

Daneben wurden noch einige Zahlen direkt genannt: einmal 1700,— DM und zweimal um 1500,— DM brutto.

So lassen sich also Schwankungen zwischen 1255 und 2025 DM für die gleiche Arbeit feststellen. Bedenkt man, wie lange in der Regel ein Kunstgeschichte-Studium dauert, daß am Abschluß kein Staatsexamen steht, sondern mindestens der Magister und in der augenblicklichen Situation faktisch sogar die Promotion Einstellungs Voraussetzung für ein Volontariat ist, so kann nur nachdrücklich die Forderung nach einer einheitlichen Entlohnung der Volontäre/Volontärinnen mit 1/2 BAT IIa erhoben werden.

Michael Hütt

## Rezensionen

PETER ANSELM RIEDL, MAX SEIDEL (Hrsg.): *Die Kirchen von Siena*. Reihe Ital. Forschungen (Sonderreihe). Bd. 1, 1—3: Abbadia all'Arco — S. Biagio. Bearbeitet von Monika Butzek und Hans Teubner sowie Alessandro Bagnoli, Michael Braune, Annelie de Palma, Carl Ludwig Fuchs, Ruth Grönwoltd, Enrica Neri Lusanna, Peter Anselm Riedl, Bruno Santi, Max Seidel und anderen. Bd. 1,1 (Textband) 576 S., Bd 1,2 (Bildband) 304 S. mit 571 s/w und 8 Farbabb., Bd. 1,3 (Planband) 134 S. mit 4 Plänen und 12 mehrfach eingeschlagenen Faltplänen. Ln. DM 572,—. München, Bruckmann 1985.

It is a marvellous thing to see the foundations of a great new enterprise well and truly laid. Yet this first, three-part volume of *Die Kirchen von Siena* is much more than merely a foundation. It is, in itself, a fully finished structure, architecturally complete down to the last and most minute of all its multifarious details.

The present volume in a near-square 'quarto' (H. 28 cm, W. 24 cm), which sets the pattern for all those still to come, runs alphabetically from Abbadia all'Arco, which is in fact S. Mustiola alla Rosa, to S. Biagio dell'Arcivescovato, which is actually the Duomo and will therefore likewise be dealt with in a later volume. Apart from such cross-referencing, the volume covers nine destroyed and eight surviving churches. These include S. Agostino, which takes up almost exactly half of the text volume of some 554 close-packed, two-column pages and gives a fair conspectus of the amazingly impressive way in which the major churches are being treated. In terms of scholarship and presentation alike, 'sumptuously' is perhaps as good an adverb as any to apply to the way it is being handled, since, in the accompanying separate parts, 300 of the 571 illustrations and 8 of the 16 plans and sections are devoted to it. It therefore gives a clear view of the kind of treatment which can be expected in the subsequent volumes as far as a major church is concerned.

First, there comes a chronological survey of the known facts, followed by a description of the building. Then the history of the main phases in the construction of the church as it now stands are set out, in this particular case in three stages. The first of these covers the early history from its foundation, not long after the approval of the Augustinian Order in 1256, up to the discontinuation of the work on the original choir and crossing as a result of the Great Plague of 1348. This section is largely

archaeological and reconstructive. The element of reconstruction also plays a major role in the second phase, which runs from the restarting of the work a quarter of a century later to the completion, in the late 15th century, of the existing structure, the interior of which lies buried, but still decipherable in its main outlines, under Luigi Vanvitelli's nave and Antonio Galli Bibiena's choir and crossing of 1747—55. These latter constitute the core of the third and final phase which runs up to the present day. In contrast to E. and W. Paatz's *Die Kirchen von Florenz*, published unillustrated in octavo and completed in the early 1950's and, in its own day, an epoch making achievement, reconstruction is now incorporated, like the analysis of the existing structure, in the main flow of the text.

As in Paatz, the present contents of the church form the next section, which is set out and illustrated in exemplary detail, covering everything in full from, for example, the history, layout, mechanism, housing, and state of conservation of the organ, through the paintings and sculptures, to the chalices and chasubles. In each category, materials, techniques and state are discussed with the same meticulous attention to detail as the documentation of their commissioning, making, and subsequent history, insofar as these are known. There is also, throughout the book, and this is in its way perhaps no less important, a commendable refusal to guess, when facts do not exist, and this is particularly true in the succeeding section in which, again as in Paatz, the lost contents of the church are set out. Here, once more, the treatment is expanded and reorganised, being set out in four columns, three of them corresponding to the three main building periods and the fourth devoted to the recorded burials. The presence or absence of a particular monument or object and the changing status of objects between one time period and another are therefore rapidly appreciable. Throughout the book the exact documentary references are given and inventories are set out in full. Then, in a separate section at the end, the texts of the major documents and entries for the churches covered are given in extenso. Indeed, the methodical transcription of the wide-ranging and unusually copious Sienese archives being undertaken by Gino Corti and Maria Letizia Strocchi, is one of the major fruits of the whole enterprise.

Finally, in this brief descriptive survey, special mention must be made of the volume of plans. Here, as everywhere, comparison with Paatz is inevitable and the contrast striking. All are newly drawn to a scale of 1:50 and published here on that of 1:100. For S. Agostino, there is naturally a plan, a cross section of the crossing and transepts, a lengthwise section down the nave, with all the Vanvitelli/Bibienna detail, together with axonometric reconstructions of the exterior and the interior c. 1500, and a plan of the former lower church of S. Croce. These are of a quality and on a scale which make them, unlike those in the majority of previous architectural publications of this or any other kind, real working tools, fit for whatever uses subsequent historians may have in mind. The only curiosities are two partial, photogrammetric print-outs of the exterior from the north east and north west, one of them with peculiar, seemingly arbitrarily chosen detail floating on one side. These seem, as far as the reader is concerned, to be entirely pointless except as a rather odd reminder that a photogrammetric survey has in fact been undertaken. The latter is in itself a major advance upon previous art historical procedures. It provides a quite new form of documentation, which allows all future

architectural historians or conservationists to make detailed investigations of the measurements of each and every part of the structure without recourse to further campaigns of measurement in the building itself.

The final virtue of the book, as far as layout is concerned, is that the notes, though copious, have been kept to their due function and proportion. Whereas in Paatz, the notes at the end take up half of the entire entry for S. Croce and fully two thirds of the 300 pages devoted to the Duomo, they here accompany and amplify, but do not overwhelm the text.

Little further emphasis is needed on the fact that when the series is complete it will constitute a visual and documentary record of the churches of Siena, both surviving and destroyed, of a completeness and a usefulness which has never previously been attempted on such a scale. It also reflects the raising to new levels of intensity of the international cooperation, governmental, regional and civic, institutional and personal, of which the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florence, which is responsible for this enterprise, as it was for Paatz's classic publication and the twenty years of effort that went into that, has been a creative and immensely productive symbol throughout the almost hundred years of its existence. Yet another virtue of this first volume, which establishes the character of the whole series, is that, under its editors and begetters, Peter Anselm Riedl and Max Seidel, the cooperative nature of the work is fully recognised. Each section of the text and every entry is initialled by one or, in some cases, by two members of the team of 11 authors and 14 co-workers under the leadership of Monika Butzek and Hans Teubner. Individual responsibility, everywhere accepted and acknowledged, is entirely to the readers' benefit.

Even the fact that when the enterprise is complete, the smallest of lost oratories in Siena will have been as well or better documented and recorded than a myriad host of major churches throughout Italy, is by no means as ironic in the case of Siena as it would have been for almost any other town or city in the land. Nowhere else, as far as I know, is there so complete a survival into the 20th century, on such a scale and at so high a qualitative level, of an entire medieval city. It is not simply a matter of the obvious physical survival of so high a proportion of the medieval urban structure and its constituent streets and buildings in a form so relatively little altered. Despite particular, disastrous losses during the last war, and the occasional but nonetheless significant depredations of well-intentioned early scholars, the wealth of the surviving archival material is hardly less remarkable. And this is no mere chance. For nowhere else on such a scale, is there so rich a survival of the organisational fabric, as well as of the physical structure of a medieval town. The Terzi into which the city was divided in the later middle ages, and the Contrade into which these were, in their turn sub-divided, are not mere recorded facts, but living entities. It is not simply in the Palio that they come to life, or for the benefit of tourists; quite the contrary. They are, to a remarkable extent, part of the human fabric and the day to day activity and experience of the individual citizens who live within their boundaries. The activity of the contrade is as constant as their names are splendid. Aquila, Chiocciola, Onda, Pantera, Tartuca, Civetta, Leocorno; all the 17 survivors of that medieval world retain their structure. As one small, happy illustration of the fact, Alberto Cornice, who, with Cecilia Alessi, has

contributed the fruits of his research into unpublished guides and diaries, holds the honoured and the active post of the Historian of the Contrada dell'Onda.

A greatly expanded understanding of this continuity of civic life and of the processes and patterns of patronage which gave existence to the buildings and the monuments and works of art, which are the primary focus of the volume, will undoubtedly be amongst the most profound and most significant of its by-products. Indeed, the very use of the term may of itself reveal misunderstanding of what has been, and of what has yet to be, achieved. Of the churches covered in this volume, S. Antonio da Padova (Tartuca), for example was founded in 1644 because the Contrada was no longer to be allowed free access for its gatherings to the oratory of S. Ansano in Castelveccchio, which also figures in the volume, and which had been put up between 1443 and 1448, at the behest of the Consiglio Generale, in honour of one of the city's four Patron Saints. With the transformation of the Palio into a regular, annual event from 1656 onwards, and the increased involvement of the contrade in its organisation and finance, there were increasing tensions between the Contrada della Tartuca and the Rector of the Opera del Duomo over the use of the Oratory of S. Ansano. So it was that one of the last of Siena's rich contrade finally decided to build an oratory of its own.

Not all of Siena's 17 contrade were as prosperous, however, and it was only in 1933 that the Contrada della Civetta, gave up its use of borrowed facilities and built itself a modest oratory of its own in the base of one of the 12th—13th century town towers of the Ugurgieri, taking up no more than two-thirds of its width.

It is only because attention has been focused just as keenly on the documentation, visual and otherwise, of lost churches as on that of the survivors, that, in connection with the Hospital of S. Antonio Abate, long destroyed, that we are given new and fascinating facts about the celebrated goldsmith Ugolino di Vieri. It was he who had apparently, in 1356, restored the dilapidated chapel of SS. Agnese ed Ivone, next to the Porta Oliviera, and now in 1372 asked for permission to build, at his own expense, a twelve-bed pilgrims' hospital and chapel in the piazza, with the proviso that Commune should, if the work was not complete in three years, be authorised to take up all his worldly goods to fund it. It is likely that it was for his chapel, in which masses were to be offered every day in perpetuity, that he intended the 'figure and miracles' of S. Antonio which he had acquired in Paris, thus finally confirming that he had, as has been long suspected, actually travelled to the artistic centre of the Gothic world.

There is even evidence of the physical impact of the art historian on the environment in the odd polygonal cap set wholly inappropriately, together with pseudo-primitive 'Romanesque' animal and human headed consoles, on the rounded apse of S. Andrea in 1929—32. The comparison between the 'restoration' of the building and its previous state as documented in a photograph of 1908 is of more than passing interest to the art historian and to the historian of art history alike, since it was Péleo Bacci, who is famous for the reconstruction of Giovanni Pisano's Pisa pulpit, who was the man in charge of this particular, imaginative tidying operation.

All in all, the users of the present volume will not merely have within their grasp a compilation or assemblage of otherwise known, but previously dispersed facts, or of facts not previously known because they were not worth the bother of discovering. To

give only the most significant and obvious example, virtually all the building history of S. Agostino, now laid out in such meticulous detail, was unknown or, where it seemed to be known, either wrong or garbled. It is already patent in this opening volume that the series is to be in no way an encyclopedia in the magpie sense, but a continuous voyage of research and exploration. However, even willing, and indeed delighted, passengers must be allowed one little opportunity to carp. There is one thing that is sorely needed on the voyage, yet is strangely missing. Where so much has been so well done and so much foresight shown, and treasure both of time and money spent, it would be good to have with every volume just one map to show us where each lost or each surviving building actually was or is. It is perhaps too much to ask for a transparent overlay to show us where the boundaries of the Terzi and Contrade lie. But passengers are like reviewers — never satisfied.

John White

JOACHIM POESCHKE, *Die Kirche San Francesco in Assisi und ihre Wandmalereien* (mit Aufnahmen von Stefan Diller, Luigi Artini und P. Gerhard Ruf). München, Hirmer Verlag 1985. 137 S. und 304 Tafeln, davon viele in Farbe. DM 198,—.

Die Ausmalung der beiden Kirchen von San Francesco in Assisi, ein Ensemble von seltenem künstlerischen und kunstgeschichtlichen Rang, hat viel Aufmerksamkeit auf sich gezogen. Die Literatur dazu ist kaum mehr für den Fachmann überschaubar. Doch bisher fehlte eine Bilddokumentation, die die ausgedehnten Zyklen der Wandmalerei in ihrem Zusammenhang, und im Verband mit dem Innenraum, zugänglich macht. Deswegen wird man einen Tafelband, der genau diese Lücke füllt, mit Begeisterung begrüßen. Das Modell des Hirmer-Buches hat sich hier wieder einmal vorzüglich bewährt. Alle modischen Unarten, die heutige Bildbände oft zur Quelle des Ärgers werden lassen, sind vermieden. Alle Möglichkeiten, das Ensemble in einer genau gestaffelten Folge von Raum-, Gesamt- und Detailaufnahmen so zu erschließen, daß der Leser sich orientieren und zugleich in das einzelne Bild vertiefen kann, sind genutzt. Man kann dem Verlag zu dieser neuerlichen verlegerischen Leistung nur gratulieren.

Die Qualität der Tafeln erweist sich auch an jenen Fresken, deren schlechter Erhaltungszustand Reproduktionen sonst so schwer lesbar macht. Überall, selbst in den Farbabbildungen, dominiert der Gegenstand und tritt das Foto als Selbstwert zurück. Das macht den Umgang mit dem Band so angenehm. Er setzt sich nicht an die Stelle der abgebildeten Werke, sondern dient ihrer Kenntnis. Die Architektur und die Glasmalerei nehmen aus verständlichen Gründen nur einen bescheidenen Raum ein, weil der Band der Ausmalung den ersten Platz einräumt. Die beiden frühen Zyklen der Unterkirche, die vor kurzem in einer verschwenderisch ausgestatteten japanischen Monographie das einzige Thema waren, eröffnen die Reihe der Abbildungen. In der Oberkirche sind alle Wandjoche in Farbe abgebildet, desgleichen alle Szenen der Franzlegende, zwischen denen die Details in Schwarz- und Weiß-Aufnahmen eingeschoben sind. In der Unterkirche, deren Raumteile und Kapellen — weil von verschiedenen Werkstätten und Schulen ausgeführt — nur in getrennten Veröffentlichungen zu sehen waren, kommt das