

# JIABS

Journal of the International  
Association of Buddhist Studies



Volume 30 Number 1-2 2007 (2009)

The *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* (ISSN 0193-600XX) is the organ of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Inc. As a peer-reviewed journal, it welcomes scholarly contributions pertaining to all facets of Buddhist Studies.

JIABS is published twice yearly.

Manuscripts should preferably be submitted as e-mail attachments to: *editors@iabsinfo.net* as one single file, complete with footnotes and references, in two different formats: in PDF-format, and in Rich-Text-Format (RTF) or Open-Document-Format (created e.g. by Open Office).

Address books for review to:

JIABS Editors, Institut für Kultur- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens, Prinz-Eugen-Strasse 8-10, A-1040 Wien, AUSTRIA

Address subscription orders and dues, changes of address, and business correspondence (including advertising orders) to:

Dr Jérôme Ducor, IABS Treasurer  
Dept of Oriental Languages and Cultures  
Anthropole  
University of Lausanne  
CH-1015 Lausanne, Switzerland  
email: *iabs.treasurer@unil.ch*  
Web: <http://www.iabsinfo.net>  
Fax: +41 21 692 29 35

Subscriptions to JIABS are USD 40 per year for individuals and USD 70 per year for libraries and other institutions. For informations on membership in IABS, see back cover.

Cover: Cristina Scherrer-Schaub

Font: "Gandhari Unicode" designed by Andrew Glass (<http://andrewglass.org/fonts.php>)

© Copyright 2009 by the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Inc.

Print: Ferdinand Berger & Söhne  
GesmbH, A-3580 Horn

## EDITORIAL BOARD

KELLNER Birgit  
KRASSER Helmut  
Joint Editors

BUSWELL Robert  
CHEN Jinhua  
COLLINS Steven  
COX Collet  
GÓMEZ Luis O.  
HARRISON Paul  
VON HINÜBER Oskar  
JACKSON Roger  
JAINI Padmanabh S.  
KATSURA Shōryū  
KUO Li-ying  
LOPEZ, Jr. Donald S.  
MACDONALD Alexander  
SCHERRER-SCHAUB Cristina  
SEYFORT RUEGG David  
SHARF Robert  
STEINKELLNER Ernst  
TILLEMANS Tom

# JIABS

Journal of the International  
Association of Buddhist Studies

Volume 30 Number 1–2 2007 (2009)

## Obituaries

- Georges-Jean PINAULT  
*In memoriam, Colette Caillat (15 Jan. 1921 – 15 Jan. 2007)* ..... 3
- Hubert DURT  
*In memoriam, Nino Forte (6 Aug. 1940 – 22 July 2006)* ..... 13
- Erika FORTE  
*Antonino Forte – List of publications* ..... 17

## Articles

- Tao JIN  
*The formulation of introductory topics and the writing of  
exegesis in Chinese Buddhism* ..... 33
- Ryan Bongseok JOO  
*The ritual of arhat invitation during the Song Dynasty: Why  
did Mahāyānists venerate the arhat?* ..... 81
- Chen-Kuo LIN  
*Object of cognition in Dignāga's Ālambanaparīkṣāvṛtti: On  
the controversial passages in Paramārtha's and Xuanzang's  
translations* ..... 117
- Eviatar SHULMAN  
*Creative ignorance: Nāgārjuna on the ontological signifi-  
cance of consciousness* ..... 139
- Sam VAN SCHAİK and Lewis DONEY  
*The prayer, the priest and the Tsenpo: An early Buddhist  
narrative from Dunhuang* ..... 175

Joseph WALSER

*The origin of the term 'Mahāyāna' (The Great Vehicle) and  
its relationship to the Āgamas* ..... 219

### **Buddhist Studies in North America**

Contributions to a panel at the XVth Congress of the International  
Association of Buddhist Studies, Atlanta, 23–28 June 2008

Guest editor: Charles S. Prebish

Charles S. PREBISH

*North American Buddhist Studies: A current survey of the field* .. 253

José Ignacio CABEZÓN

*The changing field of Buddhist Studies in North America* ..... 283

Oliver FREIBERGER

*The disciplines of Buddhist Studies – Notes on religious  
commitment as boundary-marker* ..... 299

Luis O. GÓMEZ

*Studying Buddhism as if it were not one more among the  
religions* ..... 319

•

*Notes on contributors* ..... 345

## In memoriam

COLETTE CAILLAT  
(15 Jan. 1921 – 15 Jan. 2007)

GEORGES-JEAN PINAULT

International Indology has suffered a great loss by the demise of Prof. Dr. Colette Caillat, precisely on her eighty-sixth birthday, 15 January 2007. She had contacts and friendly relationships with scholars of Indian studies all over the world, especially in her field of expertise: Jaina and Buddhist studies and Middle Indo-Aryan linguistics, not excluding other topics, as classical Sanskrit literature and Indian culture in general. I may refer to obituaries that have been already published for full information about her career and publications.<sup>1</sup> I would like to stress shortly some important facts. On one hand, the education of Colette Caillat is deeply rooted in the French humanist tradition, which is based on the study of classical languages (Latin and Greek), and masterworks of French and world literature: her interest for Sanskrit was initially connected with comparative Indo-European linguistics, but the French Indology of the 1930s and 1940s had developed a keen interest for the study of Indian languages and literature in the larger context of India and South Asia, that is in their native milieu. Her teachers, whose merits she was never reluctant to recognize, were Louis

<sup>1</sup> See *Indo-Iranian Journal* 50, 2007, pp. 1–4 (by Minoru Hara); *Bulletin d'Études Indiennes* 22–23, 2004–2005 [published in June 2007], pp. 23–70 (by Nalini Balbir, with full bibliography, including the reviews); *The Journal of Jaina Studies* (Japan), Vol. 13, September 2007, pp. 77–90 (by Nalini Balbir, with list of papers related specifically to Jaina studies); *Indologica Taurinensia*, Vol. XXXIII, 2007, pp. 167–182 (by Nalini Balbir, with list of books and articles published between 1988 and 2007); *Journal Asiatique* 295.1, 2007, pp. 1–7 (by Nalini Balbir).

Renou (1896–1966), who had the deepest knowledge of the Vedas, of Pāṇini and of the literary genres of classical Sanskrit, and Jules Bloch (1880–1953), who drew the attention of his audience to the whole history of Indo-Aryan, with Pāli and Prākṛits as intermediates, and to all aspects of Indian material and non-material culture. This latter influence explains why Colette Caillat learned, in addition to Sanskrit and Middle Indo-Aryan languages, Hindi at the School of Oriental Languages (“Langues Orientales”) in Paris. On the other hand, Colette Caillat has been from the beginnings of her research on Jaina literature at the level of international research in Indology, through the decisive collaboration with Walther Schubring (1881–1969) in Hamburg, to whom she was addressed by Louis Renou, because nobody in France was proficient in the texts of the Jaina tradition. Later, again under the recommendation of Schubring, she became a collaborator of the Critical Pāli Dictionary, an international venture based on the highest philological standards, the publication of which started in 1924. One should add that she visited India for the first time in 1963, and that she worked regularly there over the years, especially in Mysore and Ahmedabad, being in friendly contacts with Jaina scholars. Therefore, Colette Caillat has been able to combine her European scholarly education with open-mindedness for the Indian culture, including its contemporary aspects, but she never forgot the rational and historical approach, that is based ultimately on the influential doctrine of Antoine Meillet (1866–1936), linking linguistics with social and cultural history.

All works of Colette Caillat are characterized by great accuracy in philological matters, lucidity of exposition, and high sensibility to the texts. One should add common sense, which is not the quality that is most frequently met among great Indologists. Accordingly, her researches on the vocabulary and on minute details of grammar were conceived as tools for understanding with the best exactness the way of thinking of Indian authors of the past. This method is certainly welcome for the understanding of literatures that play consciously with the potentialities of the language itself.

Colette Caillat has made a great contribution to a wider knowledge of the Jaina religion and literature. As a matter of fact, she has also emphasized the links between Jaina and Buddhist traditions, despite their independence, on the linguistic as well as on the doctrinal side. Her doctoral thesis about the *Atonements in the Ancient Ritual of the Jaina Monks* (1965)<sup>2</sup> remains a masterpiece, since she was able in a luminous style to disentangle a complicated doctrine from the texts themselves and to explain it in a wider context, that makes the difficult matter understandable for every humanist.

The bibliography of Colette Caillat is quite impressive: nine personal books, mostly on Jaina texts, direction of eight books,<sup>3</sup> around 90 articles and 190 reviews in various journals. I can testify that Colette Caillat, since the beginning of her career, has read in depth and annotated many works of Indologists of present and past time. Therefore, every statement from her pen is based on long-time thinking, pondering and immense learning. I remember that she has followed with passion all advances about the interpretation of the edicts of Asoka that remain a turning point of Indian linguistic and cultural history. She said also that she never hesitated to immerse herself in the monumental edition of the *Gāndhārī Dharma-pada* by John Brough (1962). It is no surprise that she has been much interested in the past years in the publication of manuscripts from several collections that emerged from the Gandhāra region. In some sense, her teaching and original contributions helped to fully appreciate under the best angle the relevance of these documents for the history of Buddhism, which, in addition to their intrinsic linguistic import, committed to oblivion some rash ear-

<sup>2</sup> Date of the original publication in French; English translation published in Ahmedabad, 1975.

<sup>3</sup> Some of them are proceedings of conferences; others are editions of the works of her teachers: Jules Bloch, *Application de la cartographie à l'histoire de l'indo-aryen*, in collaboration with Pierre Meile, specialist of Dravidian (Paris, 1963); *Recueil d'articles de Jules Bloch 1906–1955* (Paris, 1985); Louis Renou, *Études védiques et pāṇinéennes*, t. XVII (Paris, 1969).

lier generalizations based on less material. As an appendix to this present memorial, I give a list of her articles devoted to Buddhist studies and Middle Indo-Aryan linguistics, but I would insist on the importance of her reviews, from which one can glean many important insights. To this list should be added the booklet *Pour une nouvelle grammaire du Pāli*, Turin, 1970, based on a lecture given at the Istituto di Indologia dell'Università di Torino. This modest publication (around 30 pages) actually paved the way to the linguistic interpretation of facts in a larger spectrum, including morphology, syntax, derivation, thus replacing the innovations and stylistic choices of the Pāli language into history.<sup>4</sup> One of her last works was the direction of a collective dossier about ancient Buddhism: “Le bouddhisme ancien sur le chemin de l'Éveil. Les vies du Bouddha, Nobles Vérités et Octuple sentier. Philosophie ou religion?” for the journal *Religions & Histoire*, Nr. 8, May–June 2006, pp. 12–75. It testifies to her pedagogical talent in introducing the fundamentals of the Buddhist way of thinking.

Colette Caillat was quite engaged in the teaching of Indology at the University: having started her career in Lyon (1960–1965), she succeeded Louis Renou at the Sorbonne in 1966, and she taught there until her retirement in 1989. She was convinced that Indian studies are as demanding as studies of classical languages: they are worth of a complete course at the university. Her direct pupils have much benefited from her teaching that was quite stimulating because of her wide knowledge of all aspects of Indian culture and of Indology. She was able to share with the audience her curiosity and even her love for everything Indian. As a former student, I will always remember her unique way of pronouncing Pāli and Ardhamāgadhī, which helped to communicate the feeling of living and real languages. She has encouraged young researchers that had different interests in the large field of Indology. One may say that

<sup>4</sup> It has been openly taken into account in the handbook of Middle Indian published by Prof. Dr. Oskar von Hinüber, *Das ältere Mittelindisch im Überblick*, Vienna, 1<sup>st</sup> edition 1986, 2<sup>nd</sup> revised edition 2001.



several (French and non-French) Indologists, while having their own intellectual aims, owe their degree to her benevolence and her capacity to form a decent committee for a thesis; she had the ability to highlight the strong points of a student, while indicating the weak points if needed. Her influence spread to scholars of other countries, especially from Japan, where she had many friends, some of them being former pupils, starting with Prof. Katsumi Mimiaki (Kyoto). One may recall that the latter colleague gave the name *Kaya* (“perfume” in Japanese) to his daughter, born 1977, as a reminder of his Parisian teacher. While having strong convictions, and being quite sympathetic towards modern trends, Colette Caillat was both fair and friendly, and she never compromised firm ethical principles. These personal features explain her wide influence and her role in several academic institutions, learned journals and international committees; she served as treasurer of the International Association for Sanskrit Studies (1977–2000), and she was elected to the Presidency of the International Association of Buddhist Studies (1999–2002). She conceived indological research on an international basis, and was opposed to every form of nationalism, which turns often to chauvinism or sectarianism. She was open to all sound advances in Indology; one could also say that she could express a typical French irony against fuss and overstatement, which belong to the usual pathology of scholarship. She was very demanding of herself, and she was devoted to the transmission of the knowledge that she had received from her teachers and friends, because it remains the basis of every future progress in the understanding of the contribution of India to the universal culture.

### Articles by Colette Caillat on Middle Indo-Aryan and Buddhist studies<sup>5</sup>

« Deux études de moyen-indien (1. À propos de pali *phāsuviḥāra*, ardhama-gadhi *phāsuya-esañijja* ; 2. Sur l'origine de *goṇa*) », *Journal Asiatique* 248, 1960, pp. 41–64.

« Nouvelles remarques sur les adjectifs moyen-indiens *phāsu*, *phāsuya* », *Journal Asiatique* 249, 1961, pp. 497–502.

« Les dérivés moyen-indiens du type *kārima* », *Journal Asiatique* 253, 1965, pp. 289–308.

« La séquence SHYTY dans les inscriptions indo-araméennes d'Asoka », *Journal Asiatique* 255, 1966, pp. 466–470. Following Émile Benveniste & André Dupont-Sommer, « Une inscription indo-araméenne d'Asoka provenant de Kandahar (Afghanistan) », *ibid.*, pp. 437–465.

« La finale *-ima* dans les adjectifs moyen- et néo-indiens de sens spatial », in : *Mélanges d'indianisme à la mémoire de Louis Renou*, Paris, De Boccard, 1968 (Publications de l'Institut de Civilisation Indienne, n° 28), pp. 187–204.

« *Isipatana migadaya* », *Journal Asiatique* 256, 1968, pp. 177–183.

« Pāli *ibbha*, Vedic *ibhya-* », in : Lance Cousins et al. (eds.), *Buddhist Studies in honour of I.B. Horner*, Dordrecht, D. Reidel, 1974, pp. 41–49.

« À propos de sanskrit *candrimā-* 'clair de lune' », in : *Mélanges linguistiques offerts à Émile Benveniste*, Paris (Collection linguistique publiée par la Société de Linguistique de Paris, t. 70), 1975, pp. 65–74.

« Forms of the Future in the *Gāndhārī Dharmapada* », in : *Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute*, Poona, 1977–1978 (Diamond Jubilee Volume), pp. 101–106.

« Pronoms et adjectifs de similarité en moyen indo-aryen », in: *Indianisme et Bouddhisme. Mélanges offerts à Mgr. Etienne Lamotte*, Louvain-la-Neuve, 1980 (Publications de l'Institut orientaliste de Louvain, n° 23), pp. 33–40.

« La langue primitive du bouddhisme », in : Heinz Bechert (ed.), *The Language of the Earliest Buddhist Tradition*, Göttingen (Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen. Phil.-hist. Kl., 3. Folge, Nr. 117), 1980, pp. 43–60.

<sup>5</sup> A volume of selected papers on this topic is currently in preparation for publication by the Pali Text Society.

« État des recherches sur les inscriptions d'Asoka », *Bulletin d'Études Indiennes* 1, 1983, pp. 51–57.

« Pāli (langue, littérature) », in : *Encyclopaedia Universalis*, Paris, 1985, Corpus, t. 13, pp. 986–988.

« Prohibited speech and *subhāsita* in the Buddhist Theravāda tradition », *Indologica Taurinensia* 12, 1984, pp. 61–73 (Proceedings of the Scandinavian Conference-Seminar of Indological Studies, Stockholm, June 1<sup>st</sup>–5<sup>th</sup>, 1982).

« Notes bibliographiques : quelques publications récentes consacrées aux traditions manuscrites du bouddhisme indien et aux conclusions générales qui découlent de leur étude », *Bulletin d'Études Indiennes* 2, 1984, pp. 61–69.

« The Condemnation of False ~ Wrong Speech (*musāvāda*) in the Pali Scriptures », in : Tatsuro Yamamoto (ed.), *Proceedings of the 31<sup>st</sup> International Congress of Human Sciences in Asia and North-Africa*, Tokyo-Kyoto (31<sup>st</sup> August-7<sup>th</sup> September 1983), Tokyo, 1984, Vol. 1, pp. 201–202 (résumé).

« Grammatical Incorreptions, Stylistic Choices, Linguistic trends (with reference to Middle Indo-Aryan) », in: Wolfgang Morgenroth (ed.), *Sanskrit and World Culture. Proceedings of the 4<sup>th</sup> World Sanskrit Conference (Weimar, 1979)*, Berlin, Akademie Verlag, 1986 (Schriften zur Geschichte und Kultur des Alten Orients, Nr. 18), pp. 367–373.

« Sur l'authenticité linguistique des édits d'Asoka », in: Colette Caillat (ed.), *Dialectes et formes dialectales dans les littératures indo-aryennes. Actes du colloque international*, Paris, De Boccard, 1986 (Publications de l'Institut de Civilisation Indienne, n° 55), pp. 413–432.

« The constructions *mama kṛtam* and *mayā kṛtam* in Asoka's edicts », in: Albrecht Wezler & Ernst Hammerschmidt (eds.), *Proceedings of the XXXII International Congress of Asian and North African Studies* (Hamburg, 25<sup>th</sup>–30<sup>th</sup> August 1986), Stuttgart, Franz Steiner Verlag, (ZDMG, Supplement IX), 1992, p. 489.

« Some idiosyncrasies of language and style in Asoka's Rock Edicts at Girnar », in: Harry Falk (ed.), *Hinduismus und Buddhismus. Festschrift für Ulrich Schneider*, Freiburg, 1987, pp. 87–100.

« Vedic *ghraṃśá-* 'heat' of the sun, Ardhamāgadhī *ghīmsu* 'burning heat', Jaina Māhārāṣṭrī *ghim-*<sup>o</sup> 'hot season' », in: *Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute* 68 [Ramakrishna Gopal Bhandarkar 150th Birth-Anniversary Volume], 1987, pp. 551–557.

« Aspects de l'épigraphie dans l'Asie du Sud et du Sud-Est », *Comptes rendus de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres*, 1988, 4<sup>e</sup> fascicule, pp.

1–12 (communication prononcée dans la séance publique annuelle du 18 novembre 1988).

« Notes grammaticales sur les documents kharoṣṭhī de Niya », in : Akira Haneda (ed.), *Documents et archives provenant de l'Asie centrale*. Actes du colloque franco-japonais (Kyoto, 4–8 octobre 1988), Kyoto, Société Franco-Japonaise des Études Orientales, 1990, pp. 9–24.

« Asoka et les gens de la brousse (XIII M–N) “qu'ils se repentent et cessent de tuer” », *Bulletin d'Études Indiennes* 9, 1991, pp. 9–13.

« The 'double optative suffix' in Prakrit Asoka XIII (N) *na haṃnesu/na haññeyasu* », in: *Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute* [Amṛtamahotsava Volume] 72–73 (1991–1992), 1993, pp. 637–645.

« Connections between Asokan (Shahbazgarhi) and Niya Prakrit? », *Indo-Iranian Journal* 35, 1992, p. 109–119.

« Deux notes de moyen indo-aryen. I. Les quatre thèmes de présent de HAN-en pali. II. 'Double optatif' en mahārāṣṭrī jaina ? », *Bulletin d'Études Indiennes* 10, 1992, pp. 97–111.

« Doublets désinentiels en moyen indo-aryen », in : Reinhard Sternemann (ed.), *Bopp-Symposium 1992 der Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin* (Akten der Konferenz vom 24.3.–26.3.1992), Heidelberg, Universitätsverlag Carl Winter, 1994, pp. 35–52.

« Vedic and Early Middle Indo-Aryan », in : Michael Witzel (ed.), *Inside the texts, beyond the texts. New approaches to the study of the Vedas*. Proceedings of the International Vedic Workshop (Harvard University, June 1989), Cambridge (Mass.), Harvard Oriental Series (Opera Minora, Vol. 2), 1997, pp. 15–32.

« L'appel de la Loi ou l'âge transcédé », in : Christine Chojnacki (ed.), *Les âges de la vie dans le monde indien*. Actes des journées d'étude de Lyon (22–23 juin 2000), Lyon, 2001 (Collection du Centre d'Etudes et de Recherches sur l'Occident Romain. Nouvelle série, n° 24), pp. 325–332.

« Gleanings from a Comparative Reading of Early Canonical Buddhist and Jaina Texts », *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 26/1, 2003, pp. 25–50.

« Manuscrits bouddhiques du Gandhāra », *Comptes rendus de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres*, janvier-mars 2003, pp. 453–460.

« L'époque du Bouddha et la diffusion du bouddhisme », « La doctrine des Anciens (Thera-vāda) », in : *Religions & Histoire*, n°8, mai–juin 2006, pp. 14–17, 36–42.

**Articles in the *Critical Pāli Dictionary (CPD)***, Copenhagen, in Volume II, from fascicle 7 (1971) to fascicle 15 (1990) : is–issayitatta, uddha–unnītaka, upatapeti–upananda-sakyaputta, ekato–ekāvasa, etādī–etāva(ta), ettaka–ettāvatā, edī–edisaka.

**Reviews of fascicles of the CPD** : *Indogermanische Forschungen* 71, 1966, pp. 306–309 ; 74, 1969, pp. 223–225 ; 75, 1970, pp. 299–303 ; 78, 1973, pp. 247–249 ; 79, 1974, pp. 250–255 ; 81, 1976, pp. 327–329 ; 88, 1983, pp. 312–318 ; *Bulletin de la Société de Linguistique de Paris* 66/2, 1971, pp. 66–67 ; *Comptes rendus de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 1992, pp. 689–691.