

- <sup>29</sup> N. von Holst, Die Salvatorkirche des Hochmeisters Hermann von Salza in Andria, in: *Flor. Mitt.* 20, 1976, pp. 379-89 (p. 383 Abb. 4).
- <sup>30</sup> H. M. Schaller (s. Anm. 4), p. 477.
- <sup>31</sup> Die innere Gestaltung des Turms wird auf eine Anregung von Leonardo Fibonacci zurückgeführt, der als Mathematiker zu den Hofgelehrten Friedrichs II. gehörte. Die Kapitelle am Turm sind denen der Kathedrale von Troia in Apulien verwandt: G. Nannicini Canale, Il Campanile di S. Nicola a Pisa, in: *Critica d'Arte*, N. S. 3, 1956, pp. 23-31.
- <sup>32</sup> P. Marot, Saint-Nicolas-de-Port, Nancy 1963, p. 27.

## RIASSUNTO

Si tenta di chiarire fino a che punto S. Jacopo sia in stretta relazione con la casa regnante sveva dal 1165 circa. L'autore propone di considerare le chiese dedicate a S. Giacomo nelle città di Barletta, Trani e Bari come fondazioni e chiese patronali temporanee dei crociati tedeschi le crociate del 1189/90 e del 1197. Infatti durante queste due crociate (che furono poi interrotte) molti cavalieri tedeschi si radunarono proprio in queste tre città portuali per imbarcarsi per la Palestina.

Quando intorno al 1220 l'imperatore Federico II elesse la Puglia a sua residenza abituale, fece della Basilica di S. Nicola a Bari la sua "chiesa di corte" (1218), in latino *capella specialis*. S. Jacopo cedeva così a S. Nicola il ruolo di protettore speciale di tutti i membri della famiglia reale sveva. Si può dimostrare che la sveva Beatrice II, cugina dell'imperatore Federico II, portò nella sua sfera di influenza in Spagna, come moglie di Ferdinando III di Castiglia, il culto di S. Nicola. Questo culto si rafforzò ulteriormente quando nel 1231 Hermann von Salza, che si trovava in Castiglia, stabilì che i cavalieri dell'Ordine Teutonico dalla Puglia raggiungessero la Castiglia per partecipare alla crociata andalusa. Durante la vita di Federico II il culto di S. Nicola si diffuse anche sul mar Baltico, ove i cavalieri tedeschi, reduci dalla Puglia, dedicarono chiese a questo Santo nelle loro nuove città.

## Edna Carter Southard: AMBROGIO LORENZETTI'S FRESCOES IN THE SALA DELLA PACE: A CHANGE OF NAMES

It is difficult to establish the erudite meaning of art works so rich in imagery as those that Ambrogio Lorenzetti painted from 1337 to 1340 on the walls of the meeting room of the Nine in the Palazzo Pubblico in Siena.<sup>1</sup> But these frescoes present a special difficulty. In addition to their artistic value, they are major documents of early Renaissance political thought, but by 1792 at the latest they were retitled. The change from the early titles to the modern names has affected every nineteenth and twentieth-century interpretation of the frescoes.

This short study is simply an attempt to clarify some important points in order to understand the murals in their Trecento context. First, during the last two centuries art historians have called the paintings "secular". This term does not apply in its modern sense because there was no real distinction between religious and non-religious matters in fourteenth-century Italy. Second, the current titles are relatively recent, and this has implications for understanding the meaning of the pictures. All writers before the eighteenth century called the frescoes *Peace* and *War*. We should understand these names in a Trecento context which is, above all, literal-minded rather than allegorical.

The three large wall paintings are called "The Allegory of Good Government", "The Effects of Good Government in the City and Countryside", and "The Allegory of Bad Government and the Effects of Bad Government in the City and Countryside", but they were not always known by these cumbersome titles which are based on Luigi Lanzi's 1792 interpretation of the frescoes as a poem of moral teaching about good and bad government.<sup>2</sup> Most nineteenth-century writers accepted Lanzi's idea, and no one questioned the titles after Paul Schubring's 1902 article, "Das Gute Regiment".<sup>3</sup> Thus, one interpretation influenced the present titles of the frescoes, and the new titles in turn influenced all subsequent interpretations. Political ideas of the last two centuries may have caused the ready acceptance of Lanzi's interpretation; certainly the frescoes are rich enough to support a variety of imposed interpretations.

The names of Ambrogio's frescoes are not mentioned in the commission documents, but around 1350 an anonymous Siennese chronicler called them *Peace* and *War*.<sup>4</sup> In his report about the beginnings of the Palazzo Pubblico from 1284 to 1298, he wrote that the governors of the city

*deliberato si misse in eschuzione e fatto el palazzo si deliberò di dipignervi dentro la Pace e la Ghuerra e molti uomini rei e' quai erano stati già gran tempo e fatto male, et anco tutti quegli e' quali avesseno operato bene per la republica di Siena, e anco fuo dipente le IIII [sic] virtù teologiche co' molti segni di prudenza e d'asercizio e d'iegnio. E questo edifichamento di dette dipinture fece maestro Ambruogio Lorenzetti. E queste dipinture sono in nel detto palazzo del comuno salito le schale al primo uscio a mano sinistra; e chi vi va el può vedere.*

Although there are inaccuracies and eighteenth-century interpolations in the chronicler's account, the second known naming supports the chronicler's names. In a sermon, "Qui tratta come David profeta cercando in questo mondo per la pace, non la poté trovare," which he delivered in the Campo in 1427, St. Bernardino also called the paintings *Peace* and *War*: *Voi l'avete dipènta di sopra nel vostro Palazzo, che a vedere la Pace dipènta è una allegrezza. E così è una scuritá a vedere dipènta la Guerra dell'altro lato.*<sup>5</sup> Writing from 1447 to 1455, Lorenzo Ghiberti also called them *Peace* and *War*.<sup>6</sup> In 1550 Giorgio Vasari described them as *la Guerra, la Pace, et gli accidenti di quelle*.<sup>7</sup> Ugurgieri, Pecci, and Della Valle followed Vasari in their titles of Ambrogio's frescoes.<sup>8</sup>

Further evidence that the murals were understood as *Peace* and *War* is the commission for the council room of tapestries which must have been based on Ambrogio's frescoes in the adjacent Sala dei Nove. A document of 25 September 1447 commissions Maestro Giachetto, a French or Flemish tapestry-maker residing in Siena, to make three tapestry panels with *buono governo del principe* in the middle, and *quello della pace; da poi quello della guerra* for the Sala del Consiglio.<sup>9</sup> Perhaps Palmieri Nuti's statement that Ambrogio's paintings with their mixture of abstraction and reality recalling subjects of fourteenth and fifteenth-century French and Flemish tapestries was a confused reference to Giachetto's tapestries.<sup>10</sup> Until 1809 the tapestries covered Mattia di Bernacchino's bench in the Sala del Consiglio, according to Borghesi-Banchi and Sbaragli.<sup>11</sup> Taken to Paris during the Napoleonic domination, the tapestries were later brought back to Italy but remained in Florence.<sup>12</sup> There is no known record of them after 1932.

In addition to the circumstantial evidence of the lost tapestries of *Peace*, *War*, and *Good Government* for the adjacent room and the historical evidence of the names before 1702, there is a third piece of evidence that Ambrogio Lorenzetti's murals are now misnamed. Below the figure of Justice in Taddeo di Bartolo's 1414 Antechapel frescoes, also in the Palazzo Pubblico in Siena, is this inscription: IUSTITIA OMNIUM VIRTUTUM PR[EA]CLARISSIMA REGNA CONSERVAT / PROPTER INIUSTITIAM TRANSFERUNTUR REGNA DE GENTE IN GENTEM.<sup>13</sup> This suggests that Justice preserves government and that without Justice there is war. Ambrogio's frescoes depict the idea expressed in the inscription: Good government results in peace and harmony for its citizens, whereas government not based on Justice under Wisdom results in war and chaos. Peaceful government is guided by the Christian Virtues, who are depicted on the short wall of the Sala della Pace. The personification of the Comune (also called the Common Good) wears the colors of Siena and holds the seal of the city, a golden shield with the now-faded image of the enthroned Madonna and Child. The prominence given to the Christian Virtues and to the Madonna and Child implies so close a connection between religious and secular matters that Ambrogio's frescoes cannot accurately be called secular paintings.<sup>14</sup> This connection appears in all the Trecento to Cinquecento decorations in Siena's Palazzo Pubblico.

The frescoes in the Sala della Pace visually exemplify a political theology. Under the protection of the Virgin — Siena's main patron Saint — and guided by the Christian Virtues with Justice under Wisdom with the laws the rulers of Siena were concerned with the preservation of the state. The government of the Nine, which ruled continuously from 1292 to 1355, chose for its meeting room decorations which expressed its political ideals. The government that was good for its citizens could not avoid war but could keep invading armies from its gates. War outside one's borders was the main way to secure peace within the republic, and peace was important because it preserved the state. Prosperous, contented citizens were not rebels. The main threats to government were invasion from without and revolt from within.<sup>15</sup>

The preservation of the state is the basic idea expressed in the frescoes in the Nine's meeting room. The allegorical and learned meanings seen by other writers are essentially footnotes to that central issue which is illustrated, in typical Trecento fashion, in a straightforward and literal-minded way.

In the Trecento, the entrance to the room was probably the door flanked by the figures of *Peace* and *War* (Fig. 1).<sup>16</sup> Closed off in 1680, the small courtyard of the Nine in the west wing had an exterior stairway leading to one of the two doors in the short wall of the Sala della Pace. If the entrance was the left door, the viewer would have seen on the right the figure of *War*, raising his right arm and holding a shield labelled GUERRA, and on the left the figure of *Peace*, a young woman leaning on a suit of armor. She is the only figure among the Christian Virtues who reclines and she is at the visual center of the short wall. Below the figure of *War* is a scene of men fighting and the inscription ending ...FORTIFICANDO LEI P[ER] VOSTRA PACE. Thus war and peace are made parallel both in visual and verbal terms.

The scene of *Peace* on the long wall is one of economic prosperity, so much so that there is even enough water to spare for plants. The detail of the woman watering a plant on her roof terrace must not have been lost on the Trecento viewer since Siena was always desperately short of water. The personification of Security hovers above the city gates. The scroll she holds has usually been interpreted as referring to Justice, but it might refer to Peace. In the long fresco of *War*, however, the citizens have lost their security and prosperity. On this damaged wall, there are scenes of robbery, rape, and murder. Soldiers have entered the city and some of the buildings are turning into slums.

Upon leaving the room, the Trecento viewer would have seen the personifications of *War* on the left and *Peace* on the right. Directly above the viewer was Justice under Wisdom. Below the enthroned figure of Justice, Concord joins the two cords and passes them to the twenty-four councillors, representing an earlier form of Siennese government. The image of these personifications would have summed up the meaning of the frescoed decorations.



1 The northwest corner of the Sala della Pace, Palazzo Pubblico, Siena. The niche below Justice may be the original entrance to the room.

The Sala dei Nove was called the Sala della Pace not because of the beautiful figure of Peace on the short wall, as writers since Lanzi have stated, but because peace was understood to be the main subject of the room and especially of the long wall showing peace in Siena and its countryside.<sup>17</sup> Until 1792, *Peace* and *War* were not only the names of Ambrogio Lorenzetti's murals in the Sala della Pace but seem to have been understood as descriptive of the subject matter. Our understanding of the intended meaning of these major Trecento paintings must be affected by what we call them.

## NOTES

- <sup>1</sup> The best and most recent interpretations are: N. Rubinstein, Political Ideas in Sieneese Art: The Frescoes by Ambrogio Lorenzetti and Taddeo di Bartolo in the Palazzo Pubblico, in: Warburg Journal 21, 1958, pp. 179-207, and U. Feldges-Henning, The Pictorial Programme of the Sala della Pace: A New Interpretation, in: Warburg Journal 35, 1972, pp. 145-62.
- <sup>2</sup> *Una grande opera di questo ove si soscrive Ambrosius Laurentii, si vede in Palazzo pubblico; e si può dire anche un poema d'insegnamenti morali. I Vizj di un mal Governo sotto aspetti diversi, e con simboli convenienti vi sono rappresentati; aggiuntovi anche de' versi che ne spiegano le qualità e gli effetti. Vi si veggono anche le Virtù personificate, come oggi dicesi, pur con simboli adatti; e tutto il dipinto tende a formare alla Repubblica de' governanti e de' politici non animati d'altro spirito, che di virtù vera: Luigi Lanzi, La storia pittorica della Italia inferiore, Florence 1792, p. 159. Lanzi's is the first published account of this interpretation. I am very grateful to Professor Ulrich Middeldorf for his help in locating the source for the new names and for his encouragement with this project.*
- <sup>3</sup> P. Schubring, Das Gute Regiment. Fresko von Ambrogio Lorenzetti in Siena, in: Zs. für Bildende Kunst 13, 1902, pp. 138-45. The same year, R. Langton Douglas in A History of Siena, New York 1902, p. 371, called them "Good Government of the Commune of Siena, Effects of Good Government, Bad Government or Tyranny, and the Effects of Tyranny". Lanzi's 1792 interpretation was quoted in at least three 19th-century editions of Vasari: Le opere di Giorgio Vasari, notes by G. Masselli, Florence 1832-38, p. 155 n. 6; Le Vite, ed. F. Ranalli, 4 vols., Florence 1845, vol. I, p. 410 n. 1; and: Lives, trans. Mrs. Jonathan Foster, 5 vols., London 1850, vol. I, p. 174. In 1798 Fiorillo commented, "...in dessen Werken man den Sienesischen Nationalcharakter hat ausgedrückt finden wollen": J. D. Fiorillo, Geschichte der zeichnenden Künste, 4 vols., Göttingen 1798, vol. I, p. 332. The frescoes are called "Gutes und schlechtes Regiment und die Folgen von beiden" in F. Kugler, Handbuch der Geschichte der Malerei seit Constantin dem Grossen, 2nd ed., ed. J. Burckhardt, 2 vols., Berlin 1847, vol. I, pp. 348-49. Following his friend Kugler, Burckhardt called them symbolic frescoes "mit der Darstellung der Folgen des guten und des tyrannischen Regiments" on p. 772 d, and "guten und schlechten Regiments" on p. 778 c of: Der Cicerone, Basel 1855. In L. Lazzeri, Siena e il suo territorio, Siena 1862, p. 241, and E. Micheli, Guida artistica della città e contorni di Siena, Siena 1863, pp. 62-63, the frescoes are interpreted as "ottimo governo" and "una città soggetta a mala signoria". E. A. Brigidi, La Nuova Guida di Siena e dei suoi dintorni, Siena 1879 (1st ed. 1875), p. 69, wrote, "con figure allegoriche, rappresentanti il bene ed il male che può derivare ai popoli da un buono o cattivo governo, egli tentò con questa allusione all'indirizzo de' suoi concittadini di pacificarne gli animi tanto inaspriti e divisi in quell'era nefasta di discordie municipali, e di passioni partigiane". F. Brogi gave the frescoes transitional titles, "Il Buon Governo", "I Benefici della Pace", and "Gli Effetti della Tirannia", in his "Inventario degli oggetti d'arte della Provincia di Siena", 3 vols., typescript in the library of the Soprintendenza di Siena, vol. III ("Inventario degli oggetti d'arte del Palazzo Municipale di Siena", compiled April 1862), nos. 129-131.
- <sup>4</sup> Cronaca Senese, anon. manuscript ca. 1350, Bibl. Comunale di Siena, A.III.26, published in: Archivio di Stato di Siena no. 65, ed. A. Lisini and F. Iacometti in: Muratori, RR.II.SS., vol. XV, part 6, Bologna 1931-37, p. 78. This chronicle exists only in 18th-century copies but the fact that the frescoes are called by the names used in all descriptions to 1792 suggests that the titles were not interpolated later. The commission documents are published in: G. Milanese, Documenti per la storia dell'arte senese, 3 vols., Siena 1854-56, vol. I, pp. 195-97, and in: G. Rowley, Ambrogio Lorenzetti, 2 vols., Princeton, N. J., 1958, vol. I, pp. 130-31.
- <sup>5</sup> Le Prediche volgari di San Bernardino dette nella Piazza del Campo l'Anno MCCCCXXVII, ed. L. Banchi, 3 vols., Siena 1880-88, vol. III, p. 373. See I. Origo, The World of San Bernardino, London 1963, pp. 155-56 for translation of this passage, and p. 282 n. 46. J. Larner, Culture and Society in Italy 1290-1420, New York 1971, p. 367 n. 10 cites the same source, but draws different conclusions and the translation on p. 115 seems to be of another text. He calls the frescoes "Justice and the Common Good" on pp. 115-16.
- <sup>6</sup> Nel palagio di Siena è dipinto di sua mano la pace e lla guerra: Lorenzo Ghiberti, I Commentarii, 1447-1455, ed. J. von Schlosser, Denkwürdigkeiten, 2 vols., Berlin 1912, vol. I, p. 41. In vol. II, p. 144, Schlosser calls them "Fresken des guten und schlechten Regiments". L. Bellosi, Buffalmacco e il Trionfo della Morte, Turin 1974, pp. 113-20 has shown that Ghiberti's statements on art have a 79 % probability of being totally correct and a 21 % chance of partial veracity. The fact that Ghiberti called the frescoes Peace and War should, therefore, be taken seriously.
- <sup>7</sup> Vasari-Ricci, vol. I, p. 168. In the 1568 edition, Vasari gave a similar description: Vasari-Milanese, vol. I, p. 523, but of course Vasari's descriptions are always subject to doubt.
- <sup>8</sup> Isidoro Ugurgieri Azzolini, Le pompe sanesi o'vero relazione delli huomini, e donne illustri di Siena, e suo stato, 2 vols., Pistoia 1649, vol. I, p. 337; Giov. Antonio Pecci, Relazione delle cose più notabili della Città di Siena, Siena 1752, pp. 73-74, and *idem*, Ristretto delle cose più notabili della Città di Siena ad uso de' forestieri, Siena 1759, pp. 86-87; and Guglielmo Della Valle, Lettere sanesi di un socio dell'Accademia di Fossano sopra le belle arti, 3 vols., vol. II, Rome 1785, pp. 217-22.
- <sup>9</sup> S. Borghesi and L. Banchi, Nuovi documenti per la storia dell'arte senese, Siena 1898, pp. 157-58. On Giachetto, see the documents in Milanese, Doc. sen. (see n. 4), vol. II, pp. 210-14.
- <sup>10</sup> G. Palmieri Nuti, Compendio di storia senese, Siena 1893, pp. 56-57.

- <sup>11</sup> *Borghesi-Banchi* (see n. 9), p. 158; and *P. L. Sbaragli*, *Il Palazzo del Comune di Siena*, Siena 1932, pp. 83-84.
- <sup>12</sup> *Sbaragli* (see n. 11), pp. 83-84. The present location or loss of the tapestries is still mysteriously untraceable. They are not among the tapestries requested from Florence in 1883 by the Commissione Consultiva Conservatrice di Belle Arti per le Provincie di Siena e Grosseto ("Deliberazioni dal 1 gennaio 1867 al 1 Agosto 1906", manuscript, Prefettura, Siena, fol. 188) and brought to Siena by 21 September 1907 according to a letter in the archives of the Soprintendenza in Florence (Prot. 10 346). Three tapestries are attributed to Giachetto by *E. Carli*, *Pienza: La Città di Pio II*, 2nd ed., Rome 1967, p. 123 and pl. 72, but aside from these works in Pienza, there are no other known tapestries attributable to him. Among the many people who helped me in a fruitless but interesting search for Giachetto's Palazzo Pubblico tapestries are Drs. *Ulrich Middeldorf*, *Karla Langedijk*, *Eve Borsook*, *Kirsten Aschengreen Piacenti*, and the staffs of the Soprintendenze in Florence and in Siena.
- <sup>13</sup> On Taddeo di Bartolo's *Justice*, see especially *S. Symeonides*, *Taddeo di Bartolo*, Siena 1965, pp. 147, 169 and pl. LXXII c; and *E. C. Southard*, *The Frescoes in Siena's Palazzo Pubblico, 1289-1539: Studies in Imagery and Relations to other Communal Palaces in Tuscany*, New York and London 1979, pp. 71-72, 363-71, and pl. 96.
- <sup>14</sup> The frescoes are, rather, a statement of political theology, to borrow the phrase from the subtitle of *E. H. Kantorowicz*, *The King's Two Bodies: A Study in Mediaeval Political Theology*, Princeton, N. J., 1957.
- <sup>15</sup> This idea may have been a commonplace and is reflected in the well-known, later example: "The main foundations of every state, new states as well as ancient or composite ones, are good laws and good arms; and because you cannot have good laws without good arms, and where there are good arms, good laws inevitably follow, I shall not discuss laws but give my attention to arms": Niccolò Machiavelli, *The Prince*, trans. *G. Bull*, rev. ed., Harmondsworth 1975, p. 77.
- <sup>16</sup> I am deeply thankful to Dr. *Irene Hueck* for suggesting to me that there might be visual evidence to support the thesis presented here. On the original entrance, see *G. A. Pecci*, *Ristretto* (see n. 8), 1761 ed., pp. 85-86; *F. Donati*, *Il Palazzo del Comune di Siena: Notizie storiche*, in: *Boll. Senese di Storia Patria* 11, 1904, pp. 334-35; and *G. Rohault de Fleury*, *La Toscane au moyen âge, lettres sur l'architecture civile et militaire en 1400*, 2 vols., Paris 1874, vol. II, p. 315. On page 316 of his fictional fourteenth-century visit, *Rohault* adds, "Ailleurs, il [Ambrogio Lorenzetti] a symbolisé la Tyrannie, la Cruauté, le Mensonge, la Fureur, et tous les vices ou malheurs qu'entraîne la guerre". A fountain decorated with a white marble lion carved by Antonio Brunacci in 1369 was in the center of the west wing courtyard, see *Milanesi*, *Doc. sen.*, vol. I, p. 133. The present wood door on the right in the short wall was put in place during the 1870 restoration of the room, according to the inscription on the door.
- <sup>17</sup> Even Giovacchino Faluschi, *Breve relazione delle cose notabili della Città di Siena* (1st ed. Siena 1784), 2nd ed. Siena 1815, pp. 92-93, wrote: "...fu chiamata la Sala della Pace perché entrandovi a sinistra si vedono dipinti tutti gli Esercizj che si praticano in tempo di pace, which is the same statement made by *G. A. Pecci*, *Relazione* (see n. 8), pp. 73-74. The first known naming of the room as the Sala della Pace is in the payment of 1491 to Pietro di Francesco degli Oriuoli, see *Milanesi*, *Doc. sen.*, vol. II, pp. 391-92.

## RIASSUNTO

Gli affreschi di Ambrogio Lorenzetti nella Sala della Pace del Palazzo Pubblico a Siena rappresentano — secondo l'opinione comune — "Gli Effetti del Buono e del Cattivo Governo". Questa interpretazione non è quella originale; il primo a darla fu Luigi Lanzi nella sua "Storia pittorica dell'Italia inferiore", uscita nel 1792. Dal Trecento fino al tardo Settecento si parlava di una rappresentazione di "Pace" e di "Guerra". L'autrice, che ha raccolto le prove del cambio di interpretazione, propone di restituire al ciclo di Ambrogio il suo nome originale. Questo mutamento di titolo è dovuto al variare di concetti fondamentali molto approfonditi nell'articolo.