

Seductive Sounds: Song, Chant, and Bells in Medieval Jewish, Christian, and Muslim Encounters*

Alexandra Cuffel (Bochum)

INTRODUCTION

It has been well established that sound, of various kinds and sources, was utilized in religious demarcation, competition and signification of dominance between religious groups. While much has been made lately of the competing symbolism, power and legal regulations regarding muezzins and the *adhān*, or call to prayer of the Muslims vs. the church bells of Christians in medieval Iberia, the use of sound as a form of »marking« religious (or political) territory both precedes musical competition between Muslims, Christians, and, as we shall see, Jews, in the Middle Ages, and continued as a technique long after¹⁾. For example, Nathanael Andrade, in his study of the manipulation of processions and chant in Constantinople by the fifth-century church father, John Chrysostom, demonstrates that Chrysostom used Christian processions and hymns in imitation of and at the same time competition against imperial and other Roman, non-Christian processions. Not only did they offer a musical and visual alternative to similar secular or non-Christian spectacles, he and his followers sought to claim and Christianize public spaces,

*) This article is part of the results of a project which has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program (grant agreement n° 647467 – JEWSEAST).

1) Gerhard DOHRN-VAN ROSSUM, *Campanile und Minarett. Konflikte in städtischen Lautsphären seit dem Mittelalter*, in: *Lautsphären des Mittelalters. Akustische Perspektiven zwischen Lärm und Stille*, ed. Martin CLAUS/Gesine MIERKE/Antonia KRÜGER, Wien/Köln/Weimar 2020, pp. 235–270; Michelle GARCEAU, »I call the people«. Church Bells in Fourteenth-Century Catalunya, in: *Journal of Medieval History* 37 (2011), pp. 197–214; Olivia Remie CONSTABLE, *Regulating Noise. The Council of Vienne, the Mosque Call and Muslim Pilgrimage in the Late Medieval Mediterranean World*, in: *Medieval Encounters* 16 (2010), pp. 64–95; Nikolas JASPERT, *Zeichen und Symbole in den christlich-islamischen Beziehungen des Mittelalters*, in: *Religiosità e civiltà Le comunicazioni simboliche (secoli IX–XIII)*, ed. Giancarlo ANDENNA, Milan 2009, pp. 293–342; Ali Asgar ALIBHAI, *The Reverberations of Santiago's Bells in Reconquista Spain*, in: *La Corónica. A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literatures, and Cultures* 36/2 (2008), pp. 145–164; John TOLAN, *Sons of Ishmael. Muslims through European Eyes in the Middle Ages*, Gainesville 2008, pp. 147–160; ID., *Affreux vacarme. Sons de cloches et voix de muezzins dans la polémique interconfessionnelle en péninsule ibérique*, in: *Guerre, pouvoirs et ideologies dans l'Espagne chretienne aux alentours de l'an mil*, ed. Thomas DESWARTE/Philippe SÉNAC, Turnhout 2005, pp. 51–64.

such as bathhouses or the hippodrome, of which he disapproved²⁾. Scholars of the Reformation and Counter Reformation, on the other hand, have focused on the ways in which both Protestant thinkers and Jesuits advocated the use of music in doctrinal education via hymns – representatives of both Christian groups noted music and singing as a pleasurable and thus useful way of encouraging their followers to learn poems which outlined basic doctrinal points, often from a young age³⁾. At the same time, in the competition between Christian denominations in Europe during the early modern period, it was often not merely the source and educational function of sound that became a subject of discourse. Not only did those who advocated the utility of music, note its beauty and pleasure as an *aide de memoire* and a powerful way of drawing people to love religion and churchgoing, they also discouraged their followers from joining the »songs of heretics« and often characterized their opponents and wrong-doers as producing ugly or otherwise undesirable sound⁴⁾.

This excursus into scholarship on sound and religious encounter and competition in periods outside the Middle Ages is in order to hint at some of the many areas in which music and other types of sound might be examined to understand its roles in religious encounter during our own period. The *adhān* and/or church bells were and remain a religiously and politically powerful expression of territorial marking in auditory form. However, in focusing too heavily on these, we risk missing not only the many other ways in which sound and music affected inter-religious relations, but also the full context and meaning of the medieval discourses regarding the *adhān* and church bells. In this paper I propose to examine the following: 1) the ways in which the total »soundscape«, complete with processions, festivals, bells, chanting, trumpets and/or muezzins, of medieval towns and, to a lesser extent, the countryside in Western Europe and the Middle East, would have affected hearers differently depending on their religious orientation, status and whether or not they listened voluntarily or by force of circumstance; 2) the perception of sound as seductive, able to lead individuals to the true religion, or utterly divert them from the path of God or morality; and finally, 3) how the quality of sound was religiously marked – its loudness, beauty or ugliness, etc. were often indicators of the religious desirability and power (or lack thereof).

2) Nathanael ANDRADE, The Processions of John Chrysostom and the Contested Spaces of Constantinople, in: *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 18/2 (2019), pp. 161–189.

3) Danielle FILIPPE, A Sound Doctrine. Early Modern Jesuits and the Singing of the Catechism, in: *Early Music History* 34 (2015), pp. 1–43; William McDONALD, Singing Sin. Michel Beheim's »Little Book of Seven Deadly Sins«. A German Pre-Reformation Religious Text for the Laity, in: *Sin in Medieval and Early Modern Culture. The Traditions of the Seven Deadly Sins*, ed. Richard G. NEWHAUSER/Susan J. RIDYARD, Rochester 2012, pp. 282–303.

4) FILIPPE, Sound Doctrine (as n. 3); Laura Feitzinger BROWN, Brawling in Church. Noise and the Rhetoric of Lay Behavior in Early Modern England, in: *Sixteenth Century Journal* 34/4 (2003), pp. 955–972.

I. SOUNDSCAPES: ACCIDENTAL AND COMPULSORY AUDITORY ENCOUNTERS

Medieval towns were far from silent. The poem, >Dit des Rues de Paris< of the early fourteenth-century Guillot de Paris, describes a cornucopia of diverse inhabitants, activities, sights, and of course, sounds, as does the more learned Latin composition, likewise focused on Paris, of Jean de Jandun. Amid casual greetings, the cries of merchants and prostitutes, the cacophony of badly played bagpipes, the beating of laundry, or the clanking of metal-workers at their trade, there was music: Latin chant coming from the church of Notre Dame or Saint Chapelle, which, according to Guillot and Jean, could be heard, even when surrounded by the hubbub of daily city life. Guillot calls it »such a sweet chant« (*un si dous chant*) whereas Jean waxes more theological, saying not only: »Oh how peacefully are praises sung to the most holy God in these tabernacles« (*O placide piissimo Deo in illis tabernaculis laudes canuntur*) but then goes on to couple the beauty of singing with the virtues of the hearts of the singers as they make their offering to God⁵). The casual, inadvertent »overhearing« of religious singing was part of the soundscape of medieval cities. By the time Guillot wrote his >Dit des Rues de Paris<, the Jews had been expelled by Philippe le Bel and thus were no longer there to contribute to or to hear any of the sounds of Paris, Christian or otherwise⁶. Yet their presence was missed, and had clearly been part of visual and auditory cityscape of Guillot's past, for he wrote rather wistfully: »Down the Bretonnerie/I go from there full of melancholy/ I found the street of gardens/ where the Jews had lived before«⁷).

For Jews, as for Christians, singing was a form of worship. In >Sefer Ḥasidim<, a collection of moralizing tales and warnings centering mostly around Judah b. Samuel of

5) Emma DILLON, *Sense of Sound. Musical Meaning in Medieval France 1260–1330*, Oxford 2011, pp. 61–64, p. 66, pp. 70–71. Guillot de Paris, *Le Dit des rues de Paris* (1300) par Guillot (de Paris), ed. Edgar MAREUSE, Paris 1875, »si dous chant« p. 59, beating laundry, p. 11, prostitutes, p. 18, bagpipes, p. 33, casual greeting, p. 50; Jean de JANDUN, *Tractatus de laudibus Parisius*, in: *Paris et ses historiens aux XIV^e et XV^e siècles*, ed. Le Roux de LINCY/Lazare Maurice TISSERAUD, Paris 1867, the beauty of singing and prayer from Saint Chapelle in Paris, p. 46, the sound of metal workers, p. 54. On the calls of merchants and street sellers see: DILLON, *Sense of Sound* (as n. 5), pp. 76–81; Guillaume de Villeneuve, *Crieries de Paris*, in: *Proverbes et dictons populaires. Avec les dits du mercier et des marchands, et les crieries de Paris, aux XIII^e et XIV^e siècles*, ed. Charles CRAPELET, Paris 1831, pp. 137–146.

6) William Chester JORDAN, *Administering the Expulsion in 1306*, in: *Jewish Studies Quarterly* 15/3 (2008), pp. 241–250; *Id.*, *The French Monarchy and the Jews. From Philip Augustus to the Last Capetians*, Philadelphia 1989, pp. 194, 200–213. Also see Edgar MAREUSE's preface in *Dit des rues de Paris* (as n. 5), p. xiii. He suggests the poem was written after the Jews were expelled from the street around 1299 following the accusation of host desecration case in 1290, although only a few houses were converted to Christian use at that time. On this incident see: JORDAN, *French Monarchy* (as n. 6), pp. 192–194; Susan EINBINDER, *Beautiful Death. Jewish Poetry and Martyrdom in Medieval France*, Princeton 2002, pp. 155–179.

7) »Contre val La Bretonnerie, / M'en ving plain de mirencolie; / Trouvai la rue des Jardins, / Où les Juys maintrent jadis«, Guillot de Paris, *Dit des rues de Paris* (as n. 5), p. 69.

Regensburg (1150–1217 CE), otherwise known as Judah ha-Ḥasid, the writer not only advocated singing, but warned: »he who has a pleasant voice and the Holy One, blessed be He, does not profit from his voice, he does not deserve to have come into the world«⁸⁾. Singing loudly to improve concentration during prayer was encouraged, even when it inconvenienced fellow worshippers⁹⁾. In Iberia, Jewish mystics such as Abraham Abulafia (1240–c. 1291 CE), considered the impact of music upon the human body, and the quality of sound in certain types of spaces as significant elements to consider in contemplating and singing praises to God¹⁰⁾. For some, such as the sixteenth-century Italian Jewish thinker and preacher, Judah Moscato, the human body itself was part of the cosmic harmony and a musical instrument which needed to be attuned to the heavenly spheres, a view which he shared with a number of contemporaneous Christian thinkers¹¹⁾.

Yet whatever its supernal, mystical benefits, singing loudly could have unintended, earthly consequences. Just as Guillot de Paris heard the *si dous chant* emanating from Christian church as one of the many sounds that could be heard in the street, Jews singing loudly meant that Christians could overhear them, even as Jews themselves were surrounded by Christian music. Pope Innocent III complained precisely about the imposition of Jewish worship on Christian ears in his 1205 letter to the king of France:

»[...] they have become so insolent that at Sens they have built a new synagogue near an old church, not a little bit higher than the church. There they celebrate the Jewish rites, not in a low tone, as they used to before they were expelled from the Kingdom, but in accordance with their custom, with great shouting [...]«¹²⁾.

8) *Sefer Ḥasidim*, ed. Reuven MARGOLIOT, Jerusalem 1957, no. 768. Compare with no. 129 where it is stated that it is a good deed »mizvah« to pray if one has a pleasant voice. On the role of singing and music in *Sefer Ḥasidim* see: Susanne BORCHERS, *Eine Melodie, die das Herz erfreut. Zu Musik und Gesang im Sefer Chasidim*, in: *Biblische Notizen* 116 (2003), pp. 4–14. On the structure and significance of *Sefer Ḥasidim* see: Ivan MARCUS, *Sefer Hasidim and the Ashkenazic Book in Medieval Europe*, Philadelphia 2018.

9) *Sefer Ḥasidim*, (as n. 9), no. 768.

10) Suzanne WIJSMANN, *Silent Sounds. Musical Iconography in a Fifteenth-Century Jewish Prayerbook*, in: *Resounding Images. Medieval Intersections of Art, Music and Sound*, ed. Susan BOYNTON/Diane J. REILLY, Turnhout 2015, pp. 313–333 especially pp. 317–324, 326; Moshe IDEL, *The Mystical Experience in Abraham Abulafia*, transl. Jonathan CHIPMAN, Albany 1988, pp. 53–71; ID., *Music and Prophetic Kabbalah* [Hebrew], in: Yuval 4 (1982), pp. 150–169.

11) WIJSMANN, *Silent Sounds* (as n. 10), especially pp. 318, 322–324; Gianfranco MILETTO, *The Human Body as a Musical Instrument in the Sermons of Judah Moscato*, in: *The Jewish Body. Corporeality, Society, and Identity in the Renaissance and Early Modern Period*, ed. Giuseppe VELTRI/Maria DIEMLING, Leiden/Boston 2009, pp. 377–393.

12) [...] *insolent, ut Seononensi juxta quandam ecclesiam veterem novam construxerint synagogam, ecclesia non modicum altior, in qua, non, sicut olim priusquam fuissent ejeti de regno, demissa voce, sed cum magno clamore secundum ritum Judaicum sua officia celebrantes* [...]. Solomon GRAYZEL, *The Church and the Jews in the XIIIth Century. A Study of their Relations during the Years 1198–1254 based on the Papal Letters and the Conciliar Degrees of the Period*, New York 1966, pp. 106–107. The translation mostly follows

Certainly, part of Christian concern was the real or imagined, active Jewish mockery of Christian rituals and veneration of Jesus, as Innocent goes on to describe in his letter, and the violation of proper hierarchy and Christian law¹³. Yet part of Innocent's complaint is directed at the inadvertent overhearing by Christians of Jewish prayer, because the Jews sing so loudly in an uninhibited fulfillment of what Innocent himself notes as Jews' normal custom. Such concerns about casual overhearing the sounds of the religious other and concomitant outrage regarding violated hierarchy parallel the anxiety and competition between Christians and Muslims regarding bells and the *adhān*. The hierarchy of territory is less pointed, however, since Jews could lay claim to no religiously dominant polity of their own. For Innocent and later Christian lawmakers, any religious element of a city soundscape, accidental or otherwise, should be Christian alone.

Jews in Western Europe were also anxious about casual overhearing of religious and even secular music, even in such seemingly innocuous circumstances as non-Jewish wet-nurses singing Christian lullabies to Jewish children¹⁴. Nor should Jewish parents themselves sing either Christian or Jewish religious songs to their infants:

»Whoever has a small son lays him in a cradle in order that he not cry, he should not sing for him songs and hymns of the Gentiles nor from the tunes of Israel which are for the Holy One, Blessed be He. But if there are verses from a passage [in the Bible] and the Talmud and he sings them in order that he should remember them and not forget them it is permissible even though the infant is silent and enjoys. A man should not teach [Hebrew] letters to a Christian priest and he should not play a pleasant hymn in front of him lest the priest use the same tune for his foreign worship. And everything which is played for the sake of foreign worship, the same tune should not be done for the Holy One, Blessed be He«¹⁵.

This passage addresses both the intentional sharing of song and inadvertent hearing, both within the Jewish community, and between Jews and Christians. The passage assumes that Jews would be familiar with Christian songs and tempted to sing them to their children.

Grayzel's with a little alteration. Grayzel notes that the expulsion to which the text refers is the one from 1181/2 (p. 106, n. 5). On this expulsion see: Jordan, French Monarchy and the Jews (as n. 6), pp. 30–34 13) GRAYZEL, Church and the Jews (as n. 12), pp. 106–107; Alex NOVIKOFF, »Plateas Publice Discur-rentes«. Performance and the Audio-Visual Jew in the Age of Pope Innocent III, in: Jews and Muslims under the Fourth Lateran Council. Papers Commemorating the Octocentenary of the Fourth Lateran Council (1215), ed. Marie Thérèse CHAMPAGNE/Irven M. RESNICK, Turnhout 2018, pp. 45–63; Edward SYNAN, The Popes and the Jews in the Middle Ages. An Intense Exploration of Judaeo-Christian Relationships in the Medieval World, New York 1965, p. 95.

14) Sefer Hasidim, Das Buch der Frommen, ed. Judah WISTINETZKI, Frankfurt ²1924, no. 1439; Elisheva BAUMGARTEN, Mothers and Children. Jewish Family Life in Medieval Europe, Princeton 2004, pp. 136–137.

15) מי שיש לו בן קטן מוטל בעריסה כדי שלא יבכה לא ירננו לו שירים וזמירות חרוזות מפסוק ותלמוד והוא מנגנם כדי שיוזכרם ולא ישכחם אע"פ שהתינוק שותק ונהנה מותר. לא ילמדו אדם לגלח אותיות ולא ינגן לפניו זמר נעים פן ינגן הגלח בע"ז שלו אותו גון. וכל שמנגנים בפני ע"ז לא יעשה אותו גון להקב"ה Sefer Hasidim, ed. MARGOLIOT (as n. 8), no. 238. The term גלח »galah« usually is translated as (tonsured) priest, however, since the word also has to do with shaving, it is also possible that a mendicant or monk may be meant.

While the method by which Jews would have learned Christian music is not directly addressed, one may infer through the description of how Christians might learn of Jewish songs. The writer is concerned that Jews not sing in front of a Christian priest because the Christian might appropriate the tune for his own religious service. According to the author, Christian adoption and use of a Jewish tune would render it unusable in a Jewish religious context. What is less clear is whether the phrase »in front of him« is a warning against playing Jewish music in an area where a Christian priest might happen to hear it, or against actively teaching a Christian priest Jewish music. Elsewhere in some versions of >Sefer Ḥasidim<, the dreaded consequences of inappropriate, public singing of Jewish music is presented in historical terms. Explaining how it is that Christians know the songs of the Temple and the psalms, the author blames Jews who would sing them aloud in banquets and bouts of drinking, to the point that:

»And how is it that the book of psalms which King David made for the sake of Heaven, which the Levites gave to sing in sacrifice and the priests say is worship of foreign Gods? Because the thieves [alternately: >squires<] of Israel sang it in their feasts. Because it was done in their sin, it rises against them as if they taught them to priests for the sake of saying them for foreign worship [...]«¹⁶.

Here it is clear that the author considered teaching Jewish religious songs to Christian priests or monks to be a sin; inadvertent transmission of such songs by singing them in a frivolous context is judged as if the Levites had taught these songs to non-Jews on purpose. The historical consequences of singing God's songs in inappropriate places where they could be overheard are severe and long-term for the whole of the Jewish people, however, not just the erring Levites. According to other twelfth-century Jewish authors, Christians taunted Jews for having no Temple liturgy and the musical instruments with which the Levites lauded God¹⁷. This passage in >Sefer Ḥasidim< seeks to account for what Jews saw as Christian appropriation of their liturgy, and here and elsewhere places the blame on the public singing of songs intended for the worship of God. As a whole, much of the discussion of music in relation to non-Jews in >Sefer Ḥasidim< is in order to prevent musical exchanges of any kind¹⁸.

16) איך יתכן ספר תהלים שדוד המלך עשא לשם שמים ומסרו ללויים לשורר בקרבן וגלחים אומרים אותם לע"ז? לפי שפריצי ישראל היו מזמרים מזמרים אותו במשתיהם. וכיון שבעונם נעשה מעלה עליהם כאילו למדום לגלחים על מנת לאומרו [...] לפני ע"ז. Sefer Ḥasidim, Das Buch der Frommen (as n. 14), no. 151; Sarit SHALEV-EYNI, The Aural-Visual Experience in the Ashkenazi Ritual Domain of the Middle Ages, in: BOYNTON/REILLY, Resounding Images (as n. 10), pp. 189–204, especially pp. 195–197; BORCHERS, Eine Melodie, die das Herz erfreut (as n. 8).

17) Ephraim of Bonn, in: R. Abraham b. R. Azriel, Sefer Arugat ha-Bosem auctore R. Abraham b. R. Azriel, 4 vols., ed. Ephraim URBACH, Jerusalem 1939–1963, vol. 4, pp. 47–48; SHALEV-EYNI, The Aural-Visual Experience (as n. 16), especially p. 189.

18) SHALEV-EYNI, The Aural-Visual Experience (as n. 16).

At the same time, the efforts by the compiler of ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹ to create auditory boundaries between Christians and Jews also need to be understood in relation to similar efforts by Christians and Muslims in Europe. When compared to the concerns voiced by Pope Innocent III, however, some important differences between Christian and Jewish concerns emerge. Whereas Innocent's letter and later texts such as the Council of Vienne from 1311 to 1312 were primarily concerned with violated hierarchies, the preoccupations voiced in ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹ focus rather on preserving the sanctity of music dedicated God, which, according to the author, would be compromised if a melody were also used by Christians. The care to shelter Jewish children from Christian song also suggests that the author feared the potential of Christian song, religious or otherwise, to corrupt, although this anxiety is merely implied.

Western cities were not alone in offering a plethora of auditory stimuli; places such as Cairo or Damascus were hardly quieter than Paris, even if the exact character of city noise varied from that of their more northern counterparts¹⁹. Apart from the regular call of the *adhān*, there was the tinkling of bells on the halters of beasts of burden, such as those of the water carriers, poetry recitations, the sound of storytellers, preachers, and the puppet shows and the calls and sighs of their audiences, singing of street performers in taverns and, later, in coffee houses, and the chatter of appreciative, sometimes subversive, patrons in both of these types of establishments²⁰. Such social noise could be heard by passersby of any religious persuasion, though taverns and coffee houses were potentially places of encounter and mutual listening between men, and more rarely, women, of various religious and social groups²¹. Of course there were also other forms of religious »noise«. Ibn Taymiyya, the thirteenth-century Hanbali jurist from Syria, complained when describing Christian practices regarding lighting incense for the dead and against unfriendly spirits:

»And they recite incantations with it [the burning of incense] to the beat of a small copper knocker and special words. They hang crosses on doors of their houses and do similar other disreputable things.

19) Yehoshua FRENKEL, Mamluk Soundscape. A Chapter in Sensory History (ASK Working Paper 31), in: Anne Marie Schimmel Kolleg History and Society during the Mamluk Era (1250–1517), ed. Stephan CONERMANN/Bethany WALKER (Annemarie Schimmel Kolleg Working Paper 31), Bonn 2018, pp. 1–26.

20) Paulina LEWICKA, Food and Foodways of the Medieval Cairenes. Aspects of Life in an Islamic Metropolis of the Eastern Mediterranean, Leiden 2011, pp. 363–364, p. 373, p. 413, p. 458; Daniella TAMON-HELLER, Islamic Piety in Medieval Syria. Mosques, Cemeteries and Sermons under the Zangid and the Ayyūbids, Leiden 2007, pp. 67–78, pp. 115–145; Jonathan BERKEY, Popular Preaching and Religious Authority in the Medieval Islamic Near East, Seattle 2001, pp. 4, 13, 26, 29, 31, 57–58; Boaz SHOSHAN, Popular Culture in Medieval Cairo, Cambridge 1993, pp. 17–18, 57; Ralph HATTOX, Coffee and Coffeehouses. The Origins of a Social Beverage in the Medieval Near East, Seattle 1985, pp. 81, 82, 97, 100–108, 115–116.

21) HATTOX suggests that coffeehouses were more predominantly Muslim institutions whereas taverns had a more mixed clientele, which mostly excluded Muslims because of the prohibition against drinking alcohol. Women served as coffee sellers, entertainers and occasionally patrons. HATTOX, Coffee and Coffeehouses (as n. 20), pp. 37–38, 95–98, 107–108.

However, I mentioned what I recalled of it because I saw many Muslims do it and its origin was taken from them [Christians], when on this Thursday, the markets remain filled with the sounds of these tiny knockers and with the words of incantations by astrologers and other than these words nothing is more useless. In it is what is unlawful or unbelief»²².

In the two Western Christian examples with which I began, identifiably religious sound was given a positive valence since those who described the sound came from the same religious community which produced it. Religious sound from other religious communities was often, though not always, as we shall see, cast in negative terms. This passage from Ibn Taymiyya, is deceptive however. He begins by describing what appears to be a clearly Christian set of practices and sounds, however, by the end of the passage it becomes clear that Muslims are equally engaged in such behavior, and that it is connected with certain professions, such as astrologers which, presumably existed among all communities. Indeed, earlier in his treatise, Ibn Taymiyya contrasts the trumpets of the Jews and the knockers of the Christians to the call to prayer, explaining that the Prophet Muhammad rejected these as ways in which to call the faithful to prayer because they were Jewish and Christian practices. However, he goes on to say that not only have common Muslims adopted these practices but also Muslim kings²³. Ultimately, what fills the market and is disagreeable to him is sound of many Muslim *nawāqīs* (singular: *nāqūs*) clappers, or knockers, not just those of the Christians. Furthermore, according to him, Muslims and Christians share a common understanding of the sound's meaning and spiritual power.

Individuals from different religious communities often understood the meanings of the others' sounds. This point has been amply demonstrated by those examining Muslim and Jewish views of Christian bells²⁴. However, what the example from Ibn Taymiyya underscores is that what communities or individuals did with that common understanding varied. It was not always competitive to all members. One of the reasons that the meanings of certain sounds were understandable to all, however, is because of the inescapable nature of >casual overhearing< of religious noise. This aspect of urban soundscapes is highlighted very well by the passage from Ibn Taymiyya. Ibn Taymiyya may have found the sound of many little clappers and the muttering of apotropaic chants annoying, but he could not

ويرقونه بنحاس يضر بونه كأنه ناقوس صغير. و بكلام مصنف و يصلبون على أبواب بيوتهم الى غير ذلك من الامور المنكرة. و (22) لست أعلم جميع ما يفعلونه. و انما ذكرت ما ذكرته لما رأيت كثيرا من المسلمين يفعلونه. و أصله مأخوذ عنهم حتى انه كان في مدة الخميس تبقى الاسواق مملوءة من أصوات هذه النواقيس الصغار. و كلام الرقائين من المنجمين و غيرهم بكلام أكثره باطل. و فيه ما محرم أو كفر Abū l-Abbās Aḥmad b. Abd al-Ḥalīm Ibn Taymiyya, Kitāb iqtidā al-ṣirāṭ al-mustaqīm muk-hālafat aṣḥāb al-jahīm, ed. Abd al-Ḥamid HINDĀWĪ, Beirut 2006, p. 259; Id., Ibn Taimiyya's Struggle against Popular Religion, transl. Muhammad Umar MEMON, Den Hague 1976, p. 210; GARCEAU, »I call the people« (as n. 1). My translation differs slightly from MEMON's.

23) Ibn Taymiyya, Kitāb iqtidā (as n. 22), pp. 161–163; Id., Ibn Taimiyya's Struggle (as n. 22), pp. 164–166.

24) GARCEAU, »I call the people« (as n. 1); JASPERS, Zeichen und Symbole (as n. 1).

avoid them. Legislators understood the problem, hence the stipulations to not make certain kinds of religiously charged noise too loudly²⁵⁾.

During times of festivals, whether in Europe or the Middle East, the auditory and visual encounter with others' sounds would have been that much more intense. Public processions and festivals were perhaps the loudest and most powerful form of »inadvertent« or indeed inescapable shared auditory experiences between multiple religious groups. War was another. The two were, in fact, acoustically related, especially in Iberia. Aural programs combined with visual in both directly religious processions and in civic or political festivities, such as royal entries, in ways which worked to convey specific messages about religious encounter and interactions on the one hand, and to force such encounters within pre-determined, ideological parameters on the other.

Paula Sanders, among others have demonstrated the importance of festivals and processions in Fatimid Egypt. While some festivals, such as Nawrūz were contested, and occasionally banned by subsequent regimes, they nevertheless continued to be a central aspect of life and sensory experiences within Cairo, and, to a lesser extent, the country side and surrounding towns²⁶⁾. While Cairo has been particularly well studied in this regard, processions and festivals were also important in other Middle Eastern cities, whether as expressions of political power, popular piety, personal celebration, or even satire or political protest²⁷⁾. Whatever their cause, they were noisy affairs²⁸⁾. Even when there was no full-blown festival, as Yehoshua Frenkel has amply demonstrated, public announcements regarding an event in the ruler's household – the circumcision of a son or a wedding, for example – a martial victory, or even to simply gain the populace's attention, were accompanied by the beating of drums, and occasionally other instruments²⁹⁾. Music and musicians were integral elements to many of these celebrations, like Nawrūz, and more spontaneous expressions of delight, such as the rising of the Nile or the release of a prisoner

25) DOHRN-VAN ROSSUM, *Campanile und Minarett* (as n. 1); Alex NOVIKOFF, »Plateas Publice Discurrentes« (as n. 13); CONSTABLE, *Regulating Noise* (as n. 1); BROWN, *Brawling in Church* (as n. 1); TOLAN, *Sons of Ishmael* (as n. 1), pp. 149–150; Id., *Affreux vacarme* (as n. 1).

26) Paula SANDERS, *Ritual, Politics, and the City in Fatimid Cairo*, Albany 1994; Boaz SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20); Huda LUTFI, *Coptic Festivals. Aberrations of the Past?*, in: *The Mamluks in Egyptian Politics and Society*, ed. Thomas PHILIPP/Ulrich HAARMANN, Cambridge 1998, pp. 254–282; Audri DRIDI, *Pour qui coule le Nil? Prophétie musulmane et mystique chrétienne concurrentes à l'époque mamlouke*, in: *Les Mystiques juives, chrétiennes et musulmanes dans l'Égypte médiévale. Interculturalités et contextes historiques*, ed. Giuseppe CECERE/Mireille LOUBET/Samuella PAGANI, Cairo 2013, pp. 143–171.

27) Amina ELBENDARY, *Crowds and Sultans. Urban Protest in Late Medieval Egypt and Syria*, New York/Cairo 2015, pp. 130, 173 195–197; TALMON-HELLER, *Islamic Piety* (as n. 20), pp. 29, 56–57, 84, 256–260, 293; Yassar TABBAA, *Constructions of Power and Piety in Medieval Aleppo*, University Park 1997, pp. 63–68.

28) FRENKEL, *Mamluk Soundscape* (as n. 19); ELBENDARY, *Crowds and Sultans* (as n. 27), pp. 194–197; DRIDI, *Pour qui coule le Nil?* (as n. 26); SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20), pp. 43, 53–57, 69, 75.

29) FRENKEL, *Mamluk Soundscape* (as n. 19).

favored by the populace³⁰). For example, in his description of the festivities surrounding *ʿid al-shahīd*, the Coptic celebration of martyrs, the historian, al-Maqrīzī (1364–1442 CE) declares:

»There is not a male or female musician, not a companion of pleasure, no master of artifice, no prostitute, no effeminate, no jester, no profligate, no murderer who does not remain except that he attends this festival and a crowd so huge that no one may count them except their Creator«³¹).

As Audri Dridi has noted, the celebration and participants of this festival is quite similar to those described attending Nawrūz – for example, during one Nawrūz celebration in 1188 CE:

»And effeminate and prostitutes gather under the castle of the pearl in order that the Caliph should observe them, and in their hands [they have] musical instruments. And they raise their voices and drink wine and beer openly between them«³²).

Al-Maqrīzī's rather negative tone needs to be seen within the broader context of his polemical agenda against the Fatimids, as Huda Lutfi has amply shown. By portraying them as sponsors of such festivals and casting the festivals in as negative a light as possible, al-Maqrīzī sought to discredit their regime³³). Beyond the immediate agenda of al-Maqrīzī, a pattern emerges in Muslim writing from the Mamluk era, in which the sounds associated with women in particular incur the criticism of male writers³⁴). While these caveats must be kept in mind when reading al-Maqrīzī and other extensive accounts of festivals and religious customs, it is still fairly clear that music, both instrumental and sung by women as well as men was part of large public festivals, and more familial ones, such as weddings and

30) SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20), p. 57, 73.

31) *ولا يبقى مغن ولا مغنية، ولا صاحب لهو، ولا رب ملعوب، ولا يغي ولا مخنث ولا ماجن، ولا خلع ولا فاتك ولا فاسق الا و يخرج لهذا العيد، فيجتمع عالم عظيم لا يحصيهم الا خالقهم* Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-Maqrīzī, *Kitāb al-mawā'iz wa-al-i'tibār. Fī dhikr al-khiṭaṭ wa-al-āthār, al-ma'rūf bi-al-khiṭaṭ al-Maqrīziya*, 4 vols., ed. Ḥalīl AL-MANṢŪR, Beirut 1998, vol. 1, p. 129, in the section >dhikr 'id al-shahīd<.

32) *ويتجمع المونثون، والفاسقات تحت قصر اللؤلؤة بحيث يشاهدهم الخليفة، وبأيديهم الملاهي، وترتفع الاصوات، وتشرب الخمر و المزور شربا ظاهرا بينهم* Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-Maqrīzī, *Kitāb al-mawā'iz wa-al-i'tibār* (as n. 31), vol. 2, p. 442 in the section >dhikr al-Nawrūz<. DRIDI, *Pour qui coule le Nil?* (as n. 26); SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20), p. 43.

33) LUTFI, *Coptic Festivals* (as n. 26).

34) 'Idrīs b. Baydakīn al-Turkumānī, *Kitāb al-luma' fī al-ḥawādith wa-al-bida'*, 2 vols., ed. Ṣubḥī LABIB, Cairo/Stuttgart 1986, vol. 1; Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad IBN AL-ḤAJJ, *Al-Madkhal*, 4 vols., Cairo 1929, vol. 1, pp. 162–163, 268, vol. 2, pp. 12, 17, 309–311, vol. 3, pp. 233, 242, 283, 287, 290–291; SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20), pp. 68–69; FRENKEL, *Mamluk Soundscape* (as n. 19); Huda LUTFI, *Manners and Customs of Fourteenth-Century Cairene Women. Female Anarchy versus Male Shari'i Order in Muslim Prescriptive Treatises*, in: *Women in Middle Eastern History. Shifting Boundaries in Sex and Gender*, ed. Nikki R. KEDDIE/Beth. BARON, New Haven 1991, pp. 99–121.

funerals. The sheer volume of people attending these would have created a considerable amount of noise, with or without music.

Certainly, the sounds of these festivals would have been heard by all religious groups. Indeed, some of the festivals had become shared by multiple communities; Nawrūz is a good example. It had begun as a Persian, Zoroastrian festival, was imported to Egypt and celebrated by Christians and Muslims at least³⁵. Jews joined in other festivals, however. For example, Ibn Iyās (born 1448, died after 1522 CE) noted that Jews joined in the Muslim celebration of *ʿid al-fiṭr*, which marks the end of the fast of Ramaḍān, they carried candles amid singing and the beating of tambourines³⁶. Nor were Muslim festivals the only ones which featured musical accompaniment or attracted inter-religious participation. In a lengthy account of the processions and ceremonies accompanying the appointment of the Coptic patriarch, when the candidate, Daud arrived in Cairo:

» [...] and there came to him from Cairo [*al-Qāhirah*] and Old Cairo [*Miṣr*] and countless people were around them, and there gathered from the alien nations, the Muslims and the Jews in great multitudes, so that they were spread along all the way, and at the shops and the open spaces and the house-tops from [the Church of] Michael up to the [Church] al-Muʿallaqah [...] and the decons and the priests were assembled in groups of fifty and more than this. And he came, [and] they were reciting hymns and praises before him, and the representative of the governor [*wālī*] of Cairo [*Miṣr*] and the majority of his companions with them before him. An there came drums and trumpets and flutes were playing before him (the patriarch) «³⁷.

The participation of the Muslim governor and other Muslims as well as Jews serve to mark the Patriarch and the occasion of his succession as extraordinary and to emphasize the great honor accorded to him by all. The participation and acceptance of Muslims would have been a special source of pride, since in theory, Christians were not allowed to conduct their ceremonies loudly in public³⁸. Another part of the particular honor and celebration on behalf of the Patriarch was music, the same kind of music used in Muslim celebrations. The passage suggests that there was a common musical »culture of procession« between

35) SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20), pp. 40–51; DRIDI, *Pour qui coule le Nil?* (as n. 26). It is not clear whether Jews also participated. I have not seen a discussion of their participating in Nawrūz by either Muslim or Christian authors. However, see: Yosef b. Izḥaq Sambari, *Sefer Divrei Yosef*, ed. Shimon STÖBER, Jerusalem 1994, pp. 129–130.

36) Muḥammad ibn Iyās, *Badāʾiʾ al-zuhūr fī waqāʾiʾ al-duhūr*, ed. Muḥammad MUṢṬAFA, 5 vols., Cairo/Wiesbaden 1960–1975, vol. 4, pp. 478–479; SHOSHAN, *Popular Culture* (as n. 20), p. 75.

37) و حضر اليه من القاهرة و مصر و ما حولها امم لا تحصى و اجتمع من الامم الغربية المسلمون و اليهود خلق عظيم حتى كانوا ممتدين ملء الطريق و على الدكاكين و الفرج و الاسطحة من ميكانل الى المعلقة [...] وكان الشماسه و الكهنة يجتمعون احزابا احزابا خمسين خمسين و اكثر من ذلك و اقبل يقرأون قدامه المدايح و التسابيح و الاراخنه ركاب البغال و الخيل قدامه و نايب و والي مصر و اكثر اصحابه قدامه معهم و جات طبول و بوقات و شبابيه ضربين قدام History of the Patriarchs of the Egyptian Church known as the History of the Holy Church. Cyril III, Ibn Laklak (1216–1243 AD), ed. and transl. Antoine KHATER/K. H. S. BURMEISTER, Cairo 1974, vol. 4, part 1, Arabic, p. 67, English p. 140.

38) For further references and discussions of this see section three of this article and the references there.

Muslims, Christians and Jews. Members of different communities joined willingly in one another celebrations, although the religious leaders were not always delighted by such behavior³⁹⁾.

In a northern European context, Nina Rowe has pointed to the centrality of visual representations of Jews and synagogue as part of the Christian reaction to the expanding presence of Jews in Northern French and German cities during the thirteenth century, and to the role of these decorative programs in the wider, political and religious statements they were intended to make⁴⁰⁾. Because of the centrality of cathedrals within a town and the proximity of Jewish neighborhoods to Christian religious buildings, Jews could not avoid seeing the anti-Jewish visual program on cathedrals and churches. Likewise, Jews would have had to witness public events, whether religious or civic, held in these squares, especially in cathedral towns⁴¹⁾. Many of her observations about the inescapability of Christian anti-Jewish visual messages carved on cathedrals would have been equally true of auditory ones, since the cathedrals and the squares in which they were located were often the center at which major gatherings, events, shows and processions would have taken place, or at least, passed through. Festivals became more pointedly religious in the thirteenth and especially fourteenth centuries as the Corpus Christi processions became part of proscribed Church liturgy⁴²⁾. Processions and festivals which were dedicated to a specific Christian holiday, whether a saint's day, or other liturgical event such as Corpus Christi regularly hosted religious dramas, sometimes within the cathedral, but often outside for all to hear and see. Of course the processions themselves were designed to be seen by as many

39) For instances of required participation during times of crisis see: Alexandra CUFFEL, *Environmental Disasters and Political Dominance in Shared Festivals and Intercessions among Medieval Muslims, Christians and Jews*, in: *Muslims and Others in Sacred Space*, ed. Margaret CORMACK, Oxford/New York 2012, pp. 108–146.

40) Nina ROWE, *The Jew, the Cathedral and the Medieval City. Synagoga and Ecclesia in the Thirteenth Century*, Cambridge 2011.

41) *Ibid.*, pp. 30–31, 172, 215–216, 219–220.

42) Teofilo RUIZ, *Spanish Society. 1348–1700*, London/New York 2017, pp. 162–163; *Id.*, *A King Travels. Festive Traditions in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain*, Princeton 2012, pp. 268–269; Amnon LINDER, »The Jews too were not absent [...] carrying Moses' law on their shoulders«. The Ritual Encounter of Pope and Jews from the Middle Ages to the Modern Times, in: *Jewish Quarterly Review* 99/3 (2009), pp. 323–395; Claire SOUSSEN-MAX, *La Question de violence rituelle et de ses enjeux dans l'espace aragonais*, in: *Medieval Encounters* 13 (2007), pp. 524–545; Angela MUÑOZ FERNÁNDEZ, *Fiestas laica y fiestas profanas en el Madrid medieval, un primer acercamiento al tema*, in: *El Madrid medieval sus tierras y sus hombres*, ed. Juan Carlos de Miguel RODRÍGUEZ, Madrid 1991, pp. 151–175. On the increased interconnections between Corpus Christi celebrations and other kinds of pageants, including royal processions see: RUIZ, *Spanish Society* (as n. 42), pp. 162–174; *Id.*, *A King Travels* (as n. 42), pp. 129–131, 269–272.

as possible as they traveled through the city, and they were characterized by dancing, games, floats, artillery fire, and music as well as dramas⁴³⁾.

Not only did Muslims and Jews listen to and watch Christian festivals they participated in them. For example, during the 1139 entry of Alfonso VII into Toledo:

»When the whole populace heard that the emperor was coming to Toledo, all the leaders of the Christians, Saracens and Jews and all the common people of the city moved out along the way to the city and with tympanums and zithers and psalms and every type of music. And each one of them according to his language praising and glorifying God, who was making every act of the emperor prosper, and also saying: »Blessed is he who comes in the name of the Lord [...] <<⁴⁴⁾.

Here both Muslims and Jews have joined the Christian population in the procession for the king, and furthermore, are portrayed as joining in the instrumental and vocal music-making to celebrate the king. Jews and Muslims would have willingly joined civic festivals at least, such as one celebrating a royal entry, because participating in such pageants was an important symbol of belonging to the city, and an honor, so much so that we have record of Jews and Muslims fighting over positions of precedence within the procession⁴⁵⁾. Sometimes minority communities hosted their own, parallel processions, as in the case of

43) Clara BEJARANO PELLICER, Los músicos en la festividad del corpus del Sevilla entre la baja edad media y el renacimiento, in: Anuario de Estudios Medievales 46/2 (2016), pp. 651–687; María Jesús FRAMINÁN DE MIGUEL, El espectáculo dramático-festivo del corpus en la Salamanca del renacimiento, Madrid/Frankfurt a. M. 2015; Ana HORMIGOS GONZÁLEZ, Teatro en el corpus christi de Toledo en el siglo de oro, Toledo 2015, pp. 25–59, pp. 89–95, pp. 108–120; María ASENJO GONZÁLEZ, Fiestas y celebraciones en las ciudades castellanas de la baja edad media, in: Edad Media. Revista de Historia 14 (2013), pp. 35–61; RUIZ, Spanish Society (as n. 42), pp. 133–154, 159–160, 189; ID., A King Travels (as n. 42), pp. 1–3, 38–47, 58–59, 61, 69, 89–99, 101–104, 106–108, 127, 131, 134, 137–144, 155–157, 161–166, 172–174, 184–185, 189–190, 197–202, 213–238, 253–268, 273–286, 314–316; Thomas DEVANY, Competing Spectacles in the Venetian Festa delle Marie, in: Viator 39/1 (2008), pp. 107–125; Roger E. REYNOLDS, The Drama of Medieval Liturgical Processions, in: Revue de Musicologie 86/1 (2000), pp. 127–142.

44) *Cum omnis populus audisset quod imperator veniret Toletum, omnes principes christianorum et saracenorum et iudeorum et tota plebs civitatis longe a civitate exierunt obviam et cum tympanis et citharis et psalteries et omni genere musicorum. Unusquisque eorum secundam linguam suam laudantes et florificantes Deum, qui prosperabat omnes actus imperatoris, necnon et dicentes: Benedictus qui venit in nomine Domini [...].* Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris, in: Chronica hispana saeculi XII, vol. 1, ed. Emma FALQUE/Juan Gil/Antonio MAYA, Turnholt 1990, § 157, pp. 121–122.

45) ACA: C reg. 1890 52r–53r and ACA: C reg. 1903 52v–53r. The first of these may be found transcribed in David NIRENBERG, Communities of Violence. Persecution of Minorities in the Middle Ages, Princeton 1996, p. 181, n. 61. The second may be found in María Blanca BASÁÑEZ VILLALUENGA, La aljama sarracena de Huesca en el siglo XIV, Madrid 1989, p. 231, document 92. Also see their discussion of this exchange and similar events: NIRENBERG, Communities of Violence (as n. 45), pp. 180–182; BASÁÑEZ VILLALUENGA, La aljama sarracena de Huesca (as n. 45), pp. 77–78.

Jewish funerary processions honoring a deceased king, during which an effigy of the dead ruler would be carried through part of the town and liturgical songs of mourning recited⁴⁶⁾.

In some circumstances Jew and Muslims, but most especially Jews, had no choice but to participate. This was of course true if either became the brunt or focus of a procession. For example, when the Infante Ferdinand, sometimes known as Ferdinand of Antequera (1380–1416), entered Seville, after a successful battle with the Muslims, he was greeted by the archbishop and the great men of the city. Behind him seventeen captured Muslims, their banners dragging in the mud, were required to follow the Christian lord and his cross, as he was greeted by the clerics »with very a solemn procession, saying the >Te Deum laudamus< and songs of joy«⁴⁷⁾. The very Christian song was part of the Muslims' humiliation even as it was a celebration of Ferdinand's triumph⁴⁸⁾. Aside from direct festive and musical denigrations by Christians, both Muslims and Jews were required to contribute materially to processions, including ones, like Corpus Christi, which celebrated a peculiarly Christian belief⁴⁹⁾. Part of that contribution was musical, or in related areas. For example, in a text from Madrid in 1481, which indicates the costs and responsibilities for the festival of Corpus Christi, »they mandated that the Muslims and the Jews bring out that day, the Muslims their games and dances, and the Jews their dance« and stipulates a fine if the Muslims and Jews do not comply⁵⁰⁾. Indeed, Brian Catlos maintains that by the 1300 s Muslims and Jews were regular fixtures in the Corpus Christi celebrations, in part because they were strongly associated with certain kinds of entertainment that were considered *de rigueur* for the festivals. He gives the example of Nesma, the dancer, and her husband, and *another Muslim* who in 1409 were requested to perform, but the messenger was told to force them to come, if they would not do so of their own accord⁵¹⁾. More often however, when not being required to contribute to civic/religious events, Muslim and Jewish musicians of various sorts, and other entertainers were given regular contracts to serve as part of the royal court or to serve a particular city's musical needs. As in the

46) Elena LOURIE, Jewish Participation in Royal Funerary Rites. An Early Use of >representatio< in Aragon, in: Journal of the Warburg Institute 45 (1982), pp. 192–194.

47) [...] *con muy solene proçesión diziendo el Te Deum laudamus e cantos de alegría*. Crónica de Juan II de Castilla, ed. Juan de MATA CARRIAZO, Madrid 1982, pp. 399–400, quote on p. 400. See analysis by RUIZ, A King Travels (as n. 42), pp. 81–83.

48) The text continues to describe more singing by the general populace who are joyful that Ferdinand has been victorious over the enemies of the faith (*los enemigos de la Fe*). Crónica de Juan II de Castilla (as n. 47), p. 400.

49) RUIZ, Spanish Society (as n. 42), pp. 165; MUÑOZ FERNANDEZ, Fiestas Laica (as n. 42).

50) [...] *mandaron que los moros e los judios saquen el dicho dia, los moros sus juegos e danzās e los judios su danza*. Timoteo DOMINGO PALACIO, Manual del empleado en el Archivo general de Madrid con una resña historica, Madrid 1875, p. 502; MUÑOZ FERNANDEZ, Fiestas laica (as n. 42); J. C. de Miguel RODRIGUEZ, La comunidad mudéjar de Madrid. Un modelo de análisis de aljamas mudéjares castellanas, Madrid 1989, p. 127.

51) Brian CATLOS, Muslims in Medieval Christendom c. 1050–1614, Cambridge 2014, pp. 438–439.

example cited by Catlos, these musicians were hired because of particular skills, often related to their ethnic background, or they served as slaves⁵²⁾.

In addition to these relatively benign »contributions« musical or otherwise, to Christian festivals, Jews were subject to a variety of forms of ritualized violence during Holy Week, including participating in humiliating displays or games for Christian amusement, and were required to take part in procession on the succession of a new Pope. Required participation in kingly processions were, presumably, an extension of this last category⁵³⁾. Included within such forced participation was singing. Just as Jews and Muslims played instruments and sang to welcome the king, Jews were expected to produce songs of praise for the pope and request that their law, the Torah, be accepted. Eventually, as Amnon Linder has demonstrated, Jews manipulated these *laudes* into a kind of subversion of the event by choosing biblical verses, which, if read in context, would be understood as condemnatory⁵⁴⁾. It should be noted, however, that Muslims as well as Jews displayed their religious books in the context of royal processions, replete with musical celebration⁵⁵⁾.

Muslim and Jewish »participation« via martial games – *juego de cañas* –, music, and song became so integral to Iberian understanding of what constituted a festival, that when no Muslims or Jews were at hand, or indeed after they had been expelled, Christians dressed up »in the Moorish manner« and continued the activities and styles that they had

52) Dwight REYNOLDS, *Music in Medieval Iberia. Contact, Influence and Hybridization*, in: *Medieval Encounters* 15 (2009), pp. 236–255; CATLOS, *Muslims in Medieval Christendom* (as n. 51), pp. 438–439, 490–491. Also see: Judith Kaplan EISENSTEIN, *Medieval Elements in the Liturgical Music of the Jews in Southern France and Northern Spain*, in: *Musica Judaica* 14 (1999), pp. 9–29.

53) SOUSSEN-MAX, *La Question de violence rituelle* (as n. 42); Id., *Violence rituelle ou émotion populaire? Les explosions de violence anti-juive à l'occasion des fêtes de Pâques dans l'espace aragonais*, in: *Politiques des émotions au Moyen Âge*, ed. Damien BOUQUET/Piroska NAGY, Florence 2010, pp. 149–168; LINDER, »The Jews too were not absent« (as n. 42); NIRENBERG, *Communities of Violence* (as n. 42), pp. 200–230; Id., *Les juifs, la violence et le sacré*, in: *Annales, Histoire, Sciences Sociales* 50 (1995), pp. 109–131; Noël COULET, *De l'intégration à l'exclusion. La place des juifs dans les cérémonies d'entrée solennelle au Moyen Âge*, in: *Annales. Économies, Sociétés, Civilisations* 34 (1979), pp. 672–683; Cecil ROTH, *European Jewry in the Dark Ages. A Revised Picture*, in: *Hebrew Union College Annual* 23/2 (1950–1951), pp. 151–169; Id., *The Eastertide Stoning of the Jews and Its Liturgical Echoes*, in: *Jewish Quarterly Review* 35 (1945), pp. 361–370.

54) LINDER, »The Jews too were not absent« (as n. 42); However, see the critiques of Marie Thérèse CHAMPAGNE/ Ra'anán BOUSTAN, *Walking in the Shadow of the Past. The Jewish Experience of Rome in the Twelfth Century*, in: *Rome Reimagined. Twelfth Century Jews, Christians and Muslims Encounter the Eternal City*, ed. Louis HAMILTON/Stefano RICCONI, Leiden 2011, pp. 464[52]–494[82], especially pp. 487[75]–494[82].

55) Fernan Perez de Guzman, *Crónica del Señor Rey Juan Segunda, segundo de este nombre en Castilla y en Leon con Las Generatciones y semblanzas de los señores Reyes Don Enrique III y Don Juan II*, ed. Lorenzo Galindez de Carvajal, Valencia 1789, pp. 408–409; RUIZ, *A King Travels* (as n. 42), pp. 106–107.

learned from their Muslim neighbors and their Christianized descendants⁵⁶). The same could be said of Jews and conversos, albeit within religious drama, rather than martial games and dress⁵⁷). One of the more striking instances of a festival in which Christians dressed up as Muslims, engaged in mock battles and dialogues between Christians and »Muslims« occurred in 1463 in Jaén, under the auspices of the constable Don Miguel Lucas de Iranzo. Teofilio Ruiz has extensively analyzed this incident from multiple angles, and it is not my intention to repeat his observations here, but rather to take this as an exemplary case of the intersection of music, the noise of invented battle, and imagined religious encounter⁵⁸). For Christmas, the knights of Don Miguel went out *en ábito morisco*:

»And the Moors pretended to come with their king of Morocco, from his kingdom, and brought before them their prophet Muhammad, from the house of Mecca, with the Qur'an and books of their law with great ceremony on a well-clad mule, and [which had on its back] a rich cloth on four poles which four religious scholars carried. And at their back came the said king of Morocco, very richly arrayed, with all his knights well-fitted and with many trumpets and kettle drums in front«⁵⁹).

The encounter continues with Moroccan king complaining about how many battles the Christians are winning, and challenges the Christians to a game/battle *juego de cañas*, promising to convert if the Muslim side did not win. Predictably, the »Moors« lose, reject Muhammad and the Qur'an and convert to Christianity *con muy grandes alegrías e gritas, e con muchos tronpetas e atabales* [...] (»with great joy and shouting and with many trumpets, and kettledrums«), they are baptized, kiss the Constable's hand and the festival continues with much eating and drinking⁶⁰).

Here in essence, is a simulacra of a royal and religious procession following the European formula, but transposed upon an imagined Muslim king and his army: a holy book

56) RUIZ, A King Travels (as n. 42), pp. 44, 101–105, 110, 127, 133, 137–138, 143–145, 161, 164, 197–199, 212–219.

57) Juan Carlos GARROT ZAMBRANA, *Judíos y conversos en el Corpus Christi. La dramaturgia calderoniana*, Turnhout 2013.

58) Teofilio RUIZ, *Elite and Popular Culture in Late Fifteenth-Century Castilian Festivals. The Case of Jaén*, in: *City and Spectacle in Medieval Europe*, ed. Barbara A. HANAWALT/Kathryn L. REYERSON, Minneapolis/London 1994, pp. 296–318; RUIZ, A King Travels (as n. 42), pp. 101–105.

59) *E los moros fingieron venir con su rey de Marruecos, de su reyno y trayan delante al su profeta Mahomad, de la casa de Meca, con el Alcorán e libros de su ley, con grant çirmonia, en una mula muy enparamentada; y en sono, un paño rico en quarto varas, que trayan quarto alfaquíes. E a sus espaldas venía el dico rey de Marruecos, muy ricamente arreado, con todos sus caualleros bien ajaezados, e con muchos tronpetas e atabales delante.* Hechos del Condestable Don Miguel Lucas de Iranzo, ed. Juan de MATA CARRIAZO (*Crónica del siglo 15*), Madrid 1940, vol. 10, pp. 98–99. My thanks to Professor Ana Echevarria of the Universidad Nacional de Educación de Distancia for her help with the translation of this passage. All errors are my own.

60) Hechos del Condestable Don Miguel Lucas de Iranzo (as n. 59), pp. 99–101. The quoted excerpt may be found on p. 100.

carried with great ceremony, a king surrounded by knights and (Muslim) clerics, all richly dressed. The drama moves from procession to war, and then ends with a ceremony of submission and fealty with the kissing of the Constable's hand⁶¹.

This incident and similarly staged encounters between Christians and imaginary Muslims are full of contradictions, as Ruiz spends much of his book, ›A King Travels‹, enumerating. Most notably, although these staged battles served to affirm and create an enduring memory of Christian-Muslim hostilities and Christian victories, they also entailed a substantial imitation and adoption of Muslim customs. Not only did the Christians disguise themselves as Muslims for the sake of these festive battles, but the *juego de cañas*, which became so prominent in these festivals, and came to be part of Spanish, Christian identity in the late medieval and early modern period, was adapted from a Muslim martial form. As Ruiz notes, coopting a Muslim form of war was in its own way an act of domination; Christians absorbed what was powerful and admirable (in their eyes) of Muslim culture and made it their own⁶². Continually staging *juego de cañas* featuring a Muslim ›army‹ against a Christian one, was a way of celebrating and assuring onlookers that the Christian Iberians could beat the Muslims at their own game, literally. But that was not the only major element which the Christians borrowed.

Trumpets and kettle drums were standard accompaniments for both royal processions and military engagements in medieval Iberia⁶³. The use of kettle drums and trumpets in these contexts seem to have originated from the Muslim milieu, indeed, Iberian rulers employed Muslim knights who were also musicians specializing in precisely these instruments⁶⁴. Drawing from the exhortation, ›increase the number of frightening instruments and terrifying sounds for it is power for those with you and raises their ardor, and terror and scattering for those whom you encounter‹⁶⁵, attributed to the Greek philosopher, Aristotle, to his student, Alexander the Great in Pseudo-Aristotle's ›Secret of Secrets‹, Muslim authors in Egypt and the Maghreb expanded on the idea that fearful music was and should be an integral part of military endeavors, evoking a well-established tradition in the Islamic world about music's ability to substantially transform a person's state of mind, soul, and emotions. Drums, trumpets, flutes and cymbals seem to have been regular components of this fearful orchestra, and as in Christian Iberia, they were used in

61) RUIZ, A King Travels (as n. 42), pp. 119, 138, 161.

62) Ibid., pp. 213–245, and ID., Elite and Popular Culture in Late Fifteenth-Century Castilian Festivals (as n. 58).

63) RUIZ, A King Travels (as n. 42), pp. 92–93, 120–121, 137–145.

64) Ana ECHEVARRIA, Knights on the Frontier. The Moorish Guard of the Kings of Castile (1410–1467), transl. Martin BEAGLES, Leiden/Boston 2009, pp. 112, 122, 133, 257, 284, 298, 300. My thanks to Professor Echevarria for alerting me to this phenomenon.

65) Al-'Uṣūl al-Yūnāniyya lil-naẓariyyāt al-siyāsiyya fī al-Islām, ed. 'Abd al-Raḥmān AL-BADAWĪ, Cairo 1954, p. 150, https://archive.org/details/ammam_201609/page/n229/mode/2up (05.06.2020).

actual military encounters as well as processions⁶⁶). The bureaucrat, Khalil al-Zāhirī (1410–1468 CE) specifies that within the Mamluk government there was an entire office dedicated to war music⁶⁷). Thus, in this Christmas time festival in Jaén and other real and staged skirmishes between Muslims and Christians the contest was not merely a game of arms, but a »battle of the bands« as well as celebration. Here too, Christians had coopted Muslim forms and integrated it into their real and symbolic religious encounters, regularly reiterated in the expression of royal or even municipal Christian power. Hearing these festive wars would have been inescapable for anyone in the city, regardless of social or religious status. The cacophony of actual battle would have likewise been inescapable for any onlooker, however, it too, was likely to be accompanied by contests of drums and trumpets of either side. The degree to which this was true within the Islamic world is exemplified in the Mamluk historian, Ibn Taghrī Birdī's description of the siege of Acre in 1291: »The Sultan and the army rode and they marched against it [Acre] near sunrise and they beat small drums and they [the drums] had frightening sounds and a tremendous unsettling noise«⁶⁸).

Immediately thereafter, according to Ibn Taghrī Birdī, the army advances, the Franks flee and the Sultan puts the city to the sword as he and his army enter it.

Emma Dillon emphasizes that the sensory experience of music or noise was as semi-otically charged in medieval Europe as the words or visual input that might accompany them. According to her, words of song, or the visual experience of seeing individuals engage in singing in various contexts, or admiring manuscript illuminations depicting dancing and the playing of musical instruments, could work together with sound and music, but the symbolic and emotional impact of auditory input was not necessarily dependent on word or sight; each had their own signifying power⁶⁹). Nevertheless, during festivals, in which multiple senses were confronted – taste, because of special food, sight because of plays, spectacles or processions and special clothing – all of these sensorial experiences would have worked together, each in their own semiotic field, during festivals to a degree

66) Ibid. For later Muslim discussions of martial music see for example: Walī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Rahmān IBN KHALDŪN al-Malikī, al-Muqaddama. Les Prolégamènes d'Ibn Khaldoun, ed. Étienne QUATREMÈRE, Paris 1858, vol. 2, pp. 42–43; ID., The Muqaddimah, 3 vols., trans. Franz ROSENTHAL, Princeton 1967, vol. 2, p. 48; Abū al-'Abbās Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-Qalqashandī, Kitāb subḥ al-a'shā fī ṣinā'at al-insha', Cairo 1963, vol. 4, pp. 8–9. FRENKEL, Mamluk Soundscape (as n. 19); Ines WEINREICH, Sensing Sound. Aesthetic and Religious Experience According to al-Ghazālī, in: Entangled Religions 10 [17. 12. 2019], <https://doi.org/10.13154/er.10.2019.8437> (30. 04. 2020).

67) Ghars al-Dīn Khalil ibn Shāhīn al-Zāhirī, Zubda Kashf al-mamālik, ed. Paul RAVASSE, Paris 1894, p. 125; ID., La Zubda Kachf al-Mamālik de Khalil az-Zāhirī, transl. Venture de PARADIS, ed. Jean GAULMIER, Beirut 1950, p. 208.

68) ركب السلطان و العساكر و زحفوا عليها قبل طلوع الشمس، و ضربوا الكوسات فكان لها اصوات مهولة وحس عظيم مزعج Jamāl al-Dīn Yūsūf Abū al-Maḥāsīn IBN TAGHRĪBIRDĪ, al-Nujūm al-zāhira fī mulūk Miṣr wa al-Qāhirah, 17 vols., Cairo 1963–1972, vol. 8, p. 5; FRENKEL, Mamluk Soundscape (as n. 19), especially p. 9.

69) DILLON, Sense of Sound (as n. 5), pp. 174–176, 186–194.

to which it would have been difficult to escape⁷⁰). Indeed, in some instances members of religious minorities were required to participate in such celebrations or mass intercessions. What is perhaps a bit different in Muslim lands such as Egypt, is that members of the majority could not always avoid encountering the celebratory noise of their subjects, no matter how restrained the noisemaking. While Ibn Taymiyya seems aggravated by this, many Muslims, including Caliphs, Emirs and Sultans regularly attended and oversaw major celebrations by their Christian populations in particular⁷¹). The noise of the religious other, was, ultimately, deeply alluring.

II. THE SEDUCTION OF SOUND

The degree to which music delighted and enticed was problematized to varying degrees by all three religious groups and their varieties. Dillon, in her analysis of Christian writings about music, especially singing, underscores time and again the discomfort that many Christians felt with the power of sound to delight, sadden, draw or otherwise affect the listener independent of carefully articulated, comprehensible, meaningful and sincere words. To quote one early example, Augustine of Hippo wrote in his ›Confessions‹:

»The pleasures of the ear had a more tenacious hold on me, and had subjugated me, but you [God] set me free and liberated me. As things now stand I confess I have some sense of restful contentment in sounds whose soul is in your words, when sung by a pleasant, well-trained voice [...]. But my physical delight, which has to be checked from enervating the mind, often deceives me when the perception of the senses is unaccompanied by reason, and is not patiently content to be in a subordinate place [...]. Thus I fluctuate between the danger of pleasure and the experience of beneficent effect, and I am led to put forward the opinion [...] that the custom of singing in the Church is to be approved, so that through the delight of the ear, the weaker mind may rise up towards devotion in worship. Yet when it happens to me that the music moves me more than the subject of the song, I confess myself to commit a sin deserving of punishment, and then I would have preferred not to have heard the singer«⁷²).

70) FRENKEL, Mamluk Soundscape (as n. 19). Compare with Ophira GAMLIEL, The Syntactic Roles of Touch in Shared Festivals in Kerala, in: *Entangled Religions* 10 [17. 12. 2019], <https://doi.org/10.13154/er.10.2019.8436> (01.05.2020).

71) Yahyā Ibn Saʿīd, *Histoire de Yahyā ibn Saʿīd d'Antioche*, continuateur de Saʿīd ibn Bitriq, ed. and trans. I. KRATCHOVSKY/A. VASILIEV (*Patrologia Orientalis* 23), fasc. 3, Turnhout 1976, p. 487, 493; ID., *Histoire de Yahyā ibn Saʿīd d'Antioche*, ed. Ignace KRATCHKOVSKY (*Patrologia Orientalis* 47), trans. Françoise MICHEAU/Gérard TROUPEAU, Turnhout 1997, fasc. 4, no 212, pp. 442–443, 452–453, 454–455; *History of the Patriarchs of the Coptic Church of Alexandria*, vol. 4, part 1, Cyril III, Ibn Lakak 1216–1243, ed. and trans. Antoine KHATER/O. H. E. Kh. BURMEISTER, Cairo 1974, Arabic pp. 66–67, English, pp. 138–140; Al-Qalqashandī, *Kitāb Subḥ al-aʿshā* (as n. 66), vol. 8, p. 419; al-Maqrīzī, *al-Khiṭaṭ* (as n. 31), vol. 2, pp. 29–31, 441–450. CUFFEL, *Environmental Disasters* (as n. 39); Paula SANDERS, *Ritual, Politics and the City in Fatimid Cairo*, Albany 1994, pp. 74–76, 81–82; LUTFI, *Coptic festivals* (as n. 26).

72) *Voluptates aurium tenacius me implicaverant et subiugaverant, sed resolvisti et liberasti me. nunc in sonis quos animant eloquia tua cum suavi et artificiosa voce cantantur, fateor, aliquantulum adquiesco* [...] *sed*

Few authors were so eloquently self-tortured in their expressions of anxiety about the beauty of song divorced of spiritual meaning, or meaning at all, as Augustine. Nevertheless, as Dillon demonstrates, medieval Western Christians continued to warn of the wrong kind of sound, even religious song, when the words were mispronounced, notes missed, and the singers took more pride in their musical performance than the reasoned, spiritual content of the words of the prayers they sang – a problematic objection given that it was not uncommon in the later Middle Ages for monks to know how to pronounce Latin, but not necessarily understand its meaning⁷³). The Cistercian, Caesarius of Heisterbach (1180–1240 CE) included numerous tales in his ›Dialogus Miraculorum‹, relating to sound, music and its misuse. The beauty of song and worship was evoked, as was Augustine's warning about its seductiveness and potential for sin, both because of the loveliness of the music itself, and the pride in producing it⁷⁴). In his text, sleepy monks are tempted to doze through the offices rather than singing them and are at risk of demonic possession as a result⁷⁵). Demons battle against the monastic choir to cause disharmony⁷⁶). Jacques de Vitry (c. 1160/70–1240 CE) recounted a tale of a demon carrying bags of mispronounced phrases of song, or overly embellished tunes out of churches, the better to condemn careless or prideful monks in the afterlife on the one hand⁷⁷). In all of these cautionary tales, the monks are either not seduced enough by the importance of prayerful song to God and as a result are insufficiently awake or careful with their pronunciation and musical accuracy, or they are tempted into loving and performing music for the wrong reasons. Rosemary Dubowchik has demonstrated that in a Byzantine monastic context, there was a similar concern with harmony, order, and correct motivation of singers, and

delectatio carnis meae, cui mentem enervandam non oportet dari, saepe me fallit, dum rationi sensus non ita comitatur ut patienter sit posterior [...] ita fluctuo inter periculum voluptatis et experimentum salubritatis magisque adducor [...] cantandi consuetudinem approbare in ecclesia, ut per oblectamenta aurium infirmior animus in affectum pietatis adsurgat. tamen cum mihi accidit ut me amplius cantus quam res quae canitur moveat, poenaliter me peccare confiteor et tunc mallet non audire cantantem. Augustine, Confessions Introduction and Text, vol. 1, ed. James O'DONNELL, Oxford 1992, lib. X, cap. 33, § 49–50. Electronic edition: <http://www.stoa.org/hippo/> (01.05.2020); DILLON, Sense of Sound (as n. 5), pp. 39–40.

73) DILLON, Sense of Sound (as n. 5), pp. 195–201; Susan BOYNTON, Work and Play in Sacred Music and its Social Context. 1050–1250, in: Use and Abuse of Time in Christian History. Papers read at the 1999 Summer Meeting and the 2000 Winter Meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society, ed. Robert N. SWANSON, Woodbridge 2002, pp. 57–79.

74) Caesarius of Heisterbach, Dialogus miraculorum, textum ad quator codicum manuscritorum editionisque principes fidem, 2 vols., ed. Joseph STRANGE, Cologne/Bonn/Brussels 1851, Distinctio Quarta, vol. 1, cap. VIII and IX, pp. 180–181.

75) Caesarius of Heisterbach, Dialogus miraculorum (as n. 74), Distinctio Quarta, vol. 1, cap. LV, pp. 221–222. Compare with Distinctio Quinta, cap. V, 1, p. 283.

76) Ibid., Distinctio Quinta, vol. 1, cap. V, pp. 282–284.

77) Jacques de Vitry, The Exempla or Illustrative Stories from the Sermones Vulgares of Jacques de Vitry, ed. Thomas CRANE, London 1890 (reprint 2014), no. 19, pp. 61–62; DILLON, Sense of Sound (as n. 5), pp. 105–107.

warnings that deviation could transform music into a »vehicle of the devils«⁷⁸). Thus, producing »a joyful noise« as it is often translated in English, unto God, remained a spiritually perilous if alluring prospect⁷⁹).

Between Christians and Jews in Europe, inadvertent transmission of Jewish musical knowledge to Christians was not the only issue which caused concern among Jews. In another passage from ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹, Christians are explicitly portrayed as actively seeking out Jewish tunes for their own liturgical music: »If there is a heretic (*min* – here meaning a Christian) who wants to create a liturgical song (*piyyut*) for the veneration of idols or a stranger (*nakari*) who wants [to do so] for sinning and he says to a Jew, ›tell me a pleasant melody in which you rejoice for your God‹, he should not tell him lest he (the Jew) be responsible«⁸⁰).

Not being a musicologist or historian of music, it is beyond my abilities to ascertain the extent of real musical borrowing between Jews and Christians between the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, however, it is worth noting that this is precisely the time period when various Christian religious thinkers began to complain about musical innovations in liturgical song⁸¹). Most of this innovation, was internal and tied to borrowing from secular musical practice, however, the existence and extent of inter-religious borrowing for church music may be worth investigating further. Judith Eisenstein has argued that troubadour melodies served as a bridge between Christian plain chant and Jewish music in Iberia⁸²). A similar process may have occurred farther north. Much has been made of the Jewish Minnesänger, Süßkind von Trimberg, who has been held up as emblematic of Jewish interest and involvement in the broader musical culture in German-speaking lands during the thirteenth century⁸³). These passages from ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹, however, provide indi-

78) Rosemary DUBOWCHIK, *Singing with the Angels. Foundation Documents as Evidence for the Musical Life of the Monasteries in the Byzantine Empire*, in: *Dumbarton Oaks Papers* 56 (2002), pp. 277–296. For »a vehicle of the devils« see p. 286.

79) The phrase appears in a number of Psalms. For example, Ps. 100,1. The phrase in Hebrew מזמור לתודה means »to sing thanks« whereas the *Vulgate* merely states *cantabo* »I will sing«. Compare with Ps. 66,1, 95,1–2, Ps. 98,4

80) אם יש מין שרוצה לעשות פיוט לע"ז או נכרי שרוצה לעשות לעבירה ואמר ליהודי אמור לי ניגון נעים שאתם משבחים בו Sefer Ḥasidim, ed. MARGOLIOT (as n. 8), no. 429.

81) BOYNTON, *Work and Play* (as n. 73).

82) EISENSTEIN, *Medieval Elements in the Liturgical Music of the Jews* (as n. 52). Also see: Eliyahu SCHLEIFER, *Jewish Liturgical Music from the Bible to Hasidism*, in: *Sacred Sound and Social Change. Liturgical Music in Jewish and Christian Experience*, ed. Lawrence HOFFMAN/Janet WALTON (Two Liturgical Traditions 3), Notre Dame 1992, pp. 13–58 for a more general overview.

83) Of course Süßkind's Jewish identity has been questioned by some scholars as well. Martin PRZYBILSKI, *Kulturtransfer zwischen Juden und Christen in der deutschen Literatur des Mittelalters*, Berlin 2010, pp. 267–278; Ricarda BAUSCHKE, *Süßkind vom Trimberg. Ein jüdischer Autor in der Manessischen Handschrift*, in: *Juden in der deutschen Literatur des Mittelalters. Religiöse Konzepte, Feindbilder, Rechtfertigungen*, ed. Ursula SCHULTZ, Tübingen 2002, pp. 61–86; Karl STACKMANN, *Dietrich Gerhardt über Süßkind von Trimberg. An Stelle einer Rezension*, in: *Beiträge zur Geschichte der deutsche Sprache*

cations of mutual musical admiration and exchanges between Christians and Jews in the region, even if the goal of the author of ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹ was to combat them. They may provide evidence for the process which led to commonalities between Jewish and Christian music, not only on a popular level through the songs of troubadours and minnesängers but also in the realm of religious music; in the passage cited above, clearly the Christian is depicted as seeking specifically Jewish liturgical songs to create their equivalent for Christians in Northern Europe.

Indeed, Gretchen Peters has found further evidence of Christians seeking Jewish musical teachers from a somewhat later period. A fifteenth-century contract from Avignon stipulates the conditions in which a Christian man, Anthonius, would pay a Jew for teaching him songs. He is only to pay for songs he has learned, and the Jew promises to teach the songs ›faithfully and without deceit and fraud‹ even as Anthonius agrees to work hard at learning them, also without fraud⁸⁴.

All the passages from ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹ and the contract from Avignon suggest that both intentional and inadvertent exchange of song between Christians and Jews was common, despite the disapproval of both types of exchange expressed in ›Sefer Ḥasidim‹. Approximately contemporaneous evidence from Provence and Iberia indicates that a number of Jewish poets were intrigued by Christian troubadour and trouvère forms and incorporated them into their own poetry, although as Judith Eisenstein has pointed out, we cannot determine the extent of musical influence, since musical notation for Jewish music is even more rare than for Christian. References to musical instruments, however, indicate that exchange was indeed at a musical as well as a poetic level⁸⁵. Art historical and documentary evidence also demonstrates that Jewish minstrels performed in Christian households along with non-Jewish entertainers⁸⁶. Likewise, Suzanne Wijsmann has shown clear parallels between the representation of musical activities and the interplay between text and image in the Oppenheimer ›mahzor‹, a fifteenth-century Jewish prayerbook from the Rhineland, and illuminations in Christian books of hours and other

und Literatur 121/3 (2006), pp. 440–455; Raphael STRAUSS, Was Süßkind of Trimberg a Jew? An Inquiry into 13th Century Cultural History, in: Jewish Social Studies 10/1 (1948), pp. 19–30; Albert FRIEDENBERG, Süßkind of Trimberg, in: Jewish Quarterly Review 15/1 (1902), pp. 60–70; Richard MEYER, Süßkind von Trimberg, in: Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum und deutsche Literatur 38 (1894), pp. 201–204.

84) Gretchen PETERS, The Musical Sounds of French Cities. Players, Patrons and Politics, Cambridge 2012, p. 185. The passage, which is from the Archives départementales de Vaucluse, 3 E 8/714, fol. 135v and is cited in footnote 74 reads: *Dictus Judeus promisit dicto Antonio dicta carmina sibi fideliter et sine dolo et fraude docere / et cum debita mensura / Et dictus Anthonius promisit / diligenter et sine dolo et negligencia toto posse dicta carmina addiscere et repetere ac ad lectionem sibi dandam frequenter venire et repetere.*

85) EISENSTEIN, Medieval Elements (as n. 52). SHALEV-EYNI, The Aural-Visual Experience (as n. 16) also laments the lack of musical evidence for the exchanges between Christians and Jews described in texts and implied in manuscript illuminations.

86) Thérèse METZGER/Mendel METZGER, Jewish Life in the Middle Ages. Illuminated Hebrew Manuscripts of the Thirteenth to the Sixteenth Centuries, New York 1982, p. 155.

genres⁸⁷). The warnings in >Sefer Ḥasidim< regarding what is appropriate to sing to children, indicate that Jewish exposure to Christian music came at a young age in medieval Europe, whether through Christian caretakers, or via their own parents who themselves delighted in and sung such tunes in their homes.

Shared musical material between Christians and Jews should be placed in the broader context of other shared cultural products. Jews read, translated and transformed Christian literary and artistic output throughout medieval Europe even as Christians drew from Jewish material⁸⁸). Secular and religious music was an integral component of these interchanges, which took place not only between Jews and Christians but also between Muslims and Christians or Muslims and Jews⁸⁹).

87) Suzanne WIJSMANN, *Silent Sounds* (as n. 10).

88) For example: Latin into Hebrew. *Texts and Studies*, vol. 1: *Studies*, ed. Resianne FONTAINE/Gad FREUDENTHAL, Leiden 2013; Marc Michael EPSTEIN, *The Medieval Haggadah. Art, Narrative and Religious Imagination*, New Haven 2011; ID., *Dreams of Subversion in Medieval Jewish Art and Literature*, University Park 1997; Micha PERRY, *Tradition and Transformation. Knowledge Transmission among European Jews in the Middle Ages [Hebrew]*, Tel Aviv 2010; ID., *The Imaginary War between Prester John and Eldad the Danite and Its Real Implications*, in: *Viator* 41/1 (2010), pp. 5–10; Sarit SHALEV-EYNI, *Jews among Christians. Hebrew Book Illumination from Lake Constance*, Turnhout 2010; ID., *Solomon, his Demons and his Jongleurs. The Meeting of Islamic, Judaic and Christian Culture*, in: *Al-Masaq* 18/2 (2006), pp. 145–160; Tamar DRUKKER, *A Thirteenth-century Arthurian Tale in Hebrew. A Unique Literary Exchange*, in: *Medieval Encounters* 15/1 (2009), pp. 114–129; Eli YASSIF, *The Hebrew Traditions about Alexander of Macedon. Literary Understandings and their meanings in Jewish Culture of the Middle Ages [Hebrew]*, in: *Tarbiz* 75 (2006), pp. 359–407; Katrin KOGMAN-APPEL, *Jewish Book Art between Islam and Christianity. The Decoration of Hebrew Bibles in Medieval Spain*, Leiden/Boston 2004; PRZYBILSKI, *Kulturtransfer* (as n. 83); ID., *Ein anti-arthurischer Artusroman. Invektiven gegen die höfische Literatur zwischen den Zeilen des >Melech Artus<*, in: *Zeitschrift für Deutsches Altertum und Deutsche Literatur* 131/4 (2002), pp. 409–435; Theodore STEINBERG, *Medieval Romances for Jewish Audiences*, in: *Jewish Affairs* 52/3 (1997), pp. 15–18; Fritz Peter KNAPP, *>Dukus Horant< und die deutsche sublitterarische Epik des 13. und 14. Jahrhunderts*, in: *Aschkenas* 14/1 (2004), pp. 101–123; Gabriele STRAUCH, *Text and Context in the Reading of Medieval Literature – A Case in Point. Dukas Horant*, in: *Exemplaria* 3 (1991), pp. 62–94; ID., *Dukas Horant. Wanderer zwischen zwei Welten*, Amsterdam/Atlanta 1990; Karl STACKMANN, *Dukas Horant. Der Erstling jüdisch-deutscher Literatursymbiose*, in: *Juden in der deutschen Literatur*, ed. Stéphanie MOSÈS/Albrecht SCHÖNE, Jerusalem/Göttingen 1986, pp. 64–76.

89) SHALEV-EYNI, *Solomon, his Demons* (as n. 88); Amnon SHILOAH, *Jewish and Muslim Traditions of Musical Therapy*, in: *Music as Medicine. The History of Music Therapy since Antiquity*, ed. Peregrine HORDEN, New York/London 2016, pp. 69–83; Dwight REYNOLDS, *Arab Musical Influence on Western Europe*, in: *A Sea of Languages. Rethinking the Arabic Role in Medieval Literary History*, ed. Suzanne Conklin AKBARI/Karla MALLETT, Toronto 2013, pp. 182–198; Charles BURNETT, *»Spiritual Medicine«*. *Music and Healing in Islam and its Influence on Western Medicine*, in: *Islamic Medical and Scientific Tradition*, ed. Peter E. PORTMANN, vol. 2, New York 2011, pp. 252–259; JASPERT, *Zeichen und Symbole* (as n. 1); Norman GOLB, *The Autograph Memoirs of Obediah the Proselyte of Oppido Lucano and the Epistle of Barukh b. Isaac of Aleppo. Together with an Appendix containing the Music of Obediah the Proselyte*, in: *Convegno internazionale di Studi Giovanni-Obadiah da Oppido. Proselito, viaggiatore, e musicista*

Muslims, and to a lesser extent, Jews, were also anxious about sounds, songs, words, and music, or the contexts in which they were produced. Jews were concerned about the seductive power of women's voices on men, even when raised in praise of God, a view that was transmitted to the Christian world through the early twelfth-century Jewish convert to Christianity, Petrus Alfonsi in his ›Disciplina Clericalis‹⁹⁰. Within the Islamic world, music was thought to have a powerful effect on the mind and humors of the body, so that it was used therapeutically for the mentally disturbed⁹¹. It was also understood to create or aide in the creation of ecstatic, altered state of consciousness. Many Sufi thinkers and their followers embraced music along with dance as part of path to loving God, whereas other Muslim authors were more suspicious and either warned that one needed to be sure of the source of the musically induced ecstasy, or condemned it as an innovation that would lead others astray. For all authors, whether they favored its use, were ambivalent, or condemned it, none doubted its power over the hearers⁹².

Certainly the singing, dancing, beating of tambourines, playing of pipes in mosques as part of Sufi rituals would have been part of the soundscape of late Mamluk cities. Al-Turkumānī, from the late fourteenth, early fifteenth century CE, vociferously condemned such behavior in his treatise against innovations, all the while describing them in some detail, including the sexual nature of some of the movements⁹³. Likewise, Ibn Taymiyya's

dell'eta normanna atti del convegno internazionale, ed. Antonia DE ROSA/Mauro PERANI, Firenze 2005; BAUSCHKE, *Süsskind vom Trimberg* (as n. 83); EISENSTEIN, *Medieval Elements* (as n. 52); Stefano LEONI, *Kanz al-Tuhaf (al-Musiqi), A Casket of Rarities. Ars Musica and Ars Practica between Islam and Christianity*, in: *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 27/2 (1996), pp. 167–183; Don HARRAN, *Tradition and Innovation in Jewish Music in the Later Renaissance*, in: *The Journal of Musicology* 7/1 (1989), pp. 107–130; Maria Rosa MENOCAL, *The Arabic Role in Medieval Literary History. A Forgotten Heritage*, Philadelphia 1987, p. 30, pp. 44–45, pp. 71–114.

90) Petrus Alfonsi, *Die Disciplina Clericalis des Petrus Alfonsi, das älteste Novellenbuch des Mittelalters*, ed. Alfons HILKA/Werner SÖNDERHJELM, Heidelberg 1911, pp. 13–15, no. 8; ID., *The Disciplina Clericalis of Petrus Alfonsi*, ed. and trans. Eberhard HERMES, transl. to English by P. R. QUARRIE, Berkeley/Los Angeles 1970, pp. 118–120, no. 8; Rosalind HACKETT, *Religion and Gender. Too Quiet a Field of Study*, in: *Journal of the British Association for the Study of Religions* 19 (2017), pp. 75–82; Moshe LICHENSTEIN, *Kol Isha. A Woman's Voice*, in: *Tradition. A Journal of Orthodox Jewish Thought* 46/1 (2013), pp. 9–24; Emily TAITZ, *Kol Isha. The Voice of Woman. Where was it heard in Medieval Europe?*, in: *Conservative Judaism* 38 (1986), pp. 46–61.

91) SHILOAH, *Jewish and Muslim Traditions* (as n. 89); BURNETT, ›Spiritual Medicine‹ (as n. 89); Miri SHEFER-MOSSENSOHN, *Ottoman Medicine. Healing and Medical Institutions. 1500–1700*, Albany 2009, pp. 69–76; Johan Christoph BÜRGEL, *Musicotherapy in the Islamic Middle Ages as reflected in Medical and other Sources*, in: *Studies in the History of Medicine* 4 (1980), pp. 23–28.

92) WEINREICH, *Sensing Sound* (as n. 65); M.J. KISTER, ›Exert Yourselves O Banū Afrida«! Some Notes on Entertainment in the Islamic Tradition, in: *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 23 (1999), pp. 63–78; Leonard LEWISOHN, *The Sacred Music of Islam. Samā' in the Persian Sufi Tradition*, in: *The British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 6 (1997), pp. 1–33.

93) Šafī al-Dīn Idrīs b. Baydakīn b. 'Abd Allāh al-Turkumānī, *Kitāb al-luma'* (as n. 34), i, p. 90, p. 100; KISTER, ›Exert Yourselves O Banū Afrida«! (as n. 92).

student, Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya (1292–1350 CE), described how the sounds of such celebrations mingled with that of more restrained prayers. Individuals using dance, tambourine and song in their devotions danced until they fell down, according to him, and were so determined in their practice, that even when he and his men drove them out by beating them, they simply moved to another part of the sanctuary⁹⁴.

The Mamluk historian, al-Maqrīzī (1364–1442 CE) is rather more positive about public, Sufi prayers and teaching. His description of their activities portrays them as restrained and orderly – »the Sufis walk in silence and diffidence to the door of the al-Ḥākim mosque« in order to listen to readings from the Qur'an and sermons by their teacher, and leave in the same manner as they arrived⁹⁵. This depiction stands in sharp contrast to the rather than the wilder, noisier picture created by Ibn Taymiyya and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya. What is significant however, is that, according to al-Maqrīzī these sessions attracted a large audience of observers: »The people came on Friday they arrived from Miṣr [Old Cairo] to Cairo in order to watch the Sufis of the Khānqāh of Sa'id al-Su'dā' as they went for Friday prayer at the al-Ḥākim mosque, in order that they receive their [the Sufis'] blessing and excellence by watching them«⁹⁶. In his analysis of this passage, Yehoshua Frenkel rightly emphasizes how this passage and other accounts of Sufi activities demonstrate that their rituals were a key element in the »soundscape« of Mamluk cities⁹⁷. More specifically however, this passage and the less friendly reports of their behavior and engagement with music described above, clearly indicate that Sufis' chanting, reading, beating of drums and tambourines all would have been part of incidental, inescapable religious sounds which not only Muslims heard, but also members of other religious communities. As such, these practices also had the potential to captivate individuals from these other communities, just as they did crowds of the Muslim faithful.

Among Jews in the Islamic world, the use of musical instruments, chant, and dance for the sake of divine contemplation and prayer was viewed with varying degrees of acceptance. Jewish leader, physician and philosopher, Moses Maimonides (1138–1204) associated music with the inspiration for prophesy, specifying that prophets or their disciples employed a harp, drum, flute or lyre in order to induce prophetic inspiration. However,

94) Shams al-Dīn Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya, *Ighāthat al-lahfān fī maṣāyid al-shayṭān*, 2 vols. ed. Muḥammad Ḥāmid AL-FIḤR, Beirut 1975 (reprint 2004), vol. 1, pp. 230–237. KISTER, »Exert Yourselves O Banū Afrida«! (as n. 92).

95) al-Maqrīzī, *Al-Khiṭaṭ* (as n. 31), vol. 4, p. 283, in the section »khānqāh al-ṣalāhiyyah, dār Sa'id al-Su'dā' duyrah al-ṣūfiyyah«.

96) أدرك الناس في يوم الجمعة يأتون من مصر إلى القاهرة ليشاهدوا صوفية خانقاه سعيد السعداء عندما يتوجهون منها إلى صلاة الجمعة بالجامع الحاكمي. كي تحصل لهم البركة والخير بمشاهدتهم al-Maqrīzī, *Al-Khiṭaṭ* (as n. 31), vol. 4, p. 283.

97) FRENKEL, *Mamluk Soundscape* (as n. 19).

according to him, the highest prophet of all, Moses, did not require such tools⁹⁸). This exception, apart from emphasizing the special status of the biblical prophet Moses, also suggests that Moses Maimonides understood music as a tool, assisting humans to attain the highest level of communion with God, but that ideally it should be unnecessary. His son, Abraham (1186–1237), and subsequent generations of Jews in Egypt who embraced Sufi rituals, expanded upon the use of music for the sake of contemplation, drawing from the Moses Maimonides' interpretations and the practices of their Muslim counterparts. Abraham Maimonides maintained that music altered the soul's temperament and allowed the aspiring mystic to empty his mind and concentrate upon God. It did so in part by provoking intense emotion⁹⁹). Paul Fenton and Elisha Russ-Fishbane have noted the strong similarity to the description of rituals of chanting and meditation in this and other Jewish »Sufi« writings to the Muslim Sufi practice of *samā'*, namely listening to chant, musical instruments and/or poetry designed to move the listener toward God¹⁰⁰). As in the Muslim community, not all members were pleased by such activities, and objected to teaching them¹⁰¹).

Parallel activities and internal objections to them among Muslims and Jews engaged in common mystical rituals involving musical instruments or chant indicates shared or borrowed uses of music within a religious context. While Abraham Maimonides and other Jewish Sufis in Egypt maintained that these practices were not innovations, rather that Muslim Sufis had retained ancient Jewish practices that had been lost, scholars generally recognize that Jews adapted these concepts and practices from their Muslim, Sufi neighbors, even if elements of early Jewish practices were also integrated into Jewish »Sufi« rituals¹⁰²). Jews of al-Andalus were likewise attracted to Sufism and adapted

98) Maimonides, *Mishnah Torah*, ed. Zevi PRAIZLER, Jerusalem 1985; *Hilkhot Yesodei ha-Torah*, vii: 4–6; Elisha RUSS-FISHBANE, *Judaism, Sufism and the Pietists of Medieval Egypt. A Study of Abraham Maimonides and His Times*, Oxford 2015, p. 124.

99) Abraham Maimonides, *The High Ways to Perfection of Abraham Maimonides*, vol. 2, ed. and transl. Samuel ROSENBLATT, Baltimore 1938, pp. 384–387.

100) RUSS-FISHBANE, *Judaism, Sufism* (as n. 98), pp. 123–126; Paul FENTON, *A Jewish Sufi on the Influence of Music*, in: Yuval. *Studies of the Jewish Music Research Center* 4 (1982), pp. 124–130. More generally on *samā'*, music and spirituality in Islam see for example: LEWISOHN, *Sacred Music* (as n. 92); Jean MICHON, *Sacred Music and Dance in Islam*, in: *Islamic Spirituality*, vol. 2: *Manifestations*, ed. Seyyed Hossein NASR, New York 1991, p. 469–505.

101) RUSS-FISHBANE, *Judaism, Sufism* (as n. 98), p. 123.

102) *Ibid.*; Nathan HOFER, *Mythical Identity Construction in Medieval Egyptian Sufism. Ibn 'Aṭā' Allāh al-Iskandarī and Abraham Maimonides*, in: *Les Mystiques juives, chrétiennes et musulmanes dans l'Égypte médiévale. Interculturalités et contextes historiques*, ed. Giuseppe CECERE/Mireille LOUBET/Samuella PAGANI, Cairo 2013, pp. 393–422; Zvi LANGERMAN, *From Private Devotion to Communal Prayer. New Light on Abraham Maimonides' Synagogue Reforms*, in: *Ginze Qedem* 1 (2005), pp. 31–49; Napthali WIEDER, *Islamic Influences of the Jewish Worship* [Hebrew], Jerusalem 1998; Georges VAJDA, *Mystique juive et mystique musulmane*, in: *Les nouveaux cahiers* 2 (1966), pp. 34–38. Paul Fenton has written extensively about various aspects of the phenomenon of Jewish Sufism. His articles are too numerous to list here,

mystical practices and concepts to their own approaches¹⁰³). The attraction of Sufi teachings and rituals were strong enough that Jews occasionally attempted to join Muslim Sufi study circles¹⁰⁴). Part of the allure of Sufism for Jews was their use of music as an aide to prayer and the recollection of God.

The idea of loss of sense, the hint of sexuality and lack of control on the part of those who heard or participated in musical celebrations, even for religious reasons, has a long history, and is intertwined with Muslim depictions of encounters with Christians, already as early as the Umayyad and early 'Abbasid periods. During the Umayyad and early Abbasid caliphates, churches and especially monasteries served not only as way-stations for Muslims in need of lodging, or as objects of passing curiosity, but as places where the caliph or other emirs brought their court to picnic, rest, hunt and be entertained. During this period, a number of »guides« to monasteries, known as >al-Diyarāt<, were composed in addition to independent poems about the festivities enjoyed at monasteries¹⁰⁵). The existence of an entire genre of Muslim literature dedicated to describing monasteries and churches is in itself a strong indication of the fascination that such Christian holy spaces held for Muslims. While we have passing references to several of these guides in other literature, only one of these >diyarāt< books has survived, namely that of al-Shābushtī, who died around the year 1000 CE. Within al-Shābushtī's >Book of Monasteries<, some of the poems that circulated independently, and in al-Iṣfahānī's >Book of Strangers<, the beauty of both the countryside and the monasteries themselves, the wine, the food, and the music which the monasteries provided as part of their hospitality to visitors, the attractiveness of the young men and women who sometimes lived and served in the monasteries, and the spectacle of Christian religious festivals, all drew Muslims to monasteries. Akin to later

however, for those most pertinent to the topics at hand see: FENTON, *Jewish Sufi* (as n. 100); ID., *Mystical Treatise on Prayer and the Spiritual Quest from the Pietest Circle*, in: *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 16 (1993), pp. 137–175; ID., *A Mystical Treatise on Perfection, Providence and Prophecy from the Jewish Sufi Circle*, in: *The Jews of Medieval Islam. Community, Society and Identity*, ed. Daniel FRANK, Leiden 1992, pp. 301–334; ID., *Deux Traités de la mystique juive*, Lagrasse 1987 and see his introduction and commentary to Obadayah Maimonides, *The Treatise of the Pool. al-Maqala al-Hawḍiyya*, London 1981. 103) Diana LOBEL, *A Sufi-Jewish Dialogue. Philosophy and Mysticism in Bahya ibn Paquda's Duties of the Heart*, Philadelphia 2007; ID., *Between Mysticism and Philosophy. Sufi Language of Religious Experience in Judah Ha-Levi's Kuzari*, Albany 2000; J. KRAEMER, *The Andalusian Mystic ibn Hūd and the Conversion of the Jews*, in: *Israel Oriental Studies* 12 (1992), pp. 59–73.

104) Shelomo Dov GOITEIN, *A Jewish Addict to Sufism in the Time of the Nagid David II Maimonides*, in: *Jewish Quarterly Review* 44 (1953), pp. 37–49.

105) Elizabeth CAMPBELL, *A Heaven of Wine. Muslim-Christian Encounters at Monasteries in the Early Islamic Middle East*, Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Washington 2009. Also see: Elizabeth Key FOWDEN, *The Lamp and the Wine Flask. Early Muslim in Christian Monasticism*, in: *Islamic Crosspollinations. Interactions in the Medieval Middle East*, ed. Anna AKASOY/James MONTGOMERY/Peter PORMANN, Cambridge 2007, pp. 1–28; Thomas SZGORICH, *Monks and their Daughters. Monasteries as Muslim-Christian Boundaries*, in: *Muslims and Others in Sacred Space*, ed. Margaret CORMACK, Oxford 2013, pp. 193–216.

accounts of Muslim leaders watching or even patronizing Christian festivals, al-Shābushtī describes the beauty of the Easter celebrations at the Monastery of Samālū, not far from Baghdad, and notes that both Muslims and Christians came to the monastery for the festival¹⁰⁶. Included in such ceremonies, would of course, have been Christian singing. Much more dominant, however, are the themes of wine, music, and alluring young men and women. In >The Book of Strangers< a beautiful Christian girl invites a group of Muslim and Christian party-goers to read a poem written on the wall of a monastery:

»She went out on the day of her feast dressed as a nun
And captivated with her haughty walk everyone coming and going
For my misery I saw her on the feast of the Tha'alib monastery
Swaying among women, a buxom girl among buxom girls
In whose midst she was like a full moon surrounded by stars«¹⁰⁷.

In addition to the quality of the poem and the beauty of its reciter, part of what delights the party is the sweetness of Christian girl's diction (*malāḥat manṭiqhā*/ملاحة منطقها). They suspect her of writing the poem herself as well as exclaiming how well the poem describes her¹⁰⁸. In another, later account, describing the Umayyad Caliph al-Walid II (died 744, reigned 743–744 CE) the caliph supposedly boasts that he and his friend drank and danced so wildly to music at Diyr Bawanna, a monastery in the vicinity of Damascus, that passers-by thought that they were all possessed by jinn¹⁰⁹. Elizabeth Campbell has argued that depictions of Umayyad caliphs, especially, as drunken carousers leering at or having extra-marital and often same-sex liaisons with young Christians at monasteries, served to mark the Umayyads as religiously unfit to rule in contrast to the recently empowered 'Abbasids. Noteworthy, however, is the parallel between what Campbell characterizes as a polemical depiction of the Umayyad Caliph's reaction to music at a monastery and the

106) Abi Ḥasan 'Alī ibn Muḥammad al-Shābushtī, *Book of Monasteries*, al-Diyarat, ed. George AWWAD, Piscataway 2008, p. 14; CAMPBELL, *Heaven of Wine* (as n. 105), p. 46.

107) خرجت يوم عيدها \ في ثياب الرواهب

فسبت باختيالها \ كل جاء و ذاهب

لشفتاني رأيتها \ يوم دير الثعالب

تتهادى بنسوة \ كاعب في كواعب

هي فيهم كأنها \ بدر بين الكواكب

Abū al-Faraj al-Iṣbahānī, *Kitāb adab al-ghurabā'*, ed. Ṣalāḥ AL-DĪN AL-MUNAJJID, Beirut 1972, p. 35, section 13; ID., *Book of Strangers. Medieval Arabic Graffiti on the Theme of Nostalgia*, transl. Patricia CRONE/Shmuel MOREH, Princeton 2000, p. 33.

108) Ibid.

109) Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Faḍl Allāh al-'Umarī, *al-Masālik al-abṣār fī mamālik al-anṣār*, ed. Aḥmad ZAKĪ BASHĀ, Cairo 1924, vol. 1, p. 351; Yāqūt Shihāb al-Dīn ibn 'Abdullāh al-Rūmī al-Ḥamawī, *Kitāb Muj'am al-Buldān/Geographisches Wörterbuch*, 6 vols., ed. Ferdinand WÜSTENFELD, Leipzig 1866–1870, vol. 2, p. 649 <https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.70331/page/n655/mode/2up> (1.6. 2020); Robert HAMILTON, *Walid and his Friends. An Umayyad Tragedy*, Oxford 1988, p. 91; CAMPBELL, *Heaven of Wine* (as n. 104), pp. 118–119.

later discussions by Mamluk legalists also against fellow Muslims of whom they disapprove. In each case, it is the utter abandon, to the point of losing control over the body, or in the case of Walid II, being suspected of having lost his mind.

Sexual attraction to the visual beauty of Christian women is connected to auditory beauty in these texts, as we have seen in the example noted above, of the Christian poetess, whose diction and eloquence about her own sexual allure prompted such admiration. The >Book of Strangers< also contains the tale of the Caliph al-Mutawakkil, who is enraptured by the charms of a monk's daughter. Her recitation of Arabic poetry, and then later, after feasting together at the Caliph's request, her singing one of the songs of her people renders the Caliph utterly in love with her. More restrained and religiously correct than his Umayyad counterparts, however, he convinces her to convert to Islam and marries her¹¹⁰. The idea of the sounds of Christian religious ceremonies as the primary draw for Muslims, even as they desire a beautiful young woman or man, comes frequently to the fore. They are drawn to the object of their passion through the bells or monastic singing, listening to the gospel and Christian hymns, and attending Christian festivals out of love for a young Christian man or woman¹¹¹. In one poem cited by al-Shābushtī, Abū Nuwas (d. c. 815 CE) evokes Christians rituals to chastise his lover. The poem describes the many rituals, festivals and saints of the Christians – the bells, the crosses carried in procession, the Eucharistic wine, Jesus, Mary, St. Sergius, and the ascetic exercises of the monks within the monastery. Then, after chiding his lover for keeping his distances says: »Your lovers invite one and all to Christianity from Islam, in apostasy«¹¹².

Here we have explicitly expressed one of the primary concerns regarding Muslim attraction to Christian music and festivals, namely conversion to Christianity. Also in Persian Sufi poetry by authors such as Farīd al-Dīn 'Aṭṭār, who favored the use of music, the theme of the beautiful, (Christian) maiden and the danger of conversion intermingles with power of music to evoke passionate love, loss of reason, and deviation from religious truth. The spiritual battle becomes to whom that passionate love should be directed¹¹³. Even when the emphasis is on the Christian woman's physical beauty, rather than song, one of the main markers of Christianity which the besotted Sufi has taken up and must

110) al-Iṣbahānī, *Kitāb adab al-ghurabā'* (as n. 106), pp. 64–68; ID., *Book of Strangers* (as n. 106), pp. 58–62. Al-Mutawakkil lived from 821–861 CE and was caliph from 847–861 CE; SIZGORICH, *Monks and their Daughters* (as n. 105).

111) Hady Roger IDRIS, *Fêtes chrétiennes en Ifriqiya*, in: *Revue africaine* 98 (1954), pp. 261–276, especially pp. 272–273; CAMPBELL, *Heaven of Wine* (as n. 104), pp. 133–135, 146. On the theme of male same-sex encounters, including between monks and Muslim men see: *ibid.*, pp. 132–143; Everett ROWSON, *The Categorization of Gender and Sexual Irregularity in Medieval Arabic Vice Lists*, in: *Body Guards. The Cultural Politics of Gender Ambiguity*, ed. Julia EPSTEIN/Kristina STAUB, New York 1991, pp. 50–79.

112) \ و اذن عاشقوك الى النصرارى \ من الاسلام طرا بالمروق \ Al-Shābushtī, *Book of Monasteries* (as n. 105), pp. 205–206; CAMPBELL, *Heaven of Wine* (as n. 104), p. 112.

113) Farīd al-Dīn 'Aṭṭār, *The Conference of the Birds*, transl. Afkham DARBANDI/Dick DAVIS, London/New York 1984/2011, pp. 45–48, 68–86, 117, 128–130.

cast aside is the bell¹¹⁴). Thus, for Muslim authors, Christianity was symbolized not merely by special visual signals, but also by what made it auditorily distinct. Yet Muslims imagined that religious »noise« could also work in their favor. The Arabic epic, ›Sīrat al-Amīra Dhāt al-Himma‹, abounds with tales of Muslim men rendered nearly senseless by the beauty of Christian women, either in monasteries or as their opponents on the battlefield. In at least one case however, it is the beauty of the Qur'an's recitation that causes the Christian to convert to Islam¹¹⁵).

In Christian Arabic and Syriac sources as well as Muslims 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, the son-in-law and cousin of the Prophet Muḥammad, chastises his companions for mocking the knocking of the *nāqūs*, explaining that the clapper was a source of knowledge. When challenged on this point, 'Alī recites a poem glorifying God, and reminding listeners of God's mercy and human beings' sinfulness, and of the world's transience¹¹⁶). Salam Rassi points out that this didactic, contemplative tradition focusing on the ephemeral nature of life in the current world draws from the early Christian Arabic poetic traditions of the city of al-Ḥīra. Like in the poem attributed to 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, 'Adī ibn Zayd (d. 600), one of the poets of the region and eventually a royal advisor, explicates the wisdom provided by seemingly inanimate objects, which in turn prompts the conversion of the Lakhmid king, Nu'mān ibn Mundhir (ruled c. 580–c. 602)¹¹⁷). Here it is not merely the beauty of religious sound, as in the Muslim narratives, but its hidden meaning which is supposed to move listeners to conversion, whether that be an inner conversion to a deeper commitment to God, or a more literal, practical conversion from one religion to another. Nonetheless, the idea that the sound connected to one of the core symbols and auditory practices of a given religion could bring about conversion, is similar in Islam and among Arabic- and Syriac-speaking Christian communities (both Eastern and Western Syrian Churches).

Thus, as with legal and other texts attempting to regulate the sounding of bells or the recitation of the *adhān*, religious sound is recognized as having powers to turn the hearts of those who heard the sounds of the religious other. In these texts however, the battle of sound is not through the regulation of noise (although that also certainly happened in the

114) Ibid, p. 82

115) Malcolm Cameron LYONS, *The Arabian Epic. Heroic and Oral Story-telling*, 3 vols., Cambridge 1993–1995, vol. 2, p. 161, vol. 3, p. 333, *Sīrat al-Amīra Dhāt al-Himma*, § 32; Alexandra CUFFEL, *Reorienting Christian »Amazons«. Christian Women Warriors in Medieval Islamic Literature in the Context of the Crusades*, in: *Religion, Gender, and Culture in the Pre-Modern World*, ed. Brian BRITT/Alexandra CUFFEL, New York 2007, pp. 137–166.

116) Salam RASSI, *What does the Clapper say? An Interfaith Discourse on the Christian Call to Prayer by 'Abdisho Bar Brikha*, in: *Islam and Christianity in Medieval Anatolia*, ed. Andrew Charles Spencer PEACOCK/Bruno Di NICOLA/Sara Nur YILDIZ, Farnham 2015, pp. 263–284, especially p. 275.

117) Ibid.

Islamic world) but through the redirection of its beauty, or warning that however pleasurable music was, therein lay the danger of losing one's self.

III. QUALITY AND SOURCE OF SOUND

Both the quality and the source of sound were powerful carriers of meaning in their own right, and thus, in describing religious encounters through noise, medieval authors chose their descriptors carefully. In Islamic writing, sound and music was sometimes marked as problematic, but not repugnant, as we have seen. In Western Europe, sound from an unwanted source was marked negatively. The dichotomy of beautiful, religiously correct sound vs. ugly, »wrong« or unreligious sound appears as a frequent theme in medieval European sources including those which underscore religious competition. The way in which Paulus Alvarus (c. 800–861) describes the Muslim call to prayer is a good example of the ways in which undesirable sound (from the perspective of the writer) was characterized by ugliness: »For each day they shout in their smoke-filled towers an enormous and monstrous trumpeting, jaw open, lips hanging as if about to vomit, hearts crying out, like screaming savages proclaiming [...]«¹¹⁸). One finds comparable rhetoric in the »Liber Apologeticus Martyrum« by Eulogius of Cordoba (d. 857): »[...] similar to donkeys, their jaw open and impure lips unstitched, proclaiming horridly«¹¹⁹). In both cases, the description of the sound emphasizes its loudness – »trumpeting, shouting, screaming« – its ugliness, both directly and by association – the trumpeting is monstrous, the proclaiming horrid – and more indirectly, by associating the mouths that make the sound with vomit and impurity. Finally, the vocabulary chosen associates the call of the Muslims with animality. In the first passage *barritu* or *barritus* here translated as *trumpeting* is often associated with elephants, the word for mouth or jaw, *rictu* or *riktus* is used to refer to the mouth of animals, and *furiosi*, *savages* but also generally referring to that which is savage or fierce, much like a predatory animal. The second passage cited, compares the call or preaching of the Muslims directly to that of asses. Thus, these early medieval authors dehumanized their opponents, in this case Muslims, by using the noise of animals to characterize their religious sound. Moving to a later period, one of the ways in which Peter the Venerable (1092–1156) bestializes the Jews present at the crucifixion, is to compare

118) *Quid iste in fumosis turribus cotidie barritu inormi et monstuoso hac ferarum rictu, dissolutis labiis et faucium iatu aperto ut cardiac vociferant hac vociferando velut furiosi preconant [...]*. Paulus Alvarus, *Indiculus luminosus*, in: *Corpus scriptorum muzarabiorum*, ed. Juan GIL FERNÁNDEZ, vol. 1, § 25, p. 298.

119) [...] *ita ut more aselli dissutis mandibulis impurisq[ue] patentibus labiis horrendum praeconium [...]*. Eulogius of Cordoba, *Liber Apologeticus Martyrum*, in: *Corpus scriptorum muzarabiorum*, ed. Juan GIL FERNÁNDEZ, vol. 2, § 19, p. 487. See also the analysis of both of these texts by John TOLAN, *Affreux vacarem* (as n. 1).

them to barking dogs¹²⁰). Similarly, in the Hebrew chronicle of the second crusade, the Jewish author, Ephraim of Bonn, (1132–1196) nicknamed Radulf, the monk who sought to incite crusaders and the populace against the Jews, *noveah*, *barker* and his preaching, *barking*¹²¹).

If ugly, animalistic noise was a marker of religious error, as in the examples provided here, then its melodious counterpart contained the potential for expressing what was heavenly and doctrinally correct. As demonstrated in the previous section, for all, beautiful sound was always alluring, wavering between holiness and danger. In addition to beauty, volume also sometimes served as an indicator of power and sanctity. For example, in the »Prioress' Tale« in Chaucer's — >Canterbury Tales<, a little cleric sings songs of praise to the Virgin Mary on his way home: »Full merrily he would sing and cry / >O Alma Redemptoris< evermore / the sweetness pierced his heart so/ of the Mother of Christ that to her to pray/ he could not stint his singing«¹²²). He passes the Jewish quarter, and his song so outrages the Jews who overhear it, they decide to kill him. Later, his body is discovered because he miraculously continues singing after death. Indeed, »There he, with throat cut, lay upright / he began to sing Alma Redemptoris / so loud the place began to ring«¹²³). Just before he is buried, the abbot responsible for the funeral »conjured him« to clarify how he could still sing with his throat cut:

»My throat is cut to the neck-bone<, / said this child, >and as by way of nature, / I should have died, indeed, long ago / But Jesus Christ, as you find in books / willed [...] / for the worship of his dear Mother / I may yet sing O Alma loud and clear«¹²⁴).

120) Peter the Venerable, *Adversus iudeorum*, ed. Yvonne FRIEDMANN, Turnholt 1985, vol. 3, p. 57.

121) R. Ephraim of Bonn, *Sefer Zekhirah*, in: *Sefer Gezirot ve Zarfat. divre Zikhronot mi-bene ha-dorot she bi-tequfot mas'e ha-zaclav u-mivhar piyyutehem*, ed. Abraham Meir HABERMANN, Jerusalem 1945, p. 115; *The Jews and the Crusaders. The Hebrew Chronicles of the First and Second Crusades*, ed. Shlomo EIDELBERG, Madison 1977, p. 122. On the animalization of religious opponents in medieval polemic see: Alexandra CUFFEL, *Gendering Disgust in Medieval Religious Polemic*, Notre Dame 2007, pp. 51–54, pp. 198–239; Kenneth STOW, *Jewish Dogs. An Image and its Interpreters*, Stanford 2006; compare with Ruth Mazo KARRAS, *From Boys to Men. Formations of Masculinity in Late Medieval Europe*, Philadelphia 2002, pp. 67–108.

122) *Ful murily than wolde he synge and crie / O Alma redemptoris everemo. / The sweetness his herte perced so / Of Cristes mooder that to hire to preyre / He kan nat stynte of syngyng by the weye*. Geoffrey Chaucer, *Canterbury Tales*, vol. 7, in: *The Complete Poetry and Prose of Geoffrey Chaucer*, ed. John H. FISHER, New York/Chicago 1977, p. 244, ll. 553–557.

123) *Ther he with throte ykorven lay upright / He Alma redemptoris gan to synge / So loude that al the place gan to ryng*. Idem., vol. 7, ll. 611–613.

124) *>My throte is kut unto my nakke-boon<, / Seyde this child, >and as by wey of kynde / I sholde have dyed, ye, longe tyme agon, / But Jesu Crist, as ye in books fynde, / Wil [...] / for the worship of his Mooder deere / Yet may I synge O Alma, loude and cleere<*. Idem., vol. 7, ll. 649–652, 654–655.

In this Christian story the sweetness and loudness of his voice is emphasized along with the content of the song, so that content, context, and the musical quality itself work together as a religious irritant to the Jews. They also indicate to the Christian audience that he and his song are holy. His voice and song, along with, according to the tale, the blood – of Jesus and the martyred boy all cry out against the Jews, who may speak, but make no music of their own, overwhelmed symbolically and auditorily by Christian sound. The miraculous nature of that sound is made clear in the description of how profoundly the child's throat was cut – all the way to the neck bone – so that presumably all vocal cords would have been destroyed, and yet Hugh of Lincoln sang.

In fact, although Chaucer's >Prioress' Tale< references a specific case of blood libel, the tale of a Christian child singing and being martyred by was an old and frequently repeated trope with a number of variations which continued into the late Middle Ages. In some, the Virgin thwarts the murder attempt, and the singing leads to a still living child, although the event is still treated as miraculous. In other instances, the child's miraculous postmortem singing is enabled by a physical token, such as a lily or jewel, usually provided by the Virgin Mary, which, once removed, likewise silences the supernatural song¹²⁵). In each case, however, the beauty of public singing is depicted as evoking powerful emotions in Christians and Jews alike – indeed in Gautier de Coincy's version, hearers are moved to tears – and is at the root of all inter-religious encounters in the tale, including the Jews' eventual conversion to Christianity, or in some versions, their wholesale slaughter by the Christians¹²⁶). The process is cyclical as well, for the story is contained in collections of songs for the Virgin Mary, like that of Gautier de Coincy (1177–1236) or Alfonso X's >Cantigas de Santa María< which in their turn would have been part of the soundscape in which Christians and Jews participated, willingly or otherwise¹²⁷). Similarly, the story of

125) Sources and Analogues of Chaucer's *Canterbury Tales*, ed. Robert M. CORREALE/Mary HAMEL, vol. 2, Cambridge 2005, pp. 582–648; Isamu SAITO, »Greyn« of Martyrdom in Chaucer's Prioress' Tale, in: *Arthurian and Other Studies presented to Shunichi Noguchi*, ed. Takashi SUZUKI/Tsuyoshi MUKAI, Cambridge 1993, pp. 31–38; Geoffrey Chaucer, *The Prioress' Tale*, ed. Beverly BOYD (A Variorum Edition of the Works of Geoffrey Chaucer. The *Canterbury Tales*, vol. 2, Part 20), Norman 1987, pp. 9–13; Carleton BROWN, *A Study of the Miracle of Our Lady Told by Chaucer's Prioress*, London 1910, pp. 37–53, 60–71.

126) Gautier de Coincy, *Les Miracles de Sainte Vierge*, ed. Abbé POQUET, Paris 1857, »De l'enfant que Nostre Dame résuscita, qui chantoit les répons, Gaude Maria«, col. 559, ll. 103–105. For a version in which the Jews are killed see: Alfonso X, *Las Cantigas de Santa María*, ed. Walter METTMANN, vol. 1, Coimbra 1959, p. 23, song no. 6; ID., *Songs of Holy Mary of Alfonso X, The Wise*, transl. Kathleen KULP-HILL, Tempe 2000, p. 12, song no. 6.

127) Gautier de Coincy, *Les Miracles* (as n. 126), cols. 555–572; Alfonso X, *Las Cantigas de Santa María* (as n. 126), pp. 21–23, song no. 6; ID., *Songs of Holy Mary* (as n. 126), song no. 6, pp. 11–12; John HAINES, *A Sight-Reading Vielle Player from the Thirteenth Century*, in: *The Sounds and Sights of Performance in Early Music. Essays in Honor of Timothy G. McGee*, ed. Maureen EPP/Brian POWER, Burlington/Farnham 2009, pp. 13–26; Gautier DE COINCI, *Miracles, Music and Manuscripts*, ed. Kathy M. KRAUSE/Alison

Hugh of Lincoln, the subject of the >Prioress' Tale<, was made into an Anglo-French ballad shortly after Hugh's death in 1255. There the collective guilt of the Jews, and the details of the Jews' lengthy and painful torture of Hugh through crucifixion and stabbing are itemized in verse, the singing of which long outlasted the presence of the Jews themselves in England and continued into the early modern period¹²⁸). The singing of these songs in the context of Marian veneration, or in more popular contexts, thus became themselves part of the soundscape of Christians and Jews, in medieval European territories where Jews retained a presence. Imbedded within these songs was imagery reinforcing the contrast of beautiful, worshipful voice of the Christian child in face of Jewish wrath and violence.

One finds a similar rhetoric, though less violent in the autobiography of a Jewish convert to Islam from the twelfth century. The volume of Muslim prayers in the mosque in response to his conversion, according to him, shook the mosque itself¹²⁹). Prayerful sound, then becomes the auditory marker of his entry into a new religion; its volume is a symbol of the »true« religion's power, much as the force and the inability to silence Sir Hugh's hymn to the Virgin signaled the truth of Christianity and the evil of the Jews. Both instances feature »casual« religious noise – heavily laden with meaning, particularly in the narratives in which they are described, but also, in their broader milieu, part of the soundscape that any could overhear – prayerful »noise« of the religious other. Volume of religious noise, whether in conversion or martyrological narratives, or in polemical diatribes against the awful din of the religious other, was a powerful indicator of a sound's importance, but it could be used to point to either positive or negative significance.

Leaving aside supernatural sonorousness, on a practical level, being able to overcome the restrictions confining noises of religious minorities was indicative of power and supernatural support either against the religious majority, or as proof of its tacit support, despite regulations to the contrary. The Swiss Dominican pilgrim, Felix Fabri (1441–1502) recounts how the Virgin Mary appeared to the Muslim custodians of her grave, and threatened them because they charged three ducats to all who would enter. Part of their penance is that father and sons must stand before the entrance of the tomb and say:

STONES, Turnhout 2006; Pedro LÓPEZ ELUM, *Interpretando la música medieval. Las Cantigas de Santa María*, Valencia 2005; Higinio ANGLÉS, *La Música de las Cantigas de Santa María, transcripción y estudio crítico*, Barcelona 1958. Of the two texts, Gautier's version of the tale places greater emphasis on singing and its beauty.

128) Geraldine HENG, *England's Dead Boys. Telling Tales of Christian-Jewish Relations before and after the First European Expulsion of the Jews*, in: *Modern Language Notes* 27/5 (2012), pp. 54–85.

129) Moshe PERLMANN, *Samau'al al-Maghribī Ifhām al-Yahūd. Silencing the Jews*, in: *Proceedings of the American Academy for Jewish Research* 32 (1964), pp. 15–225, English p. 86, Arabic, p. 117.

»Come adore God and praise Mary«¹³⁰). Here the Muslims are forced to undermine their own regulations of auditory and religious hierarchy by calling Christians and others to adoration, something Christians could do only quietly at best under Muslim law. The extent of this »violation« is relatively minimal, since Mary was recognized as a prophet or holy person herself within Islam. This detail did little to detract from Fabri's triumphant narrative however. Nor was the quality or loudness of the call to veneration described; having a Muslim custodian make such a call seems to have been sufficient for Fabri to undermine Muslim hierarchy in favor of what he considered to be a Christian saint. Rabbi Shalmav Shlomil of Yanstrel, writing from Safed in the seventeenth century, was more detailed, both regarding the quality and volume of sound, and about hierarchical implications of such auditory reversals:

»The Gentiles who dwell in the land of Israel, all of them are yielding and subordinate before the holiness of Israel, and even if we are standing for the whole day in a field in ṭalit and in tifilin and are praying and calling out in a loud voice >Adonai Elohenu< before the graves of the righteous [ha-ẓadiqim] not one is found among the Gentiles who would conceive in his heart to oppress the status of the Jews in the place where they pray or [who] would open his mouth to mock the prayer«¹³¹).

Here the boldness of the Jews is both visual and auditory. They openly wear ritual clothing peculiar to the Jews and pray loudly outside for all to see for an entire day¹³²). The author argues that the thought of oppressing the Jews in a place of prayer would not enter their thoughts. More significantly for our purposes, the Muslims are also silenced by the Jews' prayer. All of these elements demonstrate, according to Shalmav >the Gentiles< (non-Jews, in this case, probably Muslims) subordination to Israel.

Likewise, the capacity of a saint or holy object to punish or silence noisy expressions of acoustic dominance of the ruling group was seen as miraculous and noted with delight. For example, the late medieval traveler and diplomat, Bertrandon de la Broquière, who from 1432–1433 travelled to Constantinople and the Middle East in service of the Duke of Burgundy, Philip the Good (1396–1467), when describing a mosque in Beirut, which according to him, had once been a church dedicated to St. Barbara, notes: »And when they [the Muslims] wanted to mount on top of it to call [for prayer] as they were

130) *Vade, et Deum adora, et virginem Mariam lauda*. Felix Fabri, *Fratris Felicis Fabri Evagatorium in Terræ Sanctæ, Arabiæ et Egypti peregrinationem*, 3 vols, ed. Konrad Dietrich HASSLER, Stuttgart 1843–1849, vol. 1, pp. 372–374, folios 143a–b. Quoted passage on p. 373.

131) והגוים היושבים על אדמת ישראל, כולם הם נכנעים וכפופים לפני קדושתן של ישראל, ואפילו שאנחנו עומדים כל היום כלו על השדה בטלית ובתפילין ומתפללים וקוראים בקול גדולה אלהינו לפני קברות הצדיקים, לא נמצא אחד מהגוים שיערב אל לבו לגשת לפני מעמד היהודים במקום שהם מתפללים, או שיפתחו פיהם ללעוג אל התפילה Iggarot 'Ereẓ Yisra'el, ed. A. YA 'ARI, Tel Aviv 1971, p. 199; Zvi ILAN, *Qivrei Zaddiqim be-'Ereẓ Yisra'el*, Jerusalem 1997, p. 77.

132) Wearing religiously distinctive clothing was of course not prohibited in the Ottoman empire, rather the opposite. Nevertheless, this Jewish author seems to marvel in the ability of the Jews to dress thus in order to pray in public.

accustomed, they were so beaten up that there were none who dared go up there¹³³). Similar tales were told in the early modern period. Jean de Thévenot (1633–1667) recounted:

» We came to a mosque which one said had been a temple of Serapis, however, it was pretended that the saint, Simeon the Stylite, had been brought there from Antioch. Whatever the case may be about it, Turks say that the muezzin cannot make the cry there like at other mosques, and when he wants to cry, he has no voice; they have a lot of respect for him¹³⁴).

In both of these cases, a Christian saint (or God) silences Muslim religious noise, the call to prayer, in the first case by brutal intimidation, in the second by removing the muezzin's capacity for speech. These tales of supernatural silencing serve to assert the continued power of the individual saint, and by extension, Christianity, over holy sites appropriated by the Muslims from the Christians¹³⁵). Whether stories exalted the successful, uninhibited production of religious noise by *dhimmis* or visiting non-Muslims, or celebrated heavenly gag-orders against muezzins, they served as tales of resistance against Muslim claims and political-religious domination of places Jews and Christians considered » theirs«.

In the writings of some Eastern Christian chroniclers, the forcible cessation of religious noise, especially bells, was also viewed as a kind of punishment. In these cases, however, the silence is man-made, rather than divine. Predictably, Muslim regulation of Christian religious noise is noted, yet here, as in the case of European-derived narratives, the Christian author, Bar Hebraeus (1225/6–1286) manages to cast 'Umar's silencing of Christian bells or prayerful voices in light of Christian victory. According to Bar Hebraeus, 'Umar's restrictions of Christian religious noise and the imposition of special dress are sparked by 'Umar's hatred for Christianity because his effort to conquer Constantinople had been thwarted¹³⁶). Yet for all Bar Hebraeus' artfully derogatory reframing of 'Umar's actions as an expression of petty vengeance, John Tolan demonstrates that for Muslim

133) *Et quant ilz ont volu monter dessus pour crier ainsy qu'ilz ont acoutumé, ilz se sont trouvez tant batus qu'il n'est ores nul qui y ose aler.* Bertrandon de la Broquière, *Le Voyage d'Outremer de Bertrandon de la Broquière*, ed. Charles SCHEFER, Paris 1892 (reprint Westmead 1972), p. 40.

134) [...] *nous vimes à une Mosquée, qu'on dit avoir été un temple de Serapis, cependant l'on pretend que le corps de saint Simeon le Stilite y repose, y aiant été apporté d'Antioche. Quoi qu'il en soit les Turcs disent, que le Muesem n'y peut crier la prière comme aus autres Mosquées, et lorsqu'il veut crier, la voix lui manqué; ils lui portent grand respect.* Jean de Thévenot, *Suite du Voyage de Mr. de Thévenot au Levant*, vol. 3, Amsterdam 1727, p. 61. It is not entirely clear whom or what Thévenot believes the Muslims respect. Presumably Simeon the Stylite. For more examples of this trope see: Frederick William HASLUCK, *Christianity and Islam under the Sultans*, 2 vols., ed. Margaret M. HASLUCK, Oxford 1929, vol. 1, pp. 24–25.

135) In Jean de Thévenot's case, the Christian triumphalism is less certain since he calls into question the religious origin of the building in question.

136) Bar Hebraeus, *The Chronography of Bar Hebraeus*, Gregory Abū l-Faraj 1225–1286, transl. Ernest Alfred Wallis BUDGE, Amsterdam 1932 (reprinted 1976), vol.1, pp. 108–109.

authors and the Christians whom they ruled, the stopping of bells or clappers was symbolic of Muslim dominance and/or conquest¹³⁷⁾. In other examples the Patriarchs of Antioch and of Constantinople stop the ringing of bells or (chanted) prayer in churches as leverage or reprimand to misbehaving princes¹³⁸⁾. Thus, silence, as much as any kind of sound, religious or otherwise, was also an important auditory signifier, at least for Christian communities in the Mongol Empire.

Not surprisingly, indigenous Christians living under Muslim rule also resisted Muslim claims and regulations. This resistance seems to have come more in the form of the exegesis of Christian vs. Muslim sound, than its volume or the possibility of forcing Muslims to produce religious calls on behalf of the Christians, however. In the previous section of this article, I briefly alluded to the hidden spiritual meanings attributed to the clapper (*nāqūs*). For the »Nestorian« 'Abdīshō' bar Brikhā (d. 1318), these connotations and the concomitant spiritual power assigned to the *nāqūs* were sufficient to argue its legitimacy and the *adhān*'s inadequacy as a replacement:

»And just as the clapper on the Ark [of Noah] was a call to meet for [its] construction and the provision of food in the first instance, while warning the unmindful of the destructive flood in the second instance, so does the clapper also incite the faithful, in the first instance to meet in purity of mind and to perform religious good works, and provides knowledge of the Divine Mysteries which strengthen the pursuit of godly obligation that brings [the hearer] closer to the Divine Presence. In the second instance, it exhorts the people to escape the destruction in the deluge of sin and error which destroys the people of the world failing to worship the revered Lord. This is the reason why [we] use the clapper to know times of prayer, without relying on the cry of the herald and the call to prayer of the muezzin«¹³⁹⁾.

Throughout this section of »Kitāb Uṣūl al-Dīn«, 'Abdīshō' expands upon the tale frequently repeated in earlier works of Syriac literature, that the clapper was used to alert people to the coming of the flood and to call people and animals to Noah's ark¹⁴⁰⁾. In 'Abdīshō's work, however, the *nāqūs* does not merely call out to sinners and warn them, its sound provides knowledge of and exhortation about the Divine. This interpretation

137) TOLAN, Affreux vacarem (as n. 1).

138) Bar Hebraeus, Chronography (as n. 136), pp. 253, 309. Silencing bells was also an expression of lamentation. See p. 288. Gerhard DOHRN-VAN ROSSUM notes a similar practice in Western Europe: DOHRN-VAN ROSSUM, Campanile und Minarett (as n. 1), pp. 242–244, p. 246.

139) وكما أن الناقوس في السفينة كان حانا على الاجتماع للمصالح وتناول القوت في البداية. ومنهبا للغافلين عن الطوفان المهلك على دخول السفينة في النهاية. كذلك الناقوس أيضا يحث المؤمنين في بداية أمره على اجتماع بخلوص النية. للقيام بالمصالح الدينية وتناول العلم والأسرار المارانية المقوى على أداء الفرائض الإلهية. المقرب إلى الحضرة القدسية. ويض الناس أيضا في نهاية أمره على الفرار من الهلاك بطوفان الخاطايا والذنوب. المهلك لاهل الدنيا المتشاغلين عن عبادة الرب المرهوب.

Rassi, هذا هو السبب في اتخاذ الناقوس للتعريف بأوقات الصلوات. دون الاعتماد على نداء مناد و أذان مؤذن ظاهر الكلمات. What does the Clapper say? (as n. 116), Arabic p. 281, English p. 283. For a discussion of the debates relating to the use of »Nestorian« see pp. 64–65, footnote 8.

140) RASSI, What does the Clapper say? (as n. 116).

matches his invocation of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s poem, discussed earlier, in which ‘Alī reveals the »speech« of the *nāqūs*. Both in the poem and in ‘Abdīshō’s direct explication here, the percussion of the *nāqūs* produces spiritual knowledge, for those who have ears to hear. This auditory revelation is implicitly contrasted to the *adhān*, as ‘Abdīshō’ explains why Christian believers do not simply rely on the muezzin to know the times of prayer; the voice of Muslim men calling to pray, relays no supernal knowledge and provokes no repentance, qualities which are integral to the sound of the *nāqūs*, according to ‘Abdīshō’. The last line of the quoted passage also reveals the extent to which the clapper was in direct, one-to-one completion with the *adhān*. John Tolan notes that a number of Muslim authors complained that Christians beat their clappers at precisely the same time as the Muslim call to prayer and that some Muslim texts restricting the use of the of this instrument specified that it should not be struck just after or during the Muslim call to prayer¹⁴¹). From the Christian perspective represented in the >Kitāb Uṣūl al-Dīn<, the *adhān* represented a temptation for Christians, since it served a similar function and occurred at the same time. ‘Abdīshō’ seeks to counter any parallel his parishioners might have seen between the two sounds, and perhaps to answer critiques that Christians should abandon the use of the *nāqūs*, which clearly continued to be seen as provocative by their Muslim overlords. He does so by asserting that mystical knowledge was imbedded in the sound of the *nāqūs*.

This emphasis on the spiritual meaning, context and power of religious noise may also be found in the writings of some Jewish authors in Europe. For example, in a poem from the late thirteenth-century, the Iberian Jewish poet, Todros Abulafia, equates the singing of men at all hours of the night – presumably referring to the church hours – with singing to pagan demons. Their devotion to »demons«, however, becomes a spur his own nightly prayer. As with the Middle Eastern material, it is the source and intent which makes the music acceptable or desirable, or not, yet the music itself remains appealing¹⁴²).

Yet another polemicizing approach may be found in a series of tales that appear in both late medieval and early modern Hebrew and Yiddish sources feature R. Judah ha-Ḥasid. According to these narratives, R. Judah frequently saves the Jewish community from Christian injustice and exhibits prescient power of life and death over Jew and Gentile alike. In death R. Judah is equally powerful and distinctly more vengeful. On his deathbed he promises to topple the bell tower on the gate through which Jews were forced to pass as they carried their dead to the cemetery. During his funeral procession the bell tower does indeed collapse, killing the malicious gentile who used to ring the bell during Jewish

141) TOLAN, *Affreux vacarem* (as n. 1), especially pp. 52–53.

142) Todros b. Yehudah Abulafia, *Gan ha-Meshalim ve ha-Ḥidot*, 2 vols., ed. David YELLIN, Jerusalem 1932–1936, poem no. 938; *The Dream of the Poem. Hebrew Poetry from Muslim and Christian Spain 950–1492*, transl. and ed. Peter COLE, Princeton 2007, pp. 267–268; GARCEAU, »I call the people« (as n. 1), especially pp. 210–211.

funerals just to annoy the Jews. Here the holy Jewish dead man is able to silence Christian noise fully and completely, through the destruction of the instrument of noise – the bell tower, and the agent of the noise, namely the Christian who rang it¹⁴³).

It is peculiar that the gentile is depicted as ringing the bell at Jewish funerals out of malice, for in fact ringing bells during funerals was a way to honor the dead in Christian sources¹⁴⁴). However, to understand this tale, I think one must recall that Church bells and the Muslim call to prayer were analogous, not simply because they alerted worshippers to times of prayer, or even because they came from high points in religious buildings – the height of houses of worship in relation to the completion also being a tool of demarcation and contention. Rather the sounds were imbued with power because of the words accompanying them and the sanctified source of the sound they produced. Church bells often had bits of scripture, prayers, and/or the names of saints written on them, so that ringing them was in essence a kind of evocation of that saint and his/her power. Some bells were even baptized. Ringing them was thought to ward off demons and other dangers, to mark the auditory boundaries of a local, Christian community or a conquered area, and they eventually served to prompt Christians to show veneration to the Eucharist or other points within the Christian liturgy¹⁴⁵). Similarly, the evocation of God through the call to prayer by the muezzin and recitation of a section of the Qur'an was believed to have a salutary and protective quality against evil spirits, illness, disasters, and invaders¹⁴⁶). Thus both bell and call were not mere symbols of auditory freedom and dominance serving a social function of reminding believers to pray or come to a place of worship, but a very real evocation of religious entities – God or saints, in the case of Christians – against the enemies of a particular community, including, potentially other, dissenting religious communities. Each types of sound were an act of spiritually enhanced domination or warding, as well as an assertion of religious hierarchy as Christian or Muslim overlords. In this tale, R. Judah does not merely kill a Christian with a prayer from beyond the grave, he

143) Nathan BRÜLL, *Beiträge zur jüdischen Sagen- und Spruchkunde im Mittelalter*, in: *Jahrbücher für jüdische Geschichte und Literatur* 9 (1889), pp. 1–71, story no. 36, pp. 42–43; *Ma'aseh Book*, 2 vols., transl. Moses GASTER, Philadelphia 1934, vol. 2, pp. 395–396, story no. 183.

144) GARCEAU, »I call the people« (as n. 1).

145) GARCEAU, »I call the people« (as n. 1); JASPert, *Zeichen und Symbole* (as n. 1); TOLAN, *Affreux vacarem* (as n. 1); ALIBHAL, *Reverberations of Santiago's Bells* (as n. 1); John H. ARNOLD/Caroline GOODSON, *Resounding Community. The History and Meaning of Medieval Church Bells*, in: *Viator* 43/1 (2010), pp. 99–130; Claire BILLEN, *Dire le Bien Commun dans l'Espace public. Matérialité Épigraphique et Monumentale du Bien Commun dans les Villes des Pays-Bas, à la Fin du Moyen Âge*, in: *De bono communi. The Discourse and Practice of the Common Good in the European City/Discours et pratique du Bien Commun dans les villes d'Europe*, ed. Élodie LECUPPRE-DESJARDIN/Anne-Laure VAN BRUAENE, Turnhout 2010, pp. 71–88.

146) Amira EL-ZEIN, *Islam, Arabs and the Intelligent World of the Jinn*, Syracuse 2009, pp. 78–81; Jacob LASSNER, *Demonizing the Queen of Sheba. Boundaries in Gender and Culture in Postbiblical Judaism and Medieval Islam*, Chicago/London 1993, p. 111.

demonstrates himself more powerful than the spiritual or supernatural power which the bell embodied.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

In examining sound as an element in medieval Jewish, Christian, and Muslim interactions, both in Western Europe and the Middle East, what becomes increasingly evident is that not only were the musical traditions of these communities intertwined and were the object of curiosity and borrowing from other communities, but that the symbolic meanings, spaces and timing of other types of sounds also were part of a shared culture of sound. The sounds of the religious other were not always beloved, indeed, they were often identified as dangerous, disgusting or morally problematic. Yet among of the reasons for such designations was that the music and other sounds of the religious other were also profoundly alluring. Another reason is that they were often inescapable. Despite political and religious authorities' attempts to restrict the public, religious noise-making of the religious other, or to discourage auditory encounters between individuals, sounds, with their plurality of sources, were unavoidable. Sound is and was so powerful an element in inter-religious encounter for precisely this reason. Members of different communities did not even need to be in close proximity to one another to be confronted with the sound of the other, with all the cultural and religious connotations that a given noise carried. While many scholars have examined the competition and regulations by Muslims regarding Christian bells, and Christians in relation to the *adhān*, what should now be apparent is that this was but one small portion of the auditory competition which existed between religious communities. What is presented here is but a tiny portion of the material available relevant for understanding sound and religious encounter during the Middle Ages; one may hope that others will take up the topic in a deeper, more systematic way in the future.

SUMMARY: SEDUCTIVE SOUNDS IN MEDIEVAL JEWISH, CHRISTIAN, AND MUSLIM ENCOUNTERS

Song and music was deemed delightful yet problematic in various ways by medieval Jews, Christians and Muslims alike. This article shows that as with internal debates about song and music, in Jewish, Christian, and Muslim imaginings of »religious noise« in an inter-religious context, the music of the religious other was regularly portrayed as seductive, luring the hearer to conversion. Religious transition in any direction is often marked by music, even as legalists from all three traditions vied against listening to or exchanging musical information with members of other religious communities, again, because music was the basis for religious temptation and inter-mixing. Not only the source of sound, i. e. what and who made it, but the quality of the sound was a key element in polemical

discussions of religious noise, both in medieval Europe, and in the Middle East, so that descriptions of noise from a religiously undesirable source was often portrayed as cacophonous and ugly. Even in these cases, especially in the Islamic texts, the idea of sound as seductive, remains. In addition to these themes, within the Western European Jewish-Christian encounter, the sounds of the religious other are an irritant and the indicator of divine condemnation. Nevertheless, it is clear from texts such as *Sefer Hasidim*, that Christians and Jews exchanged music, at least on an informal level. These religio-literary motifs are indicative of the ever-present role of sound in medieval, daily experiences of peoples' lives, including inter-religious ones. This in turn helps to explain the appearance of auditory restrictions in medieval Christian and Muslim law, and warnings in Jewish ones.

