of the gurus' = *bla ma nam gsum sku*.
4. 'Tantric family' means *vajrabandhu*, or that which is joined in the Vajrayāna. In this case, the *vajrabandhu* is composed of one guru, one wisdom-consort (*rig ma*) and one *mandala*, brought together by the very nature of the vows, which are always described as mutually binding between the guru and disciple.
5. 'Vow' in this instance is our translation of *dam tshig* or *samāya*.
6. The 'wisdom-consort' or *rig ma* (*prajñā*) is the embodiment of the wisdom principle in a feminine form. Of course, this symbol is found repeatedly in tantric literature and iconography, and some dimensions of its usage are explored in my essay, "Anima and mkha' 'gro ma: A Critical, Comparative Study of Jung and Tibetan Buddhism," *Dharmasala: The Tibet Journal*, II, 3, 1977, pp. 13-43.
7. 'Loving thought' is *'byams sems* or *maitri*, which Kong sprul ('grel, II: 101) says is "the root of all virtue".
8. *Buddhagarbha* or *sangs rgyas snying po* is the potentiality for awakening in all sentient beings.
9. *Jina* or *rGyal ba* means 'the conqueror', an epithet of the Buddha and of the highest Tibetan lamas, such as the Dalai Lama and the leaders of the other three lineages.
10. 'Mundane preconceptions', *'jig rten nam rtoq* or *vikalpa*, are conceptual devices employed by ego to avoid confronting its own insubstantiality.
11. *Bodhicitta*, according to *bodhisattvayāna* texts, is said to be either relative or ultimate. Aryadeva, in his *bZhi rgya pa*, chapter five, tells us that this distinction is based on whether or not the individual's *bodhicitta* is suffused by the pure perception of *'sūnyatā* (*ngon sum du mi byed pa*).
12. The philosophic systems (*siddhānta*; *grub mtha'*) are summarized in Herbert V. Guenther, tr. and ann., *Buddhist Philosophy in Theory and Practice*, Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1972.

13. 'Outsiders' = *phyi rol pa*, or non-Buddhists.

14. The 'śrāvakas', or *nyan thos*, are literally the 'hearers' of the Buddha's teachings. The term *śrāvakayāna* (*theg pa'i nyan thos*) is generally an equivalent to the derisive 'hinayāna'. On the use of this term in Māyāna literature, see my doctoral dissertation, "The Concept of the Arahant in the *Sutta Pitaka*, with Reference to the Bodhisattva and the Mahāsiddha," Temple University, 1978, esp. pp. 448-479.

15. The *pratyekabuddha*, *rang rgyal* or *rang sangs rgyas*, originally was one who, according to the Buddha, was able to resolve the multi-lemma of *samsāra* outside of the Buddhist system. Gradually this term came to be used rather vaguely to discuss a type of Buddhist practitioner. A fine discussion of its original use in the Pali texts is M.A.G.T. Kloppenborg, *The Paccekabuddha*, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1974.

16. Mahāyānists (*theg pa chen po*) are followers of the bodhisattva method.

17. "Those either seeking or having already entered the path" indicates the traditional notion that each stage of spiritual growth has both a generative and resultant aspect. The earliest use of this type of idea is found in the Pali Buddhist notion of the four paths and the four fruitions (*maggā* and *phalāni*); in the *bodhisattvayāna* it gets expressed through the ideas of wishing and engaging types of *bodhicitta* vows (*smon pasems bskyed kyi sdom pa* and '*jug pa sems bskyed kyi sdom pa*'); and in the Vajrayāna it is expressed as the general classification of tantras into causal and resultant, and which has been discussed by Tsong kha pa in his *sNgags rim chen mo*.

18. The five *skandhas* or *phung po* are the aggregates of form, sensation, recognition, volition and consciousness which make up what we call the 'individual'. These are often expressed as the 'five aggregates of clinging' (*upāndānakkhandā*) and are seen in Pali Buddhism as essentially problematic. Tantric Buddhism tends toward an intrinsic valuation of the person, and thus the five *skandhas* are here said to be of the nature of the five wisdoms.

19. See note 18. According to tantric Buddhism, the five wisdoms are none other than the five *skandhas* transmuted.

20. The *Dharmadhātu* (*chos kyi dbyings nyid*) or 'realm of Dharma' is none other than one's ordinary experiencing without conceptualizations.

21. The *triratna* or *dkon mchog gsum* means the Buddha, Dharma and Saṅgha, and is identical with the triple refuge of Buddhism.

22. 'Constructed thought' (*rtog pa*; *vikalpa*) has been discussed in note 10 above.

23. See note 10 above; 'projections' is an alternate translation of the same term.

24. 'Practices' is our translation of the difficult term, *spyod* or *cārya*, which could alternatively be rendered as 'behavior', 'carrying-out', 'coursing', etc.

25. 'Insight' = *shes rab* or *prajñā*.

26. The 'external, internal and secret (levels)' is one way of talking about the three *yānas*.

27. The 'defilements' (*kṛśa*, *sgrib*) are ignorance, aversion and attraction; essentially, that which keeps one from enlightenment.

28. 'Offering-circle' = *ganacakra* = *tshogs 'khor*.

29. 'Elixir' = *bdud rtsi* = *amṛta*.

30. Passing seven days among the *śrāvakas* is understood in the *bodhisattvayāna* as one of the potential causes for losing *bodhicitta*. According to sGam po pa (*Jewel Ornament of Liberation*, tr. H.V. Guenther, Berkeley: Shambhala, 1971, p. 4), the *śrāvaka* mentality is characterized by: (1) fear of *samsāra*; (2) desire for *nirvāna*; and (3) interest in one's

welfare alone. Insofar as Buddhism is not merely a device for avoiding unpleasantness, such an attitude would be equally deleterious to one practicing the Theravāda as for one engaging in the *bodhisattvayāna* or *tantrayāna*.

31. The 'siddhi or Brahmā' is *tshangs pa'i dngos grub*, a way of saying 'the highest siddhi', I am grateful to Professor David L. Snellgrove, University of London, for clarifying this reference.

32. The 'wisdom deity' (*ye shes lha*) is, according to Tsong kha pa, the distinguishing characteristic of the tantric path. In his *sNgags rim chen mo* (*op. cit.*, p. 142) he says that the practices of visualization associated with this deity are the most direct method for the attainment of a Buddha-body or Buddha-intentionality. The Seventh Dalai Lama (*op. cit.*, fasc. 8b) characterizes the Vajrayāna simply as a 'short way' (*myur lam*) for actualizing the principles of the *bodhisattvayāna*.

33. See note 6.

NOTES TO THE EDITION

1. sNar thang: mchungs
2. sNar thang: 'de in place of dkyil 'khor
3. Peking: mad
4. sNar thang: sku'i
5. sNar thang: li
6. Peking: pa
7. sNar thang: "du" is absent
8. Both texts are unclear; "yin" is a conjecture.
9. sNar thang: chol
10. Both texts are nearly illegible; "rung" is a conjecture.
11. Both texts are unclear, but "bzad" seems appropriate.
12. Peking: pi'
13. sNar thang: char
14. sNar thang: rtag
15. sNar thang: sta
16. sNar thang: men
17. Both texts read rji, but rje is preferable.
18. sNar thang: thol
19. sNar thang: gshangs
20. sNar thang: bshagso
21. sNar thang: lagi

AUTHOR'S NOTE

My appreciations to: Mr. Lozang Gyaltsan of the Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, Dharamsala, for previewing this text with me; Mr. Sherab Ebin, Lecturer in Sanskrit at Naropa Institute, for checking over my critical edition; and Dr. Mark J. Tatz, University of British Columbia, for making available to me a copy of the Sa skya Paṇḍita's text.