

mente, aber auch für die panoramatischen und chronophotographischen Bilder dessen, was sich, folgt man der Kölner Ausstellungsthese, das vorkinematographische Zeitalter nennen ließe.

Da sowohl die Kölner Ausstellung als auch die des Getty ihre Exponate nicht ausschließlich im musealen Modus petrifizierter Entrücktheit präsentierte, sondern Spielraum für die eigene taktile Anwendung ausgewählter Exponate gewährte, stellte sich dem derart animierten Betrachter unwillkürlich die Frage, wie denn diese Apparate funktionierten, was denn bei deren Anblick geschehe. So beruht die Faszination nicht nur auf einem Modus des Spiels, wie ihn Johan Huizinga in seiner berühmten Schrift über den *homo ludens* 1938 als eine Tätigkeit »mit einer ganz eigenen Tendenz« ausgewiesen hat (*Homo Ludens: Versuch einer Bestimmung des Spielelements in der Kultur* [1938]. Amsterdam und Basel, Burg-Vlg. 1944, S. 13), sondern vielmehr auf einem ganz besonderen Modus der Wahrnehmung, der unseren Blick immer wieder auf uns selbst

zurückwirft. Die Irritation, die von diesen Apparaturen und Instrumenten ausgeht, weist die Leistungsfähigkeit unseres analytischen Sehens in ihre Schranken und ermöglicht gerade dadurch eine ganz andere Perspektive, nämlich die auf uns selbst. Und so liegt das Verdienst beider Ausstellungsunternehmen wohl weniger in der umfassenden Präsentation einer veritablen Technik- und Apparategeschichte vorkinematographischer Medien und Effekte, als im anschaulich vermittelten Erkenntnisgewinn, daß wir es sind, die diese Phänomene im Zusammenspiel von physiologischer Wahrnehmung und psychischem Bildverarbeitungsprozeß erst produzieren. Damit wiederum behandelten beide Ausstellungen in ebenso anschaulicher wie eindringlicher Weise implizit auch die Frage nach dem Bild, die die Kunstwissenschaft umtreibt. Fragen wir nach dem Bild – so kann man die *Devices of Wonder* und die *Sehmaschinen und Bilderwelten* heute wohl verstehen – müssen wir immer auch nach uns selbst fragen.

Lars Blunck

MARTINE CALLIAS BEY, VÉRONIQUE CHAUSSÉ, FRANÇOISE GATOULLAT, MICHEL HEROLD

Les vitraux de Haute-Normandie

Corpus Vitrearum France, série complémentaire, Recensement des vitraux anciens de la France, volume VI. CNRS. Inventaire général des monuments et des richesses artistiques de la France. Paris, CNRS Éditions / Monum, Éditions du patrimoine 2001. 495 pp. with 341 b/w ill.; 59 colour plates. ISBN 2-85822-314-9

Since its inception in 1949, the Corpus Vitrearum Medii Aevi (CVMA) has spearheaded a reawakening of interest in pre-modern stained glass. There is growing recognition across a broad spectrum of interests that stained glass constituted one of the most expensive and prestigious pictorial mediums in Europe between the 12th and mid-16th centuries, and authors of general studies of medieval art increasingly feel obliged to

include works of stained glass among the central accomplishments of artists and patrons alike during this period. This signals a dramatic shift in emphasis, for beginning in the late 16th century, this once dynamic medium plunged into an oblivion that only began to dissipate in the mid-19th century, when both glaziers and researchers were forced to start, virtually *ex nihilo*, to rediscover the complexities and the remarkable aesthetic qualities of

stained glass. While the discipline of art history has more adamantly resisted the re-insertion of stained glass into the study of Renaissance art, old barriers are rapidly being broken down, and the dismissive category of the »Decorative Arts« is well on the way to becoming a strictly historical phenomenon.

Perhaps the most formidable impediment to this resurgence of interest in stained glass is access both to the primary material itself and to scholarly study of it. This was the challenge facing the fledgling CVMA, which set itself the task of conducting fundamental research on all surviving pre-modern stained glass and subsequently publishing it. In the heady enthusiasm of its youth, nobody perhaps realized the full extent of the prodigious task that lay ahead. In order simply to ascertain how much restoration a panel of stained glass has undergone, scrupulous examination is required, and this ideally necessitates dismantling the panel for study at close range in a restoration workshop. In a single church, hundreds of panels might require such study. This may serve as an indication of the logistical and financial difficulties faced by the teams of CVMA researchers who have laboured at this laudable project over the intervening half century.

Since the CVMA was organized by national committee, the difficulties of carrying out the project of making all pre-modern stained glass accessible to researchers have varied according both to the regional exigencies of survival, damage and restoration and to the organization of each national committee. The French committee managed to produce some of the first monographs published by the CVMA. They were also the first national committee to publish a study volume, envisioned as a helpful auxiliary step in publishing a more monographic treatment. The extent of surviving stained glass in France also occasioned the initiation of a series of regional inventory volumes, both to aid in safeguarding this invaluable heritage and to catalogue the scale of the

material that needed to be dealt with: it has been claimed that France contains more medieval stained glass than the entire rest of the world, and there is an enormous amount from the Renaissance, as well. This was the initial rationale for the series, »*Recensement des vitraux anciens de la France*«, which was initiated in 1972 by Jean Taralon, Françoise Perrot and Louis Grodecki and conceived as a collaboration between the CVMA, the Inventaire général des monuments et des richesses artistiques de la France and the Centre national de la recherche scientifique.

This volume, covering Haute-Normandie, is the sixth in the *Recensement* series, and it almost completes coverage of northern France. The previous volumes are: Louis Grodecki, Françoise Perrot and Jean Taralon, *Les vitraux de Paris, de la Région parisienne, de la Picardie et du Nord-Pas-de-Calais*, *Recensement* vol. I (Paris, 1978); *Les vitraux du Centre et des Pays de la Loire*, *Recensement* vol. II (Paris, 1981); *Les vitraux de Bourgogne, Franche-Comté et Rhône-Alpes*, *Recensement* vol. III (Paris, 1986); *Les vitraux de Champagne-Ardenne*, *Recensement* vol. IV (Paris, 1992); Michel Hérold and Françoise Gatouillat, *Les vitraux de Lorraine et d'Alsace*, *Recensement* vol. V (Paris, 1994). Only Basse-Normandie, Bretagne and the south of France (which contains much less stained glass than the north) are yet to appear.

This volume is particularly welcome, since Normandy was an important manufacturing region for window glass, particularly during the Renaissance, and contains important survivals of stained glass from a number of periods. Although fragments of Carolingian stained glass have recently been found during excavations at Rouen Cathedral, stained glass is not plentiful in Normandy before the 13th century. The earliest works to survive *in situ* date only from c.1200, and only later in the 13th century are survivals plentiful. Many of the latter partake of the "mannerist" style that characterized court patronage. The impor-

tance of Rouen as a glazing centre is already evident at this time, and during the 14th century, it emerges in a blaze of glory.

The significance of Normandy for French stained glass during the early 14th century is due not only to such splendid surviving ensembles as those in the east ends of Saint-Ouen in Rouen and Evreux Cathedral, but in the evidently close connections with court production in Paris, where nothing at all has survived from this period. Some of the earliest evidence for the use of silver stain comes from Normandy, and Rouen appears to have been instrumental in the development of the rich tradition of architectural canopywork that distinguishes French stained glass of this period. There is also significant evidence in Norman stained glass for the importation of Italianate forms of spatial representation, discussion of which is usually more exclusively limited to the manuscript illuminations of Jean Pucelle and his followers.

Normandy becomes even more singular in the later 14th century, when the Hundred Years War largely disrupted the production of stained glass elsewhere in northern France, making the »Royal Windows« in Evreux Cathedral, for example, crucial survivals of court-style works. Norman stained glass is essential for the study of the courtly arts of the later Middle Ages, and this volume provides the first comprehensive access to this material. From this time, as well, the archives yield more and more names of glass painters. Such information increases through the 15th century, and signed works begin to appear. Stained glass artists such as Guillaume Barbe begin to emerge from the shadows, and as with all the arts, the »anonymity« of previous artistic production begins to dissipate. Rouen and Evreux both functioned as important glazing centres through the 15th century, and it is possible to trace their influence through their surrounding areas. Changes in format, style and iconography can be charted through stained glass surviving in such remarkable

ensembles as those at Caudebec-en-Caux, Bernay, Verneuil-sur-Avre, and, of course, both Rouen and Evreux.

Survivals of 15th-century stained glass in Normandy are much richer than previously, but the Renaissance eclipses all previous periods. The amount of early 16th-century stained glass inventoried in this volume comes as a revelation. Of the 1,367 stained glass windows, in 230 buildings, inventoried in Haute-Normandie, 863 date from the 16th century, and of those, 756 date from the first half of the 16th century. What is more, the authors have provided much more than an inventory. Careful archival research has gone beyond past studies to provide a valuable contribution to scholarship. A more nuanced picture of Renaissance stained glass in Normandy is presented than has previously been possible. Not only are the major glazing workshops and artists – such as Jean and Engrand Le Prince, Arnoult de Nimègue, Romain Buron, several generations of the Le Vieil family, etc. – placed in both a regional context and in the broader scope of the evolving French Renaissance. As well, profiles of their patrons are outlined, and a picture emerges of Renaissance stained glass production in Normandy as a dialectical relationship between patrons and artists. There is also much valuable insight into workshop practice, particularly in the dissemination and use of prints in designing stained glass and the copying of other models. Access to the remarkable number of survivals of Renaissance stained glass in Haute-Normandie – in the various churches of Rouen (pp. 332-417), Conche-en-Ouche, Gisors, Pont-Audemer, Elbeuf and many others – is gathered together here into a single, systematic and fundamental study.

The depth of coverage of the period between the wars of religion in the later 16th century and the French Revolution constitutes another valuable aspect of this work. Of course, the fate of all this stained glass during the 19th and 20th centuries, when so much restoration

work was undertaken, is also thoroughly covered, and the Introduction usefully gives a brief outline of »modern tendencies« in stained glass, which puts restoration efforts into a broader context.

This volume presents the full scope of surviving stained glass in Haute-Normandie for the first time. A historiographic account of previous scholarship is also included, in the Introduction. From this account, and throughout the volume, the enormous contribution of Jean Lafond (1888-1975) to the scholarship on Norman stained glass is constantly apparent. This book can be considered as an homage to this pioneer of stained glass studies. The experienced team of authors who compiled this volume has followed ably in his – and others' – footsteps, and their work paves the way for all future scholarship. Despite a few early studies, the bibliography on Renaissance stained glass in Normandy, in particular, has only very recently begun to flourish, and a remarkable number of the studies cited in this book appeared only in the 1990s. The *Recensement* volume for Haute-Normandie thus appeared at a highly opportune moment. The book begins with a lengthy Introduction (pp. 17-66) which provides a synthesis of the research conducted here; it is useful both as a historical overview and to orient the reader to particular aspects of the material inventoried. The Inventory follows, organized into the two *départements* making up Haute-Normandie: Eure and Seine-Maritime. Within each *département*, cities containing stained glass are listed alphabetically, and for those cities with several churches containing stained glass, the cathedral is listed first, followed by the other churches in alphabetical order; secular buildings and museums follow. The entry for each building is prefaced with a brief profile, focusing on factors relevant to the stained glass and its later history, particularly concerning 19th and 20th-century restorations. Any modern stained glass in the building is also given summary treatment. Plans of the

most important buildings are included. There follows a listing of all the windows in the building containing pre-modern stained glass, including the form and size of the window, the subjects and dates of the stained glass, brief but very useful indications of damage and restoration work, technical details of note, relevant bibliography and photographic documentation. Where known, or where firm attributions have been made, patrons and artists are also included. All pre-modern stained glass which is known to have been destroyed or displaced is listed after the individual windows, and the entry for each building ends with a bibliography.

Each window is identified through the standardized window numbering system used by the French CVMA committee. Standardized numerotation systems are one of the fundamental accomplishments of the CVMA and allow precise reference to individual stained glass windows in a way that was previously impossible. This numbering is particularly useful for the stained glass in the choir of St Ouen in Rouen, which was the subject of one of the first monographs to be published by the French CVMA, and the only CVMA monograph so far produced for Normandy: Jean Lafond, with Françoise Perrot and Paul Popesco, *Les vitraux de l'église de Saint-Ouen de Rouen*, tome I (Paris, 1970). This book has proved useful to a generation of researchers now, but it appeared before the CVMA numbering system had been fully adopted, and its numbering system is more difficult to use. The entry here on Saint-Ouen (pp. 367-84) uses the CVMA numbering system, with Lafond's numerotation identified for each window; and it also includes the transept and nave windows, which were envisioned as the subject of a second monograph that has yet to appear. After the Inventory for each *département*, there are also independent lists of stained glass that has been smashed, or has been displaced, or has been lost since the time of the French Revolution. This is particularly wel-

come for monuments such as the abbey church at Jumièges, now in ruins, since elements of its stained glass survive in several Norman churches, as well as in other French and American collections. It is useful, as well, for the church of Saint-Vincent in Rouen: the pre-modern stained glass was removed for safe-keeping during the Second World War, but the church itself was completely destroyed by bombardment in 1944. Many of the windows are now remounted in the church of Sainte-Jeanne-d'Arc, built in 1972 on the site of Saint-Vincent; others are in Rouen Cathedral, in museums and in storage.

Although the Bibliography at the end of the volume only contains works which directly document the stained glass inventoried or which establish dating, patronage or context, it is, nevertheless, in itself a valuable component of the book. So too is the very full index, which includes places, names and subject matter (in my own research, for example, I have used the index of this volume and those of the other *Recensement* volumes in charting early 13th-century devotion to St Eustace across northern France).

The research for this project extends considerably beyond the book under review. A full photographic record was made of all the stained glass in the region, and the entry for each window contains references to these and other archival photographs. Thus, although the book is generously illustrated, researchers are not limited to the choices of photographs included here. All the documentation compiled for the project can also be consulted at the Service régional de l'Inventaire in Rouen.

One of the advantages of the *Recensement* format is that it provides access not only to the primary material, but also to scholarship and photographs. It can be used both by students interested in specific churches, artists or stained glass windows and by scholars working on a wide range of research interests. Altogether, this book forms an invaluable resource.

Over the 23-year period between the first and this latest *Recensement* volume, the scope and format have changed somewhat: the Introduction has become far more substantial; the catalogue entries in the Inventory are fuller; there are many more colour plates; and the subsidiary sections – »Vitreaux disparus«, »Vitreaux déplacés«, »Vitreaux réduits à l'état de fragments« – are more developed. These changes respond to the growing realization that fully monographic treatments may not be possible for all the surviving pre-modern stained glass in France in the foreseeable future. At the very least, their appearance will probably be much slower than originally anticipated. Thus, a greater burden of scholarly responsibility falls to the *Recensement* project. The volume for Haute-Normandie – despite an understandable number of small errors in production – assumes this responsibility admirably and does more than simply provide an indispensable catalogue of the stained glass in this important region. It also constitutes an important work of art historical scholarship, which provides new perspectives on the history of French art during the later Middle Ages and Renaissance.

James Bugslag