

Tagungen

CORPUS VITREARUM – TAGUNG FÜR GLASMALEREIFORSCHUNG 16. INTERNATIONALES KOLLOQUIUM

Bern, Hauptgebäude der Universität, 26.-31. August 1991

About 150 historians and restorers of medieval stained glass attended the colloquium, the first since the meeting in Erfurt in 1989. Timed to take place during the seventh centennial year of the Swiss Republic, the conservation of stained glass was also featured at *Heureka*, the National Research Exhibition 1991 (Zurich, 10 May-27 October).

The topic chosen for the historical papers given at the colloquium, the organization and practices of stained glass workshops, elicited numerous proposals, and the following papers were given. Summaries are based on the printed booklet *Corpus Vitrearum – Tagung für Glasmalereiforschung: 16. Internationales Kolloquium in Bern 1991* (ed. Kommission für das Corpus Vitrearum in der Schweiz, red. Ellen J. Beer. Bern and Stuttgart, Paul Haupt 1991). They are regrouped here under broad subject headings that facilitate a discussion of them. Overall, the papers served to underline caution: Details that appear different in execution may be produced within a single shop, and on the other hand identical design may be used by different shops. Thus the very concept of identifying workshops empirically, from their productions alone, without the control of documents or additional technical evidence, was challenged.

A plenary guest lecture by Wolfgang Kemp, *Parallelismus als Formprinzip. Zur Komposition zweigeteilter Fenster in Frankreich und Deutschland nach 1215*, dealt with some important issues in window composition that impact the viewer's reading of the scenes in it (since published in *Kölner Domblatt* 56, 1991, 259–294). Ernst Bacher, Vice President of the Corpus Vitrearum, introduced in his lecture *Monumentale Glasmalerei und Bauhütte im Mittelalter* some of the general aspects of design and composition that impinge on workshop organization:

Since monumental stained glass is an integral part of the building, the organization and practice of glasspainting workshops have to be viewed in this larger context. In many buildings, such as the Ste. Chapelle in Paris, there is an evident collaboration between architects, sculptors and glass painters, yet the nature of this collaboration is not clear. Geometric principles are often apparent in the design, especially in ornament in glass, and further study of architectural elements imaged in glass may clarify how these designs relate to the Lodge (M. Wehdorn, *Zur Medaillon-Komposition*, in: *Die mittelalterlichen Glasgemälde in Niederösterreich*, CVMA Österreich II/1, Wien 1972, LVIIff.).

A number of papers reported new observations, in specific cases, of technical procedures that indicate the variety of means available for the production of

stained glass windows, from the manufacture of the glass to its painting and firing. Papers that relied on observations of the style, rather than the technique, of painting are grouped in the next section. Technical similarities and differences within a contemporary series of windows may indicate whether the production is due to one or several shops. Whereas Müller called for data from chemical analyses to be assembled (in so doing he did not have time to refer to the considerable amount of material already published from the 1980's on; see M. H. Caviness, *Stained Glass before 1540: An Annotated Bibliography*, Boston 1983, Techniques and Technical Studies, nos 16, 22, 23, 27, 48, 59, 62, 66, 81, 93, 98, 106, 108, 119, 121, 129j, 135, 141, 146. However, these results could not be accurately compared because the samples and analyses were not calibrated) others presented tentative conclusions from the new data collected.

In some cases, as those presented by Cothren, technical differences are an invaluable corrective to similarity of style. The very interesting paper on glass from the region of Troyes, by Hérold, might be considered in the larger context of the reuse and adaptation of full-size cartoons; I have demonstrated this practice by comparing rubbings of ornamental borders in the early 13th-century glass of Sens and Canterbury, and additional observations have been made in borders from Braine and Reims as well; so too, the reuse of cartoons with changes in color and execution is matched in the choir clerestory of St. Remi of Reims about 1180-90 (*Sumptuous Arts at the Royal Abbeys in Reims and Braine*, Princeton 1990, 9, 56, 100-102, 108, 125, figs. 6-7, Pls. 144-182). The question remains, should the sharing of cartoons be regarded as a way of defining workshops, or must we begin to suppose (as Hérold does) that they could migrate between shops? The conclusion depends in large measure on the availability of a light, pliable material, to substitute for the setting table described by Theophilus in the 12th century and known from a preserved example of the 14th century in Gerona (Joan Vila-Grau, *La table de peintre-verrier de Gérone*, *Revue de l'Art* 72, 1986, 32-38). The York glazier's wills are of interest for this question, since they document the passing of paper cartoons from one generation to another (J. A. Knowles, *Medieval Cartoons for Stained Glass: How Made and How Used*, *Journal of the American Institute of Architects* 15, 1927, 12-22). For the Renaissance it is possible to learn details about design and workshop production from the documents as well as from surviving windows (van Zuyven-Zeman). The problem for the earlier period is that neither such detailed documents nor drawings survive, and it would be foolhardy to assume analogous situations existed without more evidence to go on.

There was especially lively discussion on the papers by Vila Delclós and Cothren, since many authors had observations to add on the topic of assembly or sorting marks (indeed, some may be peccia marks, placed on each piece handled by a given glazier in order to tally his pay). This material is to be collected into a future edition of the *Corpus Vitrearum Newsletter*, published by the Centre International du Vitrail in Chartres.

W. Müller, *Die chemische Zusammensetzung mittelalterlicher Glassorten und ihre Bedeutung für heutige Konservierungs- und Restaurierungsverfahren.*

The material of medieval glasses has recently been less studied than have their surface features, including painting, yet their chemical composition is especially useful for classification and for grouping according to differences of manufacture. If, as has been supposed, glass blowers and glass painters were independently organized, the composition of the glasses may yield information about the dependence of a given workshop on certain sources of glass. Knowledge of the chemical composition of the glasses being treated is also very helpful in conservation.

M. Hérold, *Cartons et pratiques d'ateliers à Troyes 1480-1540.*

Nearly a thousand of the stained glass windows that were created in Troyes between 1480 and 1540 are still *in situ* in the very large number of churches that were rebuilt during that period throughout Champagne and beyond. The uniformity of these new windows suggests that full-size cartoons were systematically reused, even though the documents refer only to small-scale models (P. Biver, *Modes d'emploi des cartons par les peintres-verriers du XVIe siècle, Bulletin monumental* 77, 1913, 101-125). Such cartoons are not preserved, but coincidences between rubbings of the leadlines of panels with the same iconography confirm their former existence. Sometimes the glass painters copied only parts of a cartoon, adapting the composition to a different panel size or shape, a procedure that allowed a quick, „serial“ manufacture of stained glass windows when demand was high. The material of these cartoons is not known (linen, paper or parchment?).

Apparently the outline was essential for reproduction, whereas the colors and details of painting varied greatly between panels executed from the same cartoon, and all the related glass could not have been produced in one workshop (*Mémoires de verre. Vitraux champenois de la Renaissance, Cahiers de l'Inventaire*, 22, Châlons-sur-Marne 1990).

Z. van Ruyven-Zeman, *Antwerp Workshop Practice in the Middle of the 16th Century.*

The expansive policy of the Antwerp glaziers, and their export activity, are examined largely from documents, since a small fraction of their windows remains in this region. In fact Antwerp productions are better studied in the Spanish cathedrals (Segovia, Grenada, Salamanca and Seville; V. Nieto Alcaide, *La vidriera manierista en España: obras importadas y maestros procedentes de los Países Bajos, 1543-1561, Archivo Español de Arte* 46, 1973, 93-130; see also the volumes I-II of *Corpus Vitrearum, Spain* by the same author. For Granada see further *Nederlands Kunsthistorisch Jaarboek* 40, 1989, 263-80), or in churches of the northern Netherlands (Amsterdam, Gouda). These exports are in part explained by the ability of the Antwerp glaziers to underbid local competitors. Digman Meynaert is among the most famous of the Antwerp glass painters; his workshop provided glass for Gouda between 1559 and 1562, and had a permanent arrangement with the painter Lambert van Noort (Z. van Ruyven-Zeman, *Lambert van Noort, inventor*, Ph. D. thesis, Amsterdam 1990) to provide cartoons (L. Guicciardini, *Descrittione di tutti i Paesi Bassi*, Antwerp 1567, 101). This latter was a typical designer (patroneerder), in that he also designed for other materials (goldsmiths work, engravings and tapestries).

A. Vila Delclós, *Les marques d'assemblage du vitrail 'reial' du monastère de Santes Creus.*

The way „assembly marks“ were used must be considered according to whether they are on glass painters setting tables, on cartoons, or on the glass itself. Theophilus mentions letters placed on the setting table to indicate colors, and this practice was confirmed in

the table discovered in Gerona. In the case of the glass in the „royal window“ of Santes Creus, pale painted marks of various designs largely coincide with painted pieces. Consideration of their relationship to coloring, position in the window, different glass painters, situation within the cycle, and iconography, are not conclusive as to their use. The most probable explanation is that the marks designated painted pieces that might be confused with those made for another panel if all were fired together, i.e. they are sorting marks.

M. W. Cothren, *Production Practices in Medieval Stained Glass Workshops: Some Evidence in the Glencairn Museum* (Bryn Athyn, PA).

Not only a more critical study of the written documents (Suger, Theophilus) but, above all, of medieval glass itself is needed to define workshop practices, since it has been argued that technical and physical evidence are more relevant than stylistic character for this purpose (in: *Paris: Center of Artistic Enlightenment*, ed G. Mauner etc., Papers in Art History from the Pennsylvania State University, 4, 1988, 46-75). Two kinds of observation have been made recently on glass now in the Glencairn Museum: On a group of grisaille panels of the third quarter of the 13th century from Sées, St. Urbain de Troyes, St. Martin-aux-Bois and the Templars Chapel in Ste. Vauborg, images are visible in the corrosion of the exterior surface that shadow interior painted articulation. (Similar effects were noted in York glass by R. Newton, Unusual effects of the Weathering of Ancient Glass, in: *Crown in Glory. A Celebration of Craftmanship. Studies in Stained Glass*, ed. Peter Moore, Norwich 1982, 75, and in Freiburg glass by G. Frenzel, The Restoration of Medieval Stained Glass, *Scientific American* May 1985, 129). It seems that some panels with the same design were stacked ready of assemblage in the kiln, but this practice is not found in two of the Sées panels, although they are stylistically similar to those that were stacked. In canopies from Evron, on the other hand, marks like letters may have been used for sorting and assembly.

H. Horat, *Der Glasschmelzofen des Priesters Theophilus*.

The archeological excavation (1983-84) of an 18th-century glass manufactory in Sörenberg (Luzern) has provided new information about the technology of glass furnaces (G. Descoedres, H. Horat, W. Stöckli, Glashütten des 18. Jh. im Entlebuch, *Jahrbuch der Hist. Gesellschaft Luzern* 3, 1985, 2-45; H. Horat, *Flühli-Glas*, Bern 1986; id., *Der Glasschmelzofen des Priesters Theophilus*, Bern 1991). There is evidence for forms and functions comparable to those of early medieval furnaces, permitting comparison with the system described by Theophilus, and enabling us to correct several proposals about the appearance of his furnace.

A third group of papers relies on more traditional arguments, notably on stylistic analysis, to attribute works to a single shop. Some extend their analysis to works in different media, following the lead of Hans Wentzel's important article of 1949 (Glasmaler und Maler im Mittelalter, *Zeitschrift für Kunstwissenschaft* 3, 53-62). Others make a case for group authorship or for the collaboration of different artists in workshops. While some are concerned with refining the definition of authorship in relation to observed differences in execution (Matthey de l'Etang and Lautier), most grouped here continue to be more concerned with the similarities that might be explained by common authorship in the larger sense of direction and design. These contributions build upon the broad perspective given by L. Grodecki in his fundamental article of 1948 (A Stained Glass Atelier

of the 13th Century, *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 11, 87-111), but he too hinted at further nuances when he acknowledged the great diversity of hands involved in the execution of the Ste. Chapelle glass – though he was uninterested in counting hands (id. et al., *Les Vitraux de Notre-Dame et de la Ste. Chapelle de Paris*, CVMA France 1, Paris 1959, 92). Perspectives that challenge older notions of overseers and Masters may be Marxist or poststructuralist, and come as no surprise in art history as it is currently practiced.

A. P. Matthey de Etang, *Les peintres d'ornement de la vitrerie de l'abbé Suger*.

Following recent research concerning the working methods of glaziers (notably at St. Denis in the time of Abbot Suger and at Chartres in the early 13th century), which has demonstrated the collective character of stained glass production, the ornament of St. Denis has been reexamined. The collaboration of two painters, similar to that noticed by Cothren in the figural panels, is evident in the ornamental panels. In view of the high quality of the ornamental details, it is postulated that the same two painters worked on both figures and ornament.

C. Lautier, *Un peintre de la vie de St. Antoine à la cathédrale de Chartres*.

The three lights in the westernmost bay of the south choir aisle of the cathedral of Chartres have recently been cleaned and examined. One of the lancets is glazed with the so-called „Belle-Verrière“ of about 1180, surrounded by later angels and by the three temptations of Christ and the marriage of Cana, the other has the life of St. Anthony Hermit. Stylistic traits enable one to differentiate between a main painter and other participants. One assistant appears to have designed and executed one panel in the life of St. Anthony window (no. 10), and to have executed the angels surrounding the Belle Verrière, where he followed the designs of the main master, and one angel in the rose above. The same assistant's hand is also evident in one panel in the Prodigal Son window in the north transept and in some panels of the St. Mary Magdalen window in the nave. Such collaboration implies that a single large shop was producing the Chartres windows over a relatively short period of time.

A. Nickel, *Naumburg, Merseburg und Meissen, Stationen einer Werkstatt im 13. Jh.*

Extensive stained glass programs were supplied for the cathedrals of Naumburg, Merseburg and Meissen in the second half of the 13th century. These windows show an analogous stylistic development to the manuscript illuminations labelled by Arthur Haseloff as „thüringisch-sächsische“; viz: ca. 1230/35, byzantinizing elements, of Italian origin, in the main choir window in the Franciscan church of Erfurt; ca. 1250/60, the impact of a more organic and naturalistic style in the west choir windows in Naumburg, connected with the famous founders' sculptures; in the 3rd quarter of the 13th century, zackenstil elements are combined with plasticity in the axial window of the western narthex of the cathedral in Merseburg.

V. Nieto Alcaide, *Le problème des premiers ateliers de peintres-verriers de la cathédrale de Léon (13e siècle)*.

In the 19th century the stained glass windows of the cathedral of Léon were heavily restored. Although this ensured their preservation, the fact that the restorers changed the order of panels and made repairs with old glass has made it hard to distinguish the original parts, which are nonetheless the oldest extant in Spain. The origin of the glass painters remains problematic. It has been assumed the architects and sculptors came from

France where they were familiar with the cathedrals of Chartres and Reims, but the glass painters show an awareness of Parisian styles of around 1250.

E. Oberhaidacher-Herzig, *Das Atelier des Meisters der Votivtafel von St. Lambrecht, eine Werkstatt für Tafel- und Glasmalerei in der 1. H. 15. Jh.*

Three windows in the late gothic pilgrimage church at Tamsweg (1433) can be associated with the workshop of the so-called Master of the exvoto of St. Lambrecht (F. Kieslinger, *Gotische Glasmalerei in Österreich bis 1450*, Zürich, Leipzig, Wien o.J. [1928], 32ss.) The subjects of the windows include an Infancy of Christ (or of the life of the Virgin, s II), a mystical mill (s V) and an „Arbor Vitae“ (s IV). This workshop seems to have been localized in Vienna, in Wiener Neustadt or in the upper Mur valley (Styria). The principal artists of the several who worked together in this shop apparently executed stained glass.

R. Sanfaçon, *Panneaux d'un Arbre de Jessé du 15e siècle à Québec: à la recherche d'un atelier de 'miniaturistes'*.

The University of Laval in Quebec has four panels from a Jesse Tree window that may be dated approximately 1450. They are of exceptional quality but as yet it has been impossible to determine their place of origin. However their style is similar to that of manuscripts illuminated by the Rohan Master soon after 1400, and there is also a certain resemblance to Fouquet's works. Otherwise, the most significant stylistic affinity seems to be with glass in Tours (the cathedral and the church of Notre-Dame-la Riche), though an origin in Normandy cannot be ruled out. Their miniaturesque style suggests close viewing, as in a seigneurial chapel within a castle or church.

M. del Nunzio, *The Stained Glass Panels in S. Daniele del Friuli: Notes on a Local Culture and Production.*

The Church of S. Antonio in S. Daniele del Friuli was renovated between 1441 and 1470, in a typical mixture of Gothic and Lombard or Venetian Renaissance architectural and decorative styles (*Studi su S. Daniele del Friuli*. Antichità Altoadriatiche, 14, 1978, 81-89; 95-98). Only four windows, with saints, are preserved, restored by G. Fumaro and R. Rivelli in 1987 (the frames with medallions are due to a preceding „restoration“). The figures of Saints John the Baptist and Anthony of Padua, in late gothic style, date from 1487, and attest to the contacts with northern painting, especially that of Germany and the Low Countries, from the 14th century on.

Yet another group of papers relied on evidence of documented patronage or authorship to control definitions of workshops or groupings of works based on style. Some of these took account of the role of subject matter and function in encouraging a diversity of styles to coexist in a single shop, center, or region (Shepard, Marks), providing another challenge to older notions of stylistic unity (as Matthey de l'Etang and Lautier, above). Others note the importance of patronage ties in mandating the movement of workshops or the export of works.

M. P. Shepard, *The 13th-Century Glazing of the St. Germain-des-Prés Lady Chapel: Workshops, Style and Site.*

The dispersed glass from the destroyed Lady Chapel of St. Germain-des-Prés has generally been regarded as somewhat outside the mainstream of Parisian painting, but this may be explained by the relationship between style and function (L. Grodecki, *Les problèmes de l'origine de la peinture gothique et le 'maître de saint Chéron' de la cathédrale de Chartres*, *Revue de l'art* 40/41, 1978, 61). It appears that four different

styles coexist in the windows, but that they result from collaboration within one workshop on the site.

S. Brown, *The Choir Clerestory of Tewkesbury Abbey: The Formation of a Gloucestershire Workshop*.

The choir of the Benedictine Abbey church of Tewkesbury was transformed between 1322 and 1340 under the patronage of the royal favorite Hugh Despenser the Younger (+ 1326). This work (R. Morris, *Tewkesbury Abbey: The Despenser Mausoleum*, in: *Trans. of the Bristol & Gloucestershire Archaeol. Soc.* 93, 1974, 142-155) demonstrates the ambitions of the family through its dependence on a royal prototype at Westminster. The program of the windows, which continued to be executed into the 1330's, was novel; it placed images of the English knights alongside the Apostles and Prophets that flank Christ and the Virgin. The workshop appears local in origin, but Tewkesbury's prestige led to commissions from the same shop in Bristol and Gloucester.

F. Gatouillat, *Contribution à l'étude des ateliers strasbourgeois dans la seconde moitié du 15ème siècle: Thiébaud de Lixheim et les panneaux de l'ancienne église St. Pierre-le-Vieux de Strasbourg retrouvés au Musée de l'Œuvre-Notre-Dame*.

A large collection of fragments that were documented in 1884 as coming from the windows of St. Pierre-le-Vieux have been rediscovered in storage. Windows were created after 1460 for the choir of 1455, presumably in the workshop of Thiébaud de Lixheim; Thiébaud is mentioned in a contract renewed in 1481, as well as Peter Hemmel from Andlau and three other glass painters from Strasbourg. Comparisons with Thiébaud's documented works in Walbourg (1480 to 1490) and in Metz confirm the attribution.

C. Pirina, *Maîtres verriers étrangers en Lombardie: L'atelier de Currado Mochis de Cologne*.

For 25 years (1544-69) Milanese stained glass painting was dominated by Currado Mochis from Cologne. Despite this long period of time, only four windows from his later period are known (1562-1567). Nor have his origins and his impact on Milanese painting been studied. Commissioned in his youth to provide a New Testament Cycle, he relied solely on Dürer's prints as models (10 panels survive from this series, in the cathedral and in the Diocesan Museum). In 1549, after the completion of these windows, Currado met, and was inspired by, the painter Arcimboldo, and their collaboration is evident in the window of St. Catherine. Even after Arcimboldo's departure for Prague in 1562, Currado continued to work in an Arcimboldesque style.

A. Isler-de Jongh, *Un vitrail lorrain retrouvé en Colombie britannique*.

A stained glass window last recorded in 1907/13, and hence assumed lost, has reappeared in a Canadian Private Collection. This glass painting was a part of a window depicting the seven days of creation that once decorated the choir of the benedictine priory at Flavigny-sur-Moselle, to the southwest of Nancy. The series of windows was commissioned by the prior Wary de Lucy from the glass painter Valentin Bousch between 1531 and 1533, in the context of rising Protestantism. Other stained glass windows created by Bousch are in the cathedral of Metz. The work is very varied in execution, but typically it shows stylistic relationships with Rhenish glass paintings, and, especially with the art of Hans Baldung Grien.

M. Flügge, *Eine mittelalterliche Glasmalereiwerkstatt in Mitteldeutschland*.

Window sII of the church of Holy Blood at Wilsnack shows similarities with 15th-century glass paintings in the church of the order of St. John at Werber/Elbe. The windows of St. James in Stendal and in the minsters in Stendal (1443 and 1470) and

Brandenburg (around 1450) have been better studied. The workshop was responsible for only parts of the stained glass decoration of a given church, as dictated by the donors, and at Wilsnack around 1443 and at Werben in 1467 the windows were commissioned by Frederick II, elector of Brandenburg. The workshop was probably active in Stendal between 1430 and 1470.

B. Kurmann-Schwarz, *Die Berner Werkstatt des Niklaus Glaser*.

In 1441, Master Hans, glass painter from Ulm, shipped and inserted the window of Passion of Christ for the choir of the newly constructed minster in Berne, which was still unfinished at that time. Not until 1447 was there a further glazing contract for a window, commissioned by the parish council. This time the 10.000 Knights window was made by the glass painter Niklaus Glaser (Magerfritz). The documents were being reexamined by the author to shed light on the organisation and structure of the workmanship. Niklaus Glaser reduced his personnel and the employment of temporary collaborators (foreign masters). After the completion of the stained glass windows for the choir of the minster, Niklaus reduced his personnel once again. One year later, in 1485, after the stained glass work for the town church in Biel had been completed, he worked only with his collaborator Peter Glaser. Thanks to the work done in the Bernese minster, master and collaborator developed technical knowledge, the impressive artistic quality of the windows is due to foreign craftsmen.

H. Scholz, *Export oder Filiation: Auftragsvermittlung durch die Werkmeister spätmittelalterlicher Bauhütten am Beispiel Ulmer Glasmalerei-Exporte*.

Members of the Ensinger family (Matthaeus, Ulrich and Caspar) were involved in various commissions in Bern, Ulm and Thann, which explains why at least three of the windows in the choir of St. Theobald in Thann (1423-30) are so closely related to glass in the cathedral of Ulm that they must be the work of the same glass painters. Caspar Ensinger was active in the workshop at Thann from 1405/10 to 1422, and relocated at Ulm about 1429, precisely when the choir glass was installed at Thann. Ulm and Nördlingen were similarly related, in that painters or glaziers from Nördlingen received payments for windows in Ulm between 1427 and 1449, whereas the glass painter Peter Acker from Ulm was commissioned to make the windows of the new choir of St. George in Nördlingen.

R. Marks, *Glazing Workshops and Patronage: A Challenge to the Concept of Regional Styles in Late Medieval England*.

The stained glass of the collegiate church of the Holy Trinity in Tattershall (Lincolnshire) is extraordinarily well documented. It provides an important corrective to the view that regional styles existed in England in the 15th and 16th centuries. After the death of the founder, Ralph Lord Cromwell, in 1456 work was begun on the domestic buildings and church. The account books show that five glass painters provided the windows of the choir, and their names indicate they came from Stamford, Peterborough, Hereford and Worcester. The remains of the glass itself, now dispersed, can be attributed to at least six stylistically distinct ateliers, and some panels can be associated with the names in the accounts. Several of these styles can be traced elsewhere, not only locally but for instance in Peterborough, Stamford, Leicestershire, Westminster Abbey, and in the west (Hereford and Worcester [including the Malverns], Gloucestershire and Warwickshire).

Several of the papers given in the Technical Session are included above, since they addressed the historical theme of the colloquium. There were four other papers on restoration:

J. M. Bettembourg, M. Perez y Jorba, *Approche scientifique des problèmes posés par la corrosion des vitraux. Le dialogue nécessaire entre le laboratoire et l'atelier de restauration.* – E. Brivio, Duomo di Milano. *Sulle tracce di un'antica vetrata cinquecentesca.* – L. Cannon, D. Goldkuhle, *A Study of the Physical and Chemical Properties of Lead Calme and the Deterioration and Stability of Leaded Stained Glass.* – C. Richter, *Die Wiederherstellung von zwei mittelalterlichen Glasfenstern in Doberan. Eine Re-Restaurierung.*

Finally, in a supplementary session after the end of the colloquium, some papers addressed the issue of generating designs in the stained glass workshops of the 19th century:

V. Raguin, *Workshop Practices in the 19th Century: A New World of Printed Images and Written Texts.*

The glass painters of the 19th century were eager to bring the value of their product beyond „mere decoration“. They admired medieval art of its decorative brilliance, but took as figural models the art of the Renaissance, and painting on canvas and panel, the established major fields of production. Contemporary collecting followed the same trends. Graphic reproductions of such works were a major means of dissemination, and show a transformation of the original style that made their assimilation as models easier. Major painters, beginning with Sir Joshua Reynolds also followed early models, and the patrons too preferred them. The practice of borrowing continued into the 20th century, in the American atelier of Connick, who made use of albums by Westlake, Magne etc., but textual sources were equally important in the Neo Gothic era.

M. Greenland, *1847 to 1990 by way of 1545: The Corpus Vitrearum in the service of the Church of St. Ann and the Holy Trinity, Brooklyn, New York.*

The windows in the church of St. Ann and the Holy Trinity, made in the 1840's, were the first to be assembled in America. William J. and John Bolton had strong ties with Cambridge, England, and many of the designs used in Brooklyn were inspired from the King's College Chapel glass of the 16th. These early windows have therefore proved a useful source from which to recover lost compositional elements in the course of the present restoration.

Madeline H. Caviness

Rezensionen

WOLFGANG SCHENKLUHN, *San Francesco in Assisi: ecclesia specialis; die Vision Papst Gregors IX. von einer Erneuerung der Kirche.* Darmstadt, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft 1991. XII + 268 S. m. 129 Abb. DM 74.-

(mit drei Abbildungen)

Diese Habilitationsschrift veröffentlicht wichtige, neue Baubeobachtungen zur Grabeskirche des hl. Franziskus. Doch ist das Ziel weiter gesteckt. Das historische Bedingungs-feld soll in die kunstgeschichtliche Analyse miteinfließen. Der