

THE JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF BUDDHIST STUDIES

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

A.K. Narain
University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA

EDITORS

†L.M. Joshi
Punjabi University
Patiala, India

Alexander W. Macdonald
Université de Paris X
Nanterre, France

Bardwell Smith
Carleton College
Northfield, Minnesota, USA

Ernst Steinkellner
University of Vienna
Wien, Austria

Jikidō Takasaki
University of Tokyo
Tokyo, Japan

Robert Thurman
Amherst College
Amherst, Massachusetts, USA

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Roger Jackson
Fairfield University
Fairfield, Connecticut, USA

ERNST STEINKELLNER
UNIVERSITY OF VIENNA

Volume 8

1985

Number 2

CONTENTS

I. ARTICLES

1. Padma dKar-po on the Two *Satyas*, by Michael Broido 7
2. "No-Thought" in Pao T'ang Ch'an and Early Ati-Yoga,
by A. W. Hanson-Barber 61
3. Wõnhyo (Yüan Hsiao) on the Nirvāṇa School:
Summation Under the "One Mind" Doctrine,
by Whalen Lai 75
4. The Bodhisattva Ideal of Theravāda, by Shanta
Ratnayaka 85
5. Nature in Dōgen's Philosophy and Poetry, by
Miranda Shaw 111

II. BOOK REVIEWS

1. *Buddhism in Life: The Anthropological Study of Religion
and the Sinhalese Practice of Buddhism*, by Martin
Southwold
(George D. Bond) 133
2. *Dhamma: Western Academic and Sinhalese Buddhist
Interpretations: A Study of a Religious Concept*,
by John Ross Carter
(Harry M. Buck) 135
3. *Matrix of Mystery: Scientific and Humanistic Aspects of
rDzogs-Chen Thought*, by Herbert V. Guenther
(A. W. Hanson-Barber) 138
4. *The Sutra of the Contemplation of the Buddha of Immeas-
urable Life*, by the Ryukoku University Trans-
lation Center
(Minoru Kiyota) 140

5.	<i>The Sutra of the Wise and the Foolish (mdo bdzaris blun), or, the Ocean of Narratives (üliger-iin dalai), translated by Stanley Frye (John R. Krueger)</i>	143
6.	<i>Tibetan Buddhist Medicine and Psychiatry: The Diamond Healing, by Terry Clifford (Todd Fenner)</i>	145
	OBITUARIES	149
	LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	157

Theravāda tradition. For example, Southwold is impressed with the depth of insight that the villagers display in stating that the essential point of Buddhism is not to kill animals. To be sure, this idea has significance and denotes for villagers more than it might seem at first; however, it is not the case that this is the only meaning of Buddhism or that people at different places on the path, such as the meditators or the scholar monks he discredits, cannot have other insights into the truth of Buddhism.

Just as he misses the synchronic connections of the gradual path, so the author also misses the diachronic development of the tradition that led to this concept of the path. He does not explain properly the historical relation between Aśoka Buddhism, traditional Theravāda as established at Anurādhapura and the traditional village Buddhism that he investigated. Village Buddhism as Southwold depicts it, is cut off from all of the sources: the historical tradition, the scriptures, and even the Buddha. The result, therefore, is that the book provides some interesting glimpses of village Buddhism but gives the reader something less than a comprehensive understanding of village Buddhism as an expression of the dynamics of the Theravāda Buddhist tradition.

George D. Bond

Dhamma: Western Academic and Sinhalese Buddhist Interpretations: A Study of a Religious Concept, by John Ross Carter. Tokyo: The Hokuseido Press, 1978. x + 202 pp., Bibliography and index.

I begin my review by quoting the author's concluding statement:

The Buddha has been remembered by Buddhists because he re-discovered salvific Truth and through preaching it enabled men and women to hold it in mind, in heart, and through their living it to be held by it in the process of transcending, of salvation. '*Dhamma*: because it holds, supports"—"*dhāreti ti dhammo*.'

When the Buddha set in motion the *dhammacakka*, he released a force that has literally run through the world with saving power. The *dhamma* has assumed many forms—Theravāda, Mahāyāna, Tantrayāna, and many others—but the Threefold Refuge (*tis-araṇa*) has persisted wherever it went.

What better way to enter into the heart of the Buddhist tradition than by the Triple Gem:

<i>Buddham saraṇaṃ gacchāmi</i>	I go to the Buddha for refuge
<i>Dhammaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi</i>	I go to the Dhamma for refuge
<i>Samghaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi</i>	I go to the Sangha for refuge.

And what better starting place than the second jewel of the Triple Gem, the hard-to-understand term *dhamma*?

This 212-page volume is a thorough study of a narrowly defined topic, the meaning of *dhamma* in the Theravāda tradition as seen by Western scholars; in Theravāda literature, ancient and modern; and by contemporary Sinhalese Buddhists. Such an undertaking makes two demands. One must search diligently through Pāli, Sinhalese, and Western literature in order to catalogue, display, and understand how the term *dhamma* has been used in both a Sinhalese context and by Western students of Buddhism. Even if this task is performed fully and flawlessly, however, it is no guarantee that the scholar will feel the compulsion of the path of the Buddha which has attracted myriads of men and women for more than two millenia. To discern the second refuge and its ability to transform life requires more than textual analysis.

Few writers succeed in both of these demands. Even fewer Ph.D. candidates can break out of the shackles that chain them to textual analysis. We feel comfortable when we can bolster our conclusions with copious references to written materials. This book, based on the author's doctoral dissertation at Harvard University in 1972, succeeds admirably in the first task. Two of his six chapters deal directly with "*Dhamma* in the Pāli *Suttas* and Commentaries" and "Recollection of *Dhamma* in the *Visuddhimagga*." Another surveys "*Dhamma* in Sinhalese Buddhist Literature Prior to the Nineteenth Century." Lists and tables abound, cataloguing definitions and usages with sufficient thoroughness to provide future researchers with much of their basic material.

Similar classifications are made in the chapter on "*Dhamma* in the Western Academic Tradition" and "*Dhamma* in the Continuing [Sinhalese] Tradition." The former chapter, which begins the book, furnishes a valuable summary of Buddhist scholarship in the West, beginning with Eugène Burnouf (1844) who saw *dhamma* as *La Loi*, and concluding with perceptive contemporary scholars like Slater, Smith, and King, to mention just a few. Unfortunately, many significant quotations from primary source

material are left untranslated, and the convoluted style of writing makes unnecessary demands on a reader. Such writing may impress Ph.D. committees, but a publisher should insist on giving such material a thorough stenographic bath before letting it out to the public. Despite such difficulties, however, the book succeeds in the first task, a thorough analysis of the important literary materials.

Carter is sensitive to the second demand. Buried in his analysis of "*Dhamma* in the Pāli Suttas and Commentaries," is the observation that "the Buddha did not penetrate the *doctrine* of the four truths; rather, he is seen as having penetrated *dhamma* that is the four truths" (p. 73). He recognizes that "what a man says it not the most important part of his communication but rather what he assumes, what he takes for granted . . ." (p. 66). He maintains that "the task at hand . . . is to discern the way *dhamma* made a difference religiously for men and women who became Buddhists, who decided that they would live according to *dhamma*" (p. 56). I am particularly drawn to his statement that

to define a term is, by definition, to limit it. Defining the term *dhamma*—how it is used, what it means—is an interesting undertaking. Discerning a perspective for life—how it is to be lived, what it means—is of far greater import, more momentous, of cosmic consequence. Buddhists have been and are concerned with the meaning of *dhamma* not primarily as a means to facilitate textual translations but as a means to transform life" (p. 64 f.).

This reviewer would have been pleased if, in addition to reading these statements he could have felt their impact more fully throughout the book.

This book, then, belongs in serious research collections on Buddhology. It does for the term *dhamma* what Guy Welbon's study *The Buddhist Nirvāṇa and its Western Interpreters* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1968) did for the term *nirvāṇa*. It will remain a valuable compendium of research materials for many years.

Harry M. Buck